

DRAFT MINUTES OF THE 59TH PLENARY MEETING OF THE SCIENTIFIC PANEL ON BIOLOGICAL HAZARDS HELD IN BRUSSELS ON 21-22 SEPTEMBER 2010

AGENDA:

- 1. OPENING, APOLOGIES FOR ABSENCE**
- 2. ADOPTION OF THE AGENDA**
- 3. DECLARATIONS OF INTEREST**
- 4. NEW REQUESTS TO EFSA/BIOHAZ**
 - 4.1 REQUEST FOR AN EVALUATION OF A NEW PROCESSING METHOD ACCORDING TO THE ANIMAL BY-PRODUCT REGULATION**
 - 4.2 MANDATE FROM EUROPEAN COMMISSION TO EFSA ON POSSIBLE USE OF CASINGS FOR MANUFACTURING SAUSAGES MADE FROM THE INTESTINES OF THE BOVINE ANIMALS YOUNGER THAN 12 MONTHS**
- 5. DRAFT OPINIONS FOR POSSIBLE ADOPTION**
 - 5.1 USE OF RECYCLED HOT WATER AS A DECONTAMINATION TECHNIQUE FOR CARCASSES IN THE FRAMEWORK OF EU REG 853/2004**
 - 5.2 MONITORING AND RISK OF THE SALMONELLA TYPHIMURIUM LIKE STRAINS**
 - 5.3 IRRADIATION OF FOOD (EFFICACY AND MICROBIOLOGICAL SAFETY)**
 - 5.4 NESTE OIL APPLICATION FOR NEW ALTERNATIVE METHOD OF DISPOSAL OR USE OF ANIMAL BY-PRODUCTS**
 - 5.5 EVALUATION OF RESULTS OF THE CHRONIC WASTING DISEASE (CWD) SURVEY IN CERVIDS**
- 6. PROGRESS REPORTS AND DISCUSSION ON THE FOLLOWING MANDATES**
 - 6.1 PUBLIC HEALTH HAZARDS TO BE COVERED BY INSPECTION OF MEAT**
 - 6.2 EVALUATION OF TSE TESTS**
 - 6.3 REVIEW AND UPDATE OF THE SCIENTIFIC OPINION ON BSE/TSE INFECTIVITY IN SMALL RUMINANT TISSUES**

- 6.4 EPIDEMIOLOGICAL AND MOLECULAR ASSOCIATION BETWEEN THE ANIMAL AND HUMAN TSE CASES**
- 6.5 QUANTITATIVE RESIDUAL BSE RISK IN MEAT AND BONE MEAL**
- 6.6 AN UPDATE ON THE PRESENT KNOWLEDGE ON THE OCCURRENCE AND CONTROL OF FOOD-BORNE VIRUSES**
- 6.7 NOROVIRUSES IN OYSTERS: METHODS, LIMITS AND CONTROL OPTIONS**
- 6.8 MAINTENANCE OF THE LIST OF QPS MICRO-ORGANISMS INTENTIONALLY ADDED TO FOOD OR FEED (2010 UPDATE)**
- 6.9 *CAMPYLOBACTER* IN BROILER MEAT PRODUCTION: CONTROL OPTIONS AND PERFORMANCE OBJECTIVES AND/OR TARGETS AT DIFFERENT STAGES OF THE FOOD CHAIN**
- 6.10 SAFETY OF FISH OIL FOR HUMAN CONSUMPTION**
- 6.11 RISK BASED CONTROL OF BIOGENIC AMINE FORMATION IN FERMENTED FOODS**
- 6.12 QUANTITATIVE ESTIMATION OF THE PUBLIC HEALTH IMPACT OF SETTING A NEW TARGET FOR THE REDUCTION OF *SALMONELLA* IN BROILERS (*GALLUS GALLUS*)**
- 6.13 RESISTANCE CAUSED BY BACTERIAL STRAINS PRODUCING EXTENDED-SPECTRUM CEPHALOSPORINASES IN FOOD AND FOOD PRODUCING ANIMALS**
- 6.14 RISK FOR HUMAN AND ANIMAL HEALTH RELATED TO THE REVISION OF THE BSE MONITORING REGIME IN SOME MEMBER STATES**
- 6.15 ESTIMATION OF THE PUBLIC HEALTH IMPACT OF SETTING A NEW TARGET FOR THE REDUCTION OF *SALMONELLA* IN TURKEYS**
- 6.16 THE CAPACITY OF OLEOCHEMICAL PROCESSES TO INACTIVATE POSSIBLE RISKS LINKED TO TRANSMISSIBLE SPONGIFORM ENCEPHALOPATHIES IN ANIMAL BY-PRODUCTS NOT INTENDED FOR HUMAN CONSUMPTION**

