

SCIENTIFIC PANEL ON ADDITIVES AND PRODUCTS OR SUBSTANCES USED IN ANIMAL FEED

MINUTES OF THE 24th MEETING OF THE WORKING GROUP ON NUTRITIONAL ADDITIVES

TELE-conference, 11 January 2021

(Agreed on 11 January 2021)

Participants

- Working Group Members:
Francesco Cubadda and Fernando Ramos (Chair of the WG).
- Hearing Experts¹:
Not Applicable
- European Commission and/or Member States representatives:
Not Applicable
- EFSA:
FEED Unit: Angelica Amaduzzi and Gloria López-Gálvez
- Others:
Not Applicable

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

EFSA welcomed the participants.

¹ As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director concerning the selection of members of the Scientific Committee, the Scientific Panels, and the selection of external experts to assist EFSA with its scientific work :
<http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>.



2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted, after the addition of the following items: Zinc chelate of Ethylenediamine (ZnEDA) for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2018-00689](#)), Manganese chelate of Ethylenediamine (MnEDA) for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2018-00713](#)) and KemTRACE Chromium (Chromium propionate) for all growing poultry species ([EFSA-Q-2019-00804](#)).

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence² and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management³, EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Scientific topics

- 4.1. The Working Group (WG) discussed the application on Plexomin® L-Fe (Ferrous lysinate sulfate) for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2020-00169](#)), regarding the identity and characterisation of the additive and considered the section finalised.
- 4.2. The WG discussed the application on Zinc chelate of Ethylenediamine (ZnEDA) for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2018-00689](#)), regarding the chemical aspects of a study supporting safety for the consumer and considered the section finalised.
- 4.3. The WG discussed the application on Manganese chelate of Ethylenediamine (MnEDA) for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2018-00713](#)), regarding the chemical aspects of a study supporting safety for the consumer and considered the section finalised.
- 4.4. The WG discussed the application on KemTRACE Chromium (Chromium propionate) for all growing poultry species ([EFSA-Q-2019-00804](#)), regarding the chemical aspects of studies supporting safety for the consumer and considered the section finalised.

5. Any Other Business

The WG discussed some aspects related to the presence of undesirable substances in compounds of trace elements.

6. Next meeting(s)

25.03.2021

² http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

³ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf

SCIENTIFIC PANEL ON ADDITIVES AND PRODUCTS OR SUBSTANCES USED IN ANIMAL FEED

MINUTES OF THE 23rd MEETING OF THE WORKING GROUP ON NUTRITIONAL ADDITIVES

TELE-conference, 11 December 2020

(Agreed on 11 December 2020)

Participants

- Working Group Members:
Francesco Cubadda and Fernando Ramos (Chair of the WG).
- Hearing Experts¹:
Not Applicable
- European Commission and/or Member States representatives:
Not Applicable
- EFSA:
FEED Unit: Angelica Amaduzzi, Lucilla Gregoret, Gloria López-Gálvez and Paola Manini.
- Others:
Not Applicable

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

EFSA welcomed the participants.

¹ As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director concerning the selection of members of the Scientific Committee, the Scientific Panels, and the selection of external experts to assist EFSA with its scientific work :
<http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>.



2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted, after addition of the item: Copper chelate of Ethylenediamine (CuEDA) for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2019-00059](#))

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence² and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management³, EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Scientific topics

- 4.1. The Working Group (WG) discussed the application on Iron chelate of Ethylenediamine (FeEDA) for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2018-01016](#)), regarding the EDA residue studies and considered the section finalised.
- 4.2. The WG discussed the application on Copper chelate of Ethylenediamine (CuEDA) for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2019-00059](#)), regarding the EDA residue studies and considered the section finalised.
- 4.3. The WG discussed the application on KemTRACE Chromium (Chromium propionate) for all growing poultry species ([EFSA-Q-2019-00804](#)), regarding some analytical aspects of the submitted studies.

5. Any Other Business

N/A

6. Next meeting(s)

11.01.2021

² http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

³ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf

SCIENTIFIC PANEL ON ADDITIVES AND PRODUCTS OR SUBSTANCES USED IN ANIMAL FEED

MINUTES OF THE 22nd MEETING OF THE WORKING GROUP ON NUTRITIONAL ADDITIVES

TELE-conference, 19 October 2020

(Agreed on 19 October 2020)

Participants

- Working Group Members:
Francesco Cubadda and Fernando Ramos (Chair of the WG).
- Hearing Experts¹:
Not Applicable
- European Commission and/or Member States representatives:
Not Applicable
- EFSA:
FEED Unit: Angelica Amaduzzi and Gloria López-Gálvez.
- Others:
Not Applicable

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

EFSA welcomed the participants.

¹ As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director concerning the selection of members of the Scientific Committee, the Scientific Panels, and the selection of external experts to assist EFSA with its scientific work :
<http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>.



2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence² and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management³, EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Scientific topic(s)

- 4.1. The Working Group (WG) discussed the application on KemTRACE Chromium (Chromium propionate) for all growing poultry species ([EFSA-Q-2019-00804](#)) and considered that the section on characterisation and identity of the additive was finalised.
- 4.2. The WG discussed the application on Ferrous lysinate sulfate (Plexomin® L-Fe) for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2020-00169](#)) and decided to inform the applicant on issues that required clarifications.

5. Any Other Business

N/A

6. Next meeting(s)

09.11.2020

² http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

³ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf

SCIENTIFIC PANEL ON ADDITIVES AND PRODUCTS OR SUBSTANCES USED IN ANIMAL FEED

MINUTES OF THE 21st MEETING OF THE WORKING GROUP ON NUTRITIONAL ADDITIVES

TELE-conference, 02 October 2020

(Agreed on 02 October 2020)

Participants

- Working Group Members:
Francesco Cubadda and Fernando Ramos (Chair of the WG).
- Hearing Experts¹:
Not Applicable
- European Commission and/or Member States representatives:
Not Applicable
- EFSA:
FEED Unit: Angelica Amaduzzi, Lucilla Gregorette, Gloria López-Gálvez and Fabiola Pizzo
- Others:
Not Applicable

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

EFSA welcomed the participants.

¹ As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director concerning the selection of members of the Scientific Committee, the Scientific Panels, and the selection of external experts to assist EFSA with its scientific work :
<http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>.



