

Parma, 8 December 2016
EFSA/CONTAM/2917

Scientific Panel on Contaminants in the Food Chain
Minutes of the 81st plenary meeting
Held on 22-24 November 2016, Parma (Italy)
(Agreed on 15-12-2016)

Participants

- **Panel Members:**

Jan Alexander¹, Lars Barregard², Margherita Bignami, Beat Brüscheweiler, Sandra Ceccatelli³, Bruce Cottrill, Mike Dinovi³, Lutz Edler, Christer Hogstrand, Ron Hoogenboom⁴, Helle Knutsen⁵, Carlo Nebbia⁴, Isabelle Oswald, Annette Petersen, Martin Rose, Alain-Claude Roudot⁴, Tanja Schwerdtle, Christiane Vleminckx⁶, Günter Vollmer⁷ and Heather Wallace.

- **Hearing Experts⁸:**

Andrew Hart (for item 7.3)

- **European Commission and/or Member States representatives:**

Frans Verstraete (European Commission, DG Health and Food Safety, unit E2),

- **EFSA:**

- **BIOCONTAM Unit:**

Katleen Baert, Marco Binaglia, Mari Eskola, Michaela Hempen (for item 8), Marta Hugas, Sara Levorato, Karen Mackay, Ruth Roldán Torres, Luisa Ramos Bordajandi and Hans Steinkellner.

- **DATA Unit:**

Andrea Altieri (for item 7.3) and José Ángel Gómez Ruiz (for item 9)

- **Observers:**

Not applicable

¹ Attendance by audio-web conference on 23 November only

² Present on 23-24 November

³ Attendance by audio-web conference on 23 and 24 November only

⁴ Present on 22-23 November

⁵ Attendance by audio-web conference

⁶ Present on 22 and 24 November.

⁷ Attendance by audio-web conference on 22 November only

⁸ As defined in Article 11 of the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest:
<http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>

- **Others:**

Not Applicable

1. Welcome

The meeting was chaired by L. Edler, vice-Chair of the CONTAM Panel, who welcomed the participants. S. Levorato, a new trainee in the CONTAM Team was welcomed by the CONTAM Panel.

2. Apologies for absence

Bettina Grassl-Kraupp (CONTAM Panel), Frank Swartenbroux (European Commission, DG Health and Food Safety, unit E2) and Marina Marini (European Commission, DG Health and Food Safety, unit D1).

3. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes. The content of the Summary report of the 83rd meeting of the Joint WHO/FAO Expert Committee on Food Additives and Contaminants (JECFA)⁹ in relation to the assessment of 3-monochloropropane-1,2-diol (3-MCPD) esters and glycidyl esters was included in the agenda under item 13.

4. Declarations of Interest of Scientific Panel members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes¹⁰ and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest¹¹, EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest and the Specific Declarations of Interest filled in by the Scientific Panel Members invited for the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

5. Agreement of the minutes of the 80th Plenary meeting held on 20-22 September 2016, Parma (Italy)

The minutes of the 80th Plenary meeting held on 20 – 22 September 2016 were agreed on 6 October 2016.

6. Report on the written procedures since 80th Plenary meeting

Not applicable.

⁹ <http://www.fao.org/documents/card/en/c/feb0d3a7-cb80-4dd6-a03a-403bd20d0db4/>

¹⁰ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencpolicy.pdf>

¹¹ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>

7. Scientific outputs submitted for discussion and/or possible adoption

7.1. Draft opinion on the evaluation of substances as acceptable previous cargoes for edible fats and oils (EFSA-Q-2015-00196)¹²

The Chair of the WG on Group Previous cargoes presented the Draft opinion on the evaluation of substances as acceptable previous cargoes for edible fats and oils for possible adoption. The Panel discussed the opinion and, subject to some revisions, adopted it. The vice-Chair of the CONTAM Panel expressed his appreciation to the members of the WG and the EFSA staff.

7.2. Draft opinion on the appropriateness to set a group health based guidance value for T-2 and HT-2 toxins and their modified forms (EFSA-Q-2015-00229)¹³

The Chair of the WG on Group HBGV for mycotoxins presented the draft opinion on the appropriateness to set a group health based guidance value for T-2 and HT-2 toxin and their modified forms for possible adoption. The Panel discussed the opinion and, subject to some revisions, adopted it. The vice-Chair of the CONTAM Panel expressed his appreciation to the members of the WG and the EFSA staff. The Panel noted that, as indicated in the summary report of the 83rd JECFA meeting⁹, in the assessment of 4,15-diacetoxyscirpenol (DAS) JECFA agreed to include DAS in the group 'provisional maximum tolerable daily intake' for the T-2 and HT-2 toxins previously established. The CONTAM Panel will consider this approach in its forthcoming opinion on DAS.

