

## MINUTES OF THE 40TH PLENARY MEETING OF THE SCIENTIFIC PANEL ON BIOLOGICAL HAZARDS HELD IN PARMA ON 4-5 JUNE 2008

### AGENDA:

---

- 1 Opening, apologies for absence
- 2 Adoption of the agenda
- 3 Declarations of interest
- 4 New requests to EFSA/BIOHAZ
- 5 Follow up from the EC: from risk assessments to regulatory issues
- 6 Discussion and possible adoption of opinions
  - 6.1 Assessment on the risk related to TSEs from carcasses of ovine and caprine animals below 6 months of age intended for human consumption
  - 6.2 Microbiological risk assessment on feedingstuffs for food-producing animals
- 7 Progress reports and discussion on the following mandates
  - 7.1 Follow up of the QPS approach for assessing the safety of microorganisms intentionally added to the food chain
  - 7.2 Overview of source attribution methodology
  - 7.3 Assessment on the risk for human and animal health related to the revision of the BSE monitoring regime in some MS
  - 7.4 Further consideration of age-related parameters on the Risk for Human and Animal Health related to the revision of the BSE Monitoring regime in some Member States.
  - 7.5 Public health significance of meticillin resistant *Staphylococcus aureus* (MRSA)
  - 7.6 Quantitative estimation of the public health impact of setting a new target for the reductions of *Salmonella* in certain poultry productions: breeding hens, laying hens and poultry
  - 7.7 Technical assistance on the link between *Salmonella* criteria at different stages of the poultry production chain
  - 7.8 TSE infectivity in milk and milk products from small ruminants
  - 7.9 Special measures to reduce the risk for consumers through *Salmonella* in table eggs – e.g. cooling of table eggs
  - 7.10 QMRA on *Salmonella* in slaughter and breeding pigs
  - 7.11 Food safety aspects from the welfare of dairy cows
  - 7.12 Food safety aspects from the welfare of fish welfare
  - 7.13 Foodborne antimicrobial resistance as a biological hazard
- 8 Feed back from the Scientific Committee and from other WGs
  - 8.1 Risk benefit analysis
- 9 Standing items on the agenda:
  - 9.1 Food safety issues of Avian Influenza
  - 9.2 Emerging risks
- 10 Activities of the Zoonoses Data Collection Unit related to biological hazards

---

- 11 Dates for Plenaries meeting in 2009
- 12 Any Other Business
- 13 Closure of the meeting

## **PARTICIPANTS**

### Panel Members:

Olivier Andreoletti, Herbert Budka, Sava Buncic, Pierre Colin, John D Collins, Aline De Koeijer, John Griffin, Arie Havelaar, James Hope, Günter Klein, Simone Magnino, Miguel Prieto Maradona, Antonio Martínez López, James McLauchlin, Christophe Nguyen-The, Karsten Noeckler, Birgit Noerrung and Emmanuel Vanopdenbosch.

### EFSA:

Marta Hugas, Pia Mäkelä (item 10), Fulvio Barizzone, Ernesto Liebana Criado, Michaela Hempen, Tobin Robinson, Pietro Stella, Eirini Tsigarida, Luis Vivas-Alegre Alessandro Mannelli, (Scientific Staff), Bianca Bottoni (Administrative staff).

### European Commission (EC):

DG Health and Consumer Protection: Taina Sateri.

## **1. OPENING, APOLOGIES FOR ABSENCE**

The Chair welcomed everyone. Apologies were received from Hilde Kruse, Terence Roberts and Ivar Vågsholm.

## **2. ADOPTION OF THE AGENDA**

The agenda was adopted.

## **3. DECLARATIONS OF INTEREST**

There were no new declarations of interest.

## **4. NEW REQUESTS TO EFSA/BIOHAZ**

### **4.1. EXAMINATION AND SELECTION OF APPLICATIONS FOR TSE TEST SUITABLE TO ENTER INTO A FORMAL EVALUATION PROGRAMME**

European Commission requests EFSA to evaluate six dossiers. A WG will be created.

### **4.2. TECHNICAL GUIDE FOR THE SCIENTIFIC DATA COLLECTION ON ANTIMICROBIAL RESISTANCE WITHIN THE FRAME WORK OF THE USE OF AMTs<sup>1</sup> FOR THE DECONTAMINATION OF POULTRY CARCASSES**

A request for this technical guide was received from the European Commission. EFSA asked EC for clarification on the scope of the document and on the deadline.

## **5. FOLLOW UP FROM THE EC: FROM RISK ASSESSMENTS TO REGULATORY ISSUES**

---

<sup>1</sup> Antimicrobial treatments

The representative of the Commission presented the European legislation adopted and the legal actions taken as a consequence of the Opinions of BIOHAZ Panel adopted from June 2006 until May 2008.

