



SCIENTIFIC PANEL ON ADDITIVES AND PRODUCTS OR SUBSTANCES USED IN ANIMAL FEED UNIT

MINUTES OF THE 119TH MEETING OF THE WORKING GROUP ON

FEED FLAVOURINGS

Held on 26-27 March 2019, Parma

(Agreed on 27 March 2019)

Participants

■ Working Group Members:

Maria de Lourdes Bastos, Andrew Chesson, Birgit Dusemund and Johannes Westendorf.
Paul Brantom attended on both days via web conference.

■ Hearing Experts:

Not Applicable

■ European Commission and/or Member States representatives:

Not Applicable

■ EFSA:

FEED Unit: Lucilla Gregoretti and Paola Manini

■ Others:

Not Applicable

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

EFSA welcomed the participants.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members



In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence¹ and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management², EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

- 4.1. The Working Group continued the discussion on the application Macleaya cordata extract for all animal species (EFSA-Q-2010-01066) and decided to present the draft opinion, modified accordingly, to the plenary meeting.
- 4.2. The Working Group continued the discussion on the application Mugwort tincture for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2011-00181](#)) and decided to present the draft opinion, modified accordingly, to the plenary meeting.
- 4.3. The Working Group continued the discussion on the application Great mullein tincture for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2011-00146](#)) and decided to present the draft opinion, modified accordingly, to the plenary meeting.
- 4.4. The Working Group continued the discussion on the application Melissa officinalis dry extract all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2010-01311](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 4.5. The Working Group continued the discussion on the application Botanically defined flavourings from Botanical Group 09 - Zingiberales: ginger oil, ginger oleoresin, ginger tincture and ginger extract from Zingiber officinale Rosc ([EFSA-Q-2017-00533](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 4.6. The Working Group continued the discussion on the application Botanically defined flavourings from Botanical Group 08 – Sapindales for all animal species and categories ([EFSA-Q-2010-01517](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 4.7. The following item was not discussed: Primary Smoke Condensate-Smoke Flavouring for cats and dogs ([EFSA-Q-2013-01029](#))

5. Any Other Business

- 5.1. Not Applicable

6. Next meeting

10 May 2019

¹ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

² http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf



SCIENTIFIC PANEL ON ADDITIVES AND PRODUCTS OR SUBSTANCES USED IN ANIMAL FEED UNIT

MINUTES OF THE 118TH MEETING OF THE WORKING GROUP ON FEED FLAVOURINGS

Held on 28 February 2019, Parma

(Agreed on 28 February 2018)

Participants

- Working Group Members:
Maria de Lourdes Bastos and Birgit Dusemund
Andrew Chesson and Johannes Westendorf have participated via teleconference
- Hearing Experts¹:
Gabriele Aquilina, Diane Benford, Claudia Bolognesi, Rainer Gürtler and Josef Schlatter
- European Commission and/or Member States representatives:
Miguel-Angel Granero-Rosell
- EFSA:
FEED Unit: Paola Manini, Maria Vittoria Vettori and Frank Verdonck
FIP Unit: Maria Carfi, Carla Martino and Camilla Smeraldi
SCER Unit: Daniela Maurici
- Others:

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants. Apologies were received from Francesca Marcon.

¹ As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director concerning the selection of members of the Scientific Committee, the Scientific Panels, and the selection of external experts to assist EFSA with its scientific work:
<http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>.



2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence² and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management³, EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Hearing Experts⁴

Gabriele Aquilina, Diane Benford, Claudia Bolognesi, Francesca Marcon, Rainer Gürtler and Josef Schlatter were invited to present their view for item 5.1 of the present meeting.

5. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

- 5.1. The Working Group continued the discussion on the application Primary Smoke Condensate-Smoke Flavouring for cats and dogs ([EFSA-Q-2013-01029](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.**

6. Any Other Business

- 6.1. Not Applicable**

7. Next meeting

26-27 March 2019.

² http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

³ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf



SCIENTIFIC PANEL ON ADDITIVES AND PRODUCTS OR SUBSTANCES USED IN ANIMAL FEED

MINUTES OF THE 117th MEETING OF THE WORKING GROUP ON FEED FLAVOURINGS

TELE-conference, 15 February 2019

(Agreed on 15 February 2019)

Participants

- Working Group Members:
Maria de Lourdes Bastos, Paul Brantom, Andrew Chesson, Birgit Dusemund and Johannes Westendorf
- Hearing Experts¹:
Not Applicable
- European Commission and/or Member States representatives:
Not Applicable
- EFSA:
Feed Unit: Lucilla Gregoretti and Paola Manini
- Others:
Not Applicable

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

EFSA welcomed the participants.

¹ As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director concerning the selection of members of the Scientific Committee, the Scientific Panels, and the selection of external experts to assist EFSA with its scientific work:
<http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>.



2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence² and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management³, EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

- 4.1. **The Working Group continued its discussion on the application on *Macleaya cordata* extract for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2010-01066](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.**
- 4.2. **The Working Group discussed the application on *Mugwort* tincture for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2011-00181](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.**
- 4.3. **The Working Group continued its discussion on the application on great mullein tincture for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2011-00146](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.**
- 4.4. **Botanically defined flavourings from Botanical Group 18 - Gymnosperms (Coniferales, Ginkgoales) for all animal species and categories ([EFSA-Q-2010-01516](#)) and decided to inform the applicant on issues that required clarification.**
- 4.5. **Chemically defined flavourings from Flavouring Group 03 - Alfa, beta-unsaturated (alkene or alkyne) straight-chain and branched-chain aliphatic primary alcohols/aldehydes/acids, acetals and esters with esters containing alfa, beta-unsaturated alcohol and acetal containing alfa, beta-unsaturated alcohols or aldehydes: hex-2-en-1-ol [02.020], nona-2,6-dien-1-ol [02.049], pent-2-en-1-ol [02.050], non-2(cis)-en-1-ol [02.112], tr-2, cis-6-nonadien-1-ol [02.231], 2-dodecenal [05.037], nona-2(trans),6(cis)-dial [05.058], nona-2,4-dial [05.071], trans-2-nonenal [05.072], hex-2(trans)-enal [05.073], 2,4-decadienal [05.081], 2,4-heptadienal, hepta-2,4-dial [05.058], deca-2(trans),4(trans)-dial [05.140], dodec-2(trans)-enal [05.144], hept-2(trans)-enal [05.150], non-2-enal [05.171], nona-2(trans),6(trans)-dial [05.172], undec-2(trans)-enal [05.184], trans-2-octenal [05.190], trans-2-decenal [05.191], tr-2, tr-4-nonadienal [05.194], tr-2, tr-4-undecadienal [05.196], allyl heptanoate [09.097], allyl hexanoate [09.244], hex-2(trans)-enyl acetate [09.394] and hex-2-enyl**

² http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

³ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf



butyrate [09.396] for all animal species and categories ([EFSA-Q-2016-00344](#)) and decided to present the draft opinion, modified accordingly, to the plenary meeting.

5. Any Other Business

5.1. Not Applicable

6. Next meeting(s)

28 February 2019

Scientific Panel on Additives and Products or Substances Used in Animal Feed

Minutes of the 116th meeting of the Working Group on Feed Flavourings

Tele-web conference, 29 January 2019

(Agreed on 29 January 2019)

Participants

- **Working Group Members:**

Maria de Lourdes Bastos, Paul Brantom, Andrew Chesson, Birgit Dusemund and Johannes Westendorf

- **Hearing Experts:¹**

Not Applicable.

- **European Commission and/or Member States representatives:**

Not Applicable.

- **EFSA:**

FEED Unit: Lucilla Gregoretti and Paola Manini

- **Others:**

Not Applicable.

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair of the Working Group welcomed the participants.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

¹ As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director concerning the selection of members of the Scientific Committee, the Scientific Panels, and the selection of external experts to assist EFSA with its scientific work: <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Group members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence² and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management³, EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Scientific topics for discussion

- 4.1. The Working Group continued the discussion on the application on botanically defined flavourings from Botanical Group 09 - Zingiberales: ginger oil, ginger oleoresin, ginger tincture and ginger extract from *Zingiber officinale* Rosc ([EFSA-Q-2017-00533](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 4.2. The Working Group continued its discussion on chemically defined flavourings for use in cats and dogs from different chemical groups ([EFSA-Q-2018-00123](#)) and decided to present the draft opinion, modified accordingly, to the plenary meeting.
- 4.3. The Working Group continued its discussion on the application on Primary Smoke Condensate-Smoke Flavouring for cats and dogs ([EFSA-Q-2013-01029](#)) and decided to present the draft opinion, modified accordingly, to the plenary meeting.
- 4.4. The Working Group continued its discussion on the application on *Macleaya cordata* extract for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2010-01066](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 4.5. The Working Group discussed the application on *Mugwort* tincture for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2011-00181](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 4.6. The Working Group continued its discussion on the application on great mullein tincture for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2011-00146](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.

² http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

³ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf

5. Any Other Business

Not Applicable

6. Next meeting

15 February 2019 (web conference)

Scientific Panel on Additives and Products or Substances Used in Animal Feed

Minutes of the 115th meeting of the Working Group on Feed Flavourings

Tele-web conference, 8 January 2019

(Agreed on 8 January 2019)

Participants

- **Working Group Members:**

Maria de Lourdes Bastos, Paul Brantom, Andrew Chesson, Birgit Dusemund and Johannes Westendorf

- **Hearing Experts:¹**

Not Applicable.

- **European Commission and/or Member States representatives:**

Not Applicable.

- **EFSA:**

FEED Unit: Lucilla Gregoretti and Paola Manini

- **Others:**

Not Applicable.

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair of the Working Group welcomed the participants.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

¹ As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director concerning the selection of members of the Scientific Committee, the Scientific Panels, and the selection of external experts to assist EFSA with its scientific work: <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Group members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence² and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management³, EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Scientific topics for discussion

- 4.1. The Working Group continued the discussion on the application on Primary Smoke Condensate-Smoke Flavouring for cats and dogs ([EFSA-Q-2013-01029](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 4.2. The Working Group continued its discussion on Oil of *Origanum vulgare* L. subsp. *Hirtum* for poultry ([EFSA-Q-2018-00121](#)) and decided to present the draft opinion, modified accordingly, to the plenary meeting.
- 4.3. The Working Group continued its discussion on the application on *Macleaya cordata* extract for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2010-01066](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 4.4. The Working Group continued its discussion on the application on Oregano oil for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2018-00122](#)) and decided to present the draft opinion, modified accordingly, to the plenary meeting.
- 4.5. The Working Group discussed the application on Botanically defined flavourings from Botanical Group 06 - Laurales, Magnoliales, Piperales for all animal species and categories ([EFSA-Q-2010-01296](#)) and decided to inform the applicant on issues that required clarification.
- 4.6. The following item was not discussed: Botanically defined flavourings from Botanical Group 09 - Zingiberales: ginger oil, ginger oleoresin, ginger tincture and ginger extract from *Zingiber officinale* Rosc ([EFSA-Q-2017-00533](#)), Chemically

² http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

³ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf

defined flavourings for use in cats and dogs from different chemical groups ([EFSA-Q-2018-00123](#)).

5. Any Other Business

Not Applicable

6. Next meeting

29 January 2019

Scientific Panel on Additives and Products or Substances Used in Animal Feed

Minutes of the 114th meeting of the Working Group on Feed Flavourings

Tele-web conference, 03 December 2018

(Agreed on 03 December 2018)

Participants

- **Working Group Members:**

Maria de Lourdes Bastos, Paul Brantom, Andrew Chesson, Birgit Dusemund and Johannes Westendorf

- **Hearing Experts:¹**

Not Applicable.

- **European Commission and/or Member States representatives:**

Not Applicable.

- **EFSA:**

FEED Unit: Lucilla Gregoretti and Paola Manini

- **Others:**

Not Applicable.

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair of the Working Group welcomed the participants.

2. Adoption of agenda

¹ As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director concerning the selection of members of the Scientific Committee, the Scientific Panels, and the selection of external experts to assist EFSA with its scientific work: <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>.

The agenda was adopted with changes. The following item was not discussed *Macleaya cordata* extract for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2010-01066](#)).

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Group members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence² and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management³, EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Scientific topics for discussion

- 4.1. The Working Group continued the discussion on the application, Botanically defined flavourings from Botanical Group 09 - Zingiberales: ginger oil, ginger oleoresin, ginger tincture and ginger extract from *Zingiber officinale* Rosc ([EFSA-Q-2017-00533](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 4.2. The Working Group continued the discussion on the application on Primary Smoke Condensate-Smoke Flavouring for cats and dogs ([EFSA-Q-2013-01029](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 4.3. The Working Group continued its discussion on Oil of *Origanum vulgare* L. subsp. *Hirtum* for poultry ([EFSA-Q-2018-00121](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 4.4. The Working Group continued its discussion on *Melissa officinalis* dry extract for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2010-01311](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 4.5. The Working Group discussed the application on Chemically defined flavourings for use in cats and dogs from different chemical groups ([EFSA-Q-2018-00123](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.

5. Any Other Business

Not Applicable

² http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

³ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf

6. Next meeting

8 January 2019

Scientific Panel on Additives and Products or Substances Used in Animal Feed

Minutes of the 113th meeting of the Working Group on Feed Flavourings

Tele-web conference, 07 November 2018

(Agreed on 07 November 2018)

Participants

- **Working Group Members:**

Maria de Lourdes Bastos, Paul Brantom, Andrew Chesson, Birgit Dusemund and Johannes Westendorf

- **Hearing Experts:¹**

Not Applicable.

- **European Commission and/or Member States representatives:**

Not Applicable.

- **EFSA:**

FEED Unit: Lucilla Gregoretti and Paola Manini

- **Others:**

Not Applicable.

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Group members

¹ As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director concerning the selection of members of the Scientific Committee, the Scientific Panels, and the selection of external experts to assist EFSA with its scientific work: <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>.

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence² and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management³, EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Agreement of the minutes of the 112nd Working Group meeting held on 19 October 2018, Tele web-conference.

The minutes of the 112nd Working Group meeting held on 19 October 2018 were agreed on the same day⁴.

5. Scientific Topics for discussion

- 5.1.** The Working Group continued the discussion on the application on Botanically defined flavourings from Botanical Group 09 - Zingiberales: cardamom oil from *Elettaria cardamomum* (L.) Maton for all animal species and categories ([EFSA-Q-2010-01293](#)) and decided to present it, modified accordingly, at the plenary meeting.
- 5.2.** The Working Group continued its discussion on Chemically defined flavourings from Chemical Group 20 - aliphatic and aromatic mono- and di-thiols and mono-, di-, tri-, and polysulphides with or without additional oxygenated functional groups when used as flavourings: 8-mercapto-p-methan-3-one [12.038], p-menth-1-ene-8-thiol [12.085] for all animal species and categories ([EFSA-Q-2013-00325](#)) and decided to present the draft document, modified accordingly, to the plenary meeting.
- 5.3.** The Working Group continued its discussion on Chemically defined flavourings from Flavouring Group 03 - Alpha, beta-unsaturated (alkene or alkyne) straight-chain and branched-chain aliphatic primary alcohols/aldehydes/acids, acetals and esters with esters containing alpha, beta-unsaturated alcohol and acetal containing alpha, beta-unsaturated alcohols or aldehydes: hex-2-en-1-ol [02.020], nona-2,6-dien-1-ol [02.049], pent-2-en-1-ol [02.050], non-2(cis)-en-1-ol [02.112], tr-2, cis-6-nonadien-1-ol [02.231], 2-dodecenal [05.037], nona-2(trans),6(cis)-dienal [05.058], nona-2,4-dienal [05.071], trans-2-nonenal [05.072], hex-2(trans)-enal [05.073], 2,4-decadienal [05.081], 2,4-

² http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

³ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf

⁴ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/wgs/animal-feed/feedapfeedflavourings20152018.pdf>

heptadienal, hepta-2,4-dienal [05.058], deca-2(trans),4(trans)-dienal [05.140], dodec-2(trans)-enal [05.144], hept-2(trans)-enal [05.150], non-2-enal [05.171], nona-2(trans),6(trans)-dienal [05.172], undec-2(trans)-enal [05.184], trans-2-octenal [05.190], trans-2-decenal [05.191], tr-2, tr-4-nonadienal [05.194], tr-2, tr-4-undecadienal [05.196], allyl heptanoate [09.097], allyl hexanoate [09.244], hex-2(trans)-enyl acetate [09.394] and hex-2-enyl butyrate [09.396] for all animal species and categories ([EFSA-Q-2016-00344](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.

5.4. The Working Group discussed the application on Oregano oil for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2018-00122](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.

5.5. The following item was not discussed: Botanically defined flavourings from Botanical Group 09 - Zingiberales: ginger oil, ginger oleoresin, ginger tincture and ginger extract from *Zingiber officinale* Rosc ([EFSA-Q-2017-00533](#)).

6. Any Other Business

Not applicable

7. Next meeting

3 December 2018