7.3. Draft Scientific Opinion on the risks for animal health related to the presence of zearalenone and its modified forms in feed (EFSA-Q-2015-00247)¹⁴

The Chair of the WG on Zearalenone in feed presented, for discussion, the draft opinion on the risks for animal health related to the presence of zearalenone and its modified forms in feed. The Panel discussed the opinion and, subject to some minor revisions, endorsed the following sections: 3.1.2 Mode of action, 3.2. Feed occurrence data, 3.3 Exposure assessment. The invited Hearing Expert presented the outcome of the uncertainty exercise following the new Scientific Committee Uncertainty Guidance, which was considered at the last WG meeting. The CONTAM Panel discussed the proposed approach to uncertainty analysis and provided comments and suggestions.

8. Draft opinion of the BIOHAZ Panel on hazard analysis approaches for certain small retail establishment (EFSA-Q-2016-00593)¹⁵

The Panel member representing the CONTAM Panel in the WG on HACCP presented the draft opinion with special focus on the chemical hazards. The CONTAM Panel discussed the sections related to chemical hazards and, subject to some minor revisions, endorsed these sections. The vice-chair of the CONTAM Panel expressed his appreciation to the members of the WG and the EFSA staff.

9. Alternaria exposure assessment report

The draft EFSA report of on dietary exposure assessment to *Alternaria* toxins in food was presented to the CONTAM Panel. A discussion was held on the need to update the

¹² <http://registerofquestions.efsa.europa.eu/roqFrontend/questionLoader?question=EFSA-Q-2015-00196>

¹³ <http://registerofquestions.efsa.europa.eu/roqFrontend/questionLoader?question=EFSA-Q-2015-00229>

¹⁴ <http://registerofquestions.efsa.europa.eu/roqFrontend/questionLoader?question=EFSA-Q-2015-00027>

¹⁵ <http://registerofquestions.efsa.europa.eu/roqFrontend/questionLoader?question=EFSA-Q-2015-00593>

conclusions of the previous opinion of the CONTAM Panel on the risks to public health related to the presence of *Alternaria* toxins in food, published in 2011. In this opinion no conclusion could be reached on the risks posed by dietary exposure to alternaria toxins, due to the data-gaps on their toxicity. The CONTAM Panel noted that, in view the lack of new relevant data on the toxicity of the *Alternaria* toxins addressed in the EFSA report, an update of the previous scientific opinion is not warranted. The Panel endorsed the draft report with minor comments.

10. New mandates

10.1 Request for assessment of scientific information related to the presence of free gossypol in whole cotton seed for possible update of the opinion of the Scientific Panel on Contaminants in the Food Chain from EFSA on gossypol as undesirable substance in animal feed. (EFSA-Q-2016-00708)¹⁶

The CONTAM Panel discussed the new mandate and agreed with the proposal of the secretariat to address it with a Panel statement. The Panel Chair agreed to set up an *ad-hoc* working group composed by two CONTAM Panel members, Jan Alexander and Bruce Cottrill.

11. Feedback from the Scientific Committee/Scientific Panels, EFSA, the European Commission

11.1. European Commission

The European Commission representative gave feedback on the activities of the European Commission in relation to the scientific opinions of the CONTAM Panel. Several amendments for current legislation are under discussion with the Member States as an outcome of the CONTAM Panel scientific opinions. In addition, several recommendations to the Member States are under preparation by the European Commission, based on CONTAM opinions.

11.2. CONTAM Panel Working Groups

11.2.1. Update from WG on Fusarium toxins

The Chair of the WG presented the status of the draft opinion on deoxynivalenol (DON), metabolites of DON and modified DON in food and feed (EFSA-Q-2013-00721). It was pointed out that the draft opinion will be sent to the members of the CONTAM Panel before the Christmas break for pre-reading and commenting by emails, and that the final draft will be sent for the possible adoption in the January CONTAM Panel meeting. It was further pointed out by the WG Chair that most parts of the opinion will not change between these two drafts.

The work on the draft opinion on moniliformin (MON) in food and feed (EFSA-Q-2010-01004) has started by the WG on Fusarium toxins.

11.2.2. Update from WG on dioxins in food and feed

This item was deferred to the next meeting.

¹⁶ <http://registerofquestions.efsa.europa.eu/roqFrontend/questionLoader?question=EFSA-Q-2016-00708>

11.2.3. Update from WG on Group HBGV for mycotoxins

See item 7.2

11.2.4 Update from WG on Zearalenone in feed

See item 7.3

11.2.5. Update from WG on Previous cargoes

See item 7.1

11.2.6. Update from WG on Perfluoroalkylated substances (PFASs) in food

The chair of the WG on PFASs in food informed the members of the CONTAM Panel that the draft opinion is progressing well.

11.2.7. Update from WG on Furan in food

This item was deferred to the next meeting

11.2.8. Update from WG on TTX and TTX-analogues

The Chair of the WG presented the Terms of Reference for the scientific opinion on the evaluation of the toxicity of Tetrodotoxins (TTX) and TTX-analogues in bivalve molluscs and marine gastropods. The work has progressed well and currently the WG was evaluating the possible toxicological approaches for setting health based guidance values. At the next CONTAM Plenary in January 2017, the draft opinion will be tabled for a first discussion and endorsement of individual sections.

11.3. EFSA

11.3.1. Advisory Forum

The CONTAM Team Leader informed the CONTAM Panel that the 61st meeting of EFSA's Advisory Forum meeting was held on 28-29 September 2016. Additional information is available on the EFSA website¹⁷.

11.3.2. Management Board

The CONTAM Team Leader informed the CONTAM Panel that the 70th meeting of the EFSA's Management Board was held on 5 October 2016. Additional information is available on the EFSA website¹⁸

11.3.3. Other

The CONTAM Team Leader briefly introduced seven new requests for scientific opinions issued by the European Commission. The new mandates will be circulated to the CONTAM Panel by written procedure, together with the proposals for setting new working groups, and the request for comments and expressions of interest to join the new working groups.

11.4 Scientific Committee and its Working Groups of interest to the CONTAM Panel

C. Vleminckx, vice-Chair of the CONTAM Panel, highlighted the main items discussed in the 81st plenary meeting of the Scientific Committee (SC) held on 16-17 November

¹⁷ <https://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/events/event/160928>

¹⁸ <https://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/events/event/161005>

2016. In particular the draft opinions on biological relevance and on the weight of evidence were presented and discussed by the Scientific Committee. The updated guidance on the benchmark dose approach in chemical risk assessment was adopted by the Scientific Committee.

The respective CONTAM Panel members who are members of the SC WGs of interest to the CONTAM Panel reported on the current status of these WGs, namely the WG on Weight of evidence, WG on Mixtures, WG on Biological relevance, and SWG on Genotoxicity.

12. Other scientific topics for information and/or discussion

12.1. Present status of current outsourcing activities of the CONTAM Team (BIOCONTAM Unit)

For the Article 36 grant on the occurrence of tropane alkaloids in food, the contract was signed with the appointed beneficiaries (Stichting Dienst Landbouwkundig Onderzoek (RIKILT, The Netherlands)), Institut de Recerca i Tecnologia Agroalimentàries (IRTA, Spain), Fera Science Ltd. (UK) and Vysoka Skola Chemicko-Technologicka V Praze (VSCHT, Czech Republic). The final report, received on 08 October 2016, is in the final stages of the approval process.

For the Article 36 grant on occurrence data on citrinin in food, the contract was signed with the appointed beneficiaries (RIKILT, The Netherlands), Netherlands Food and Consumer Product Safety Authority (NVWA, The Netherlands), Università Cattolica del Sacro Cuore (UCSC, Italy), IRTA (Spain) and National Institute of Public Health – National Institute of Hygiene (NIPH-NIH, Poland) in August 2015. EFSA received the draft final report and the final meeting will take place 29 November 2016.

For the Article 36 grant on *in vivo* toxicity and genotoxicity of beauvericin and enniatins, the kick-off meeting with the appointed beneficiaries (Consortium of Istituto Superiore di Sanità (ISS), Italian National Agency for New Technologies, Energy and Sustainable Economic Development (ENEA) and French Agency for Food, Environmental and Occupational Health and Safety (ANSES) was held on 1 April 2016. The first interim meeting was held on 7 October (discussion of the 1st interim report). The next interim meeting (discussion of the 2nd interim report) will be held on 7th April 2017.

For the reopening competition under the multiple framework contract for an extensive literature search on furan and its methyl analogues, 2-methylfuran and 3-methylfuran, a contract has been signed with the Technical University of Denmark (DTU). The activities started in April and the final report was approved by EFSA in July 2016.

For the reopened competition under the multiple framework contract for an extensive literature search on fumonisins and their modified forms, the final project report was received on 21 November and is currently evaluated by EFSA.

For the two negotiated procedures on extensive literature searches, selection for relevance and data extraction of studies related to the toxicity of polychlorinated dibenzodioxins (PCDD), polychlorinated dibenzofurans (PCDFs) and dioxin like-polychlorinated biphenyls (DL-PCBs) in humans and in experimental animals, two contracts have been signed with RPA Ltd/IEH Consulting Ltd and WCA Environment Ltd, respectively. The activities for both contracts started in June and final deliverables have been submitted and approved by EFSA.

A negotiated procedure for the implementation and verification of published dioxin PBPK modelling codes into ACSLXtreme software have been signed with RIVM (The Netherlands) and the kick-off meeting has been held.

13. Any other business

The CONTAM Panel discussed the content of the summary report of the 83rd JECFA meeting⁹ regarding the assessments of 3-MCPD esters and glycidyl fatty acid esters. Differences were identified in the application of benchmark dose modelling for the dose-response analysis approaches applied by JECFA and by the CONTAM Panel. As a result of these different approaches, an important scientific divergence was identified, in particular in the tolerable daily intake levels established for 3-MCPD esters by the CONTAM Panel (0.8 µg/kg bw per day) and JECFA (4 µg/kg bw per day). The CONTAM Panel, upon request from the European Commission representative, agreed that a detailed analysis of the identified divergences is warranted with the aim of concluding whether an update of the CONTAM opinion on the risks for human health related to the presence of 3- and 2-MCPD, and their fatty acid esters, and glycidyl fatty acid esters, is deemed necessary.