7. INFORMATION SESSIONS

8. FEED BACK FROM THE SCIENTIFIC COMMITTEE AND FROM OTHER WGS

9. STANDING ITEMS ON THE AGENDA:

- 9.1 EMERGING RISKS**
- 9.2 FEEDBACK FROM THE EUROPEAN COMMISSION: THE TSE ROAD MAP III**
- 9.3. BIOHAZ NETWORKS**

10. ANY OTHER BUSINESS

10.1 TOPICS FOR RESEARCH

10.2 QMRA ON SALMONELLA IN SLAUGHTER AND BREEDING PIGS: ERROR IN THE MODEL

11. CLOSURE OF THE MEETING

PARTICIPANTS

Panel Members:

Olivier Andreoletti, Herbert Budka (apologies), Sava Buncic, John D Collins (apologies), John Griffin, Arie Havelaar, Tine Hald, James Hope, Günter Klein, James McLauchlin, Christine Müller-Graf, Christophe Nguyen-The, Birgit Noerrung (Vice-Chair), Luisa Peixe, Miguel Prieto Maradona, Antonia Ricci, John Sofos, John Threlfall, Ivar Vågsholm, Emmanuel Vanopdenbosch.

EFSA:

Marta Hugas, Fulvio Barizzone, Alessandro Broglia, Ernesto Liebana, Renata Leuschner, Winy Messens, Pablo Romero-Barrios, Pietro Stella, (Scientific staff).

European Commission (EC):

DG Health and Consumers: Sabine Osaer, Koen Van Dyck, Leena Rasanen, Klaus Kostenzer.

1. OPENING AND APOLOGIES FOR ABSENCE

The meeting started at 9:00. Given the absence of the Panel Chair (Prof John D. Collins), the Plenary was chaired by Dr Birgit Noerrung. The Vice-Chair welcomed everyone. Apologies were received from John D. Collins, and Herbert Budka.

2. ADOPTION OF THE AGENDA

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. DECLARATIONS OF INTEREST

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Declarations of Interests, EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of interest (ADoI) and the Specific Declaration of interest (SDoI) filled in by the experts invited to the present meeting. For further details on the outcome of the screening of the ADoI and SDoI (as well as the ones declared at the beginning of the meeting), please refer to Annex I of these Minutes.

4. NEW REQUESTS TO EFSA/BIOHAZ

4.1. REQUEST FOR AN EVALUATION OF A NEW PROCESSING METHOD ACCORDING TO THE ANIMAL BY-PRODUCT REGULATION

A new mandate submitted by the Norwegian Food Safety Authority was received in EFSA and allocated to the BIOHAZ Panel. The terms of reference were discussed and a Working Group will be set up. John Griffin was appointed as Chair person. It has been proposed to the applicant to set the deadline for this mandate in May 2011.

4.2. MANDATE FROM EUROPEAN COMMISSION TO EFSA ON POSSIBLE USE OF CASINGS FOR MANUFACTURING SAUSAGES MADE FROM THE INTESTINES OF THE BOVINE ANIMALS YOUNGER THAN 12 MONTHS

A new mandate submitted by the EC was received in EFSA and allocated to the BIOHAZ Panel. The terms of reference were discussed and a Working Group will be set up. Emmanuel Vanopdenbosch was appointed as Chair person. The agreed deadline for this mandate is 31/12/2010, an extension to 31/03/2011 is under negotiation due to the need of integrating the results of the scientific opinion on the BSE monitoring regime in some Member states which is in progress.

5. DRAFT OPINIONS FOR POSSIBLE ADOPTIONS

5.1. USE OF RECYCLED HOT WATER AS A DECONTAMINATION TECHNIQUE FOR CARCASSES IN THE FRAMEWORK OF EU REG 853/2004

The Draft Opinion as prepared by the Working Group was presented to the Panel by the Chairman of the Working Group, and after a thorough discussion it was adopted by the Panel on the 22/09/2010.

5.2. MONITORING AND RISK OF THE SALMONELLA TYPHIMURIUM LIKE STRAINS

The Draft Opinion as prepared by the Working Group was presented to the Panel by the Chairman of the Working Group, and after a thorough discussion it was adopted by the Panel on the 22/09/2010.

5.3. IRRADIATION OF FOOD (EFFICACY AND MICROBIOLOGICAL SAFETY)

The Draft Opinion as prepared by the Working Group was presented to the Panel by the Chairman of the Working Group, and after a thorough discussion it was adopted by the Panel on the 22/09/2010.

5.4. NESTE OIL APPLICATION FOR NEW ALTERNATIVE METHOD OF DISPOSAL OR USE OF ANIMAL BY-PRODUCTS

The Draft Opinion as prepared by the Working Group was presented to the Panel by the Chairman of the Working Group, and after a thorough discussion it was adopted by the Panel on the 22/09/2010.

5.5. EVALUATION OF RESULTS OF THE CHRONIC WASTING DISEASE (CWD) SURVEY IN CERVIDS

The Draft Opinion as prepared by the Working Group was presented to the Panel by the Chairman of the Working Group, and after a thorough discussion it was adopted by the Panel on the 22/09/2010.

6. PROGRESS REPORTS AND DISCUSSION ON THE FOLLOWING MANDATES

6.1. PUBLIC HEALTH HAZARDS TO BE COVERED BY INSPECTION OF MEAT

The first meeting of the WG on inspection of Swine was on the 13/09/2010 in Brussels. A second meeting is planned for the 19/10/2010 in Parma. The current deadline for the opinion in swine is 31/06/2011.

6.2. EVALUATION OF TSE TESTS

The reports of the laboratory evaluation of the two new rapid tests under assessment were submitted in June/July 2010 by IRMM to EFSA for evaluation. The WG last met on 13 July 2010 in order to discuss the two reports. The next WG meeting is scheduled for 29 September 2010, in order to prepare conclusions on the laboratory evaluation of the tests.

6.3. REVIEW AND UPDATE OF THE SCIENTIFIC OPINION ON BSE/TSE INFECTIVITY IN SMALL RUMINANT TISSUES

The fifth WG meeting took place on 20/09/2010 in Brussels. The Document was discussed thoroughly and will be presented for adoption during the October BIOHAZ Plenary meeting.

6.4. EPIDEMIOLOGICAL AND MOLECULAR ASSOCIATION BETWEEN THE ANIMAL AND HUMAN TSE CASES

This is a joint mandate to EFSA and to ECDC. The last WG meeting took place on the 26 August 2010. Next WG meeting will be held on 6-7 October 2010. Adoption of the opinion is foreseen in December 2010.

6.5. QUANTITATIVE RESIDUAL BSE RISK IN MEAT AND BONE MEAL

The last WG meeting took place on 06/09/2010 in Weybridge. Next WG meeting is scheduled for 08/09/2010 in Brussels. The Chair gave an overall presentation on the modeling approach for this mandate. Adoption of the opinion is foreseen in December 2010.

6.6. AN UPDATE ON THE PRESENT KNOWLEDGE ON THE OCCURRENCE AND CONTROL OF FOOD-BORNE VIRUSES

The working group last met on 30th June 2010 in Barcelona. The next meeting will be a teleconference on the 4th October 2010. The WG Chair gave an overall picture of the progress with this mandate. The deadline for this mandate is December 2011.

6.7. NOROVIRUSES IN OYSTERS: METHODS, LIMITS AND CONTROL OPTIONS

The first WG meeting is scheduled for the 8th November in Paris. The deadline for this mandate is under negotiation.

6.8. MAINTENANCE OF THE LIST OF QPS MICRO-ORGANISMS INTENTIONALLY ADDED TO FOOD OR FEED (2010 UPDATE)

The last WG meeting took place in Brussels on 15th June 2010. The next physical WG meeting will be held on 5th October in Brussels. Adoption is foreseen in December 2010.

6.9. CAMPYLOBACTER IN BROILER MEAT PRODUCTION: CONTROL OPTIONS AND PERFORMANCE OBJECTIVES AND/OR TARGETS AT DIFFERENT STAGES OF THE FOOD CHAIN

The working group last met on 23/24 September in Brussels. A subgroup meeting will take place on 22nd October in Parma. During the October plenary the contractor will present the outsourced model to the BIOHAZ Panel. The next WG meeting is scheduled for 23rd November in Paris. The EC granted an extension of the deadline to March 2011.

6.10. SAFETY OF FISH OIL FOR HUMAN CONSUMPTION

The last WG meeting took place on the 10th September in Lisbon. The next WG meeting is scheduled for 11th October. This opinion will be presented for adoption at the October plenary meeting of the BIOHAZ Panel.

6.11. RISK BASED CONTROL OF BIOGENIC AMINE FORMATION IN FERMENTED FOODS

The last WG meeting took place in Brussels on the 23rd September. The next WG meeting is scheduled for 16 November 2010. Adoption is foreseen in October 2011.

6.12. QUANTITATIVE ESTIMATION OF THE PUBLIC HEALTH IMPACT OF SETTING A NEW TARGET FOR THE REDUCTION OF SALMONELLA IN BROILERS (GALLUS GALLUS)

The next meeting will take place on 22nd October in Parma. The deadline for the opinion is 31/03/2011.

6.13. RESISTANCE CAUSED BY BACTERIAL STRAINS PRODUCING EXTENDED-SPECTRUM CEPHALOSPORINASES IN FOOD AND FOOD PRODUCING ANIMALS

The first WG meeting took place on the 6th of July 2010. The following meeting will be in Brussels on the 12th November 2010. The deadline for this mandate is 31st June/2011. The Panel and WG Chair agreed to the inclusion in the WG of a new

external expert nominated from the Unit in Zoonoses Data Collection in EFSA to work specifically in the harmonised surveillance aspects of the mandate.

6.14. RISK FOR HUMAN AND ANIMAL HEALTH RELATED TO THE REVISION OF THE BSE MONITORING REGIME IN SOME MEMBER STATES

The first working group meeting was held on 7th September in Brussels. The next WG meeting will be held on the 28th of September. Adoption is foreseen on December's Plenary meeting.

6.15. ESTIMATION OF THE PUBLIC HEALTH IMPACT OF SETTING A NEW TARGET FOR THE REDUCTION OF SALMONELLA IN TURKEYS

The WG composition is currently under preparation. Deadline for this mandate is March 2012.

6.16. THE CAPACITY OF OLEOCHEMICAL PROCESSES TO INACTIVATE POSSIBLE RISKS LINKED TO TRANSMISSIBLE SPONGIFORM ENCEPHALOPATHIES IN ANIMAL BY-PRODUCTS NOT INTENDED FOR HUMAN CONSUMPTION

The first WG meeting was held on 23rd September, the industry representatives were invited to present the oleochemical process to be assessed. The WG asked to be provided with the technical report of the process. The next WG meeting will take place after receiving the further documentation. Adoption is foreseen in January plenary meeting

7. INFORMATION SESSIONS

8. FEED BACK FROM THE SCIENTIFIC COMMITTEE AND FROM OTHER WGS

The last meeting of the SC was held on the 14th September 2010. The draft agenda and minutes of that meeting are available on the EFSA website (<http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/events/event/scaf100914.htm>).

9. STANDING ITEMS ON THE AGENDA

9.1. EMERGING RISKS

The BIOHAZ Panel will be informed during each plenary of the potential emerging risks identified by the EmergingRisks Internal Collaboration group (ERIC). A strategy to manage information to and from the Panel was discussed, and will be implemented for the next meetings.

9.2. FEEDBACK FROM THE EUROPEAN COMMISSION

The Head of Unit on Biological Risks from DG SANCO presented the TSE Roadmap 2 to the Panel

The EC provided an updated table with feedback on actions resulting from recently adopted opinions.

9.3. BIOHAZ NETWORKS

The MRA Network met on June the 16th in Parma. The TSE Network will meet on 18-19 November 2010 in Parma.

10. ANY OTHER BUSINESS

10.1. TOPICS FOR RESEARCH

A self-task initiative of the Scientific Committee/Advisory forum was presented to the Panel, and a table with recommendations for research extracted from BIOHAZ opinions published in 2009-2010 was discussed. Feedback will be provided to the SCAF Unit in EFSA.

10.2. MRA SALMONELLA IN PIGS: ERROR IN THE MODEL

EFSA was recently informed of some errors detected in the contractor's QMRA model on *Salmonella* in pigs. The Panel was briefed on this matter and decided to request an addendum to the report, considering possible implications to the conclusions and recommendations of the BIOHAZ Opinion "QMRA on *Salmonella* in slaughter and breeder pigs". The consortium will provide a detailed Erratum and a correction version of their report in week 40. After receiving the report the Panel will discuss the implications on the previously adopted opinion.

11. CLOSURE OF THE MEETING

The meeting closed at 4:30.

ANNEX I

INTERESTS AND ACTIONS RESULTING FROM THE SCREENING OF ADoI OR SDoIs

CONFLICT LEVEL B: In the SDoI filled for the present meeting Dr. Arie Havelaar declared the following interest for the agenda item "**ANY OTHER BUSINESS: QMRA ON SALMONELLA IN SLAUGHTER AND BREEDING PIGS, ERROR IN THE MODEL**": He was part of the consortium that won the research grant (article 36) entitles "Quantitative Microbial Risk Assessment of *Salmonella* in Slaughter and Breeder Pigs". The work is funded by the EU commission through EFSA.

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Declarations of Interests and Implementing documents thereof, and taking into account the specific matters discussed at the meeting in question, the interest above was deemed to represent a conflict of Interest (level B). Pursuant to EFSA's Procedure on Identifying and Handling Declarations of Interest, the said expert incurs the limitations identified under point C.III.b1. That is, he did not take part in the discussions on this agenda item.