

Scientific Committee and Emerging Risks (SCER) Unit

Scientific Committee

Minutes of the 8th meeting of the Standing Working Group (SWG) on Emerging Risks

Held on 08-09 12 2014, Parma

(Approved on 02 03 2015)

Participants

- **Working Group Experts:**

Josef SCHLATTER (chair), Qasim CHAUDRY, David GOTT (via teleconference), Arie HAVELAAR (via teleconference), Klaus-Dieter JANY, Gijs KLETER, Robert LUTTIK, Matthew MACLEOD, Alberto MANTOVANI, Hildegard PRZYREMBEL, Jan SCHANS, Vittorio SILANO, Ivar VÅGSHOLM, Matthew WRIGHT.

- **EFSA:**

SCER Unit: Andrea ALTIERI, Caroline MERTEN

Scientific Committee: Anthony HARDY

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The chair welcomed the participants. Apologies were received from Jean-Claude GRÉGOIRE, Patrick DU JARDIN and Birgit NØRRUNG.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of interest

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes¹ and the Decision of the Executive Director implementing this Policy regarding Declarations of Interests², EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of interest and the Specific Declaration of interest) filled in by the experts invited for the present meeting. No conflicts of interests related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of interest at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Agreement of the minutes of the 7th Working Group meeting

The minutes of the 7th meeting were agreed.

5. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

EFSA presented an update of the issues discussed at the Emerging Risks Exchange Network. The presentation included a list of issues identified, briefing notes prepared by EFSA Emerging Risks Exchange Network and the Stakeholder Consultative Group on Emerging Risks, and follow-up actions. The issues discussed were: detection of *Aethina Tumida* in Southern Italy and long term effects of food emulsifiers on intestinal barriers.

A presentation was given on the feasibility of a global food chain analysis addressing in general terms possible objectives, tasks, possible criteria to select which food chain, possible deliverables, resources, and timelines.

Next meetings

2015 March 02 (14.00-18.00) – 03 (9.00-16.00), Parma

¹ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf>

² <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules.pdf>

Scientific Committee

Minutes of the 7th meeting of the Standing Working Group (SWG) on Emerging Risks

Held on 22-23 09 2014, Parma

(Approved on 08 12 2014)

Participants

- **Working Group Experts:**

Josef SCHLATTER (chair), David GOTT, Arie HAVELAAR, Klaus-Dieter JANY (only on 22 January 2014), Gijs KLETER, Robert LUTTIK, Alberto MANTOVANI, Birgit NØRRUNG, Jan SCHANS, Vittorio SILANO, Hildegard PRZYREMBEL, Matthew WRIGHT.

- **EFSA:**

SCER Unit: Andrea ALTIERI, Arianna CHIUSOLO, Andrea GERMINI, Tilemachos GOUMPERIS, Tobin ROBINSON.

ALPHA Unit: Renata LEUSCHNER (only on 21 January 2014)

BIOCONTAM Unit: Michaela HEMPEN (only on 21 January 2014)

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The chair welcomed the participants. Apologies were received from Qasim CHAUDRY, Patrick DU JARDIN, Jean-Claude GRÉGOIRE, Matthew MACLEOD, and Ivar VÅGSHOLM.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of interest

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes¹ and the Decision of the Executive Director implementing this Policy regarding Declarations of Interests², EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of interest and the Specific Declaration of interest) filled in by the experts invited for the present meeting. No conflicts of interests related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of interest at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Agreement of the minutes of the 5th Working Group meeting

The minutes of the 6th meeting were agreed.

5. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

EFSA presented an update of the on-going activities on emerging risks. The presentation included a list of issues identified, briefing notes prepared by the EFSA Emerging Risks Exchange Network and the Stakeholder Consultative Group on Emerging Risks, and follow-up actions.

The WG discussed different possible interpretations and implications of the EFSA definition of emerging risks as well as possible ways to increase the efficacy and efficiency of the current process for the identification of emerging risks, including the reduction of the filtering and decision steps.

The WG agreed that EFSA needs to acquire more experience in the identification of issues emerging in the medium to long term. This would require expertise on the identification and interpretation of drivers of emerging risks.

The WG discussed possible ways to improve the interaction with the Panels on emerging risks, in order to have the Panels more actively involved be more involved in identifying emerging risks.

