

Scientific Panel on Biological Hazards

Minutes of the 6th meeting of the Working Group on a “request for a scientific opinion on Bovine Spongiform Encephalopathy (BSE) cases born after the total feed ban”

Web-conference on 18 May 2017

(Agreed on 22 May 2017)¹

Participants

- **Working Group Members:**

Amie Adkin, Christian Ducrot, John Griffin, Giuseppe Ru (Chair),
Marion Simmons

- **EFSA:**

BIOCONTAM Unit: Angel Ortiz Pelaez, Pietro Stella, Francesca
Latronico

- **Others:**

N/A

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants. Aline de Koeijer sent apologies.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without a change.

¹ The publication of the minutes shall be made without delay in compliance with the Founding Regulation and no later than 15 working days following the day of their agreement.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes² and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest³, EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the working group members invited for the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Scientific topic(s) for discussion⁴

The draft of the answer to ToR2 was finalised. An extra paragraph was discussed and added to ToR2 explaining the concept of spontaneous disease and putting into context the results of the back-calculation models as in section 3.7. Since this is the last meeting and there was no time left, the Chair asked WG members to submit contributions for the sections on uncertainty and recommendations. Consolidated draft opinion will be circulated for final revision before it is submitted for adoption.

5. Next meeting(s)

The Chair thanked the work of the WG members during the mandate. No other points for discussion were raised. The Chair closed the meeting.

² <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf>

³ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>

⁴ <http://registerofquestions.efsa.europa.eu/roqFrontend/questionLoader?question=EFSA-Q-2016-00350>

Scientific Panel on Biological Hazards

Minutes of the 5th meeting of the Working Group on a “request for a scientific opinion on Bovine Spongiform Encephalopathy (BSE) cases born after the total feed ban”

Web-conference on 15 May 2017

(Agreed on 22 May 2017)¹

Participants

- **Working Group Members:**

Amie Adkin, Aline de Koeijer, Christian Ducrot, John Griffin, Giuseppe Ru (Chair), Marion Simmons

- **EFSA:**

BIOCONTAM Unit: Angel Ortiz Pelaez

- **Others:**

N/A

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without a change.

¹ The publication of the minutes shall be made without delay in compliance with the Founding Regulation and no later than 15 working days following the day of their agreement.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes² and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest³, EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the working group members invited for the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Scientific topic(s) for discussion⁴

The Chair provided feedback of the comments made by BIOHAZ Panel members during the thorough reading at the last plenary. The opinion was well received and no major issues were raised. The Secretariat informed that two Panel members sent comments mostly editorial by email or handwritten. The Chair reviewed the changes in the layout and structure of the opinion following the contributions of WG members after the previous meeting. The concluding remarks and answers to the ToRs were reviewed in depth. It was decided to merge concluding remarks with the answers to the ToRs and make these longer. The answer to ToR1 was finalised and there was insufficient time left to review the answers to the ToR2 that was only reviewed partially.

5. Next meeting(s)

Due to the lack of time to discuss and agree final draft of the answer to ToR2, the chair asked the Secretariat if an extra webconference could be organized to finalise the opinion. The secretariat would inform if this is approved and will circulate time slots.

² <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf>

³ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>

⁴ <http://registerofquestions.efsa.europa.eu/roqFrontend/questionLoader?question=EFSA-Q-2016-00350>

Scientific Panel on Biological Hazards

Minutes of the 4th meeting of the Working Group on a "request for a scientific opinion on Bovine Spongiform Encephalopathy (BSE) cases born after the total feed ban"

Held on 7 April 2017, Parma (IT)

(Agreed on 12 April 2017)¹

Participants

- **Working Group Members:**

Amie Adkin, Christian Ducrot, John Griffin, Giuseppe Ru (Chair),
Marion Simmons

- **EFSA:**

BIOCONTAM Unit: Angel Ortiz Pelaez, Pietro Stella

- **Others:**

N/A

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants. Aline A. de Koeijer did not send apologies.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without a change.

¹ The publication of the minutes shall be made without delay in compliance with the Founding Regulation and no later than 15 working days following the day of their agreement.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes² and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest³, EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the working group members invited for the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Scientific topic(s) for discussion⁴

The list of actions agreed on the previous meeting and the state of the draft scientific opinion was reviewed by the Secretariat and discussed by the WG. The chair briefed to the WG on the feedback provided by the BIOHAZ panel during the first reading. The Data and Methodology sections were reviewed and minor additions and modifications were agreed. The descriptive and analytical sections of the assessment went into a thorough review. The theoretical framework set out to analyse the possible origin of each individual BARB case using the information and data from the questionnaire survey was discussed in depth again including the decision rules and a final decision on how to apply it was made. The application of the Bradford-Hill criteria was not pursued and a paragraph will be added to the opinion instead. Supporting sections of the assessment like the review of the FVO reports, the traceability of ingredients for livestock feed production and the analysis of the surveillance data were reviewed. The drafts of the answers to the ToRs were reviewed and some modifications were made.

5. Next meeting(s)

The date for the 5th WG meeting was not decided but it was agreed to have it in mid-May. In principle it will be a web-conference, as originally planned. The Secretariat will circulate a poll to fix the date.