2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted after the introduction of an item under Any Other Business.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence² and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management³, EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Scientific topic(s)

- 4.1. The Working Group (WG) discussed the application on Zinc chelate of Ethylenediamine (ZnEDA) for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2018-00689](#)) and considered finalised the section on the identity of the additive.
- 4.2. The WG discussed the application on Manganese chelate of Ethylenediamine (MnEDA) for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2018-00713](#)) and considered finalised the section on the identity of the additive.
- 4.3. The WG discussed the application on Copper chelate of Ethylenediamine (CuEDA) for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2019-00059](#)) and considered finalised the section on the identity of the additive.
- 4.4. The WG discussed the application on Iron chelate of Ethylenediamine (FeEDA) for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2018-01016](#)) and considered finalised the section on the identity of the additive.

5. Any Other Business

- 5.1. The WG finalised the correction to the Opinions on the Safety and efficacy of trace elements chelates of lysine and glutamic acid as feed additives for all animal species.⁴

6. Next meeting(s)

19.10.2020

² http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

³ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf

⁴ <https://efsa.onlinelibrary.wiley.com/doi/epdf/10.2903/j.efsa.2019.5728>

<https://efsa.onlinelibrary.wiley.com/doi/epdf/10.2903/j.efsa.2019.5782>

<https://efsa.onlinelibrary.wiley.com/doi/pdf/10.2903/j.efsa.2019.5792>

<https://efsa.onlinelibrary.wiley.com/doi/epdf/10.2903/j.efsa.2020.6001>

SCIENTIFIC PANEL ON ADDITIVES AND PRODUCTS OR SUBSTANCES USED IN ANIMAL FEED

MINUTES OF THE 20TH MEETING OF THE WORKING GROUP ON NUTRITIONAL ADDITIVES

TELE-conference, 02 September 2020

(Agreed on 02 September 2020)

Participants

- Working Group Members:
Francesco Cubadda and Fernando Ramos (Chair of the WG).
- Hearing Experts¹:
Not Applicable
- European Commission and/or Member States representatives:
Not Applicable
- EFSA:
FEED Unit: Angelica Amaduzzi and Gloria López-Gálvez
- Others:
Not Applicable

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

EFSA welcomed the participants.

¹ As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director concerning the selection of members of the Scientific Committee, the Scientific Panels, and the selection of external experts to assist EFSA with its scientific work :
<http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>.



2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted after the introduction of an item under Any Other Business.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence² and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management³, EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Scientific topic(s)

- 4.1.** The Working Group (WG) discussed the application on KemTRACE Chromium (Chromium propionate), for all growing poultry species ([EFSA-Q-2019-00804](#)) and decided to inform the applicant on issues that required clarifications.

5. Any Other Business

- 5.1.** The WG discussed a possible correction to the Opinion of Safety and efficacy of copper chelates of lysine and glutamic acid as a feed additive for all animal species.⁴

6. Next meeting(s)

02.10.2020

² http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

³ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf

⁴ <https://efsa.onlinelibrary.wiley.com/doi/epdf/10.2903/j.efsa.2019.5728>

SCIENTIFIC PANEL ON ADDITIVES AND PRODUCTS OR SUBSTANCES USED IN ANIMAL FEED

MINUTES OF THE 19TH MEETING OF THE WORKING GROUP ON NUTRITIONAL ADDITIVES

TELE-conference, 14 July 2020

(Agreed on 14 July 2020)

Participants

- Working Group Members:
Francesco Cubadda and Fernando Ramos (Chair of the WG).
- Hearing Experts¹:
Not Applicable
- European Commission and/or Member States representatives:
Not Applicable
- EFSA:
FEED Unit: Angelica Amaduzzi, Lucilla Gregoretti, Gloria López-Gálvez, Fabiola Pizzo and Konstantinos Sofianidis
- Others:
Not Applicable

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

EFSA welcomed the participants.

¹ As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director concerning the selection of members of the Scientific Committee, the Scientific Panels, and the selection of external experts to assist EFSA with its scientific work:
<http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>.



2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted after introducing a new item: KemTRACE Chromium (Chromium propionate), for all growing poultry species ([EFSA-Q-2019-00804](#)).

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence² and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management³, EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Scientific topic(s)

- 4.1. The Working Group (WG) discussed the application on Manganese chelate of Ethylenediamine (MnEDA) for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2018-00713](#)) and decided to inform the applicant on issues that required clarifications.
- 4.2. The WG discussed the application on Copper chelate of Ethylenediamine (CuEDA) for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2019-00059](#)) and decided to inform the applicant on issues that required clarifications.
- 4.3. The WG discussed the application on Iron chelate of Ethylenediamine (FeEDA) for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2018-01016](#)) and decided to inform the applicant on issues that required clarifications.
- 4.4. The WG discussed the application on KemTRACE Chromium (Chromium propionate), for all growing poultry species ([EFSA-Q-2019-00804](#)) and decided to inform the applicant on issues that required clarifications.

5. Any Other Business

Not applicable

6. Next meeting(s)

02.10.2020

² http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

³ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf



FEED UNIT

SCIENTIFIC PANEL ON ADDITIVES AND PRODUCTS OR SUBSTANCES USED IN ANIMAL FEED

MINUTES OF THE 18TH MEETING OF THE WORKING GROUP ON NUTRITIONAL ADDITIVES

TELE-conference, 24 June 2020

(Agreed on 24 June 2020)

Participants

- Working Group Members:
Francesco Cubadda and Fernando Ramos (Chair of the WG).
- Hearing Experts¹:
Not Applicable
- European Commission and/or Member States representatives:
Not Applicable
- EFSA:
FEED Unit: Lucilla Gregoretti, Gloria López-Gálvez, Fabiola Pizzo and Konstantinos Sofianidis
- Others:
Not Applicable

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

EFSA welcomed the participants.

¹ As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director concerning the selection of members of the Scientific Committee, the Scientific Panels, and the selection of external experts to assist EFSA with its scientific work:
<http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>.



2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence² and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management³, EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

- 4.1. The Working Group discussed the applications on Zinc chelate of Ethylenediamine (ZnEDA) for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2018-00689](#)) and decided to inform the applicant on issues that required clarifications.
- 4.2. The following applications were not discussed: Manganese chelate of Ethylenediamine (MnEDA) for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2018-00713](#)), Copper chelate of Ethylenediamine (CuEDA) for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2019-00059](#)) and Iron chelate of Ethylenediamine (FeEDA) for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2018-01016](#)).