## **6. DISCUSSION AND POSSIBLE ADOPTION OF OPINIONS**

### **6.1. ASSESSMENT ON THE RISK RELATED TO TSEs FROM CARCASSES OF OVINE AND CAPRINE ANIMALS BELOW 6 MONTHS OF AGE INTENDED FOR HUMAN CONSUMPTION**

The draft opinion was adopted pending some technical and editorial changes which were agreed.

### **6.2. MICROBIOLOGICAL RISK ASSESSMENT ON FEEDINGSTUFFS FOR FOOD-PRODUCING ANIMALS**

The Chair of the WG on microbiological risk assessment on feedingstuffs presented the draft opinion. Discussion took place on the conclusions and recommendations after which the opinion was adopted.

## **7. PROGRESS REPORTS AND DISCUSSION ON THE FOLLOWING MANDATES**

### **7.1. FOLLOW-UP OF THE QPS APPROACH FOR ASSESSING THE SAFETY OF MICROORGANISMS INTENTIONALLY ADDED TO THE FOOD CHAIN**

The WG met on 28 May. The next meeting is foreseen in the end of August.

### **7.2. OVERVIEW OF SOURCE ATTRIBUTION METHODOLOGY**

The WG met on 30 May. The draft opinion was presented to the Panel for its first reading and discussion took place on the conclusions and recommendations. The draft opinion will be discussed at the next plenary meeting with a view to possible adoption.

### **7.3. ASSESSMENT ON THE RISK FOR HUMAN AND ANIMAL HEALTH RELATED TO THE REVISION OF THE BSE MONITORING REGIME IN SOME MS**

The draft opinion was discussed. Adoption is foreseen in July.

### **7.4. FURTHER CONSIDERATION OF AGE-RELATED PARAMETERS ON THE RISK FOR HUMAN AND ANIMAL HEALTH RELATED TO THE REVISION OF THE BSE MONITORING REGIME IN SOME MEMBER STATES**

The draft opinion was discussed. Adoption is foreseen in July.

## **7.5. PUBLIC HEALTH SIGNIFICANCE OF METICILLIN RESISTANT STAPHYLOCOCCUS AUREUS (MRSA)**

The first WG meeting is to be held following the plenary meeting. Representatives of the ECDC, EMEA and AHAW Panel have been invited.

## **7.6. QUANTITATIVE ESTIMATION OF THE PUBLIC HEALTH IMPACT OF SETTING A NEW TARGET FOR THE REDUCTIONS OF *Salmonella* IN CERTAIN POULTRY PRODUCTIONS: BREEDING HENS, LAYING HENS AND BROILERS**

This request from the Commission consists of three mandates on the quantitative estimation of the public health impact of setting a new target for the reduction of *Salmonella* in (i) breeding hens of *Gallus gallus*, (ii) in laying hens and (iii) in broilers. The expected deadlines are March 2009, March 2010 and March 2011. Three different WGs will address these mandates. A WG on the quantitative estimation of the public health impact of setting a new target for the reduction of *Salmonella* in breeding hens of *Gallus gallus* will meet soon.

## **7.7. TECHNICAL ASSISTANCE ON THE LINK BETWEEN *Salmonella* CRITERIA AT DIFFERENT STAGES OF THE POULTRY PRODUCTION CHAIN**

Commission asked EFSA for a technical assistance on the link between *Salmonella* criteria at different stages of the poultry production. A call for data related to process hygiene criteria of *Salmonella* in turkey and broiler carcasses is being considered.

## **7.8. TSE INFECTIVITY IN MILK AND MILK PRODUCTS FROM SMALL RUMINANTS**

The possible composition of the WG was discussed. The WG will aim to have its first meeting in July and adoption is foreseen in October. Discussion took place on the scientific publications and opinions available from national risk assessment bodies.

## **7.9. SPECIAL MEASURES TO REDUCE THE RISK FOR CONSUMERS THROUGH *Salmonella* IN TABLE EGGS – E.G. COOLING OF TABLE EGGS**

The WG was established and the first meeting is scheduled for the 19 June. An observer from the requestor (BfR<sup>2</sup>) of this mandate was invited in the meeting.

## **7.10. QMRA ON *Salmonella* IN SLAUGHTER AND BREEDING PIGS**

Commission informed EFSA that there will be a delay in sending the data from the baseline study on the prevalence of *Salmonella* in herds of breeding pigs. As a consequence there will be a delay in submitting the final report from the project

---

<sup>2</sup> BfR - Bundesinstitut für Risikobewertung (German Risk Assessment group)

funded under Article 36, which will in turn necessitate a delay in adopting the associated opinion.

### **7.11. FOOD SAFETY ASPECTS FROM THE WELFARE OF DAIRY COWS**

The WG will meet on 13 June.

### **7.12. FOOD SAFETY ASPECTS FROM THE WELFARE OF FISH**

The WG will meet on 18 June. A draft opinion will be presented at the next plenary meeting.

### **7.13. FOODBORNE ANTIMICROBIAL RESISTANCE AS A BIOLOGICAL HAZARD**

The public consultation of the draft opinion and the call for data on the prevalence of certain antimicrobial resistant bacteria in foods closed on 27 May 2008<sup>3</sup>. Twelve replies for the public consultation and six replies on the call of data were received from meat associations, industry, scientific societies and national food safety authorities and risk assessment bodies. The BIOHAZ Panel wishes to acknowledge and express gratitude to those who provided comments. The WG will meet to discuss the comments and the need to revise the draft opinion. The revised draft opinion will be presented at the next plenary meeting.

## **8. FEED BACK FROM THE SCIENTIFIC COMMITTEE AND FROM OTHER WGS**

The 30<sup>th</sup> Plenary meeting of the Scientific Committee was held on 21-22 April<sup>4</sup>.

### **8.1. RISK BENEFIT ANALYSIS**

Apologies were received from the member of the WG (see item 1) and this item was not discussed.

## **9. STANDING ITEMS ON THE AGENDA:**

### **9.1. FOOD SAFETY ISSUES OF AVIAN INFLUENZA**

There had been no indications of food safety concerns.

---

<sup>3</sup> [www.efsa.europa.eu/EFSA/efsa\\_locale-1178620753812\\_1178700895856.htm](http://www.efsa.europa.eu/EFSA/efsa_locale-1178620753812_1178700895856.htm)

<sup>4</sup> [www.efsa.europa.eu/EFSA/efsa\\_locale-1178620753812\\_1178700136320.htm](http://www.efsa.europa.eu/EFSA/efsa_locale-1178620753812_1178700136320.htm)

## **9.2. EMERGING RISKS**

The ESCO<sup>5</sup> WG on Emerging Risks comprises around 26 members. Two sub-WGs have been formed to deal with different aspects of the early identification of emerging risks. The WG is reviewing the benefits of an interaction with non-food bodies regarding the timely collection and assessment of information.

## **10. ACTIVITIES OF THE ZOONOSES DATA COLLECTION UNIT RELATED TO BIOLOGICAL HAZARDS**

The Head of the Zoonoses Data Collection Unit presented their current activities. The Panel welcomed the presentation and acknowledged the good collaboration between the two EFSA's units. The Panel offered their help in exchanging further documents.

## **11. DATES FOR PLENARIES MEETINGS IN 2009**

The Panel agreed on the following dates for Plenary meetings in 2009:

21-22 January 2009	8-9 July 2009
4-5 March 2009	9-10 September 2009
22-23 April 2009	21-22 October 2009
27-28 May 2009	9-10 December 2009

## **12. ANY OTHER BUSINESS**

### **12.1. CORRIGENDUM TO THE OPINION ON CONSUMPTION OF BEEF TONGUE: HUMAN BSE RISK ASSOCIATED WITH EXPOSURE TO LYMPHOID TISSUE IN BOVINE TONGUE IN CONSIDERATION OF NEW RESEARCH FINDINGS.**

An error was identified by the Rapporteur of the WG and the Panel approved the correction. The error identified did not have any impact either on any conclusion drawn from the text nor on the final outcome of the Opinion. It was agreed that an updated version of the opinion with the corrected sentence<sup>6</sup> will replace the version published on the web as soon as possible and the corrigendum will then be attached on the first page of the Opinion<sup>7</sup>.

### **12.2. RESEARCH PROJECTS ON PRIONS WITHIN THE 7<sup>TH</sup> FRAMEWORK PROGRAMME FOR RESEARCH AND TECHNOLOGICAL DEVELOPMENT**

---

<sup>5</sup> ESCO - EFSA Scientific Cooperation

<sup>6</sup> In this revision, the original sentence "Buschmann and Groschup (2005) provide data on a Tgbov mice model giving a 1.000-10.000 fold greater sensitivity than the cattle bioassay." at lines 6-8 of page 12 of the document has been replaced by the sentence "Buschmann and Groschup (2005) provide data on a Tgbov mice model giving a 10 fold greater sensitivity than the cattle intra-cerebral bioassay."

<sup>7</sup> [http://www.efsa.europa.eu/EFSA/Scientific\\_Opinion/biohaz\\_op\\_ej700\\_bovine\\_tongue\\_rev1\\_en.pdf](http://www.efsa.europa.eu/EFSA/Scientific_Opinion/biohaz_op_ej700_bovine_tongue_rev1_en.pdf)

The Panel expressed its concern regarding the reduction in the funding to be provided under the latest call for the 7<sup>th</sup> FP for research on prions. The Panel considered how cooperation with DG Research could be further enhanced.

**13. CLOSURE OF THE MEETING**

The meeting closed at 13.30.