Next meetings

2014 December 08 (14.00-18.00) – 09 (9.00-16.00), Parma

2015 March 02 (14.00-18.00) – 03 (9.00-16.00), Parma

¹ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf>

² <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules.pdf>

Scientific Committee and Emerging Risks Unit

Scientific Committee and Emerging Risks Unit

Minutes of the 6th meeting of the Standing Working Group (SWG) on Emerging Risks

Held on 03-04 06 2014, Parma

(Approved on 22 09 2014)

Participants

- **Working Group Experts:**

Josef SCHLATTER (chair), Arie HAVELAAR (vice-chair), Vittorio SILANO (vice-chair), David GOTT, Jean-Claude GRÉGOIRE, Klaus-Dieter JANY, Gijs KLETER, Robert LUTTIK, Alberto MANTOVANI, Matthew MACLEOD, Jan SCHANS, Hildegard PRZYREMBEL, Ivar VÅGSHOLM, Matthew WRIGHT.

- **Hearing Experts:**

Erik MATHIJS (KU LEUVEN) has participated via teleconference
Frank ALLEWELDT and Nicholas MCSPEDDEN-BROWN (Civic Consulting)
George PRPICH (Cranfield University)

- **European Commission:**

Andreas MENIDIATIS (DG - Health and Consumers)

- **EFSA:**

SCER Unit: Andrea ALTIERI, Andrea GERMINI, Tilemachos GOUMPERIS, Tobin ROBINSON.

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants and introduced the hearing experts and the representative from the DG-Health and Consumers. Apologies were received from Patrick du Jardin.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of interest

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes¹ and the Decision of the Executive Director implementing this Policy regarding Declarations of Interests², EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of interest and the Specific Declaration of interest filled in by the experts invited for the present meeting. No conflicts of interests related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of interest at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Agreement of the minutes of the 5th Working Group meeting

The minutes of the 5th meeting were agreed on 07 02 2014 and published on the EFSA website on the 06 03 2014.

5. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

5.1 Emerging Risks Identification: an appraisal of the approaches trialled by EFSA

A summary of the approaches trialled by EFSA on emerging risk identification and related activities since the establishment of EFSA were presented. It was acknowledged that EFSA and the European Commission have taken actions on several of the issues identified. However, a more formal communication is needed on the issues identified and on the follow-up activities. It was also noted that the identification process can sometimes have an impact on the development of an issue, for example when prevention or mitigation measure are put in place.

5.2 The way forward

The SWG discussed possible ways to further develop the EFSA approach on emerging risk identification. The SWG discussed the opportunity to increase the collaboration with other Agencies on this topic and possible hurdles in establishing an operative collaboration. These include, for example, different mandates and methodological issues, such as lack of validated tools and methods to identify possible future threats. It was proposed to prepare an editorial on the EFSA journal on the evolution of the EFSA approach on emerging risk identification.

5.3 Food fraud

The SWG discussed the topic of food fraud. It was concluded that in most cases food fraud is a risk management issue and that only under certain specific circumstances food fraud can become a driver of emerging risk.

5.4 Briefing notes on emerging issues from EFSA

The SWG discussed potential issues identified by EFSA (i.e. increased okadaic acid contamination, novel phlebovirus, new heat generated chemical contaminants).

¹ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf>

² <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules.pdf>

5.5 Drivers of emerging risks and future studies

Several initiatives on future and foresight studies were presented to the SWG. These include the initiative sponsored by DG-Health and Consumers, i.e. the Scoping Study Delivering on EU Food Safety and Nutrition in 2050, the initiative of DG-AGRI, i.e. the Scientific Committee for Agricultural Research Foresight Exercise, and the work of Cranfield University on the identification of emerging risks. The SWG was positively impressed with the approach proposed regarding food chain mapping with the objective of identifying vulnerabilities.

Next meetings

2014 September 22 (14.00-18.00) – 23 (9.00-16.00), Parma

2014 December 08 (14.00-18.00) – 09 (9.00-16.00), Parma

Scientific Committee and Emerging Risks Unit
Minutes of the preparatory meeting of the Standing Working Group (SWG)
on Emerging Risks
WEB-conference, 26 February 2014
(Agreed on 14 05 2014)

Participants

- **Working Group Experts:**
 - Arie Havelaar (chair), Birgit Nørrung, Jan Schans, Ivar Vågsholm

- **EFSA:**
 - SCER Unit: Andrea Germini

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

Apologies were received from Jean-Claude Grégoire.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes

3. Declarations of interest

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes¹ and the Decision of the Executive Director implementing this Policy regarding Declarations of Interests², EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of interest and the Specific Declaration of interest) filled in by the experts invited for the present meeting. No conflicts of interests related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of interest at the beginning of this meeting.

¹ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf>

² <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules.pdf>

5. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

5.1 Draft technical report ([EFSA-Q-2014-00077](#))

The WG discussed the draft technical report. Historical cases presented by the WG members were also included in the report. The final version of the draft report will be circulated to the AHAW, BIOHAZ, PLAH Panels and the Scientific Committee for final consultation.

6. Next meeting

The next meeting will take place on 3-4 June 2014 in Parma.