5. Any Other Business

Not applicable

6. Next meeting(s)

14 July 2020

² http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

³ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf

SCIENTIFIC PANEL ON ADDITIVES AND PRODUCTS OR SUBSTANCES USED IN ANIMAL FEED

MINUTES OF THE 17TH MEETING OF THE WORKING GROUP ON NUTRITIONAL ADDITIVES

TELE-conference, 21 February 2020

(Agreed on 21 February 2020)

Participants

- Working Group Members:
Francesco Cubadda, Noël Dierick, Marta López-Alonso, Alberto Mantovani, Alena Pechová and Fernando Ramos (Chair of the WG).
- Hearing Experts¹:
Not Applicable
- European Commission and/or Member States representatives:
Not Applicable
- EFSA:
FEED Unit: Jordi Tarrés-Call
- Others:
Not Applicable

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

EFSA welcomed the participants.

¹ As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director concerning the selection of members of the Scientific Committee, the Scientific Panels, and the selection of external experts to assist EFSA with its scientific work:
<http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>.



2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence² and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management³, EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

- 4.1. The Working group continued the discussion of the applications on L-histidine monohydrochloride monohydrate for salmon and trout ([EFSA-Q-2016-00305](#)) and on L-histidine monohydrochloride monohydrate for fish other than salmonids ([EFSA-Q-2018-00546](#)) and decided to present the draft opinion, modified accordingly, to the FEEDAP Panel plenary meeting.

5. Any Other Business

Not applicable

6. Next meeting(s)

24 April 2020

² http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

³ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf

SCIENTIFIC PANEL ON ADDITIVES AND PRODUCTS OR SUBSTANCES USED IN ANIMAL FEED

MINUTES OF THE 16TH MEETING OF THE WORKING GROUP ON NUTRITIONAL ADDITIVES

TELE-conference, 6 December 20219

(Agreed on 6 December 2019)

Participants

- Working Group Members:
Francesco Cubadda, Noël Dierick, Marta López-Alonso, Alberto Mantovani, Alena Pechová and Fernando Ramos (Chair of the WG).
- Hearing Experts¹:
Not Applicable
- European Commission and/or Member States representatives:
Not Applicable
- EFSA:
FEED Unit: Gloria López-Gálvez and Jordi Tarrés-Call
- Others:
Not Applicable

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

EFSA welcomed the participants.

2. Adoption of agenda

¹ As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director concerning the selection of members of the Scientific Committee, the Scientific Panels, and the selection of external experts to assist EFSA with its scientific work:
<http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>.



The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence² and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management³, EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

- 4.1. The Working group continued the discussion of the opinion on L-lysine monohydrochloride and sulfate for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2018-00427](#)) and decided to present it, modified accordingly, to the FEEDAP Panel plenary meeting.
- 4.2. The Working group continued the discussion of the opinion on L-Tryptophan produced using *Escherichia coli* KCCM 10534 for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2018-00545](#)) and decided to present it, modified accordingly, to the FEEDAP Panel plenary meeting.

5. Any Other Business

Not applicable

6. Next meeting(s)

22 January 2020

² http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

³ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf



FEED UNIT

SCIENTIFIC PANEL ON ADDITIVES AND PRODUCTS OR SUBSTANCES USED IN ANIMAL FEED

MINUTES OF THE 15th MEETING OF THE WORKING GROUP ON NUTRITIONAL ADDITIVES

TELE-conference, 9 October 2019

(Agreed on 9 October)

Participants

- Working Group Members:
Francesco Cubadda, Noël Dierick, Marta López-Alonso, Alberto Mantovani, Alena Pechová and Fernando Ramos (Chair of the WG).
- Hearing Experts¹:
Not Applicable
- European Commission and/or Member States representatives:
Not Applicable
- EFSA:
Feed Unit: Gloria López-Gálvez
- Others:
Not Applicable

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

EFSA welcomed the participants.

¹ As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director concerning the selection of members of the Scientific Committee, the Scientific Panels, and the selection of external experts to assist EFSA with its scientific work:
<http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>.



2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence² and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management³, EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

- 4.1. The Working Group revised the draft opinion on Manganese chelates of lysine and glutamic acid (ProPath Mn) for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2018-00254](#)) and decided to present it, modified accordingly, to the FEEDAP Plenary meeting.

5. Any Other Business

N/A

6. Next meeting(s)

6 December 2019.

² http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

³ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf

SCIENTIFIC PANEL ON ADDITIVES AND PRODUCTS OR SUBSTANCES USED IN ANIMAL FEED

MINUTES OF THE 14th MEETING OF THE WORKING GROUP ON NUTRITIONAL ADDITIVES

TELE-conference, 3 and 13 September 2019¹

(Agreed on 19 September 2019 by written procedure)

Participants

- Working Group Members:
Noël Dierick, Marta López-Alonso, Alberto Mantovani, Alena Pechová and Fernando Ramos
(Chair of the WG).
- Hearing Experts²:
Not Applicable
- European Commission and/or Member States representatives:
Not Applicable
- EFSA:
Feed Unit: Gloria López-Gálvez
- Others:
Not Applicable

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

EFSA welcomed the participants. Apologies were received from Francesco Cubadda

¹ The session on the 13th September was cancelled

² As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director concerning the selection of members of the Scientific Committee, the Scientific Panels, and the selection of external experts to assist EFSA with its scientific work:
<http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>.



2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted after withdrawal of the item L-tryptophan for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2017-00610](#)).

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence³ and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management⁴, EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

- 4.1. The Working Group revised the draft opinion on Manganese chelates of lysine and glutamic acid (ProPath Mn) for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2018-00254](#)) and decided to inform the applicant on issues that required clarifications.

5. Any Other Business

N/A

6. Next meeting(s)

To be decided.

³ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

⁴ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf



FEED UNIT

SCIENTIFIC PANEL ON ADDITIVES AND PRODUCTS OR SUBSTANCES USED IN ANIMAL FEED

MINUTES OF THE 13th MEETING OF THE WORKING GROUP ON NUTRITIONAL ADDITIVES

TELE-conference, 21 June 2019

(Agreed on 21 June 2019)

Participants

- Working Group Members:
Francesco Cubadda, Noël Dierick, Marta López-Alonso, Alberto Mantovani, Alena Pechová and Fernando Ramos (Chair of the WG).
- Hearing Experts¹:
Not Applicable
- European Commission and/or Member States representatives:
Not Applicable
- EFSA:
Feed Unit: Gloria López-Gálvez and Jordi Tarrés-Call
- Others:
Not Applicable

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

EFSA welcomed the participants.

¹ As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director concerning the selection of members of the Scientific Committee, the Scientific Panels, and the selection of external experts to assist EFSA with its scientific work:
<http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>.



