

DRAFT MINUTES OF THE 46TH PLENARY MEETING OF THE SCIENTIFIC PANEL ON BIOLOGICAL HAZARDS HELD IN PARMA ON 4-5 MARCH 2009

AGENDA:

1. OPENING, AND APOLOGIES FOR ABSENCE
 2. ADOPTION OF THE AGENDA
 3. DECLARATION OF INTEREST
 4. NEW REQUESTS TO EFSA/BIOHAZ
 - 4.1 Self-tasking mandate for a scientific opinion on maintenance of the list of QPS microorganisms intentionally added to food or feed (2009)
 5. POSSIBLE ADOPTIONS
 - 5.1 Quantitative estimation of the public health impact of setting a new target for the reductions of *Salmonella* in breeding hens
 - 5.2 Genetic TSE resistance in goats
 - 5.3 Public health significance of meticillin resistant *Staphylococcus aureus* (MRSA)
 - 5.4 The use of antibiotic resistance genes as marker genes in genetically modified plants
 6. PROGRESS REPORTS AND DISCUSSION ON THE FOLLOWING MANDATES
 - 6.1 Evaluation of TSE tests
 - 6.2 Revision of the joint BIOHAZ/CEF guidance document on the submission of data for the evaluation of the safety and efficacy of substances for the removal of microbial contamination of foods of animal origin intended for human consumption
 - 6.3 Microbiological efficacy of food irradiation
 - 6.4 Quantitative estimation of the public health impact of setting a new target for the reductions of *Salmonella* in laying hens
 - 6.5 Quantitative estimation of the public health impact of setting a new target for the reductions of *Salmonella* in broilers
 - 6.6 Request for an update and quantification of the risk posed by *Campylobacter* in broiler meat production
 - 6.7 Technical assistance on the link between *Salmonella* criteria at different stages of the poultry production chain
 - 6.8 QMRA on *Salmonella* in slaughter and breeding pigs
 - 6.9 Food safety aspects from the welfare of dairy cows
 - 6.10 ABP alternative method from the European Lime Association (EULA)
 - 6.11 Update BSE monitoring regime for EU15, Slovenia and Cyprus
 - 6.12 BSE-related risk of bovine intestines
 - 6.13 Welfare aspects of stunning and killing of fish
 7. FEED BACK FROM THE SCIENTIFIC COMMITTEE AND FROM OTHER WGs
 8. STANDING ITEMS ON THE AGENDA
 - 8.1 Food safety issues of Avian Influenza
-

8.2	Emerging risks
9.	ANY OTHER BUSINESS
9.1	EFSA's 12 th Scientific Colloquium
11	CLOSURE OF THE MEETING

PARTICIPANTS

Panel Members:

Olivier Andreoletti, Herbert Budka, Sava Buncic, Pierre Colin, John D Collins, Aline De Koeijer, James Hope, Günter Klein, Hilde Kruse, Simone Magnino, Antonio Martínez López, James McLaughlin, Karsten Noeckler, Birgit Noerrung, Miguel Prieto Maradona, Terence Roberts, Ivar Vågsholm and Emmanuel Vanopdenbosch.

EFSA:

Marta Hugas, Fulvio Barizzone, Alessandro Broglia, Bart Goosens, Michaela Hempen, Renata Leuschner, Ernesto Liebana, Tobin Robinson, Pietro Stella, Eirini Tsigarida, Luis Vivas-Alegre, Bianca Bottoni (Administrative staff).

European Commission (EC):

DG Health and Consumer Protection: Kris de Smet, Sabine Osaer.

1. OPENING AND APOLOGIES FOR ABSENCE

The Chair welcomed everyone. Apologies were received from James Hope, Hilde Kruse and Birgit Noerrung.

2. ADOPTION OF THE AGENDA

The agenda was adopted.

