

**MINUTES OF THE 55<sup>TH</sup> PLENARY MEETING OF  
THE SCIENTIFIC PANEL ON BIOLOGICAL HAZARDS  
HELD IN PARMA ON 10-11 MARCH 2010**

**AGENDA:**

- 1. OPENING, APOLOGIES FOR ABSENCE**
- 2. ADOPTION OF THE AGENDA AND MINUTES FROM PREVIOUS PLENARY**
- 3. DECLARATIONS OF INTEREST**
- 4. NEW REQUESTS TO EFSA/BIOHAZ**
  - 4.1 REQUEST FOR TECHNICAL ASSISTANCE ON THE FORMAT FOR APPLICATIONS FOR NEW ALTERNATIVE METHODS FOR ANIMAL-BY-PRODUCTS (ABP)**
  - 4.2 ANALYTICAL SENSITIVITY OF APPROVED TSE RAPID TESTS – NEW DATA FOR EVALUATION OF 2 RAPID TESTS**
  - 4.3 EVALUATION OF RESULTS OF THE CWD SURVEY**
- 5. DRAFT OPINIONS FOR POSSIBLE ADOPTION**
  - 5.1 QMRA ON SALMONELLA IN SLAUGHTER AND BREEDING PIGS**
  - 5.2 QUANTITATIVE ESTIMATION OF THE PUBLIC HEALTH IMPACT OF SETTING A NEW TARGET FOR THE REDUCTION OF SALMONELLA IN LAYING HENS (GALLUS GALLUS)**
  - 5.3 TECHNICAL ASSISTANCE ON THE LINK BETWEEN SALMONELLA CRITERIA AT DIFFERENT STAGES OF THE POULTRY PRODUCTION CHAIN**
  - 5.4 REVISION OF THE JOINT AFC/BIOHAZ GUIDANCE DOCUMENT ON THE SUBMISSION OF DATA FOR THE EVALUATION OF THE SAFETY AND EFFICACY OF SUBSTANCES FOR THE REMOVAL OF MICROBIAL SURFACE CONTAMINATION OF FOODS OF ANIMAL ORIGIN INTENDED FOR HUMAN CONSUMPTION**
  - 5.5 PARASITES IN FISHERY PRODUCTS**
- 6. PROGRESS REPORTS AND DISCUSSION ON THE FOLLOWING MANDATES**
  - 6.1 IRRADIATION OF FOOD (EFFICACY AND MICROBIOLOGICAL SAFETY)**

- 6.2 USE OF RECYCLED HOT WATER AS DECONTAMINATION TECHNIQUE OF CARCASSES**
  - 6.3 QUANTITATIVE ESTIMATION OF THE PUBLIC HEALTH IMPACT OF SETTING A NEW TARGET FOR THE REDUCTION OF *Salmonella* IN BROILERS (*GALLUS GALLUS*)**
  - 6.4 *CAMPYLOBACTER* IN BROILER MEAT PRODUCTION: CONTROL OPTIONS AND PERFORMANCE OBJECTIVES AND/OR TARGETS AT DIFFERENT STAGES OF THE FOOD CHAIN**
  - 6.5 ABP ALTERNATIVE METHOD FROM EUROPEAN LIME ASSOCIATION (EULA)**
  - 6.6 EVALUATION OF TSE TESTS**
  - 6.7 EPIDEMIOLOGICAL AND MOLECULAR ASSOCIATION BETWEEN THE ANIMAL AND HUMAN TSE CASES**
  - 6.8 RISK BASED CONTROL OF BIOGENIC AMINE FORMATION IN FERMENTED FOODS**
  - 6.9 APPLICATION FOR NEW ALTERNATIVE METHOD OF DISPOSAL OR USE OF ANIMAL BY-PRODUCTS UNDER REGULATION (EC)N. 1774/2002.**
  - 6.11 RISK ASSESSMENT OF FOOD-BORNE VIRUSES (FBV)**
  - 6.11 FOOD SAFETY CONSIDERATIONS OF NOVEL H1N1 INFLUENZA VIRU INFECTIONS IN HUMANS**
  - 6.12 MAINTENANCE OF THE LIST OF QPS MICRO-ORGANISMS INTENTIONALLY ADDED TO FOOD OR FEED (2010 UPDATE)**
  - 6.13 QUANTITATIVE RESIDUAL BSE RISK IN MEAT AND BONE MEAL**
  - 6.14 MONITORING AND RISK OF THE *Salmonella* TYPHIMURIUM LIKE STRAINS**
  - 6.15 REQUEST FOR A SCIENTIFIC OPINION ON Q FEVER**
  - 6.16 REQUEST FOR A SCIENTIFIC OPINION ON FISH OIL FOR HUMAN CONSUMPTION**
  - 6.17 REVIEW AND UPDATE OF THE SCIENTIFIC OPINION ON BSE/TSE INFECTIVITY IN SMALL RUMINANT TISSUES**
- 7. INFORMATION SESSIONS**
- 7.1 LIBRARY SUPPORT FOR PANEL EXPERTS**
- 8. FEED BACK FROM THE SCIENTIFIC COMMITTEE AND FROM OTHER WGS**
- 9. STANDING ITEMS ON THE AGENDA:**
- 8.1 EMERGING RISKS**