2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted after withdrawal of the items 'Manganese chelates of lysine and glutamic acid (ProPath Mn) for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2018-00254](#))' and 'L-lysine formulated as L-lysine monohydrochloride and L-lysine sulphate for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2018-00427](#))'.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence² and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management³, EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

- 4.1. The Working Group (WG) revised the draft opinion on Sodium selenate for ruminants ([EFSA-Q-2017-00644](#)) and decided to present it, modified accordingly, to the FEEDAP Plenary meeting.
- 4.2. The WG revised the draft opinion on Iron chelates of lysine and glutamic acid (ProPath Fe) for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2018-00255](#)) and decided to present it, modified accordingly, to the FEEDAP Plenary meeting.
- 4.3. The WG revised the draft opinion on L-lysine monohydrochloride and concentrated liquid L-lysine (base) ([EFSA-Q-2018-00507](#)) and decided to present it, modified accordingly, to the FEEDAP Plenary meeting.
- 4.4. The WG revised the draft opinion on L-lysine monohydrochloride and concentrated liquid L-lysine (base) ([EFSA-Q-2018-00266](#)) and decided to present it, modified accordingly, to the FEEDAP Plenary meeting.
- 4.5. The WG revised the draft opinion on L-Histidine monohydrochloride monohydrate (feed grade) produced by fermentation with *Corynebacterium glutamicum* KCCM 80172 for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2018-00438](#)) and decided to present it, modified accordingly, to the FEEDAP Plenary meeting.

5. Any Other Business

N/A

6. Next meeting(s)

16 July 2019

² http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

³ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf

SCIENTIFIC PANEL ON ADDITIVES AND PRODUCTS OR SUBSTANCES USED IN ANIMAL FEED

MINUTES OF THE 12th MEETING OF THE WORKING GROUP ON NUTRITIONAL ADDITIVES

TELE-conference, 24 May 2019

(Agreed on 7 June 2019 by written procedure)

Participants

- Working Group Members:
Francesco Cubadda, Noël Dierick, Marta López-Alonso, Alberto Mantovani, Alena Pechová and Fernando Ramos (Chair of the WG).
- Hearing Experts¹:
Not Applicable
- European Commission and/or Member States representatives:
Not Applicable
- EFSA:
Feed Unit: Gloria López-Gálvez and Jordi Tarrés-Call
- Others:
Not Applicable

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

EFSA welcomed the participants.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

¹ As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director concerning the selection of members of the Scientific Committee, the Scientific Panels, and the selection of external experts to assist EFSA with its scientific work:
<http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>.



3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence² and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management³, EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

- 4.1. The Working group (WG) discussed the draft opinion on Sodium selenate for ruminants. ([EFSA-Q-2017-00644](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 4.2. The WG discussed the draft opinion on Iron chelates of lysine and glutamic acid (ProPath Fe) for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2018-00255](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 4.3. The WG discussed the draft opinion on L-lysine monohydrochloride and concentrated liquid L-lysine (base) of ([EFSA-Q-2018-00266](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 4.4. The WG discussed the draft opinion on L-lysine monohydrochloride and concentrated liquid L-lysine (base) ([EFSA-Q-2018-00507](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.

5. Any Other Business

The WG discussed an issue related to the use of histidine in animal nutrition: its accumulation in tissues and organs and its potential transformation to histamine in some animal species, especially in fish.

6. Next meeting(s)

21 June 2019

² http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

³ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf

SCIENTIFIC PANEL ON ADDITIVES AND PRODUCTS OR SUBSTANCES USED IN ANIMAL FEED

MINUTES OF THE 11TH MEETING OF THE WORKING GROUP ON NUTRITIONAL ADDITIVES

TELE-conference, 20 May 2019

(Agreed on 20 May 2019)

Participants

- Working Group Members:
Marta López-Alonso, Alena Pechová and Fernando Ramos (Chair of the WG).
- Hearing Experts¹:
Not Applicable
- European Commission and/or Member States representatives:
Not Applicable
- EFSA:
Feed Unit: Gloria López-Gálvez
- Others:
Not Applicable

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

EFSA welcomed the participants.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

¹ As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director concerning the selection of members of the Scientific Committee, the Scientific Panels, and the selection of external experts to assist EFSA with its scientific work:
<http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>.



3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence² and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management³, EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

- 4.1.** The Working Group discussed the draft opinion on Sodium selenate for ruminants ([EFSA-Q-2017-00644](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.

5. Any Other Business

N/A

6. Next meeting(s)

24 May 2019

² http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

³ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf

SCIENTIFIC PANEL ON ADDITIVES AND PRODUCTS OR SUBSTANCES USED IN ANIMAL FEED

MINUTES OF THE 10TH MEETING OF THE WORKING GROUP ON NUTRITIONAL ADDITIVES

TELE-conference, 29-30 April 2019 and 2 May 2019

(Agreed on 7 May 2019 by written procedure)

Participants

- Working Group Members:
Francesco Cubadda, Noël Dierick, Marta López-Alonso, Alberto Mantovani, Alena Pechová and Fernando Ramos (Chair of the WG).
- Hearing Experts¹:
Not Applicable
- European Commission and/or Member States representatives:
Not Applicable
- EFSA:
Feed Unit: Gloria López-Gálvez and Jordi Tarrés-Call
- Others:
Not Applicable

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

EFSA welcomed the participants.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

¹ As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director concerning the selection of members of the Scientific Committee, the Scientific Panels, and the selection of external experts to assist EFSA with its scientific work:
<http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>.



3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence² and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management³, EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

- 4.1. The Working Group (WG) discussed the draft opinion on (Sodium selenate for ruminants ([EFSA-Q-2017-00644](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed
- 4.2. The WG discussed the draft opinion on Zinc chelates of lysine and glutamic acid (ProPath Zn) for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2018-00012](#)) and decided to present it, modified accordingly, to the FEEDAP Plenary meeting.
- 4.3. The WG discussed the draft opinion on Manganese chelates of lysine and glutamic acid (ProPath Mn) for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2018-00254](#)) and decided to inform the applicant on issues that required clarifications.
- 4.4. The WG discussed the draft opinion on Iron chelates of lysine and glutamic acid (ProPath Fe) for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2018-00255](#)) and decided to inform the applicant on issues that required clarifications.
- 4.5. The WG discussed the draft opinion on L-lysine formulated as L-lysine monohydrochloride and L-lysine sulphate for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2018-00427](#)) and decided —once the outcome of the microorganisms WG is available— to present it, modified accordingly, to the FEEDAP Plenary meeting.