Scientific Committee and Emerging Risks Unit
Minutes of the 5th meeting of the Standing Working Group (SWG) on Emerging Risks
Held on 20-21 01 2014, Parma
(Agreed on 07 02 2014)

Participants

- **Working Group Experts:**

Josef SCHLATTER (chair), Qasim CHAUDRY, Patrick DU JARDIN (only on 22 January 2014), David GOTT, Jean-Claude GRÉGOIRE, Arie HAVELAAR, Klaus-Dieter JANY (only on 22 January 2014), Gijs KLETER, Robert LUTTIK, Alberto MANTOVANI, Birgit NØRRUNG, Jan SCHANS, Vittorio SILANO, Ivar VÅGSHOLM.

- **EFSA:**

SCER Unit: Andrea ALTIERI, Arianna CHIUSOLO, Andrea GERMINI, Tilemachos GOUMPERIS, Tobin ROBINSON.

ALPHA Unit: Renata LEUSCHNER (only on 21 January 2014)

BIOCONTAM Unit: Michaela HEMPEN (only on 21 January 2014)

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants. Apologies were received from Matthew MACLEOD, Hildegard PRZYREMBEL and Matthew WRIGHT.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of interest

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes¹ and the Decision of the Executive Director implementing this Policy regarding Declarations of Interests², EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of interest and the Specific Declaration of interest) filled in by the experts invited for the present meeting. No conflicts of interests related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of interest at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Agreement of the minutes of the 4th Working Group meeting

The minutes of the 4th meeting were agreed on 20 01 2014 and published on the EFSA website on the 31 01 2014.

5. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

5.1 Chemical emerging risks

The SWG has finalised the technical report on a process for identifying emerging chemical risks in the food and feed chain. The report will be published by the end of Jan 2014. The SWG proposed to pilot the procedure focusing, in the first instance, on a limited number of industrial chemical substances. Testing this procedure starting from a specific list of chemicals will show whether the procedure can work effectively, and it may also provide additional inputs for improvement. The results of the proposed pilot project should then be used to decide on additional activities for the further refinement of the proposed approach. The involvement of the SWG in the deployment of the pilot project is advisable.

5.2 Biological emerging risks

The SWG is proceeding with the drafting of a scientific report outlining the strategy to address biological risks. The report includes an analysis of the outcomes of the expert consultations carried out during a pilot study with the BIOHAZ and AHAW Panels. The SWG will further work on the development of historical cases to appraise the methodology. The BIOHAZ and AHAW Panels will be further consulted before proceeding to the finalization of the report.

5.3 Update on activities on Emerging Risks and next steps

The SWG provided comments to the draft technical report of the SCER Unit on the activities of the Unit on emerging risks in 2012-2013. The report should include a section summarizing the activities of the SWG.

The SWG decided to prepare a technical report on the development of the concept of emerging risk identification, assisting the unit in the re-appraisal of the process under development and on the overall strategy.

¹ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencypolicy.pdf>

² <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules.pdf>

6. Briefing notes on emerging issues from EFSA

The SWG discussed selected potential issues submitted by EFSA (i.e. cyanotoxins contamination of food supplements, masked mycotoxins, epigenetic endpoints in chemical risk assessment, 3d food printing).

7. Next meetings

2014 June 3 (14.00-18.00) – 4 (9.00-16.00), Parma

2014 September 22 (14.00-18.00) – 23 (9.00-16.00), Parma

Scientific Committee and Emerging Risks Unit
Minutes of the preparatory meeting of the Standing Working Group (SWG)
on Emerging Risks
Held on 5-6 11 2013, Parma
(Agreed on 6 12 2013)

Participants

- **Working Group Experts:**

Jean-Claude GRÉGOIRE, Arie HAVELAAR, Birgit NØERRUNG, Jan SCHANS,
Ivar VÅGSHOLM

- **Hearing Experts:**

Liisa SIHVONEN, Tom RITCHEY

- **EFSA:**

SCER Unit: Tobin ROBINSON, Andrea GERMINI

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of interest

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes¹ and the Decision of the Executive Director implementing this Policy regarding Declarations of Interests², EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of interest filled in by the experts invited for the present meeting. No conflicts of interests related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of interest at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Scientific topic for discussion

4.1 General Morphological Analysis workshop

The meeting was organized in the form of a workshop to discuss the applicability of morphological modelling for scenario development in the context of EFSA's work with emerging risks.

The principles of General Morphological Analysis (GMA) were used to address the following scientific question: "*What are the most important parameters (factors/variables) concerning viral agents associated with the food chain relevant for human and animal health, and how do these parameters interact?*"

The experts identified the main parameters relevant for answering the scientific question and analysed through parameter influence analysis the cross-influence relationships between them. The parameters identified as critical were then used for the development of the scenario modelling framework. The total number of possible configurations of the scenario modelling framework was reduced to a series of plausible configurations through a cross-consistency assessment (CCA) of the parameters. Based on the defined model the experts simulated a set of scenarios relevant to address the scientific question previously formulated.

The experts decided to test the model developed during the workshop on a set of historical cases relevant to their specific field of expertise.

5. Next meeting

The next meeting will take place on 20-21 January 2014 in Parma.

¹ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf>

² <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules.pdf>

Scientific Committee and Emerging Risks Unit
Minutes of the 4th meeting of the Standing Working Group (SWG) on Emerging Risks
Held on 21-22 10 2013, Parma
(Agreed on 20 01 2014)

Participants

- **Working Group Experts:**

Josef SCHLATTER (chair), David GOTT, Robert LUTTIK, Klaus-Dieter JANY, Arie HAVELAAR, Matthew WRIGHT, Gijs KLETER, Hildegard PRZYREMBEL, Ivar VÅGSHOLM, Birgit NØRRUNG, Matthew MACLEOD, Jan SCHANS, Vittorio SILANO.

- **EFSA:**

SCER Unit: Andrea ALTIERI, Tilemachos GOUMPERIS.

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants. Apologies were received from Qasim CHAUDRY, Alberto MANTOVANI, Patrick DU JARDIN, and Jean-Claude GRÉGOIRE.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of interest

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes¹ and the Decision of the Executive Director implementing this Policy regarding Declarations of Interests², EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of interest and the Specific Declaration of interest filled in by the experts invited for the present meeting. No conflicts of interests related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process. At the Oral Declaration of interest at the beginning of this meeting Jany declared the following interest: participation in the preparation of the opinion on BPA. Considering that alternatives to BPA will be discussed as a potential emerging issue with no reference to the outcome of the risk assessment on BPA, in accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes and the Decision of the Executive Director implementing this Policy regarding Declarations of Interests, and taking into account the specific matters discussed at the meeting in question, the interest above was not deemed to represent a conflict of Interest for the expert concerned.

Macleod declared the following interest: research funding from the private sector on a project studying persistence & bioaccumulation of mixtures of essential oils in the environment. Pharmaceuticals and personal care products in the environment and possible human exposure through the food chain will be discussed as a potential emerging issue. In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes and the Decision of the Executive Director implementing this Policy regarding Declarations of Interests, and taking into account the specific matters discussed at the meeting in question, the interest above was deemed to represent a conflict of Interest. This results in the impossibility for the expert to participate in any way in the discussion when that item (pharmaceuticals and personal care products in the environment) was addressed.

4. Agreement of the minutes of the 3rd Working Group meeting

The minutes of the 3rd meeting were agreed by written procedure on 06 09 2013 and published on the EFSA website on the 29 10 2013.

5. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

5.1 Chemical emerging risks

The chair reported the feedback from the Scientific Committee on the draft report concerning a procedure for the identification of emerging industrial or natural chemicals occurring or likely to occur in the food and feed chain. The Scientific Committee welcomed the report and proposed to publish it as a technical report. The working group agreed to finalise the report addressing minor editorial changes and to submit it to EFSA for final approval and publication.

5.2 Biological emerging risks

In the field of biological risks the SWG is conducting a series of expert consultations involving experts from the BIOHAZ and AHAW Panels in order to identify priority emerging risks and

¹ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf>

² <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules.pdf>

drivers of biological emerging risks to human and animal health for the next 5-10 years. The first round of consultations has been carried out in June and July 2013. The SWG is now analysing the outcome of this first consultations and planning the next steps, including a workshop to be held by the end of 2013.

6. Briefing notes on emerging issues from EFSA

The SWG discussed selected potential emerging issues submitted by EFSA (i.e. potential contamination of food from recycled paper, pharmaceuticals and personal care products in the environment and in the food chain, alternatives to Bisphenol A for food contact material applications, possible future use of insects as food and feed).

7. Next meeting(s)

January 20 (14.00-18.00) – 21 (9.00-13.00), Parma

**Scientific Committee and Emerging Risks Unit
Standing Working Group (SWG) on Emerging Risks
Minutes of the preparatory meeting
Held on 04 09 2013, Copenhagen
(Agreed on 05 09 2013)**

Participants

- **Working Group Experts:**

Arie HAVELAAR, Jean-Claude GRÉGOIRE, Ivar VågSHOLM, Birgit NøRRUNG, Jan SCHANS

- **EFSA:**

SCER Unit: Andrea ALTIERI, Tobin ROBINSON, Tilemachos GOUMPERIS, Jean-Lou DORNE

- **Hearing Expert:**

Tom RITCHEY (Ritchey Consulting)

1. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

2. Declarations of interest

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes¹ and the Decision of the Executive Director implementing this Policy regarding Declarations of Interests², EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of interest and the Specific Declaration of interest) filled in by the experts invited for the present meeting. No conflicts of interests related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of interest at the beginning of this meeting.

3. General introduction

Havelaar gave a presentation covering the mandate of EFSA on the identification of emerging risks, and some background information on past and ongoing initiatives of EFSA on the topic.

4. Discussion of results of the expert consultation with BIOHAZ and AHAW Panels

The working group discussed the preliminary results of the expert consultations with the AHAW and BIOHAZ Panels. The results of the consultation include a provisional list of drivers and a preliminary general list of emerging issues. Taking into account the inputs received from the Panels, it was decided to focus the next step of the expert consultation on emerging viruses in human and animals.

5. Presentation on General Morphological Analysis (GMA)

Ritchey gave a presentation on the general concepts of the General Morphological Analysis (GMA), providing some concrete examples of the application of the procedure and some possible scenarios applicable to EFSA. The working group agreed that the GMA approach could be considered by EFSA for a pilot project for the analysis of the results of the first consultation with the Panels.

6. Next meeting(s)

2013 October 21 (14.00-18.00) – 22 (9.00-16.00), Parma.

¹ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf>

² <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules.pdf>

**Scientific committee and Emerging Risks Unit
Standing Working Group (SWG) on Emerging Risks
Minutes of the preparatory meeting
Held on 11 07 2013, Parma
(Agreed on 04 09 2013)**

Participants

- **Working Group Experts:**
Arie HAVELAAR, GRÉGOIRE Jean-Claude, Ivar VÅGSHOLM, Birgit NØRRUNG.
- **EFSA:**
EMRISK Unit: Tobin ROBINSON, Andrea ALTIERI.

1. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

2. Declarations of interest

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes¹ and the Decision of the Executive Director implementing this Policy regarding Declarations of Interests², EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of interest and the Specific Declaration of interest filled in by the experts invited for the present meeting. No conflicts of interests related to the issues discussed at this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of interest at the beginning of this meeting.

3. Preliminary results of the expert consultation

The working groups discussed the preliminary results of the expert consultations with the AHAW and BIOHAZ Panel. In general, the plan for this exercise was well perceived by the Panels. The group agreed that the next step should be to consolidate the list of drivers and emerging issues. One possibility would be to analyse the results in terms of possible effects of the different combinations of these drivers. It would be useful to have an example. It was suggested to try to have an analysis of this kind using as an example antibiotic resistance. At the same time it would be useful to have a complete map of these drivers and emerging risks. In order to analyse the results and plan the next steps, it was suggested that we could benefit from an expert specialised in the analysis of drivers or expert elicitation. The group will collect more information on experts in this field and EFSA will probe the possibility of inviting the expert for the next meeting or for the workshop, planned for round 2.

4. Next meeting(s)

2013 September 04 Sept (10-17.00), Copenhagen.

2013 October 21 (14.00-18.00) – 22 (9.00-16.00), Parma.

¹ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf>

² <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules.pdf>

Scientific Committee and Emerging Risks Unit
Minutes of the 3rd meeting of the Standing Working Group (SWG) on Emerging Risks
Held on 11-12 07 2013, Parma
(Agreed on 21 10 2013)

Participants

- **Working Group Experts:**

Josef SCHLATTER (chair), Robert LUTTIK, Alberto MANTOVANI, Patrick du JARDIN, Klaus-Dieter JANY, Arie HAVELAAR, Matthew WRIGHT, Jean-Claude GREGOIRE, Gijs KLETER, Hildegard PRZYREMBEL, Ivar VÅGSHOLM, Birgit NØRRUNG, Matthew MACLEOD.

- **EFSA:**

SCER Unit: Andrea ALTIERI, Tobin ROBINSON, Tilemachos GOUMPERIS, Jean-Lou DORNE.

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants. Apologies were received from Vittorio Silano, Qasim Chaudhry, David Gott, Jan Schans.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of interest

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes¹ and the Decision of the Executive Director implementing this Policy regarding Declarations of Interests², EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of interest and the Specific Declaration of interest) filled in by the experts invited for the present meeting. No conflicts of interests related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of interest at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Minutes of the 2nd Working Group meeting held on 25-26 03 2013

The minutes of the 2nd meeting were agreed by written procedure on 19 03 2013 and published on the EFSA website 19 03 2013.

5. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

5.1 Chemical emerging risks

The SWG discussed the advanced draft report concerning a procedure for the identification of emerging industrial or natural chemicals occurring or likely to occur in the food and feed chain. The proposed procedure is based on the new data sources on chemicals manufactured or imported in the European Union and on the environmental occurrence of chemicals. The proposed procedure makes use of a variety of data from many relevant sources which recently became available as well as of in silico and physiologically-based models for the prediction of the environmental behaviour and (eco)toxic activity of chemicals. The procedure should be tested, preferably through a pilot project, in order to decide on additional activities for further refinement. The working group agreed to prepare a revised advanced draft taking into account the comments provided during the meeting, and to submit the report to the SC for the plenary meeting of September 2013.

5.2 Biological emerging risks

In the field of biological risks the SWG is conducting a series of expert consultations involving experts from the BIOHAZ and AHAW Panels in order to identify priority emerging risks and drivers of biological emerging risks to human and animal health for the next 5-10 years. The first round of consultations has been carried out in June and July 2013. The SWG is now analysing the outcome of this first consultation and planning the next steps, including a workshop to be held by the end of 2013.

6. Next meeting(s)

2013 October 21 (14.00-18.00) – 22 (9.00-16.00), Parma

¹ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf>

² <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules.pdf>

Scientific Committee and Emerging Risks Unit

**Scientific Committee and Emerging Risks Unit
Standing Working Group (SWG) on Emerging Risks
Minutes of the preparatory meeting
Held on 21 06 2013, Parma
(Agreed on 06 09 2013)**

Participants

- **Working Group Experts:**

David Michael GOTT, Klaus-Dieter JANY, Gijs A KLETER, Alberto MANTOVANI, Josef SCHLATTER, Vittorio SILANO, Robert LUTTIK, Qasim CHAUDRY, Matthew WRIGHT.

- **EFSA:**

EMRISK Unit: Andrea ALTIERI.

1. Welcome

The EFSA secretariat welcomed the participants.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without amendments.

3. Declarations of interest

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes¹ and the Decision of the Executive Director implementing this Policy regarding Declarations of Interests², EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of interest and the Specific Declaration of interest filled in by the experts invited for the present meeting. No conflicts of interests related to the issues discussed at this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of interest at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Preparation of the draft document

The working group discussed the revised version of the draft document, with a particular focus to the changes since the last draft. The EFSA secretariat will incorporate the proposed amendments in the revised draft, and share it with the working group by the end of August. It was agreed to substantially shorten the report and incorporate selected sections as annexes. The working group decided that once this comments have been taken into account, the report should be shared with the Standing Working Group on Emerging Risks and to have the document ready for the SC plenary of September.

5. Feedback from the consultation with ECHA

The EFSA secretariat updated the group on the consultation with ECHA. The ECHA website provide specific information on chemicals based on the disseminated information from the REACH Registration dossiers. The information on chemicals of concern found on the ECHA web include the Candidate list (Substances of Very High Concern) and the Restriction list. ECHA proposed that EFSA's work should focus on the previously-mentioned lists of chemicals for the time being.

6. Next meeting(s)

2013 July 11 (14.00-18.00) – 12 (9.00-13.30), Parma

2013 October 21 (14.00-18.00) – 22 (9.00-16.00), Parma

¹ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencpolicy.pdf>

² <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules.pdf>

EMRISK UNIT

Emerging Risks Unit
Standing Working Group (SWG) on Emerging Risks
Minutes of the preparatory meeting
Held on 7-8 05 2013, Parma
(Agreed on 21 06 2013)

Participants

- **Working Group Experts:**

David Michael GOTT, Klaus-Dieter JANY, Gijs A KLETER, Alberto MANTOVANI, Josef SCHLATTER, Vittorio SILANO, Matthew MACLEOD, Qasim CHAUDRY, Robert LUTTIK, Matthew WRIGHT.

- **EFSA:**

EMRISK Unit: Andrea ALTIERI, Arianna CHIUSOLO.

SCOM Unit: Miriam JACOBS.

1. Welcome

The head of the EMRISK Unit welcomed the participants.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted deleting item 5 considering that ECHA was not able to participate agenda point 5 was deleted.

3. Declarations of interest

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes¹ and the Decision of the Executive Director implementing this Policy regarding Declarations of Interests², EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of interest and the Specific Declaration of interest filled in by the experts invited for the present meeting. No conflicts of interests related to the issues discussed at this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of interest at the beginning of this meeting.

4. General introduction and overview of the proposal for chemicals

The rationale of the proposed approach to systematically identify emerging risks associated with so far undetected chemicals of potential concern in the food/feed chain was presented.

Possible approaches for modelling the environmental fate of chemical contaminants, including QSAR modelling for the prediction of the chemical toxicity of certain groups of chemicals, the OECD Tool Box, and other relevant computational tools/databases of potential interest for this project were presented and discussed. It was agreed that specific sections on this topics would be added to the report.

The working group discussed in detail the revised draft of the document. Working group members were assigned specific contributions to be finalised by mid May and send them to the EFSA secretariat. The EFSA secretariat will prepare and share a revised draft by the end of May.

5. Next meeting(s)

The possibility of having an extra meeting by the end of June will be explored by the EFSA secretariat.

¹ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf>

² <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules.pdf>

EMRISK UNIT

**Emerging Risks Unit
Standing Working Group (SWG) on Emerging Risks
Minutes of the preparatory meeting
Held on 03 04 2013, Amsterdam
(Agreed on 11 07 2013)**

Participants

- **Working Group Experts:**
Arie HAVELAAR, Jean-Claude GRÉGOIRE, Jan SCHANS, Ivar VågSHOLM,
Birgit NØRRUNG.
- **EFSA:**
EMRISK Unit: Tobin ROBINSON, Andrea ALTIERI.

1. Welcome

The head of the EMRISK Unit welcomed the participants.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of interest

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes¹ and the Decision of the Executive Director implementing this Policy regarding Declarations of Interests², EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of interest and the Specific Declaration of interest filled in by the experts invited for the present meeting. No conflicts of interests related to the issues discussed at this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of interest at the beginning of this meeting.

4. General introduction and scope of the expert consultation

Altieri gave a short presentation with general indications on how to conduct efficiently expert consultations using the Delphi method. The working group acknowledged that the ultimate goal of this exercise is to support decisions for the identification of priority areas for EFSA activities, including areas for self tasking, and to provide inputs for Horizon 2020. The strategic time horizon is 5-10 years ahead. The BIOHAZ and AHAW Panels have been informed on the planned exercise and they has expressed interests in participating.

5. Overview of the draft protocol

The working group discussed the draft protocol for the expert consultations prepared by Havelaar. The working group agreed that Havelaar and EMRISK will revised the draft protocol incorporating the comments provided during the meeting.

6. Plenary meetings

It was agreed that the EFSA secretariat will identify, with the corresponding units, suitable dates for the expert consultations with AHAW and BIOHAZ Panels.

7. Plenary meetings

2013 July 11 (14.00-18.00) – 12 (9.00-13.30), Parma

2013 October 21 (14.00-18.00) – 22 (9.00-16.00), Parma

¹ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf>

² <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules.pdf>

EMRISK UNIT

**Emerging Risks Unit
Standing Working Group (SWG) on Emerging Risks
Minutes of the preparatory meeting
Held on 25-26 03 2013, Parma
(Agreed on 7 05 2013)**

Participants

- **Working Group Experts:**

David Michael GOTT, Klaus-Dieter JANY, Gijs A KLETER, Alberto MANTOVANI, Josef SCHLATTER, Vittorio SILANO, Robert LUTTIK, Matthew WRIGHT.

- **EFSA:**

EMRISK Unit: Andrea ALTIERI, Arianna CHIUSOLO.

1. Welcome

The head of the EMRISK Unit welcomed the participants.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted with no amendments.

3. Declarations of interest

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes¹ and the Decision of the Executive Director implementing this Policy regarding Declarations of Interests², EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of interest and the Specific Declaration of interest filled in by the experts invited for the present meeting. No conflicts of interests related to the issues discussed at this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of interest at the beginning of this meeting.

4. General introduction and overview of the proposed procedure

Silano summarised the general rationale of the proposed procedure to systematically identify emerging risks associated with chemical substances of potential concern in the food/feed chain, and presented the preliminary draft report. The working group discussed in detail the preliminary draft of the document. Working group members were assigned specific contributions. The EFSA secretariat will prepare and share a revised draft of the draft document by mid May. The WG confirmed the need for having additional expertise in the WG on modelling the environmental fate of chemical contaminants, including QSAR modelling for the prediction of the chemical toxicity of certain groups of chemicals.

5. Next meeting(s)

2013 May 7 (14.00-18.00) - 8 (9.00-13.30).

¹ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf>

² <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules.pdf>

Emerging Risks Unit
Standing Working Group (SWG) on Emerging Risks
Minutes of the 2nd Meeting
Held on 25-26 02 2013, Parma
(Agreed on 19 04 2013)

Participants

- **Working Group Experts:**

Josef SCHLATTER (chair), Robert LUTTIK, Alberto MANTOVANI, Vittorio SILANO, Patrick DU JARDIN (by teleconference 1st day), Klaus-Dieter JANY, Arie HAVELAAR, Matthew WRIGHT, David Michael GOTT, Jean-Claude GRÉGOIRE, Gijs KLETER, Jan SCHANS, Hildegard PRZYREMBEL, Ivar VÅGSHOLM, Birgit NØRRUNG.

- **EFSA:**

EMRISK Unit: Tobin ROBINSON, Andrea ALTIERI, Arianna CHIUSOLO, Agnès RORTAIS, Jean-Lou DORNE, Tilemachos GOUMPERIS, Maria-Eleni FILIPPITZI;
SCOM Unit: Djen LIEM

1. Welcome

The Chair and the Head of the EMRISK Unit welcomed the participants. As discussed at the first meeting, two new members with expertise in animal health and human nutrition have joined the working group. The chair summarised the conclusions of the first meeting.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes. The minutes of the first meeting were agreed.

3. Declarations of interest

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes and the Decision of the Executive Director implementing this Policy regarding Declarations of Interests, EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of interest and the Specific Declaration of interest filled in by the experts invited for the present meeting. No conflicts of interests related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of interest at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Discussions

The working group discussed the two initial proposals on how to address emerging risks in the fields of biological and chemical hazards. The approach proposed for the biological hazards includes an expert consultation with selected Panels, followed by an expert workshop. It was agreed that a protocol for the expert consultations and for the workshop will be prepared by the working group.

For the chemical hazards the approach is based on the new data sources on chemicals manufactured or imported in the European Union and on the environmental occurrence of chemicals. The proposed procedure makes use in a structured manner of a variety of data produced for different purposes, including those available from the REACH. Overall, the working group agreed with the proposed approach, which was perceived as a major step forward. Moreover, this approach could give a contribution bridging EFSA with other EU agencies involved in REACH.

Considering the scope of the work on chemicals, the SWG identified the need for additional expertise in the working group in the field of software models for predicting persistence and bioaccumulation of chemicals and in molecular modelling, including QSAR approaches. The working group agreed to prepare a revised draft of the initial proposal, taking into account the comments provided during the meeting. The EMRISK secretariat shared with the working group an example of issues identified through the Emerging Risks Exchange Network and the Stakeholders Consultative Group.

5. Next meeting(s)

Tentative dates for 2013 meetings of the SWG:

2013 July 11 (14.00-18.00) – 12 (9.00-13.30), Parma

2013 October 21 (14.00-18.00) – 22 (9.00-16.00), Parma

Emerging Risks Unit

Emerging Risks Unit

Minutes of the 1st Meeting of the Standing Working Group (SWG) on Emerging Risks

Held on 13-14 12 2012, Parma

(Agreed by the WG on 25 02 2013)

Participants

- **Working Group Experts:**

Josef SCHLATTER (chair), Robert LUTTIK, Alberto MANTOVANI, Vittorio SILANO, Patrick du JARDIN, Klaus-Dieter JANY, Arie HAVELAAR, Matthew WRIGHT, David Michael GOTT.

- **EFSA:**

EMRISK Unit: Tobin ROBINSON, Andrea ALTIERI, Arianna CHIUSOLO, Agnes RORTAIS, Tilemachos GOUMPERIS, Maria-Eleni FILIPPITZI.

SCOM Unit: Djien LIEM.

1. Welcome

The Chair and the Head of the EMRISK Unit welcomed the participants. The meeting started with a *tour de table* of the SWG) members and staff of the EMRISK Unit. This SWG includes members from the Panels of BIOHAZ, PPR, GMO, PLH, ANS, CEF, CONTAM, and the SC.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of interest

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes¹ and the Decision of the Executive Director implementing this Policy regarding Declarations of Interests², EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of interest and the Specific Declaration of interest filled in by the experts invited for the present meeting. No conflicts of interests related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of interest at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Discussions

The Secretariat presented the mandate to the SWG and a summary of the work carried out to date in EFSA including the terminology and working definitions related to emerging risk identification. The existing networks with Member States and Stakeholders were also described. The Secretariat presented the procedure for emerging risks identification. This procedure has been tested by the EMRISK Unit in the last years and was recently revised by a dedicated [WG on methodology for Emerging Risk Identification](#).

Considering the wide scope of the mandate of this SWG, it was suggested that the SWG could benefit from additional expertise in the field of human nutrition and epidemiology, as well as on animal health and veterinary epidemiology. To aid the work covering such a broad remit, it was agreed, in the first instance, to create two groups one on emerging chemical risks, and a second on emerging biological risks. Initial tasks for the two groups were proposed.

5. Next meeting(s)

Tentative dates for 2013 meetings of the SWG:

February 25 (14.00-18.00) – 26 (9.00-16.00), Parma

July 11 (14.00-17.30) – 12 (9.00-13.30), Parma

October 21 (14.00-18.00) – 22 (9.00-16.00), Parma

¹ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf>

² <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules.pdf>