



SCIENTIFIC PANEL ON BIOLOGICAL HAZARDS BIOCONTAM UNIT

MINUTES OF THE 4th MEETING OF THE WORKING GROUP ON AN APPLICATION ON AN ALTERNATIVE METHOD ECN TUNNEL COMPOSTING

Teleconference, 27th May 2020

(Agreed 6th June 2020)

Participants

■ Working Group Members:¹

Avelino Alvarez Ordonez

Alessandra De Cesare

Elisabetta Suffredini

Pablo Fernandez Escamez

■ Hearing Experts²:

Not Applicable

■ European Commission and/or Member States representatives:

N/A

■ EFSA:

Biocontam Unit: Katrin Bote, Angel Ortiz Pelaez, Seán Ashe.

■ Others: Not Applicable

¹ Indicate first full name and then surname (John Smith) all throughout the document.

² As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director concerning the selection of members of the Scientific Committee, the Scientific Panels, and the selection of external experts to assist EFSA with its scientific work:

<http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>.

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair opened the meeting and welcomed the members of the working group (WG).

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Group members

No new interests were declared by the WG members.

3. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

The additional information and particle size information submitted by the applicant was reviewed.

4.Any Other Business

There was not any other business.

5. Next meeting(s)

No further WG meeting were planned at this point.



SCIENTIFIC PANEL ON BIOLOGICAL HAZARDS BIOCONTAM UNIT

MINUTES OF THE 3rd MEETING OF THE WORKING GROUP ON AN APPLICATION ON AN ALTERNATIVE METHOD ECN TUNNEL COMPOSTING

Teleconference, 14th April 2020

(Agreed 21st April 2020)

Participants

■ Working Group Members:¹

Avelino Alvarez Ordonez

Alessandra De Cesare

Elisabetta Suffredini

Pablo Fernandez Escamez

■ Hearing Experts²:

Not Applicable

■ European Commission and/or Member States representatives:

N/A

■ EFSA:

Biocontam Unit: Katrin Bote, Angel Ortiz Pelaez, Seán Ashe.

■ Others: Not Applicable

¹ Indicate first full name and then surname (John Smith) all throughout the document.

² As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director concerning the selection of members of the Scientific Committee, the Scientific Panels, and the selection of external experts to assist EFSA with its scientific work:
<http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>.

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair opened the meeting and welcomed the members of the working group (WG).

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Group members

No new interests were declared by the WG members.

3. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

The request for additional information was reviewed and finalised.

The draft opinion was discussed and tasks generated. It was noted that Gale (2002) has been updated in a new paper (WRAP 2017).

4. Any Other Business

There was not any other business.

5. Next meeting(s)

Next Web conference 27th of May (9AM-1PM).



SCIENTIFIC PANEL ON BIOLOGICAL HAZARDS BIOCONTAM UNIT

MINUTES OF THE 2nd MEETING OF THE WORKING GROUP ON AN APPLICATION ON AN ALTERNATIVE METHOD ECN TUNNEL COMPOSTING

Teleconference, 17th March 2020

(Agreed 1st April 2020)

Participants

■ Working Group Members:¹

Avelino Alvarez Ordonez

Alessandra De Cesare

Elisabetta Suffredini

Pablo Fernandez Escamez

■ Hearing Experts²:

Not Applicable

■ European Commission and/or Member States representatives:

Matjaz Klemencic (MK)

■ EFSA:

Biocontam Unit: Katrin Bote, Angel Ortiz Pelaez, Seán Ashe.

■ Others: Not Applicable

¹ Indicate first full name and then surname (John Smith) all throughout the document.

² As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director concerning the selection of members of the Scientific Committee, the Scientific Panels, and the selection of external experts to assist EFSA with its scientific work:

<http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>.

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair opened the meeting and welcomed the members of the working group (WG). The Chair asked whether the ongoing Covid-19 situation might impact on the availability of the members for the WG.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Group members

No new interests were declared by the WG members.

3. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

In relation to the raw material in question: cat. 3 catering waste, garden waste (and bio-waste), the WG decided to continue with the approach agreed during the 1st WG meeting, in that only Cat 3 Catering Waste would be considered by the WG for the assessment. A note of clarification will be placed in the opinion.