² <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf>

³ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>

⁴ <http://registerofquestions.efsa.europa.eu/roqFrontend/questionLoader?question=EFSA-Q-2016-00350>

Scientific Panel on Biological Hazards

Minutes of the 3rd meeting of the Working Group on a "request for a scientific opinion on Bovine Spongiform Encephalopathy (BSE) cases born after the total feed ban"

Held on 7 March 2017, London (UK)

(Agreed on 17 March 2017)¹

Participants

- **Working Group Members:**

Amie Adkin, Christian Ducrot, John Griffin, Aline A. de Koeijer (pm),
Giuseppe Ru (Chair), Marion Simmons

- **EFSA:**

BIOCONTAM Unit: Angel Ortiz Pelaez

- **Others:**

N/A

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants. No apologies for absence. Aline A. de Koeijer only attended the afternoon session.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted with a change. Point 7 ("*Breakout groups (2): Draft answers to ToR 1 and Tor2 and recommendations*"), and Point 8 ("*Review drafts from breakout groups*") of the draft agenda were merged into Point 7: "*Draft answers to ToR 1 and Tor2*") in the final one.

¹ The publication of the minutes shall be made without delay in compliance with the Founding Regulation and no later than 15 working days following the day of their agreement.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes² and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest³, EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the working group members invited for the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Scientific topic(s) for discussion⁴

The list of actions agreed on the previous meeting and the state of the draft scientific opinion was reviewed by the Secretariat and discussed by the WG. The Data and Methodology sections were reviewed and some additions and modifications were agreed. The descriptive and analytical sections of the assessment went into a thorough review. The theoretical framework set out to analyse the possible origin of each individual BARB case using the information and data from the questionnaire survey was discussed in depth and a final decision on how to apply it was made. The evidence from quantitative analyses was also reviewed including a new section of the power of surveillance at both aggregated and individual country levels. Supporting agreed sections of the assessment like the review of the FVO reports on the implementation of the feed ban and the description of the different hypotheses of origin of BSE were finalised. First draft of the answers to the ToRs was produced.

5. Next meeting(s)

The 4th WG meeting had been set on 7 April 2017 as a physical meeting, Parma (Italy). Upon the request of the WG members, the Secretariat will explore the possibility to have that meeting in Brussels.

² <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf>

³ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>

⁴ <http://registerofquestions.efsa.europa.eu/roqFrontend/questionLoader?question=EFSA-Q-2016-00350>

Scientific Panel on Biological Hazards

Minutes of the 2nd meeting of the Working Group on a “request for a scientific opinion on Bovine Spongiform Encephalopathy (BSE) cases born after the total feed ban”

Held on 1-2 December 2016, Parma (Italy)

(Agreed on 13 December 2016)¹

Participants

- **Working Group Members:**

Amie Adkin, Christian Ducrot, John Griffin, Aline A. de Koeijer,
Giuseppe Ru (Chair), Marion Simmons

- **EFSA:**

BIOCONTAM Unit: Francesca Latronico (Day 2), Angel Ortiz Pelaez

- **Others:**

N/A

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants. No apologies for absence.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without any changes.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

¹ The publication of the minutes shall be made without delay in compliance with the Founding Regulation and no later than 15 working days following the day of their agreement.

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes² and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest³, EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the working group members invited for the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Scientific topic(s) for discussion⁴

The WG discussed the use of the outputs of the literature review and the questionnaire survey to the 11 concerned MS to address the ToRs. A summary of the results of the questionnaire survey to concerned MS was presented by the Secretariat. Analytical approaches of surveillance and qualitative data were discussed, including the presentation of the modelling the decline of BSE in EU member states by Amie Adkin that will be used as part of the scientific evidence to answer the ToRs. Additional analyses will include comparison of the power of surveillance within the group of concerned member states and between member states with/without BSE BARB. Supporting agreed actions included the review of the FVO reports on the implementation of the feed ban and the description of the different hypotheses of origin of BSE. The work plan for 2017 was discussed and agreed.

5. Next meeting(s)

3rd WG meeting: 7 March 2017. The Secretariat will explore the possibility to have a physical meeting in London. Date for the 4th WG meeting will be agreed. Provisionally it was fixed for 7 April 2017, as a physical meeting, Parma (Italy).

² <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf>

³ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>

⁴ <http://registerofquestions.efsa.europa.eu/roqFrontend/questionLoader?question=EFSA-Q-2016-00350>

Scientific Panel on Biological Hazards

Minutes of the 1st meeting of the Working Group on a “request for a scientific opinion on Bovine Spongiform Encephalopathy (BSE) cases born after the total feed ban”

Held on 6 September 2016, Brussels (Belgium)

(Agreed on 12 September 2016)¹

Participants

- **Working Group Members:**

Christian Ducrot, John Griffin, Aline A. de Koeijer, Giuseppe Ru (Chair), Marion Simmons (MS)

- **EFSA:**

BIOCONTAM Unit: Angel Ortiz Pelaez

- **Others:**

Lucie Carrouée-Pook (LCP) (DG SANTE G4)

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants. Apologies were received from Amie Adkin.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without any changes.

¹ The publication of the minutes shall be made without delay in compliance with the Founding Regulation and no later than 15 working days following the day of their agreement.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes² and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest³, EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the working group members invited for the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

4.1. Mandate and Terms of reference ⁴

The chair introduced the mandate received from the European Commission (EC) and terms of reference (ToRs). The EC representative provided additional background on the mandate.

4.2. Terms of reference: discussion

The WG discussed in detail the mandate and each of the ToRs, with the aim to have a common understanding of the questions to be answered. It was considered necessary to collect individual information for each case from the concerned MS in order to address the ToRs.

4.3. Scope and methodology of the evaluation

The WG discussed the methodological approaches that will be adopted for each of the three ToRs. A questionnaire survey delivered to the concerned MS and the analysis already done by one WG member were thoroughly discussed.

5. Any Other Business

Not Applicable

6. Next meeting(s)

2nd WG meeting: 1 December pm and 2 December am. 2016. Physical meeting, Parma (Italy)

² <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf>

³ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>

⁴ <http://registerofquestions.efsa.europa.eu/roqFrontend/questionLoader?question=EFSA-Q-2016-00350>