**8.2 FEEDBACK FROM THE EUROPEAN COMMISSION**

- 10. BIOHAZ NETWORKS**
- 11. ANY OTHER BUSINESS**
- 12. CLOSURE OF THE MEETING**

## **PARTICIPANTS**

---

### Panel Members:

Olivier Andreoletti, Herbert Budka, Sava Buncic, John D Collins, John Griffin, Arie Havelaar, Tine Hald, James Hope, Günter Klein, James McLaughlin, Winy Messens, Christine Müller-Graf, Christophe Nguyen-The, Birgit Noerrung, Luisa Peixe, Miguel Prieto Maradona, John Sofos, John Threlfall, Ivar Vågsholm, Emmanuel Vanopdenbosch.

### EFSA:

Marta Hugas, Fulvio Barizzone, Alessandro Broglia, Bart Goossens, Michaela Hempen, Renata Leuschner, Ernesto Liebana, Pablo Romero-Barrios, Pietro Stella, Luis Vivas Alegre (Scientific staff), and Bianca Bottoni (Administrative staff).

### European Commission (EC):

DG Health and Consumers: Koen van Dyck (10/03/2010 only), Sabine Osaer and Josiane Houins-Roulet.

## **1. OPENING AND APOLOGIES FOR ABSENCE**

The meeting started at 9:00, and the Chair welcomed everyone. Apologies were received from Antonia Ricci.

## **2. ADOPTION OF THE AGENDA AND MINUTES FROM PREVIOUS PLENARY**

The agenda was adopted. The draft minutes from the previous Plenary meeting held in January 2010 were adopted at this meeting.

## **3. DECLARATIONS OF INTEREST**

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Declarations of Interests, EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest (ADoI) and the Specific Declaration of interest (SDoI) filled in by the experts invited to the present meeting. For further details on the outcome of the screening of the ADoI and SDoI (as well as the ones declared at the beginning of the meeting), please refer to Annex I of these Minutes.

## **4. NEW REQUESTS TO EFSA/BIOHAZ**

### **4.1. REQUEST FOR TECHNICAL ASSISTANCE ON THE FORMAT FOR APPLICATIONS FOR NEW ALTERNATIVE METHODS FOR ANIMAL-BY-PRODUCTS (ABP)**

A new mandate submitted by the EC was received in EFSA and allocated to the BIOHAZ Panel. The terms of reference were discussed and a Working Group will be set up. John Griffin was appointed as Chair person. The agreed deadline for this mandate is July 2010.

#### **4.2. ANALYTICAL SENSITIVITY OF APPROVED TSE RAPID TESTS – NEW DATA FOR EVALUATION OF 2 RAPID TESTS**

A new mandate submitted by the EC was received in EFSA and allocated to the BIOHAZ Panel. The terms of reference were discussed. Due to the short deadline, a Working Group was set up prior to the March plenary Emmanuel Vanopdenbosch was appointed as Chair person. The agreed deadline for this mandate is April 2010.

#### **4.3. EVALUATION OF RESULTS OF THE CWD SURVEY**

A new mandate submitted by the EC was received in EFSA and allocated to the BIOHAZ Panel. The terms of reference were discussed and a Working Group will be set up. Emmanuel Vanopdenbosch was appointed as Chair person. An extension of the deadline for this mandate from 31<sup>st</sup> July to September 2010 is under negotiation.

### **5. DRAFT OPINIONS FOR POSSIBLE ADOPTIONS**

#### **5.1. QMRA ON SALMONELLA IN SLAUGHTER AND BREEDING PIGS**

The Opinion was presented to the Panel by the chair of the Working Group. After a thorough discussion the document was adopted by the Panel on the 11/03/2010.

#### **5.2. QUANTITATIVE ESTIMATION OF THE PUBLIC HEALTH IMPACT OF SETTING A NEW TARGET FOR THE REDUCTION OF SALMONELLA IN LAYING HENS (GALLUS GALLUS)**

The Opinion was presented to the Panel by the chair of the Working Group. In addition a supporting Scientific Report of EFSA (prepared by the Assessment Methodology Unit (AMU)) was presented. After a thorough discussion the Opinion was adopted by the Panel on the 11/03/2010.

