

Transport Enforcement Problems

Peter Stevenson

Compassion in World Farming

Journey log deficiencies

- Sometimes no journey log for journeys >8h
- Important parts of journey log often left blank
- Some authorities accept journey logs with unrealistically short estimated journey times
- as a result the rest stops that are obligatory for long journeys are neither planned nor carried out
- Authorities should verify journey time is realistic by checking it on computer program

Unrealistically short estimated journey times

➡ animals do not get 24h mid-journey rest

- **FVO report on France, 2009**
 - Authorities approve short estimated times for cattle to Sicily & Greece & pigs to Sicily
- **FVO report on Belgium, 2009**
 - Journey logs examined from different countries were deficient, incomplete & unrealistic
- **FVO report on Poland, 2010**
 - Authorities approve short estimated times for calves to Italy
- **Two FVO reports on Spain, 2010**
 - Authorities regularly approve unrealistic estimated times – in some cases actual journey 3 times longer than indicated in log
- **FVO report on Lithuania, 2010**
 - “officials reviewing journey logs had failed to ensure that they were realistic for the proposed journeys”

Violations observed on route Spain-Italy

Unrealistic journey times

COMMUNAUTÉ EUROPÉENNE **Certificat intracommunautaire**

Partie I: Détails concernant le lot présenté

1.1. Expéditeur Nom: EXPLOTACIONES GANADERAS DEL SUR Adresse: AVENIDA DE ANDALUCIA 50 Code postal: 41810 Castilleja Del Campo Pays: Espagne (ES)		1.2. N° de référence du certificat INTRA.ES.2006.0016965		1.3. N° de référence locale	
1.3. Destinataire Nom: LA MADDALENA SRL Adresse: VIA QUARANTA 133 Code postal: 70100 Bari Pays: Italie (IT)		1.4. N° de référence du certificat ES47001 Sevilla		1.5. N° de référence locale	
1.6. Pays d'origine Espagne		1.7. Région d'origine ES		1.8. Pays de destination Italie	
1.9. Région de destination IT		1.10. N° de référence du certificat MATTATOIO CE 2612M		1.11. Région de destination IT	
1.12. Lieu d'origine/Lieu de pêche Exploitation <input type="checkbox"/> Centre de rassemblement <input type="checkbox"/> Installation du négociant <input type="checkbox"/> Organisme agréé <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Centre semence <input type="checkbox"/> Exploitation aquaculture agréée <input type="checkbox"/> Equipe embryons <input type="checkbox"/> Etablissement <input type="checkbox"/> Autres <input type="checkbox"/>		1.13. Lieu de destination Exploitation <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Centre de rassemblement <input type="checkbox"/> Installation du négociant <input type="checkbox"/> Organisme agréé <input type="checkbox"/> Centre semence <input type="checkbox"/> Exploitation aquaculture agréée <input type="checkbox"/> Equipe embryons <input type="checkbox"/> Etablissement <input type="checkbox"/> Autres <input type="checkbox"/>		1.14. Date et heure du chargement 28/07/2006 10:00	
1.15. Lieu de chargement Code postal: 41810 Castilleja Del Campo		1.16. Lieu de destination Code postal: 70100 Bari		1.17. Date et heure du déchargement	
1.18. Espèce animale / Produits Chevaux, ânes, mulets et bardots, vivants Equus caballus		1.19. Code produit (Code NC) 0101		1.20. Nombre/Quantité 32,0	
1.21. Température produits Ambiante <input type="checkbox"/> Réfrigérée <input type="checkbox"/> Congelée <input type="checkbox"/>		1.22. Nombre de conditionnement 1		1.23. Type de conditionnement	
1.24. Animaux certifiés aux fins de / Produits certifiés pour: Élevage <input type="checkbox"/> Engraissement <input type="checkbox"/> Abattage <input type="checkbox"/> Transhumance <input type="checkbox"/> Reproduction artificielle <input type="checkbox"/> Equides enregistrés <input type="checkbox"/> Reconstitution gibier <input type="checkbox"/> Animaux de compagnie <input type="checkbox"/> Consommation humaine <input type="checkbox"/> Aliments pour animaux <input type="checkbox"/> Usage pharmaceutique <input type="checkbox"/> Usage technique <input type="checkbox"/> Autres <input checked="" type="checkbox"/>		1.25. Transit par les Etats Membres Etat membre: France Code: FR Etat membre: France Code: FR Etat membre: France Code: FR		1.26. Transit par les Etats Membres Etat membre: France Code: FR Etat membre: France Code: FR Etat membre: France Code: FR	
1.27. Transit par un pays tiers Pays tiers: France Point de sortie: France Point d'entrée: France		1.28. Export Pays tiers: France Point de sortie: France Point d'entrée: France		1.29. Temps estimé de transport 24.0 Heures	
1.30. Plan de marche Oui <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Non <input type="checkbox"/>		1.31. Identification des animaux / des produits Espèces: Race: Age: Sexe: Méthode d'identification: Identification:		1.32. Identification des animaux / des produits Espèces: Race: Age: Sexe: Méthode d'identification: Identification:	

Sevilla (ES) → 2.921 km → Bari (IT) → 41 hours à 70 km/h → 24 hours

No unloading of animals planned, horses to stay on board for 41 hours!

Failure to give food, water & rest

- Requirement often ignored to give animals food, water & 24h rest after 24h travel (pigs, horses), 28h travel (cattle, sheep), 18h travel (unweaned)
- Sometimes no rest break at all
- Sometimes rest much shorter than required by 1/2005
- FVO, 2009: animals rested <24h in the case of 44 of the 55 consignments stopping at French control post
- FVO, 2009: calves arriving in Belgium after long journey from other Member States sometimes get just 1h rest prior to re-export



FVO reports & NGO trails show EU legislation on rest, food & water often ignored during these journeys

Young Irish calves should be given 12h rest on arrival in northern France. Often given no rest or just 3h rest

Permitted stocking density often exceeded

- Overcrowding – particularly harmful when combined with inadequate ventilation, water deprivation & high summer temperatures
- FVO Belgium, 2009: recurrent overstocking during poultry transport tolerated by CCA



Copyright Animals' Angels

Insufficient headroom



Copyright: Animals' Angels

Inadequate drinking devices

- Water tanks sometimes empty
- Drinking devices sometimes fail to function
- Calves & lambs not accustomed to nipples used on many trucks & do not know how to activate them
- Drinking devices often installed on only one side of truck – many animals cannot get to them
- Sometimes nipples too high for lambs to reach

Unfit animals frequently transported

- FVO Bulgaria, 2009: unfit animals being transported
- FVO France, 2009: transport of unfit animals continues to be a serious problem in France
- FVO Lithuania, 2010: transport of unfit animals to slaughter
- FVO Spain, 2010: many cows with serious injuries & arthritic lambs transported to slaughter
- FVO Spain, 2010: actions of CA “still not sufficient to deter” transport of unfit animals

Penalties

- Must by law be “effective, proportionate and dissuasive”
- Often no penalties imposed
- When imposed, often too low to be dissuasive
- Some Member States have no effective powers to impose penalties on transporters from other Member States

Need for effective liaison between Member States

- Regulation 1/2005 requires countries of transit or destination, when they find breaches of the law, to report them to the country of departure so that it can take steps to prevent recurrence
- FVO France 2009: on a number of occasions France has failed to reply to requests for information by Italy
- FVO France 2009: failure to inform other Member States of non-compliances
- FVO Spain 2010: inadequate follow-up of complaints from other Member States
- Countries of departure and of destination should establish clear arrangements with each other under which the destination authorities notify breaches to departure authorities