5. Any Other Business

N/A

6. Next meeting(s)

20 May 2019

² http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

³ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf

SCIENTIFIC PANEL ON ADDITIVES AND PRODUCTS OR SUBSTANCES USED IN ANIMAL FEED

MINUTES OF THE 9TH MEETING OF THE WORKING GROUP ON NUTRITIONAL ADDITIVES

TELE-conference, 8 April 2019

(Agreed on 8 April 2019)

Participants

- Working Group Members:
Francesco Cubadda, Noël Dierick, Marta López-Alonso, Alberto Mantovani and Alena Pechová.
- Hearing Experts¹:
Not Applicable
- European Commission and/or Member States representatives:
Not Applicable
- EFSA:
Feed Unit: Gloria López-Gálvez and Jordi Tarrés-Call
- Others:
Not Applicable

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

EFSA welcomed the participants. Apologies were received from Fernando Ramos.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

¹ As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director concerning the selection of members of the Scientific Committee, the Scientific Panels, and the selection of external experts to assist EFSA with its scientific work:
<http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>.



3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence² and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management³, EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

- 4.1. The WG discussed/revised the draft opinion on Copper chelates of lysine and glutamic acid (ProPath Cu) for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2018-00011](#)) and decided to present it, modified accordingly, to the FEEDAP Plenary meeting.
- 4.2. The WG discussed/revised the draft opinion on Tocopheryl phosphate mixture (TPM®) for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2017-00743](#)) and decided to inform the applicant on issues that required clarifications.
- 4.3. The WG discussed/revised the draft opinion on L-histidine monohydrochloride monohydrate for fish other than salmonids ([EFSA-Q-2018-00546](#)) and decided —once the outcome of the microorganisms WG is available— to present it, modified accordingly, to the FEEDAP Plenary meeting.
- 4.4. The following item(s) was (were) not discussed: Sodium selenate for ruminants ([EFSA-Q-2017-00644](#)), Zinc chelates of lysine and glutamic acid (ProPath Zn) for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2018-00012](#)), Manganese chelates of lysine and glutamic acid (ProPath Mn) for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2018-00254](#)) and Iron chelates of lysine and glutamic acid (ProPath Fe) for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2018-00255](#))

5. Any Other Business

N/A

6. Next meeting(s)

29 & 30 April and 2 May 2019

² http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

³ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf

SCIENTIFIC PANEL ON ADDITIVES AND PRODUCTS OR SUBSTANCES USED IN ANIMAL FEED

MINUTES OF THE 9TH MEETING OF THE WORKING GROUP ON NUTRITIONAL ADDITIVES

TELE-conference, 8 April 2019

(Agreed on 8 April 2019)

Participants

- Working Group Members:
Francesco Cubadda, Noël Dierick, Marta López-Alonso, Alberto Mantovani and Alena Pechová.
- Hearing Experts¹:
Not Applicable
- European Commission and/or Member States representatives:
Not Applicable
- EFSA:
Feed Unit: Gloria López-Gálvez and Jordi Tarrés-Call
- Others:
Not Applicable

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

EFSA welcomed the participants. Apologies were received from Fernando Ramos.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

¹ As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director concerning the selection of members of the Scientific Committee, the Scientific Panels, and the selection of external experts to assist EFSA with its scientific work :
<http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>.



3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence² and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management³, EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

- 4.1. The WG discussed/revised the draft opinion on Copper chelates of lysine and glutamic acid (ProPath Cu) for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2018-00011](#)) and decided to present it, modified accordingly, to the FEEDAP Plenary meeting.
- 4.2. The WG discussed/revised the draft opinion on Tocopheryl phosphate mixture (TPM®) for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2017-00743](#)) and decided to inform the applicant on issues that required clarifications.
- 4.3. The WG discussed/revised the draft opinion on L-histidine monohydrochloride monohydrate for fish other than salmonids ([EFSA-Q-2018-00546](#)) and decided —once the outcome of the microorganisms WG is available— to present it, modified accordingly, to the FEEDAP Plenary meeting.
- 4.4. The following item(s) was (were) not discussed: Sodium selenate for ruminants ([EFSA-Q-2017-00644](#)), Zinc chelates of lysine and glutamic acid (ProPath Zn) for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2018-00012](#)), Manganese chelates of lysine and glutamic acid (ProPath Mn) for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2018-00254](#)) and Iron chelates of lysine and glutamic acid (ProPath Fe) for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2018-00255](#))

5. Any Other Business

N/A

6. Next meeting(s)

29 & 30 April and 2 May 2019

² http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

³ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf

SCIENTIFIC PANEL ON ADDITIVES AND PRODUCTS OR SUBSTANCES USED IN ANIMAL FEED

MINUTES OF THE 8TH MEETING OF THE WORKING GROUP ON NUTRITIONAL ADDITIVES

TELE-conference, 27 March 2019

(Agreed on 27 March 2019)

Participants

■ Working Group Members:

Francesco Cubadda, Noël Dierick, Marta López-Alonso, Alberto Mantovani,¹ Alena Pechová and Fernando Ramos (chair of the WG).

■ Hearing Experts²:

Not Applicable

■ European Commission and/or Member States representatives:

Not Applicable

■ EFSA:

Feed Unit: Gloria López-Gálvez and Jordi Tarrés-Call

■ Others:

Not Applicable

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

EFSA welcomed the participants.

2. Adoption of agenda

¹ Participated physically in Parma

² As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director concerning the selection of members of the Scientific Committee, the Scientific Panels, and the selection of external experts to assist EFSA with its scientific work:
<http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>.



The agenda was adopted after withdrawal of the item L-histidine monohydrochloride monohydrate for fish other than salmonids ([EFSA-Q-2018-00546](#)).

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence³ and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management⁴, EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

- 4.1. The Working group (WG) discussed the draft opinion on L-Tryptophan for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2017-00610](#)) and decided —once the outcome of the microorganisms WG is available— to present it, modified accordingly, to the FEEDAP Plenary meeting.
- 4.2. The WG discussed the draft opinion on Tocopheryl phosphate mixture (TPM®) for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2017-00743](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 4.3. The WG discussed the draft opinion on L-Histidine monohydrochloride monohydrate (feed grade) produced by fermentation with *Corynebacterium glutamicum* KCCM 80172 for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2018-00438](#)) and decided to present it, modified accordingly, to the FEEDAP Plenary meeting.
- 4.4. The WG discussed the draft opinion on L-histidine monohydrochloride monohydrate produced by fermentation with *Corynebacterium glutamicum* KCCM 80179 for all animal species. ([EFSA-Q-2018-00547](#)) and decided to present it, modified accordingly, to the FEEDAP Plenary meeting.

5. Any Other Business

- 5.1. Following the discussions held on the 1st of February 2019 regarding the need of data related to chelate compounds as additives used in animal nutrition, EFSA informed the WG on the possibility of collecting these data via a Grant/Procurement.

6. Next meeting(s)

8 April 2019

³ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

⁴ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf

SCIENTIFIC PANEL ON ADDITIVES AND PRODUCTS OR SUBSTANCES USED IN ANIMAL FEED

MINUTES OF THE 7TH MEETING OF THE WORKING GROUP ON NUTRITIONAL ADDITIVES

TELE-conference, 6 March 2019

(Agreed on 6 March 2019)

Participants

- Working Group Members:
Francesco Cubadda, Noël Dierick, Marta López-Alonso, Alberto Mantovani, Alena Pechová and Fernando Ramos (Chair of the WG).
- Hearing Experts¹:
Not Applicable
- European Commission and/or Member States representatives:
Not Applicable
- EFSA:
FEED Unit: Gloria López-Gálvez and Jordi Tarrés-Call
- Others:
Not Applicable

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

EFSA welcomed the participants.

2. Adoption of agenda

¹ As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director concerning the selection of members of the Scientific Committee, the Scientific Panels, and the selection of external experts to assist EFSA with its scientific work:
<http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>.



The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence² and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management³, EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

- 4.1. The Working group (WG) revised the draft opinion on Sodium selenate for ruminants. ([EFSA-Q-2017-00644](#)) application under Art. 4 Regulation (EC) No 1831/2003 and decided to inform the applicant on issues that require clarification.
- 4.2. The WG discussed the L-Tryptophan produced by fermentation with *Corynebacterium glutamicum* KCCM 80176 for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2018-00451](#)) application under Article 4 of Regulation (EC) No 1831/2003 and decided that to present it, modified accordingly, to the FEEDAP Plenary meeting
- 4.3. The WG discussed the opinion on L-lysine monohydrochloride and concentrated liquid Lysine, produced by fermentation with *Corynebacterium glutamicum* KCCM 10227 for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2018-00442](#)) application under Article 4 of Regulation (EC) No 1831/2003 and decided that to present it, modified accordingly, to the FEEDAP Plenary meeting.
- 4.4. The following items were not discussed: L-Tryptophan for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2017-00610](#)) application under Article 4 of Regulation (EC) No 1831/2003, Tocopheryl phosphate mixture (TPM®) for all animal species FAD-2017-0057 ([EFSA-Q-2017-00743](#)) application under Article 4 of Regulation (EC) No 1831/2003, L-Histidine monohydrochloride monohydrate (feed grade) produced by fermentation with *Corynebacterium glutamicum* KCCM 80172 for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2018-00438](#)) application under Article 4 of Regulation (EC) No 1831/2003 and L-histidine monohydrochloride monohydrate produced by fermentation with *Corynebacterium glutamicum* KCCM 80179 for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2018-00547](#)) application under Article 4 of Regulation (EC) No 1831/2003.

² http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

³ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf



5. Any Other Business

Not Applicable

6. Next meeting(s)

8 April 2019

SCIENTIFIC PANEL ON ADDITIVES AND PRODUCTS OR SUBSTANCES USED IN ANIMAL FEED

MINUTES OF THE 6TH MEETING OF THE WORKING GROUP ON NUTRITIONAL ADDITIVES

TELE-conference, 15 February 2019

(Agreed on 15 February 2019)

Participants

- Working Group Members:
Francesco Cubadda, Noël Dierick, Marta López-Alonso, Alberto Mantovani, Alena Pechová and Fernando Ramos (Chair of the WG).
- Hearing Experts¹:
Not Applicable
- European Commission and/or Member States representatives:
Not Applicable
- EFSA:
FEED Unit: Gloria López-Gálvez and Jordi Tarrés-Call
- Others:
Not Applicable

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

EFSA welcomed the participants.

2. Adoption of agenda

¹ As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director concerning the selection of members of the Scientific Committee, the Scientific Panels, and the selection of external experts to assist EFSA with its scientific work:
<http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>.



The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence² and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management³, EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Agreement of the minutes of the 5th TELE-conference held on 1st February 2019.

The minutes of the 5th TELE-conference held on 1st February were agreed by written procedure on 7th February 2019⁴

5. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

- 5.1. The Working group (WG) revised the draft opinion on Sodium selenate for ruminants. ([EFSA-Q-2017-00644](#)) application under Art. 4 Regulation (EC) No 1831/2003 and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 5.2. The WG revised the draft opinion on L-Leucine produced by fermentation with *Escherichia coli* NITE BP-02351 for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2018-00548](#)) application under Article 4 of Regulation (EC) No 1831/2003 and decided to present it, modified accordingly, to the FEEDAP Plenary meeting.
- 5.3. The following items were not discussed: 'L-Tryptophan for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2017-00610](#)) application under Article 4 of Regulation (EC) No 1831/2003', 'Tocopheryl phosphate mixture (TPM®) for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2017-00743](#)) application under Article 4 of Regulation (EC) No 1831/2003' and 'L-Tryptophan produced by fermentation with *Corynebacterium glutamicum* KCCM 80176 for all animal species([EFSA-Q-2018-00451](#)) application under Article 4 of Regulation (EC) No 1831/2003'.

6. Any Other Business

- 6.1. Not Applicable

² http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

³ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf

⁴ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/wqs/animal-feed/wq-nutritional-additives-2018-2021.pdf>



7. Next meeting(s)

6 March 2019

SCIENTIFIC PANEL ON ADDITIVES AND PRODUCTS OR SUBSTANCES USED IN ANIMAL FEED

MINUTES OF THE 5TH MEETING OF THE WORKING GROUP ON NUTRITIONAL ADDITIVES

Held on 1 February 2019, Parma

(Agreed by written procedure on 7 February 2019)¹

Participants

■ Working Group Members:²

Francesco Cubadda, Noël Dierick, Marta López-Alonso, Alberto Mantovani, Alena Pechová and Fernando Ramos (Chair of the WG).

■ Hearing Experts³:

Not Applicable

■ European Commission and/or Member States representatives:

Not Applicable

■ EFSA:

FEED Unit: Gloria López-Gálvez and Jordi Tarrés-Call

■ Others:

Not Applicable

¹ Minutes should be published within 15 working days of the final day of the relevant meeting.

² Indicate first full name and then surname (John Smith) all throughout the document.

