



**MINUTES OF THE 10<sup>TH</sup> PLENARY MEETING  
OF THE SCIENTIFIC PANEL ON PLANT HEALTH, PLANT  
PROTECTION PRODUCTS AND THEIR RESIDUES  
HELD IN PADOVA ON 16 FEBRUARY 2005**  
(Adopted by written procedure on 11 March 2005)

**AGENDA**

1. Welcome, apologies for absence	p.2
2. Adoption of the agenda	p.2
3. Adoption of the opinion on variability of residues	p.2
4. Adoption of the opinion on dimoxystrobin	p.2
5. State of the art on the question on pirimicarb	p.2
6. Presentation of new questions	p.2
7. Feedback from the Scientific Committee, WGs Exposure and Gentox	p.3
8. Delivery of two new conclusions in the Peer review of the risk assessment of the second list of active substances by the PRAPeR sector of EFSA	p.4
9. Miscellaneous	p.4

**PARTICIPANTS**

*Members of the PPR Panel*

Mr. D. BARCELLO-CULLERES, Mr. R. BLACK, Mr. J. BOESTEN, Mr. A. HARDY (Chairman), Mr. A. HART, Mr. H. KOEPP, Mr. R. LUTTIK, Mr. D. McGREGOR, Mrs. K. MACHERA, Mr. O. MEYER, Mr. A. MORETTO, Mrs E. MOURKIDOU- PAPADOPOLOU-, Mr. E. PETZINGER, Mr. A. SCHAEFFER, Mr. J. STENSTRÖM, Mr. W. STEURBAUT, Mr. K. SAVOLAINEN, and Ms. D. TSIPI-STEFANITSI.

*Ad hoc Expert*

Mr. Peter CRAIG (morning)

*Apologies*

Mrs. DUNIER-THOMANN, Mr. A. BOOBIS, Mr. M. MARONI and Ms C. VLEMINCKX

*EFSA*

Ms. Christine FUELL, Ms. M. MESNAOUI and Mrs. M. PAQUES.

*European Commission*

Mr. M. WALSH (Interface Unit, DG SANCO D5), Mr. Luis MARTIN PLAZA part time (DG SANCO D3).

Seat :	All mail to be sent to:
Palazzo Ducale, Parco Ducale 3, I-43100 Parma	Largo N. Palli 5/a, I-43100 Parma

## **1. WELCOME, APOLOGIES FOR ABSENCE**

The Chairman, Mr. A. Hardy, welcomed the participants, apologies had been received from three members. He expressed his grateful thanks to the University of Padua for hosting, and Mr. A. Moretto for organising the meeting. Prof. M. Riolfatti sent regards from the Rector of the University of Padova. In his speech he appreciated that EFSA is dealing with very important issues, e.g. residues of pesticides in food, and wished the participants fruitful discussions and a successful meeting. The Vice Chairman, Mr. K. Savolainen, continued to chair the meeting in the afternoon.

## **2. ADOPTION OF THE AGENDA**

The agenda was adopted without changes. Declarations of interest were noted for 3 Panel Members but these were not considered to influence their continued participation. The participants were also reminded that according to the declaration of interest adopted by the Management Board on 16<sup>th</sup> December, each Panel member (and each *ad hoc* expert) has the responsibility to update it when his/her situation changes.

## **3. ADOPTION OF THE OPINION ON VARIABILITY OF RESIDUES**

The Chairman expressed his thanks to the four *ad hoc* experts, Mr. P. Craig who provided the statistical “backbone” to the opinion, Mr. A. Ambrus and Ms G Suszter, giving access to various datasets, Mr. A. Walters for independent calculations.

The rapporteurs presented the final opinion on the appropriate variability factor(s) to be used for acute dietary exposure assessment of pesticide residues in fruit and vegetables. This has been prepared following discussions at the Residues Working Group (WG) on 11<sup>th</sup> and 12<sup>th</sup> (a.m.) January 2005 in Athens (Greece) with four *ad hoc* experts and finalised on 15<sup>th</sup> February in the Padova Residues WG. The members of the PPR Panel went through the document in detail and made final corrections and amendments. The PPR Panel agreed to include exceptionally reference to a personal communication by A. Ambrus since there is no published data available to quote. Further, the summary was phrased as clear and precise as possible to be understood by a non-technical reader.

The opinion was adopted unanimously. The final text will be circulated by the EFSA Secretariat after the plenary meeting for a last editorial check (deadline for editorial comments: Wed, 23<sup>rd</sup> Feb.) before publication on EFSA’s website end of February 2005. Thus, the Commission will be able to use the PPR Panel’s opinion in the Codex alimentarius meeting in April 2005.

#### **4. ADOPTION OF THE OPINION ON DIMOXYSTROBIN**

The rapporteur for this draft opinion (question in ecotoxicology raised by the EFSA PRAPeR sector on the selection of an appropriate long-term fish toxicity endpoint for dimoxystrobin) presented the text which had been finalized at the Ecotoxicology WG meeting on 18<sup>th</sup> January 2005 with the help of two *ad hoc* experts (P. Adriaanse and V. Forbes). A few changes and clarifications were agreed before the opinion was adopted with unanimity. The final text will be circulated after the plenary meeting for a last editorial check before publication by mid-March 2005. Written comments should be sent to the rapporteur within five working days (copy to the secretariat).

#### **5. STATE OF THE ART ON THE QUESTION OF PIRIMICARB**

The terms of reference for the question submitted by the EFSA PRAPeR sector on the assessment of the acute risk to birds from the use of pirimicarb (an active substance from the second list) were discussed during the Ecotoxicology WG on 18<sup>th</sup> January when separation into two questions was envisaged. The PPR Panel agreed that this issue will be discussed in detail in the Ecotoxicology WG on 17<sup>th</sup> February.

#### **6. PRESENTATION OF NEW QUESTIONS**

The question from the EFSA PRAPeR on the refinement of the chronic risk assessment for fish and invertebrates (*i.e.*, to reduce the assessment factor/level of protection, if there is a certain amount of fish species tested) was briefly discussed for the first time at the Ecotoxicology WG on 18<sup>th</sup> January. It is a generic question rather than dealing with a particular active substance.

The rapporteur described the current state of the discussions. The question will be officially accepted during the 11<sup>th</sup> plenary meeting, to be held in Parma on 06<sup>th</sup> April. The next Ecotoxicology WG on 05<sup>th</sup> April will decide which *ad hoc* experts are to be invited for this opinion. The adoption of this opinion is foreseen in September 2005.

No further questions were presented during this meeting.

#### **7. FEEDBACK FROM THE SCIENTIFIC COMMITTEE, WG EXPOSURE AND GENTOX**

##### **7.1 Information on the Exposure WG**

A. Hart informed the PPR Panel about the main activities of this Exposure Working Group of the Scientific Committee. These include the proposal of procedures and the provision of guidance to achieve a harmonized view on human exposure assessment. This WG is also

coordinating efforts to improve access to data on food consumption and contaminant concentrations, to assist all the Panels in their work.

An EFSA colloquium on food consumption data is envisaged for April 2005. In this context, A. Moretto informed the meeting that he is the Scientific Coordinator of a project funded by EU within the FP&-priority FOOD, on the preparation of a database concerning the activities on food consumption surveys and chemical analysis for food contamination, and respective legislation in the new EU Member States and the Associated Candidate Countries. This project involves at least one institution from each of these countries. A website (probably [www.safefoodnet.org](http://www.safefoodnet.org) or info) will be available soon.

### **7.2 Information on the Gentox WG**

D. McGregor informed the PPR Panel about the draft opinion on a Harmonised Approach for Risk Assessment of Compounds that are both Genotoxic and Carcinogenic (GENTOX), to be discussed and finalised at the 11<sup>th</sup> Plenary Meeting of the EFSA Scientific Committee, to be held 28 February - 1 March, 2005. However the PPR Panel wishes to comment on this document before its final adoption since it will have major impacts on all risk assessment work. The PPR Panel plans to discuss this issue further during its next plenary meeting in April 2005.

## **8. DELIVERY OF TWO NEW CONCLUSIONS IN THE PEER REVIEW OF THE RISK ASSESSMENT OF THE SECOND LIST OF ACTIVE SUBSTANCES BY THE PRAPER SECTOR OF EFSA**

The PPR Panel took note of the two new conclusions on diuron and oxamyl recently finalised by the PRAPeR sector of EFSA on the Peer Review of the risk assessment of active substances of the second list. As nobody of the EFSA team was able to attend the plenary meeting in Padova, members are kindly asked to send any comments directly to the responsible EFSA scientific coordinator.

## **9. MISCELLANEOUS**

The next plenary meeting will be held on 06 April 2005 in Parma. The Chairman pointed out that this meeting will be without any opinions to be adopted. Thus, the PPR Panel plenary meeting should take the opportunity to catch up with some deferred scientific issues, establish a list of potential self-tasking issues, discuss risk assessment versus risk management and how to further develop opinion summaries that are both comprehensive and understandable to the non-technical reader.

Further details concerning the plenary meeting in September will be made available in due course.