

Scientific Panel on Additives and Products or Substances Used in Animal Feed

Minutes of the 8th meeting of the Working Group on Revision of Maximum Content of Copper in Feed

Tele-web conference, 30 June 2016

(Agreed by written procedure on 7 July 2016)

Participants

- **Working Group Members:**

Noël Dierick, Christer Hogstrand, Jürgen Gropp¹ (Chair), Anne-Katrine Lundebye, Marta López Alonso, Alena Pechova and Hanne Damgaard Poulsen.

- **Hearing Experts:²**

Not Applicable.

- **European Commission and/or Member States representatives:**

Not Applicable.

- **EFSA:**

FEED Unit: Gloria López-Gálvez

- **Others:**

Not Applicable.

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants. Apologies were received from Peter Aggett.

2. Declarations of Interest of Working Group members

¹ Attended in Parma physically

² As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director on the selection of external experts:
<http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes³ and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest,⁴ EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the working group members invited for the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

3. Agreement of the minutes of the 7th Working Group meeting held on 6-8 June 2016, Parma.

The minutes of the of the 7th Working Group meeting were agreed per written procedure on 23/06/2016.⁵

4. Hearing Expert(s)

Not Applicable

5. Scientific topic for discussion

The draft opinion on "Revision of Maximum Content of Copper in Feed". ([EFSA-Q-2015-00435](http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/EFSA-Q-2015-00435)) was discussed. The experts revised various parts of the opinion, in connection with the comments posted during the review process. The recently available data on compound feed production during 2015 in the EU were considered. Additionally, the following chapters were finalised: abstract, summary, conclusions and recommendations, remark. The WG agreed that the draft opinion was finalised and decided to present it, modified accordingly, to the FEEDAP Plenary meeting.

6. Any Other Business

Not Applicable

7. Next meeting

Not Applicable

³ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf>

⁴ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>

⁵ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/wqcopperinfeed.pdf>

Scientific Panel on Additives and Products or Substances Used in Animal Feed

Minutes of the 7th meeting of the Working Group on Revision of Maximum Content of Copper in Feed

Held on 8-10 June 2016, Parma¹

(Agreed by written procedure on 23 June 2016)

Participants

- **Working Group Members:**

Peter Aggett, Noël Dierick, Jürgen Gropp (Chair), Christer Hogstrand,² Marta López Alonso, Anne-Katrine Lundebye,³ Alena Pechova and Hanne Damgaard Poulsen.

- **Hearing Experts:⁴**

Not Applicable.

- **European Commission and/or Member States representatives:**

Marta Ponghellini, Wolfgang Trunk.⁵

- **EFSA:**

FEED Unit: Gloria López-Gálvez

Advisory Forum and Scientific Cooperation Unit: Karen Wong Yoke Sim⁶

- **Others:**

Not Applicable.

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

¹ The meeting continued with a follow-up meeting on 20 June (Audio-Web) in which only the relevant experts involved in the discussions were invited: Peter Aggett, Noël Dierick, Jürgen Gropp (Chair), Christer Hogstrand (apologies), Marta López Alonso and Hanne D. Poulsen (apologies).

² Present on 9th June

³ Present on 8th and 9th June. By tele-conference on 10th June

⁴ As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director on the selection of external experts: <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>

⁵ EC representatives participated by telephone conference on the 10th June

⁶ Present on 8th June

2. Declarations of Interest of Working Group members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes⁷ and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest,⁸ EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the working group members invited for the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

3. Agreement of the minutes of the 6th Working Group meeting held on 13 May 2016, Tele-web conference.

The minutes of the of the 6th Working Group meeting were agreed per written procedure on 20/05/2016.⁹

4. Hearing Expert(s)

Not Applicable

5. Scientific topic for discussion

The draft opinion on "Revision of Maximum Content of Copper in Feed". ([EFSA-Q-2015-00435](http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf)) was discussed. Discussions included the review of: (i) copper in animal nutrition (requirements, deficiency, tolerance and other uses of copper), (ii) copper availability and interactions, (iii) copper intake and effect on gut microbiota profile, and (v) data concerning the copper monitoring activities from Member States and European countries. A proposal for modification of some of the current maximum levels of copper in feed was discussed. The consequences of the potentially newly proposed levels on the health and welfare of target animals, on the consumer supply and on the environmental load were also discussed. A section on copper in food from animal products will also be included in the draft opinion.

6. Any Other Business

Not Applicable

7. Next meeting

30 June 2016

⁷ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf>

⁸ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>

⁹ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/wqccopperinfeed.pdf>

Scientific Panel on Additives and Products or Substances Used in Animal Feed

Minutes of the 6th meeting of the Working Group on Revision of Maximum Content of Copper in Feed

Tele-web conference, 13 May 2016

(Agreed by written procedure on 20 May 2016)

Participants

- **Working Group Members:**

Peter Aggett, Noël Dierick, Christer Hogstrand, Jürgen Gropp (Chair), Anne-Katrine Lundebye, Marta López Alonso, Alena Pechova and Hanne Damgaard Poulsen.

- **Hearing Experts:**¹

Mr Brian Curtin.

- **European Commission and/or Member States representatives:**

Not Applicable.

- **EFSA:**

FEED Unit: Gloria López-Gálvez

- **Others:**

Not Applicable.

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

2. Declarations of Interest of Working Group members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes² and the Decision of the Executive Director on

¹ As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director on the selection of external experts: <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>

² <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf>

Declarations of Interest,³ EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the working group members invited for the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

3. Agreement of the minutes of the 5th Working Group meeting held on 6-8/04/2016, Parma.

The minutes of the of the 5th Working Group meeting were agreed per written procedure 17/05/2016.⁴

4. Hearing Expert(s)

Dr Brian Curtain was invited to present his views for specific aspects of item 5 of the agenda. In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes⁵ and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest,⁶ EFSA invited Dr Curtain to submit an Annual Declaration of Interest. His participation was limited to providing testimony, without the possibility to take on any role undertaken by members of the Panel, in accordance with the applicable legal framework.⁷

5. Scientific topic for discussion

The draft opinion on "Revision of Maximum Content of Copper in Feed". ([EFSA-Q-2015-00435](#)) was discussed. The discussions focused mainly on the proposals and options for maximum copper contents in complete feed. The outcome of the statistical evaluation of the data concerning the copper monitoring activities from Member States and other European countries was revised.

6. Any Other Business

Not Applicable

7. Next meeting

³ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>

⁴ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/wqcopperinfeed.pdf>

⁵ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf>

⁶ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>

⁷ Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest:
<http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>

8-10 June 2016

Scientific Panel on Additives and Products or Substances Used in Animal Feed

Minutes of the 5th meeting of the Working Group on Revision of Maximum Content of Copper in Feed

Held on 6-8 April 2016,¹ Parma

(Agreed by written procedure on 17 May 2016)

Participants

- **Working Group Members:**

Peter Aggett, Noël Dierick, Christer Hogstrand, Jürgen Gropp (Chair), Anne-Katrine Lundebye, Marta López Alonso, Alena Pechova and Hanne Damgaard Poulsen

Noël Dierick and Anne-Katrine Lundebye² have participated via teleconference

- **Hearing Experts:**³

Mr Paul Toplis.

- **European Commission and/or Member States representatives:**

Not Applicable.

- **EFSA:**

FEED Unit: Frida Edman, Gloria López-Gálvez and Oriol Ribó

- **Others:**

Not Applicable.

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

¹ The meeting continued with follow-up meetings on the 22 April and 3 May in which only the relevant experts involved in the discussions were invited (Noël Dierick, Jürgen Gropp (Chair), Christer Hogstrand, Anne-Katrine Lundebye, Marta López Alonso, Alena Pechova and Hanne D. Poulsen)

² Present on 7th and 8th April

³ As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director on the selection of external experts: <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>

2. Declarations of Interest of Working Group members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes⁴ and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest,⁵ EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the working group members invited for the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

3. Agreement of the minutes of the 4th Working Group meeting held on 14 March 2016 (Tele-web conference).

The minutes of the of the 4th Working Group meeting were agreed.⁶

4. Hearing Expert(s)

Dr Paul Toplis was invited to present his views for specific aspects of the item 5 of the agenda. In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes⁷ and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest,⁸ EFSA invited Dr Toplis to submit an Annual Declaration of Interest. His participation was limited to providing testimony, without the possibility to take on any role undertaken by members of the Panel, in accordance with the applicable legal framework.⁹

5. Scientific topic for discussion

The draft opinion on "Revision of Maximum Content of Copper in Feed". ([EFSA-Q-2015-00435](http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf)) was discussed. Discussions included the review of: (i) copper in animal nutrition (requirements, deficiency, tolerance and other uses of copper), (ii) copper availability and interactions, (iii) copper intake and effect on gut microbiota profile, (iv) influence of copper in animal nutrition on the development of antibiotic resistance in bacteria and (v) data concerning the copper monitoring activities from Member States and European countries.

⁴ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencypolicy.pdf>

⁵ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>

⁶ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/wqcopperinfeed.pdf>

⁷ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencypolicy.pdf>

⁸ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>

⁹ Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest:
<http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>

6. Any Other Business

Not Applicable

7. Next meeting

13 May 2016

Scientific Panel on Additives and Products or Substances Used in Animal Feed

Minutes of the 4th meeting of the Working Group on Revision of Maximum Content of Copper in Feed

**Tele-Web conference, 14 March 2016
(Agreed on 6 April 2016)**

Participants

- **Working Group Members:**

Peter Aggett, Noël Dierick, Jürgen Gropp (Chair), Anne-Katrine Lundebye, Marta López Alonso, Alena Pechova and Hanne Poulsen

- **Hearing Experts:¹**

Not Applicable.

- **European Commission and/or Member States representatives:**

Not Applicable.

- **EFSA:**

FEED Unit: Frida Edman and Gloria López-Gálvez

- **Others:**

Not Applicable.

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants. Apologies were received from Christer Hogstrand.

2. Declarations of Interest of Working Group members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes² and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest,³ EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of

¹ As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director on the selection of external experts:

<http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>

² <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf>

³ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>

Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the working group members invited for the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

3. Agreement of the minutes of the 3rd Working Group meeting held on 20-22 January (Parma) and 4-5 February 2016 (Tele-web conference).

The minutes of the of the 3rd Working Group meeting were agreed.⁴

4. Scientific topic for discussion

The draft Opinion on “Revision of Maximum Content of Copper in Feed” ([EFSA-Q-2015-00435](http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/wgcopperinfeed.pdf)) was discussed. Discussions included the report of the Procurement on the influence of dietary copper on antibiotic resistance of gut microbiota in pigs (including piglets),⁵ and the progress on the call for data to Member States and stakeholders. The WG decided that further discussion is needed.

5. Any Other Business

Not Applicable

6. Next meeting

6-8 April 2016

⁴ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/wgcopperinfeed.pdf>

⁵ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/supporting/pub/1005e>

Scientific Panel on Additives and Products or Substances Used in Animal Feed

Minutes of the 3rd meeting of the Working Group on Revision of Maximum Content of Copper in Feed

Parma, 20-22 January 2016¹

(Agreed on 14 March 2016)

Participants

- **Working Group Members:**

Peter Aggett,² Noël Dierick, Jürgen Gropp (Chair), Christer Hogstrand,² Anne-Katrine Lundebye, Marta López Alonso, Alena Pechova and Hanne Poulsen.³

- **Hearing Experts:⁴**

Not Applicable.

- **European Commission and/or Member States representatives:**

Not Applicable.

- **EFSA:**

FEED Unit: Frida Edman, Gloria López-Gálvez, Oriol Ribó

Evidence Management Unit: Enikő Varga

- **Others:**

Not Applicable.

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

¹ The meeting continued with a follow-up meeting on 4-5 February (Audio-Web) in which only the relevant experts involved in the discussions were invited: Noël Dierick, Jürgen Gropp (Chair), Anne-Katrine Lundebye (present on the 5th), Marta López Alonso, Alena Pechova and Hanne Poulsen

² Present on 21 and 22 January

³ Present on 4 and 5 February

⁴ As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director on the selection of external experts: <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>

2. Declarations of Interest of Working Group members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes⁵ and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest,⁶ EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the working group members invited for the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

3. Agreement of the minutes of the 2nd Working Group meeting held on 8 December 2015, Audio-Web.

The minutes of the of the 2nd Working Group meeting held on 8 December 2015 were agreed.⁷

4. Scientific topic for discussion

The Working Group (WG) discussed the mandate on a request on a revision of maximum copper levels in feed ([EFSA-Q-2015-00435](#)). The status of the project was reviewed, including the state-of-the-art of the data received from Member States and Stakeholders. The contributions submitted by the WG experts were reviewed; particularly, copper requirements of animals and copper in feedingstuffs were discussed *in extenso*.

5. Any Other Business

Not Applicable

6. Next meeting

14/03/2016

⁵ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencypolicy.pdf>

⁶ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>

⁷ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/wgcopperinfeed.pdf>

Scientific Panel on Additives and Products or Substances Used in Animal Feed

Minutes of the 2nd meeting of the Working Group on Revision of Maximum Content of Copper in Feed

Tele-web conference, 08 December 2015

(Agreed on 20 January 2016)

Participants

- **Working Group Members:**

Peter Aggett, Noël Dierick, Jürgen Gropp (Chair), Anne-Katrine Lundebye, Marta López Alonso, Alena Pechova and Hanne Poulsen

- **Hearing Experts:**¹

Not Applicable.

- **European Commission and/or Member States representatives:**

Not Applicable.

- **EFSA:**

FEED Unit: Frida Edman, Gloria López-Gálvez, Oriol Ribó

- **Others:**

Not Applicable.

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants. Apologies were received from Christer Hogstrand.

2. Declarations of Interest of Working Group members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes² and the Decision of the Executive Director on

¹ As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director on the selection of external experts:

<http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>

² <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf>

Declarations of Interest,³ EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the working group members invited for the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

3. Agreement of the minutes of the 1st Working Group meeting held on 13 October 2015, Brussels.

The minutes of the of the 1st Working Group meeting held on 13 October 2015 were agreed.⁴

4. Scientific topic for discussion

The Working Group (WG) discussed the mandate on a request on a revision of copper levels in feed ([EFSA-Q-2015-00435](#)). The status of the project was reviewed, including the state-of-the-art of the questionnaires received from Member States and Stakeholders. The contributions submitted by the WG experts were reviewed.

5. Any Other Business

Not Applicable

6. Next meeting

20-22/01/2016

³ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>

⁴ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/wqcopperinfeed.pdf>

Scientific Panel on Additives and Products or Substances Used in Animal Feed

Minutes of the 1st meeting of the Working Group on Revision of Maximum Content of Copper in Feed

Held on 13 October 2015, Brussels (Belgium)

(Agreed on 8 December 2015)

Participants

- **Working Group Members:**

Peter Aggett, Christer Hogstrand, Jürgen Gropp, Anne-Katrine Lundebye Haldorsen, Marta López Alonso, Alena Pechova and Hanne Poulsen

- **Hearing Experts:**¹

Not Applicable.

- **European Commission and/or Member States representatives:**

Not Applicable.

- **EFSA:**

FEED Unit: Gloria López-Gálvez

- **Others:**

Not Applicable.

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

Apologies were received from Noël Dierick.

2. Declarations of Interest of Working Group members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes² and the Decision of the Executive Director on

¹ As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director on the selection of external experts:
<http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>

Declarations of Interest,³ EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the working group members invited for the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

3. Scientific topic for discussion

The WG discussed the mandate on a request on a revision of copper levels in feed (EFSA-Q-2015-00435), and decided that further discussion is needed. The general outline of the draft opinion and the task distributions were agreed. Two rapporteurs were appointed.

4. Any Other Business

Not Applicable

5. Next meeting

8 December 2015

² <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf>

³ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>