³ As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director concerning the selection of members of the Scientific Committee, the Scientific Panels, and the selection of external experts to assist EFSA with its scientific work:
<http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>.



1. Welcome and apologies for absence

EFSA welcomed the participants.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence⁴ and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management⁵, EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Agreement of the minutes of the 4th Working Group meeting held on 16-18 January 2019.

The minutes of the 4th Working Group meeting held on 16-18 January 2019 were agreed on the 18th January 2019.⁶

5. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

- 5.1.** The Working group (WG) revised the draft opinion on Sodium selenate for ruminants ([EFSA-Q-2017-00644](http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf)) and decided that further discussion is needed
- 5.2.** The WG revised the draft opinion on L-Tryptophan for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2016-00380](http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf)) and decided to present it, modified accordingly, to the FEEDAP Plenary meeting
- 5.3.** The WG revised the draft opinion on L-Leucine produced by fermentation with *Escherichia coli* NITE BP-02351 for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2018-00548](http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/wqs/animal-feed/wq-feed-nutritional-additives-1821.pdf)) and decided that further discussion is needed
- 5.4.** The following items were not discussed: L-Tryptophan for all animal species FAD-2017-0038 ([EFSA-Q-2017-00610](http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf)), Tocopheryl phosphate mixture (TPM®) for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2017-00743](http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf)) and L-Tryptophan produced by fermentation with *Corynebacterium glutamicum* KCCM 80176 for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2018-00451](http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/wqs/animal-feed/wq-feed-nutritional-additives-1821.pdf)).

⁴ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

⁵ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf

⁶ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/wqs/animal-feed/wq-feed-nutritional-additives-1821.pdf>



6. Any Other Business

- 6.1.** WG discussed the need of data related to chelate compounds as additives used in animal nutrition

7. Next meeting(s)

15 February 2019 web-conference

Scientific Panel on Additives and products or Substances Used in Animal Feed

Minutes of the 4th meeting of the Working Group on Nutritional Additives

Parma, 16-18 January 2019

(Agreed on 18 January 2019)¹

Participants

- **Working Group Members:**

Francesco Cubadda, Noël Dierick,² Marta López-Alonso, Alberto Mantovani, Alena Pechová and Fernando Ramos (Chair of the WG).

- **Hearing Experts³:**

Not Applicable

- **European Commission and/or Member States representatives:**

Not Applicable

- **EFSA:**

FEED Unit: Gloria López-Gálvez, Jordi Tarrés-Call and Frank Verdonck

- **Others:**

Not Applicable

¹ Minutes should be published within 15 working days of the final day of the relevant meeting. This provision does not apply to Pesticides Risk Assessment Peer Review meetings, which should follow the steps stated in Article 6 of the Decision of the Executive Director of the European Food Safety Authority concerning Pesticides Risk Assessment Peer Review (http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/eddecisionppr.pdf).

² Participated by Audio-Web

³ As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director concerning the selection of members of the Scientific Committee, the Scientific Panels, and the selection of external experts to assist EFSA with its scientific work: <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>.

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants. Apologies were received from Marta López-Alonso on 18.01.2019.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted after withdrawal of the items “L-Histidine monohydrochloride monohydrate (feed grade) produced by fermentation with *Corynebacterium glutamicum* KCCM 80172 for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2018-00436](#)) (application under Article 4 of Regulation (EC) No 1831/2003)” and “L-Tryptophan produced by fermentation with *Corynebacterium glutamicum* KCCM 80176 for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2018-00451](#)) (application under Article 29 of Regulation (EC) No 178/2002)”.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA’s Policy on Independence⁴ and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management⁵, EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Agreement of the minutes of the 3rd Working Group TELE-conference held on 12th December 2018.

The minutes of the 3rd Working Group meeting held on 12 December 2018 were agreed on the same day.⁶

5. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

- 5.1. The Working group (WG) revised the draft opinion on Copper chelates of lysine and glutamic acid (ProPath Cu) for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2018-00011](#)) (application under Article 4 of Regulation (EC) No 1831/2003) and decided to inform the applicant on issues that require clarification.

⁴ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

⁵ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf

⁶ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/wqs/animal-feed/wq-feed-nutritional-additives-1821.pdf>

- 5.2. The WG revised the draft opinion on Zinc chelates of lysine and glutamic acid (ProPath Zn) for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2018-00012](#)) (application under Article 4 of Regulation (EC) No 1831/2003) and decided to inform the applicant on issues that require clarification.
- 5.3. The WG revised the draft opinion on Manganese chelates of lysine and glutamic acid (ProPath Mn) for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2018-00254](#)) (application under Article 4 of Regulation (EC) No 1831/2003) and decided to inform the applicant on issues that require clarification.
- 5.4. The WG revised the draft opinion on 5.4. Iron chelates of lysine and glutamic acid (ProPath Fe) for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2018-00255](#)) (application under Article 4 of Regulation (EC) No 1831/2003) and decided to inform the applicant on issues that require clarification.
- 5.5. The WG revised the draft opinion on L-Tryptophan technically pure produced by *Escherichia coli* CGMCC 7248 for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2017-00485](#)) (application under Article 4 of Regulation (EC) No 1831/2003) and decided to present it, modified accordingly, to the FEEDAP Plenary meeting.
- 5.6. The WG revised the draft opinion on L-Valine for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2016-00379](#)) (application under Article 4 of Regulation (EC) No 1831/2003) and decided to present it, modified accordingly, to the FEEDAP Plenary meeting.
- 5.7. The WG revised the draft opinion on L-Tryptophan produced by fermentation with *Escherichia coli* K12 KCCM 80135 for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2017-00542](#)) (application under Article 4 of Regulation (EC) No 1831/2003) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 5.8. The WG revised the draft opinion on L-Tryptophan produced by fermentation with *Escherichia coli* K12 KCCM 80152 for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2017-00693](#)) (application under Article 4 of Regulation (EC) No 1831/2003) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 5.9. The WG revised the draft opinion on L-Threonine produced by fermentation with *Corynebacterium glutamicum* KCCM 80118 for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2018-00084](#)) (application under Article 4 of Regulation (EC) No 1831/2003) and decided to present it, modified accordingly, to the FEEDAP Plenary meeting.
- 5.10. The WG revised the draft opinion on L-Leucine produced using the strain NITE BP-02351 for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2018-00548](#)) (application under Article 4 of Regulation (EC) No 1831/2003) and decided that further discussion is needed.