3. DECLARATIONS OF INTEREST

The EFSA secretariat screened the ADoI and SDoI filled in by the scientific experts invited to this meeting in accordance with EFSA's Policy on Declarations of Interests.

With regard to the ADoI, SDoI and this meeting no other interest than those already declared in the ADoI or in a previous SDoI and screened by EFSA in accordance with its Policy on Declarations of Interests and implementing documents thereof was declared by the experts.

4. NEW REQUESTS TO EFSA/BIOHAZ

4.1. SELF-TASKING MANDATE FOR SCIENTIFIC OPINION ON MAINTENANCE OF THE LIST OF QPS MICROORGANISMS INTENTIONALLY ADDED TO FOOD OR FEED (2009)

A request for a self-tasking mandate was agreed by EFSA to carry out the annual update of the QPS list. The mandate was presented, and a working group chair appointed.

5. POSSIBLE ADOPTIONS

5.1. QUANTITATIVE ESTIMATION OF THE PUBLIC HEALTH IMPACT OF SETTING A NEW TARGET FOR THE REDUCTION OF *SALMONELLA* IN BREEDING HENS

The draft opinion and report were presented. A number of editorial comments were received. The draft scientific opinion and scientific report will be updated and circulated for adoption by written procedure.

5.2. GENETIC TSE RESISTANCE IN GOATS

The draft opinion was adopted pending some editorial changes.

5.3. PUBLIC HEALTH SIGNIFICANCE OF METICILLIN RESISTANT STAPHYLOCOCCUS AUREUS (MRSA)

The draft opinion was adopted.

5.4. USE OF ANTIBIOTIC RESISTANCE GENES AS MARKER GENES IN GENETICALLY MODIFIED PLANTS

The draft BIOHAZ-GMO joint opinion was discussed in detail and some editorial changes suggested. Adoption is to be decided through written procedure pending comments following presentation of the draft opinion to the GMO Panel on 11-12 March.

6. PROGRESS REPORTS AND DISCUSSION ON THE FOLLOWING MANDATES

6.1. EVALUATION OF TSE TESTS

Nothing to report.

6.2. REVISION OF THE JOINT BIOHAZ/CEF GUIDANCE DOCUMENT ON THE SUBMISSION OF DATA FOR THE EVALUATION OF THE SAFETY AND EFFICACY OF SUBSTANCES FOR THE REMOVAL OF MICROBIAL CONTAMINATION OF FOODS OF ANIMAL ORIGIN INTENDED FOR HUMAN CONSUMPTION

A WG has been established to address this self-tasking mandate. The next meeting will be held on 12th March 2009. The EC welcomed this initiative and suggested to expand the mandate to environmental issues and to involve the non-food committees (SCHER and SCENHIR). Experts from those Committees have been invited to participate in the working group. Considering these issues, the ToRs will be amended accordingly by including the environmental issues and the deadline extended to December 2009 in agreement with the EC services.

6.3. MICROBIOLOGICAL EFFICACY OF FOOD IRRADIATION

A first meeting took place on 5 February 2009. Its results, including the draft structure of the opinion were presented. The next meeting will take place on 2 April in Brussels.

6.4. QUANTITATIVE ESTIMATION OF THE PUBLIC HEALTH IMPACT OF SETTING A NEW TARGET FOR THE REDUCTION OF *SALMONELLA* IN LAYING HENS

The approach for addressing this mandate will be elaborated at the WG meeting on 13 March 2009. The possibility of outsourcing part of the work is being investigated.

6.5. QUANTITATIVE ESTIMATION OF THE PUBLIC HEALTH IMPACT OF SETTING A NEW TARGET FOR THE REDUCTION OF *SALMONELLA* IN BROILERS

This mandate has not yet been addressed by the WG due to the prioritisation of mandates covered under points 5.1 and 6.4 above. The approach to be adopted will be addressed at the WG meeting in March 2009.

6.6. REQUEST FOR AN UPDATE AND QUANTIFICATION OF THE RISK POSED BY *CAMPYLOBACTER* IN BROILER MEAT PRODUCTION

The last working group meeting was held on 11 February. The next meeting will take place on 15 April 2009.

6.7. TECHNICAL ASSISTANCE ON THE LINK BETWEEN *SALMONELLA* CRITERIA AT DIFFERENT STAGES OF THE POULTRY PRODUCTION CHAIN

The next meeting will take place on 28 April. The interim report from the outsourced project is expected to be available at the end of April.

6.8. QMRA ON *SALMONELLA* IN SLAUGHTER AND BREEDING PIGS

The last WG meeting was held on 27-28 January. The consortium carrying out the outsourced work presented the 12-month report to the WG. The EC contractor for the cost-benefit analysis attended the meeting and presented briefly their working approach. The next WG meeting will be on 15-16 June.

DG Health and Consumer Protection organised with support from EFSA a workshop on control of *Salmonella* in pigs which was held in Brussels on 26 February 2009. The members of the WG were invited to attend. The workshop intended to foster communication between risk managers, stakeholders and risk assessors. Around 130 participants attended.

6.9. FOOD SAFETY ASPECTS FROM THE WELFARE OF DAIRY COWS

A combined food safety chapter addressing all four related AHAW opinions is being prepared. An updated draft will be presented at the April Plenary.

6.10. ABP ALTERNATIVE METHOD FROM EUROPEAN LIME ASSOCIATION (EULA)

The first working group meeting took place on 10 February. A letter requesting some clarifications on the received dossier as well as additional information was sent to EULA. The mandate is now placed under "clock stop".

6.11. UPDATE BSE MONITORING REGIME FOR EU 15, SLOVENIA AND CYPRUS

In order to be able to take into account the full 2008 dataset, the extension of the deadline to April 2009 was accepted by the European Commission. The WG is currently waiting to receive the complete dataset, by end of March, in order to perform the calculations necessary to carry out the risk assessment.

6.12. BSE-RELATED RISK OF BOVINE INTESTINES

The Commission has agreed to extend the original deadline to the end of September 2009. A working group is being established to address this issue.

6.13. WELFARE ASPECTS OF STUNNING AND KILLING FISH

A combined food safety chapter addressing all related AHAW opinions is being prepared. The first draft will be presented at the April plenary meeting.

7. FEED BACK FROM THE SCIENTIFIC COMMITTEE AND FROM OTHER WGS

The chair reported back the issues discussed at the last Scientific Committee Plenary meeting (http://www.efsa.europa.eu/EFSA/ScientificPanels/efsa_locale-1178620753812_ScientificCommittee.htm)

8. STANDING ITEMS ON THE AGENDA:

8.1. FOOD SAFETY ISSUES OF AVIAN INFLUENZA

There have been no recent indications of food safety concerns.

8.2. INDICATORS FOR EMERGING RISKS

This item will continue to be a standing item on the agenda in order to facilitate in a timely manner the identification of possible emerging risks posed by biological hazards.

9. ANY OTHER BUSINESS

9.1. EFSA'S 12TH SCIENTIFIC COLLOQUIUM

EFSA organized the Colloquium: Assessing Health Benefits of controlling Campylobacter in the food chain on 4-5 December in Rome (Italy)

Some 90 scientists and stakeholders from 30 countries, including the USA and New Zealand, attended a meeting organised by EFSA on 'Assessing health benefits of controlling Campylobacter in the food chain' in Rome. The participants worked in 4 separate discussion groups: the source attribution and health impact of Campylobacter; its quantitative risk assessment in broiler meat; its resistance to fluoroquinolones (an antimicrobial substance) and effective control measures in broiler meat production from farm to fork.

Full details of the conclusions will be available in a Summary Report to be published on EFSA's website in spring 2009.

10. CLOSURE OF THE MEETING

The meeting closed at 14.45.