#### **5.3. TECHNICAL ASSISTANCE ON THE LINK BETWEEN SALMONELLA CRITERIA AT DIFFERENT STAGES OF THE POULTRY PRODUCTION CHAIN**

The Opinion as prepared by the Working Group, and the supporting outsourced project contractor report, were tabled. The Opinion was presented to the Panel by the chair of the Working Group, and after a thorough discussion it was adopted by the Panel on the 11/03/2010.

#### **5.4. REVISION OF THE JOINT BIOHAZ/AFC GUIDANCE DOCUMENT ON THE SUBMISSION OF DATA FOR THE EVALUATION OF THE SAFETY AND EFFICACY OF SUBSTANCES FOR THE REMOVAL OF MICROBIAL CONTAMINATION OF FOODS OF ANIMAL ORIGIN INTENDED FOR HUMAN CONSUMPTION**

The guidance document was presented to the Panel by the chair of the Working Group. In addition, the Panel discussed in detail the comments received during the Public Consultation, and agreed on the necessary modifications as discussed by the WG. The Guidance document was subsequently adopted by the Panel on the

11/03/2010. The Panel acknowledged the involvement of invited experts from SCHER, SCENHIR, CRL and an expert from the CEF Panel in the WG.

### **5.5. PARASITES IN FISHERY PRODUCTS**

The Opinion was presented to the Panel by the chair of the Working Group. After a thorough discussion the document was adopted by the Panel on the 11/03/2010.

## **6. PROGRESS REPORTS AND DISCUSSION ON THE FOLLOWING MANDATES**

### **6.1. IRRADIATION OF FOOD (EFFICACY AND MICROBIOLOGICAL SAFETY)**

There was nothing new to report since the last plenary meeting.

### **6.2. USE OF RECYCLED HOT WATER AS DECONTAMINATION TECHNIQUE OF CARCASSES**

The working group last met on the 26<sup>th</sup> of February 2010, and the next meeting will take place on 23<sup>rd</sup> April 2010. Involvement of the CONTAM Panel concerning chemical and toxicological risks is in progress.

### **6.3. QUANTITATIVE ESTIMATION OF THE PUBLIC HEALTH IMPACT OF SETTING A NEW TARGET FOR THE REDUCTION OF SALMONELLA IN BROILERS (GALLUS GALLUS)**

The working group last met on 8<sup>th</sup> of February 2010 via a web conference, and the next meeting will take place in April 2010. Evaluation of the applications received under the recent Call for Tenders has been completed.

### **6.4. CAMPYLOBACTER IN BROILER MEAT PRODUCTION: CONTROL OPTIONS AND PERFORMANCE OBJECTIVES AND/OR TARGETS AT DIFFERENT STAGES OF THE FOOD CHAIN**

The working group last met on 2-3 March 2010, and the next meeting will take place on 20 April 2010. The draft interim report from the contractor has been submitted to EFSA and is under evaluation.

### **6.5. ABP ALTERNATIVE METHOD FROM EUROPEAN LIME ASSOCIATION (EULA)**

Requested information has now been received from EuLA. The working group will now restart the assessment of the application. The deadline for adoption of the Opinion is 30 September 2010.

### **6.6. EVALUATION OF TSE TESTS**

Two new TSE tests are under investigation by IRMM and they will most probably be submitted for evaluation by EFSA during the second semester of 2010.

## **6.7. EPIDEMIOLOGICAL AND MOLECULAR ASSOCIATION BETWEEN THE ANIMAL AND HUMAN TSEs**

This is a joint mandate to EFSA and to ECDC. The working group last met on 9<sup>th</sup> of February 2010, and the next meeting will take place on 22<sup>nd</sup> and 23<sup>rd</sup> April 2010.

## **6.8. RISK BASED CONTROL OF BIOGENIC AMINE FORMATION IN FERMENTED FOODS**

There was nothing new to report since the last plenary meeting.

## **6.9. APPLICATION FOR NEW ALTERNATIVE METHOD OF DISPOSAL OR USE OF ANIMAL BY-PRODUCTS UNDER REGULATION (EC) N. 1774/2002.**

The requested documentary report from the Member State's Competent Authority has been received. An *ad hoc* WG will be set up to assess the application received. John Griffin was appointed as a Chair person of the WG.

## **6.10. RISK ASSESSMENT OF FOOD AND WATER-BORNE VIRUSES (FBV)**

The working group last met on 5<sup>th</sup> of February 2010, and the next meeting will take place on 27<sup>th</sup> April 2010. A draft table of contents for the risk assessment was presented by the WG Chair.

## **6.11. FOOD SAFETY CONSIDERATIONS OF NOVEL H1N1 INFLUENZA VIRUS INFECTIONS IN HUMANS**

There was nothing new to report since the last plenary meeting.

## **6.12. MAINTENANCE OF THE LIST OF QPS MICRO-ORGANISMS INTENTIONALLY ADDED TO FOOD OR FEED (2010 UPDATE)**

The first WG meeting will take place on 23 March 2010.

## **6.13. QUANTITATIVE RESIDUAL BSE RISK IN MEAT AND BONE MEAL**

The first WG meeting will take place on 17<sup>th</sup> March 2010.

## **6.14. MONITORING AND RISK OF THE SALMONELLA TYPHIMURIUM LIKE STRAINS**

The first WG meeting will take place on 19<sup>th</sup> March 2010.

## **6.15. REQUEST FOR A SCIENTIFIC OPINION ON Q FEVER**

This mandate is being addressed by the Panel on Animal Health and Welfare (AHAW) with support from EFSA BIOHAZ panel and the ECDC. A Working Group was formed and met on 24 February and 9 and 10 March 2010. The next meeting is foreseen for 12 April 2010. The BIOHAZ panel is responsible for the chapter on Q fever and food safety. A draft chapter was presented and discussed.

## **6.16. REQUEST FOR A SCIENTIFIC OPINION ON FISH OIL FOR HUMAN CONSUMPTION**

An addendum to the Terms of Reference was provided by the EC. The first WG meeting will take place on 15 April 2010.

## **6.17. REVIEW AND UPDATE OF THE SCIENTIFIC OPINION ON BSE/TSE INFECTIVITY IN SMALL RUMINANT TISSUES**

An extension of the deadline for adoption was requested by end of October. The EC has agreed to extent the deadline only until 1<sup>st</sup> September 2010. The Chair of the WG pointed out that this timeline might not provide enough time for the Panel to deliver an opinion. The Chair of the Panel noted this reservation with concern. The first WG meeting will take place on Friday 19<sup>th</sup> March in Brussels.

## **7. INFORMATION SESSIONS**

### **7.1. LIBRARY SUPPORT FOR PANEL EXPERTS**

Discussion on this topic was deferred to the next Panel meeting in April.

## **8. FEED BACK FROM THE SCIENTIFIC COMMITTEE AND FROM OTHER WGS**

The last meeting of the SC was held on 2<sup>nd</sup> and 3<sup>rd</sup> February 2010. The minutes of that meeting are available on the EFSA website (<http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/events/event/scaf100102.htm>).

## **9. STANDING ITEMS ON THE AGENDA**

### **9.1. EMERGING RISKS**

Nothing new to report.

### **9.2. FEEDBACK FROM THE EUROPEAN COMMISSION**

Nothing new to report.

## **10. BIOHAZ NETWORKS**

Nothing new to report.

## **11. ANY OTHER BUSINESS**

Discussion took place on alternative dates for the BIOHAZ Plenary meeting originally scheduled for the 8-9<sup>th</sup> September 2010, due to coincidence with a major scientific event on the field of prion research. New meeting dates, namely 21<sup>st</sup>-22<sup>nd</sup> September in Brussels, were agreed.

## **12. CLOSURE OF THE MEETING**

The meeting closed at 2 pm.

## ANNEX I

### INTERESTS AND ACTIONS RESULTING FROM THE SCREENING OF ADoI OR SDoIs

CONFLICT LEVEL B: In the SDoI filled for the present meeting Dr. Tine Hald declared the following interest for the agenda item "**REPORT ON THE QMRA ON SALMONELLA IN SLAUGHTER AND BREEDING PIGS**": She is part of the consortium that won the research grant (article 36) entitles "Quantitative Microbial Risk Assessment of *Salmonella* in Slaughter and Breeder Pigs". The work is funded by EFSA.

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Declarations of Interests and Implementing documents thereof, and taking into account the specific matters discussed at the meeting in question, the interest above was deemed to represent a conflict of Interest (level B). Pursuant to EFSA's Procedure on Identifying and Handling Declarations of Interest, the said expert incurs the limitations identified under point C.III.b1. That is, she did not take part in the discussions on this agenda item.

CONFLICT LEVEL B: In the SDoI filled for the present meeting Dr. James Hope declared the following interest for the agenda item "**ANALYTICAL SENSITIVITY OF APPROVED TSE RAPID TESTS – NEW DATA FOR EVALUATION OF 2 RAPID TESTS**": He is an author of the study under assessment and a hearing expert for this WG.

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Declarations of Interests and Implementing documents thereof, and taking into account the specific matters discussed at the meeting in question, the interest above was deemed to represent a conflict of Interest (level B). Pursuant to EFSA's Procedure on Identifying and Handling Declarations of Interest, the said expert incurs the limitations identified under point C.III.b1. That is, he did not take part in the discussions on this agenda item.