6. Any Other Business

Not Applicable

7. Next meeting

1 February 2019 (Web-conference)

Scientific Panel on Additives and Products or Substances Used in Animal Feed

Minutes of the 3rd meeting of the Working Group on Nutritional Additives

Tele-web conference, 12 December 2018

(Agreed on 12 December 2018)

Participants

- **Working Group Members:**

Francesco Cubadda, Noël Dierick, Marta López-Alonso, Alberto Mantovani, Alena Pechová and Fernando Ramos (Chair of the WG).

- **Hearing Experts:¹**

Not Applicable.

- **European Commission and/or Member States representatives:**

Not Applicable.

- **EFSA:**

FEED Unit: Niovi Kordali, Gloria López-Gálvez and Jordi Tarrés-Call

- **Others:**

Not Applicable.

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

One of the EFSA representatives welcomed the participants.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Group members

¹ As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director concerning the selection of members of the Scientific Committee, the Scientific Panels, and the selection of external experts to assist EFSA with its scientific work: <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>.

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence² and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management,³ EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Agreement of the minutes of the 2nd Working Group TELE-conference held on 23rd November 2018.

The minutes of the 2nd Working Group meeting held on 23 November 2018 were agreed on the same day.⁴

5. Scientific topic for discussion

- 5.1. The Working Group (WG) continued the discussion on the draft opinion on L-Threonine for all animal species, ([EFSA-Q-2018-00506](#)) and decided to present the draft document, modified accordingly, to the plenary meeting.
- 5.2. The WG continued the discussion on the draft opinion on L-Histidine HCl monohydrate for all species ([EFSA-Q-2018-00547](#)) and decided to inform the applicant on issues that required clarification.
- 5.3. The WG continued the discussion on the draft opinion on L-Lysine HCl and concentrated liquid L-lysine (base) for all species ([EFSA-Q-2018-00442](#)) and decided to inform the applicant on issues that required clarification.
- 5.4. The WG continued the discussion on the draft opinion on L-Tryptophan for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2018-00545](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.
- 5.5. The WG continued the discussion on the draft opinion on L-Tryptophan for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2016-00380](#)) and decided to inform the applicant on issues that required clarification.
- 5.6. The following item was not discussed: L-Tryptophan for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2017-00485](#)).

6. Any Other Business

² http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

³ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf

⁴ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/wqs/animal-feed/wq-feed-nutritional-additives-1821.pdf>

Not applicable

7. Next meeting

16-18 January 2019

Scientific Panel on Additives and Products or Substances Used in Animal Feed

Minutes of the 2nd meeting of the Working Group on Nutritional Additives

Tele-web conference, 23 November 2018

(Agreed on 23 November 2018)

Participants

- **Working Group Members:**

Francesco Cubadda, Noël Dierick, Marta López-Alonso, Alberto Mantovani, Alena Pechová and Fernando Ramos (Chair of the WG).

- **Hearing Experts:¹**

Not Applicable

- **European Commission and/or Member States representatives:**

Not Applicable

- **EFSA:**

FEED Unit: Matteo L. Innocenti, Niovi Kordali, Gloria López-Gálvez and Jordi Tarrés-Call

- **Others:**

Not Applicable

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

One of the EFSA representatives welcomed the participants to the first meeting of the Working Group Nutritional Additives of the FEEDAP Panel.

¹ As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director concerning the selection of members of the Scientific Committee, the Scientific Panels, and the selection of external experts to assist EFSA with its scientific work: <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted after withdrawal of the item L-Tryptophan for all animal species (EFSA-Q-2016-00380).

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence² and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management³, EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Agreement of the minutes of the 1st Working Group meeting held on 12 November 2018, Tele-web conference.

The minutes of the 1st Working Group meeting held on 12 November 2018 were agreed on the same day.⁴

5. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

- 5.1. The Working group (WG) revised the draft opinion on L-Valine produced by fermentation with *Corynebacterium glutamicum* KCCM 11201P for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2017-00483](http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/EFSA-Q-2017-00483)) and decided to present it, modified accordingly, to the FEEDAP Plenary meeting.
- 5.2. The WG revised the draft opinion on L-Lysine monohydrochloride and L-lysine sulphate from *Corynebacterium glutamicum* CCTCC M 2015595 for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2016-00574](http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/EFSA-Q-2016-00574)) and decided to present it, modified accordingly, to the FEEDAP Plenary meeting.
- 5.3. The WG evaluated the spontaneous information submitted on the dossier Concentrated liquid L-lysine (base), L-lysine monohydrochloride and L-lysine sulphate produced using different strains of *Corynebacterium glutamicum* for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2016-00391](http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/EFSA-Q-2016-00391)); the draft opinion was updated. The WG

² http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

³ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf

⁴ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/wqs/animal-feed/wq-feed-nutritional-additives-1821.pdf>

decided to present the opinion, modified accordingly, to the FEEDAP Plenary meeting.

6. Any Other Business

Not Applicable

7. Next meeting

12 December 2018

Scientific Panel on Additives and Products or Substances Used in Animal Feed

Minutes of the 1st meeting of the Working Group on Nutritional Additives

Tele-web conference, 12 November 2018

(Agreed on 12 November 2018)

Participants

- **Working Group Members:**

Francesco Cubadda, Noël Dierick, Marta López-Alonso, Alberto Mantovani, Alena Pechová and Fernando Ramos (Chair of the WG).

- **Hearing Experts:¹**

Not Applicable.

- **European Commission and/or Member States representatives:**

Not Applicable.

- **EFSA:**

FEED Unit: Niovi Kordali, Gloria López-Gálvez and Jordi Tarrés-Call

- **Others:**

Not Applicable.

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

One of the EFSA representatives welcomed the participants to the first meeting of the Working Group Nutritional Additives of the FEEDAP Panel.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted after withdrawal of the items L-lysine sulphate from *Corynebacterium glutamicum* CCTCC M 2015595 for all animal

¹ As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director concerning the selection of members of the Scientific Committee, the Scientific Panels, and the selection of external experts to assist EFSA with its scientific work: <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>.

species ([EFSA-Q-2016-00574](#)) and L-Tryptophan for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2016-00380](#)).

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Group members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence² and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management,³ EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Scientific topic for discussion

- 4.1. The Working Group (WG) revised the draft opinion on L-Tryptophan produced by fermentation with *Corynebacterium glutamicum* KCCM 80176 for all animal species ([EFSA-Q-2018-00451](#)) and decided that further discussion is needed.

5. Any Other Business

The WG held a discussion on analytical methods of amino acids.

6. Next meeting

23 November 2018

² http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

³ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf