

**MINUTES OF THE 12<sup>th</sup> PLENARY MEETING  
OF THE EFSA SCIENTIFIC PANEL ON PLANT HEALTH  
HELD IN PARMA ON 12-13 MARCH 2008**

**(ADOPTED ON 22 MAY 2008)**

#	AGENDA	PAGE
1.	Welcome, apologies for absence	3
2.	Adoption of the agenda	3
3.	Declaration of interests	3
4.	Adoption of the minutes of 11 <sup>th</sup> Plenary meeting	3
5.	Training on web-conferencing	3
6.	EFSA mandate for self-task on guidance document for evaluation of pest risk assessments	4
7.	Report on the status of the opinions on French PRAs	4
8.	Report on the outcome of written procedure	4
9.	<p>Presentation and discussion of draft opinions on PRAs made by France on organisms which are considered by France as harmful in 4 French overseas departments, i.e. French Guiana, Guadeloupe, Martinique and Réunion:</p> <p>“Full PRAs”</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• <i>Panonychus citri</i></li> <li>• <i>Metcalfa pruinosa</i></li> <li>• <i>Xanthomonas axonopodis</i> pv. <i>citri</i> (Xac)</li> <li>• <i>Mycosphaerella fijiensis</i></li> </ul> <p>“Simplified PRAs”</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• <i>Ceratocystis fimbriata</i></li> <li>• <i>Sphaeropsis tumefaciens</i></li> <li>• <i>Citrus chlorotic dwarf virus</i> (CCDV)</li> <li>• <i>Erionota thrax</i></li> </ul>	4

PANEL ON PLANT HEALTH

	<ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>• <i>Nacoleia octasema</i></li><li>• <i>Odoiporus longicollis</i></li><li>• <i>Phyllosticta musarum</i></li><li>• <i>Trachysphaera fructigena</i></li><li>• <i>Mycosphaerella eumusae</i></li><li>• <i>Xanthomonas campestris</i> pv. <i>musaceraum</i></li></ul>	
10.	<b>Miscellaneous</b>	7

**PANEL ON PLANT HEALTH**

**PARTICIPANTS**

***Members of the PLH Panel***

Richard BAKER, David CAFFIER, James William CHOISEUL, Patrick DE CLERCQ, Erzsébet DORMANNSNÉ SIMON, Bärbel GEROWITT, Olia Evtimova KARADJOVA, Gábor LÖVEI, David MAKOWSKI, Charles MANCEAU, Luisa MANICI, Alfons OUDE LANSINK, Dionyssios PERDIKIS, Angelo PORTA PUGLIA, Jan SCHANS, Gritta SCHRADER, Anita STRÖMBERG, Kari TIILIKKALA, Irene VLOUTOGLOU

***Ad hoc experts***

Mariano CAMBRA, Julian SMITH, Emilio STEFANI, Stephan WINTER

***Apologies***

Thierry CANDRESSE, Robert STEFFEK, Johan Coert VAN LENTEREN

***European Commission (DG SANCO)***

Harry ARIJS

***EFSA***

Elzbieta CEGLARSKA, Sharon CHEEK, Giuseppe STANCANELLI, Sara TRAMONTINI

---

**1. WELCOME, APOLOGIES FOR ABSENCE**

The Panel's Chair welcomed the panel members and the Commission observers.

Apologies for absence were received from Thierry CANDRESSE, Robert STEFFEK, Johan Coert VAN LENTEREN.

Apologies for delay were received from Richard BAKER, David CAFFIER, David MAKOWSKI, Alfons OUDE LANSINK.

**2. ADOPTION OF THE DRAFT AGENDA**

The agenda was adopted giving priority to the presentation of "banana" opinions for adoption. These will be presented at the Plant Health Standing Committee (March 31<sup>st</sup>). In addition to the draft agenda the Panel noted that also the presentation of the draft opinions on *Metcalfa pruinosa*, *Mycosphaerella eumusae*, *Trachysphaera fructigena* and *Xanthomonas campestris* pv. *musacearum* need to be included in the agenda.

**3. DECLARATIONS OF INTERESTS.**

It was requested that DoIs be completed and signed as soon as possible, as publication in conjunction with the opinions is planned by the end of March.

**4. ADOPTION OF THE MINUTES OF 11<sup>TH</sup> PLENARY MEETING**

The minutes were adopted.

**5. TRAINING ON WEB-CONFERENCING**

## PANEL ON PLANT HEALTH

Training was provided in part through the web-conferencing presentation by James Choiseul of the draft opinion on *Mycosphaerella citri*, but, due to technical difficulties of internet access, the direct training in the web-conferencing of the Panel members was postponed to another occasion.

### **6. EFSA MANDATE FOR SELF-TASK ON GUIDANCE DOCUMENT FOR EVALUATION OF PEST RISK ASSESSMENTS**

Due to time constraints the presentation and discussion on the guidance document was postponed until the next Plenary.

### **7. REPORT ON THE STATUS OF THE OPINIONS ON FRENCH PRAs**

The summary table on the opinions adoption was presented indicating that 14 scientific opinions on DOMs PRA were scheduled for adoption during the 12th Plenary meeting.

### **8. REPORT ON THE OUTCOME OF WRITTEN PROCEDURE**

The current status of the opinions in written adoption was presented, indicating number of responses received to date. Opinions on *Aceria sheldoni*, *Banana bunchy top virus*, *Prays endocarpa* and *Brevipalpus* spp. were confirmed as adopted.

The opinion on *Banana streak virus* was discussed further in relation to citrus opinions (*Citrus exocortis viroid* and *Hop stunt viroid*) adopted at the 11th Plenary, to clarify justification for the conclusions agreed. The rapporteurs were requested to review text to ensure clarity in the justification presented to support the conclusions. The BSV opinion was adopted.

The opinion on *Prays citri* was further discussed and revised text proposed, to reflect the high level of uncertainty in relation to the variable reports of economic consequences linked with the species and cultivars of host plants, the cultivation practices, and the presence of natural enemies. The Panel confirmed that evidence of economic consequences in areas of its current distribution resulted in the conclusion that *Prays citri* could be considered potentially eligible for addition to the list of harmful organisms in Directive 2000/29/EC. The opinion was adopted.

### **9. PRESENTATION AND DISCUSSION OF DRAFT OPINIONS ON PRAs MADE BY FRANCE ON ORGANISMS WHICH ARE CONSIDERED BY FRANCE AS HARMFUL IN 4 FRENCH OVERSEAS DEPARTMENTS, I.E. FRENCH GUIANA, GUADELOUPE, MARTINIQUE AND RÉUNION**

EFSA was requested to provide a scientific opinion on 30 pest risk assessments made by France on organisms which are considered by France as harmful in 4 French overseas departments, i.e. Guadeloupe, French Guiana, Martinique and Réunion, and in particular whether these organisms can be considered as harmful organisms for the endangered area of the above departments in the meaning of the definition mentioned in Art. 2.1.(e) of the Directive 2000/29/EC and thus potentially eligible for addition to the list of harmful organisms in the Directive 2000/29/EC.

## PANEL ON PLANT HEALTH

The question was accepted at the Plenary meeting in October 2006. The Panel was given 18 months for answering the question.

Two types of pest risk assessments were prepared by the French risk assessors:

“Full” assessments, based on the EPPO scheme [PM 5/3(1)], for harmful organisms for which the probability of introduction into the French overseas departments was considered high.

“Simplified” assessments, for organisms for which the probability of introduction was considered extremely low.

The Rapporteurs presented the following draft opinions for discussion by the Panel:

- **Pest risk assessment on *Nacoleia octasema* (simplified)**

The Rapporteur presented the draft opinion on the assessment made by France on *N. octasema*.

The opinion noted that the probability of entry was extremely low, and in such cases the combination of ratings for entry (low probability) and impact (high) presented difficulties in terms of considering the harmfulness of the organism without taking into consideration management options. Members of the Panel highlighted the need to have decision rules for reaching an overall judgement on risk in such circumstances. A reformulation of the conclusions was proposed. It was noted that this difficulty was a subject of current debate. Decision criteria for the opinions gave weight to the potential impact in the absence of management measures. The opinion was adopted.

- **Pest risk assessment on *Erionota thrax* (simplified)**

The opinion was presented highlighting taxonomic confusion as a key issue and the Panel confirmed that the assessment could not be made on a single species, but covered a number of related species. A high level of uncertainty was noted due to the difficulties of interpreting the literature. The opinion was adopted.

- **Pest risk assessment on *Trachysphaera fructigena* (simplified)**

The opinion was presented in the new EFSA PLH template highlighting the improvements suggested by the Panel during the 9th Plenary. The main modifications regarded the consideration of the other host plants (cacao and coffee) of *T. fructigena* as pathways. During the discussion it was suggested to better clarify in the text the impact of this disease on family gardens and smallholdings growing banana and plantain. After these amendments, the Panel decided to adopt the opinion.

- **Pest risk assessment on *Mycosphaerella eumusae* (simplified)**

This opinion, which was presented and already proposed for written adoption procedure at the 7th Plenary in September 2007, was presented to the Plenary in the new EFSA PLH template. The opinion was adopted by the Panel.

- **Pest risk assessment on *Ralstonia solanacearum* race 2 (full)**

After the precedent Plenary where it was presented (9th Plenary, November 2007), several amendments were included and the opinion was structured in the new template. The Panel discussed

## PANEL ON PLANT HEALTH

the draft opinion and made some minor remarks, requesting clarifications on the vitroplants pathway. The opinion was adopted.

- **Pest risk assessment on *Phyllosticta musarum* (simplified)**

The Rapporteur presented the draft opinion. The Panel discussed the draft opinion particularly regarding the lack of evidence supporting the potential impact of the disease. The Panel considered that the evidence provided did not justify the conclusion on the impact of this disease and that this pathogen should not be eligible for consideration of risk management options. Therefore the Panel asked the Rapporteur to amend the opinion accordingly and to present it again to the Panel the following day. The opinion was accepted for adoption on the second day.

- **Pest risk assessment on *Odoiporus longicollis* (simplified)**

The Panel suggested minor amendments to the text after which the opinion was adopted.

- **Pest risk assessment on *Xanthomonas campestris musacearum* (simplified)**

The opinion, already presented and proposed for written adoption during the 7th Plenary meeting of September 2007, was restructured into the new EFSA PLH template for consistency with the other DOMs opinions and presented to the Plenary. The opinion was adopted.

- **Pest risk assessment on *Mycosphaerella citri* (full)**

The Rapporteur presented the opinion through a web conference. Several amendments were suggested, mostly regarding the lesser importance of control vs. eradication in the establishment step, the control measures and the conclusion of the economic impact. It was proposed that the opinion be amended according to the comments received, revised by the Working Group and then proposed to the Panel by written adoption procedure in April 2008.

- **Pest risk assessment on *Citrus chlorotic dwarf virus CCDV* (full)**

The opinion was presented, highlighting changes made as requested by the Panel at the 11<sup>th</sup> Plenary. The opinion was adopted subject to documentation of uncertainties and clarification of conclusions.

- **Pest risk assessment on *Xanthomonas axonopodis citri* (full)**

The Panel discussed the draft opinion presented by the Rapporteur, particularly regarding the host range and the current regulation. The Panel agreed with the content and the conclusions of the opinion. The opinion was adopted subject to clarification of the host range and current regulation.

- **Pest risk assessment on *Panonychus citri* (full)**

Changes made to the opinion were highlighted to confirm amendments made since it was presented at the 11th Plenary. The opinion was adopted.

- **Pest risk assessment on *Sphaeropsis tumefaciens* (simplified)**

The Panel examined the draft opinion presented. The Panel agrees with the content and the conclusions of the opinion. It was requested to edit the opinion according to the new template

## PANEL ON PLANT HEALTH

particularly regarding the conclusions on the probability of entry, the effect on export markets and the social consequences. The reference to copper in the environmental consequences section was not considered relevant for this disease. The Panel adopted the opinion subject to the suggested amendments.

- **Pest risk assessment on *Ceratocystis fimbriata* (simplified)**

The Panel discussed the draft opinion presented by the Rapporteur. The level of uncertainty related to the direct pest effects and to the species and varieties of citrus host plants were judged by the Panel as not adequately estimated. The Panel requested the opinion to be revised considering information on yield losses and susceptibility of citrus varieties, if available, or adding these elements to the uncertainties. The opinion was proposed for the adoption by written procedure in April after amendments by the Working Group.

- **Pest risk assessment on *Metcalfa pruinosa* and *Parlatoria ziziphi* (full)**

At the 8th Plenary, the opinions on *Metcalfa pruinosa* and *Parlatoria ziziphi* had been presented in the old template, and recommended for adoption by written procedure. Due to the development of the new template, these opinions were reformatted. The Panel discussed the new version of the opinion on *M. pruinosa*, requested further elaboration and supporting evidence to be included. Further review by the Working Group was recommended and the opinion was proposed for adoption by written procedure after the requested amendments. The same procedure was recommended for *Parlatoria ziziphi*.

## 10. MISCELLANEOUS

Next Plenary meeting was confirmed as one day and a half on 21-22<sup>nd</sup> of May. The four remaining opinions (on *Metcalfa pruinosa*, *Parlatoria ziziphi*, *Mycosphaerella citri* and *Ceratocystis fimbriata*) should be circulated for written adoption by the end of April 2008.