

PANEL ON PLANT HEALTH

**MINUTES OF THE 32ND PLENARY MEETING
 OF THE EFSA SCIENTIFIC PANEL ON PLANT HEALTH
 HELD IN BUDAPEST (HUNGARY) ON 18-19 MAY 2011**

(ADOPTED ON 13 JULY 2011)

ITEM	AGENDA	PAGE
1.	Welcome, apologies for absence	2
2.	Adoption of the agenda	2
3.	Declarations of interests	2
4.	Adoption of the minutes of 31st Plenary meeting	3
5.	Discussion and possible adoption of the draft scientific opinion on evaluation of PRA of <i>Phytophthora ramorum</i>	3
6.	Discussion in view of the inter-panel consultation of the draft scientific opinion on PLH guidance document on environmental risk assessment (self task).	3
7.	New mandates from the Commission: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Risk assessment of potato cyst nematodes (<i>Globodera rostochiensis</i> and <i>G.pallida</i>) 	4
8.	Commission feedback on PLH opinions	4
9.	Update on the status of the on-going mandates: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Assessment of the risk to plant health of solanaceous pospiviroids for the EU territory - Request from the USA regarding export of Florida citrus fruit to the EU - Self task on Guidance on evaluation of pest risk reduction options 	4
10.	Update on Prima phacie 1st and 2nd interim reports: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Results from the first comparison of risk assessment methods - Application of systematic review for pest risk assessment 	5

11.	Review of EFSA policy on DoIs	5
12.	Miscellaneous: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Report from Scientific Committee - Update from PLH Secretariat - Next meeting confirmation 	6

PARTICIPANTS

Members of the PLH Panel

Thierry CANDRESSE, Erzsébet DORMANNSNÉ SIMON, Gianni GILIOLI, Jean-Claude GRÉGOIRE, Michael John JEGER, Olia Evtimova KARADJOVA, Gábor LÖVEI, David MAKOWSKI, Charles MANCEAU, Maria NAVAJAS, Angelo PORTA PUGLIA, Trond RAFOSS, Vittorio ROSSI, Gritta SCHRADER, Gregor UREK, Johan Coert VAN LENTEREN, Stephan WINTER, Marina ZLOTINA

EFSA

PLH Unit: Roberta CARFAGNINI, Elzbieta CEGLARSKA, Virag KERTESZ, Svetla KOZELSKA, Doreen RUSSELL, Giuseppe STANCANELLI, Sara TRAMONTINI, Sybren VOS

European Commission

Guillermo CARDON

Apologies

PLH Panel: Richard BAKER, Irene VLOUTOGLOU

European Commission: Michael WALSH

1. WELCOME, APOLOGIES FOR ABSENCE

The Panel Chair welcomed the Panel members. A welcome address was made to the Panel by Gábor Szalkai, the Hungarian Chief Officer of Plant Health Services.

Apologies were received from Richard BAKER, Irene VLOUTOGLOU (whole meeting), Johan Coert VAN LENTEREN (2nd day), and Michael WALSH (whole meeting).

2. ADOPTION OF THE AGENDA

The agenda was adopted.

3. DECLARATIONS OF INTERESTS

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Declarations of Interest, EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest (ADoI) and Specific Declaration of Interest (SDoI) filled in by the experts

invited to the meeting. For further details on the outcome of the declaration of interest please refer to Annex 1.

4. ADOPTION OF THE MINUTES OF THE 31ST PLENARY MEETING

The minutes were adopted without changes.

5. DISCUSSION AND POSSIBLE ADOPTION OF THE DRAFT SCIENTIFIC OPINION ON EVALUATION OF PRA OF *PHYTOPHTHORA RAMORUM*

EFSA is requested to provide a scientific opinion on the pest risk analysis on *Phytophtthora ramorum* prepared by the FP6 project RAPRA. The mandate is registered in the EFSA register of questions as EFSA-Q-2010-00841.

The Chair and rapporteurs presented the draft opinion including the key findings and conclusions of the pest risk assessment, the evaluation of risk reduction options and an overall synthesis. The conclusions reached by the Panel concur with those of RAPRA but added that there is increasing evidence of a greater impact by the pathogen than was previously assessed and that further investigation will be required in the future.

The Panel sought further clarifications concerning the range of host plant susceptible to the pathogen and also discussed uncertainties.

Minor amendments were suggested by the Panel and the opinion was adopted unanimously.

6. DISCUSSION IN VIEW OF THE INTER-PANEL CONSULTATION OF THE DRAFT SCIENTIFIC OPINION ON PLH GUIDANCE DOCUMENT ON ENVIRONMENTAL RISK ASSESSMENT (SELF TASK)

EFSA is requested to develop guidance for the assessment of environmental risks of harmful organisms. The mandate is registered in the EFSA register of questions as EFSA-Q-2010-00794.

Members of the working group presented the new approach developed by the working group to address environmental risk assessment. These included the structure of the opinion and the new environmental risk assessment methodology (including the necessary preliminary information and scenario assumptions), the main questions and their sub-questions to be used in the evaluation of impact on biodiversity and ecosystem services, the rating system for the evaluation of risk and uncertainty, the list of minimum data requirements as well as considerations for the identification of possible management options.. The approach adopted by the working group was demonstrated using a selected organism *Anoplophora chinensis*.

The Panel sought further information from the working group including referencing the figures for uncertainty and consistency. Timelines for endorsement of the draft, the inter-Panel and public consultations together with final adoption were given and to facilitate the timetable the Panel was requested to provide comments to the Secretariat on the draft guidance.

7. NEW MANDATES FROM THE COMMISSION

The European Commission representative presented to the Panel a mandate request currently under preparation by the Commission and concerning potato cyst nematodes, (*Globodera rostochiensis* and *G.pallida*). The organisms are listed in Council Directive 2000/29/EC which covers all plant material while Council Directive 2007/33/EC addresses the same group of organisms but specifies different plant materials according to risk, particularly in relation to spread. The Commission indicated that an opinion is needed from EFSA as soon as possible.

The Panel discussed the outline of the request as presented which is yet to be formally received and accepted by EFSA.

8. COMMISSION FEEDBACK ON PLH OPINIONS

The Commission representative provided feedback on the status of the delivered Plant Health Opinions. In relation to requests received from Third Countries, the Commission supports the assessments conducted by the Panel. For those requests specifically sought to either develop or modify legislation some of these opinions are still under discussion at Commission level. In addition other opinions need to be discussed by the Standing Committee on Plant Health.

9. UPDATE ON THE STATUS OF THE ON-GOING MANDATES

- Assessment of the risk to plant health of solanaceous pospiviroids for the EU territory

EFSA is requested to provide a pest risk assessment of the solanaceous pospiviroids, to identify risk management options and to evaluate their effectiveness in reducing the risk to plant health posed by this organism. The area to be covered is the EU territory. EFSA is also requested to provide an opinion on the effectiveness of the measures listed in Commission Decision 2007/410/EC in reducing the risk to plant health posed by this organism. The mandate is registered in the EFSA register of questions as EFSA-Q-2010-00911.

The rapporteur presented the draft opinion. The sections on identification and evaluation of management options and on the evaluation of current provisional EC emergency measures were presented and discussed. The management options were evaluated with regard to their effectiveness in reducing the different elements of the risk, i.e. the probabilities of entry, establishment and spread and the consequences of introduction. Each management option was described and evaluated with respect to its technical feasibility and effectiveness. The results of the questionnaire sent to Member States on the evaluation of the provisional EC emergency measures were also presented to the Panel.

The Panel sought further clarifications from the working group and was asked to provide any further comments in writing, so that a final draft opinion could be proposed for possible adoption at next plenary meeting.

- Request to provide a scientific opinion on the request from the USA regarding export of Florida citrus fruit to the EU

EFSA is requested to provide a scientific opinion on risk analyses submitted to the Commission and published by the APHIS/USDA in support of their request to consider removing some of the Union's plant health import requirements for citrus fruit. In particular, EFSA is requested to determine whether the conclusions of those risk analyses are scientifically justified. The mandate is registered in the EFSA register of questions as EFSA-Q-2010-01262.

An outline to the opinion was presented to the Panel.

- **Self task on Guidance on evaluation of pest risk reduction options**

The EFSA Panel on Plant Health is requested to produce guidance on methodology for evaluation of the effectiveness of options to reduce the risk of introduction and spread of organisms harmful to plants in the EU territory. The mandate is registered in the EFSA register of questions as EFSA-Q-2010-01343.

The working group chair provided a progress report on the mandate including the tasks undertaken and those to be executed. Comments and questions were welcomed and the Panel Chair asked for part of the presentation to be made available so the Guidance could be shared with the EFSA Scientific Committee.

10. UPDATE ON PRIMA PHACIE 1ST AND 2ND INTERIM REPORTS

Progress on the EFSA Article 36 funded project "Pest Risk Assessment for the European Community Plant Health: a comparative approach with case studies" (acronym Prima Phacie) was presented to the Panel by the project coordinator and a consortium member. In line with the milestones of the project, 2 interim reports have been delivered to and approved by EFSA. The project objectives were outlined and methodologies used described to the Panel along with the identities of the consortium/partner organisations. The methods identified by the project were presented in detail and the advantages/disadvantages of the methods explained.

A representative from one of the consortium partners described the systematic literature review undertaken for the Phytoplasmas and advocated the benefits of using systematic literature review in pest risk assessment.

The Panel questioned the project representatives on aspects of the presentation.

11. REVIEW OF EFSA POLICY ON DoIs

The EFSA secretariat advised the Panel of the external review and assessment of EFSA's Declarations of Interest policy. The recommendations of the external reviewer, who undertook a benchmarking exercise, were shared with the Panel. The importance of the independence of experts was stressed as the critical consideration for EFSA and the objective is to produce an integrated policy on independence.

12. MISCELLANEOUS

- **Report from Scientific Committee**

The report from previous Scientific Committee included an update from the working group on terminology and environmental risk assessment. The Panel chair also provided feedback from the presentation of plant health activities to the EFSA Advisory Forum. The work of the Panel was warmly received and positive suggestions for future activities were received from the Advisory Forum representatives.

- Update from PLH Secretariat

The Panel was reminded of the EFSA call for Panel renewal and the importance of including previous involvement with EFSA. Owing to time constraints, the intended presentation and discussion for outsourcing was postponed until the next meeting.

- Next meeting confirmation:

13-14 July 2011 Parma, Italy

Annex 1

With regard to the mandate on *Phytophthora ramorum* (EFSA-Q-2010-00841) Dr. Richard Baker declared an interest in relation to his involvement in preparation of the PRA under evaluation. In accordance with EFSA's policy on Declarations of Interest and Implementing documents thereof, and taking into account the specific matters discussed at the meeting above, the interest above was deemed to be a conflict (level C). Pursuant to EFSA's Procedure on Identifying and Handling Declarations of Interest, the said expert as per point C.III¹ is excluded from drafting the opinion, and discussing and adopting the final Panel output.

With regard to the mandate on citrus canker (EFSA-Q-2010-01262) Dr. Marina Zlotina declared an interest in relation to her current activities with USDA APHIS. In accordance with EFSA's policy on Declarations of Interest and Implementing documents thereof, and taking into account the specific matters discussed at the meeting above, the interest above was deemed to represent a conflict (level C). Pursuant to EFSA's Procedure on Identifying and Handling Declarations of Interest, the said expert as per point C.III¹ is excluded from drafting the opinions, and discussing and adopting the final Panel outputs.

¹ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/doiconflicts.pdf>