The WG will follow the log reductions for bacteria and viruses as specified in Section 2, Chapter 3 of Annex V of R142/2011.

The applicant did not consider any relevant viruses in the application. The WG decided to consult the Biohaz panel as to what approach to take in this regard.

The WG discussed the following topics: heat resistance of the most relevant biological hazards; the tomato seed model; validation studies at national level; methodology of temperature measurement and particle heat penetration during composting.

4. Any Other Business

There was not any other business.

5. Next meeting(s)

Next Web conference 14th of April (2-6 pm).



SCIENTIFIC PANEL ON BIOLOGICAL HAZARDS BIOCONTAM UNIT

MINUTES OF THE 1ST MEETING OF THE WORKING GROUP ON AN APPLICATION ON AN ALTERNATIVE METHOD ECN TUNNEL COMPOSTING

Teleconference, 6 February 2020

(Agreed on 06 February 2020)¹

Participants

■ Working Group Members:²

Avelino Alvarez Ordonez

Alessandra De Cesare

Pablo Fernandez Escamez

■ Hearing Experts³:

Not Applicable

■ European Commission and/or Member States representatives:

Not Applicable

■ EFSA:

Biocontam Unit: Katrin Bote, Angel Ortiz Pelaez, Seán Ashe.

■ Others: Not Applicable

¹ Minutes should be published within 15 working days of the final day of the relevant meeting.

² Indicate first full name and then surname (John Smith) all throughout the document.

³ As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director concerning the selection of members of the Scientific Committee, the Scientific Panels, and the selection of external experts to assist EFSA with its scientific work:
<http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>.

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Group members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence⁴ and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management⁵, EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting.

For further details on the outcome of the screening of the Annual Declarations of Interest, please refer to the Annex. Oral Declaration(s) of Interest were asked at the beginning of the meeting and no additional interest was declared.

3. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

The Working Group assessed the application and it was deemed to be complete. The WG decided to evaluate only the Cat 3 ABP component of the material to be treated, as per Article 20 of EU Reg 1069/2009. The methodological approach for the assessment was discussed and it was agreed to assess the proposed methods of composting Cat. 3 catering waste against the micro-biological reduction criteria as specified in Annex V Chapter 3 Section 2 of EU Regulation 142/2011. Tasks were allocated to EFSA staff and WG experts.

4. Any Other Business

There was not any other business.

5. Next meeting(s)

The next meeting will be on the 17th of March 2020 in EFSA.

⁴ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

⁵ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf

Annex

Interests and actions resulting from the screening of Annual Declarations of Interest (ADoI)

CONFLICT OF INTEREST: In the Annual Declaration of Interest filled by Dr John Griffin, the following interest has been declared: Dr John Griffin was, until February 2019, the Head of the TSE and Animal By-Products Veterinary Division in the Department of Agriculture, Food and the Marine in Ireland, and this Division was responsible for the implementation of the measures set out in EU Regulation 1069/2009 for the control of animal by-products. This constitutes a Conflict of Interest (CoI) with the mandate of the EFSA Working Group in hand. In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence⁶ and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management⁷, and taking into account the specific matters discussed at the meeting in question, a waiver was granted in accordance with Article 21 of the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management.

Pursuant to Article 21(6) of the above-mentioned Decision, the concerned expert was initially allowed to attend the meeting and take part in the discussion and in the drafting phase of the EFSA Scientific Opinion *An application on an alternative method ECN tunnel composting*, and has not been allowed to be, or act as, a chairman, a vice-chairman or rapporteur of the Working Group.

However, before this meeting, Dr John Griffin submitted an update of his Annual Declaration of Interests, declaring the following interest: in March 2019, Dr. John Griffin reviewed and provided some comments to the draft application to EFSA proposing an alternative standard for the composting of catering waste, under current assessment. In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence⁸ and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management⁹, and taking into account the specific matters discussed at the meeting in question, the interest above was deemed to represent a Conflict of Interest (CoI). Therefore the expert did not attend the meeting, and this results in the exclusion of the expert from any discussion, voting or other involvement by the concerned scientific group.

⁶ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

⁷ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf

⁸ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

⁹ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf