

**MINUTES OF THE 23<sup>rd</sup> PLENARY MEETING  
OF THE SCIENTIFIC PANEL ON  
FOOD ADDITIVES, FLAVOURINGS, PROCESSING AIDS  
AND MATERIALS IN CONTACT WITH FOOD**

**Held in Brussels on 15-16 May 2007**

**Adopted on 3 July 2007 at the 24<sup>th</sup> Plenary meeting**

**AGENDA:**

1.	<i>Welcome; apologies for absence</i> .....	3
2.	<i>Adoption of the agenda</i> .....	3
3.	<i>Declarations of interest</i> .....	3
4.	<i>Matters arising from the 22<sup>ND</sup> plenary meeting held on 17-19 April 2007</i> .....	4
4.1.	<i>Adoption of the minutes</i> .....	4
5.	<i>General information from EFSA and the Commission</i> .....	4
6.	<i>Feedback from recent meetings of the Scientific Committee, management board and advisory forum</i> .....	4
7.	<i>Flavourings</i> .....	4
7.1.	<i>Camphor (EFSA-Q-2003-144)</i> .....	4
7.2.	<b><i>Flavouring Group Evaluations (FGE)</i></b> .....	4
7.2.1.	FGE.01-revised .....	4
7.2.2.	FGE.02-revised .....	5
7.2.3.	FGE.14-revised (EFSA-Q-2003-157-revised) .....	5
	Phenethyl alcohol, aldehyde, acetal, a carboxylic acid and related esters. ....	5
7.2.4.	FGE.16-revised (EFSA-Q-2003-159-revised) .....	5
	Aromatic ketones. ....	5
7.2.5.	FGE.19 (Q)SAR).....	5
	(Q)SAR predictions on 271 alpha, beta-unsaturated substances or precursors predicted to be metabolised to alpha, beta-unsaturated aldehydes and ketones.....	5
7.3.	<b><i>Review of JECFA evaluations of flavourings since 2000 (EFSA-Q-2004-049)</i></b> .....	5
7.3.1.	FGE.51: 13 alicyclic ketones and secondary alcohols and related esters evaluated by JECFA (59th meeting). .....	6
7.3.2.	FGE.52: 45 hydroxy- and alkoxy-substituted benzyl derivates evaluated by JECFA (57th meeting).6	

7.3.3. FGE.53: 41 phenethyl alcohol, aldehyde, acid and related acetals and esters evaluated by JECFA (59th meeting).....	6
7.3.4. FGE.54: Consideration of 36 benzyl derivates evaluated by JECFA (57th meeting).....	6
7.3.5. FGE.55: 15 phenyl-substituted aliphatic alcohols and related aldehydes and esters evaluated by JECFA (63rd meeting).....	6
7.3.6. FGE.56: 22 monocyclic and bicyclic secondary alcohols, ketones, and related esters evaluated by JECFA (63rd meeting).....	6
8. <i>Any other business</i> .....	7
8.1. <i>The genotoxic potential in vivo and in vitro of estragole and tarragon</i> .....	7
8.2. <i>Behaviour study on food colours and benzoate</i> .....	7

**MINUTES OF THE 23<sup>rd</sup> PLENARY MEETING  
OF THE SCIENTIFIC PANEL ON  
FOOD ADDITIVES, FLAVOURINGS, PROCESSING AIDS  
AND MATERIALS IN CONTACT WITH FOOD (AFC)  
Held in Brussels on 15-16 May 2007**

---

**PARTICIPANTS**

Panel Members:

Fernando Aguilar, Herman Autrup, Susan Barlow (Chair), Laurence Castle (2<sup>nd</sup> day), Riccardo Crebelli, Karl-Heinz Engel (Vice Chair), Nathalie Gontard, David Gott (2<sup>nd</sup> day), Rainer Gürtler, John Christian Larsen (Vice Chair), Jean-Charles Leblanc, Catherine Leclercq, F. Xavier Malcata, Wim C. Mennes, Iona Pratt, Paul Tobback, Fidel Toldrá.

Experts:

Jørn Gry (item 9.3).

Apologies

Wolfgang Dekant, Sandro Grilli, Maria Rosaria Milana, Ivonne Rietjens.

EFSA

Torben Hallas-Møller (scientific co-ordinator of AFC Panel), Kim Rygaard Nielsen (assistant scientific co-ordinator of AFC Panel), Anne Theobald (assistant scientific co-ordinator of AFC Panel); Ilse Koenig (administrative assistant of AFC Panel), Maud Pâques (administrative secretary of AFC Panel).

Commission

Xavier Pavar (DG Health and Consumer Affairs), Wim Debeuckelaere (DG Health and Consumer Affairs).

**1. WELCOME; APOLOGIES FOR ABSENCE**

The chair welcomed the participants and the secretariat noted apologies.

**2. ADOPTION OF THE AGENDA**

The agenda was adopted.

**3. DECLARATIONS OF INTEREST**

No declarations concerning items on the agenda of this meeting.

## **4. MATTERS ARISING FROM THE 22<sup>ND</sup> PLENARY MEETING HELD ON 17-19 APRIL 2007**

### **4.1. Adoption of the minutes**

The draft minutes were discussed. The Panel was informed about the latest development concerning the Primary Product FF-B and after adding a "post meeting note" the minutes were adopted.

They can be seen on:

[http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/science/afc/afc\\_meetings/afc\\_22nd\\_meeting.html](http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/science/afc/afc_meetings/afc_22nd_meeting.html)

## **5. GENERAL INFORMATION FROM EFSA AND THE COMMISSION**

EFSA: 5<sup>th</sup> anniversary Scientific Forum will be organised in Brussels on 20-21 Nov. Parallel sessions will be held on food additives and flavourings; on active and intelligent packaging and on nanotechnologies.

EC: The ENVI committee in the European Parliament has voted on the proposal on a Regulation on Food Flavourings.

The European Commission has started preparation of the Flavourings Positive List using already adopted revised Flavouring Groups Evaluations (FGE revised) and adopted considerations of JECFA evaluated flavourings. The Commission will inform the Panel how the work will proceed and be implemented.

## **6. FEEDBACK FROM RECENT MEETINGS OF THE SCIENTIFIC COMMITTEE, MANAGEMENT BOARD AND ADVISORY FORUM**

The secretariat shortly informed on the 21<sup>st</sup> Advisory Forum meeting held on 19 of April in Berlin.

Minutes from the Advisory Forum meetings can be found on  
[http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/advisory\\_forum/adv\\_meetings.html](http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/advisory_forum/adv_meetings.html)

## **7. FLAVOURINGS**

### **7.1. Camphor (EFSA-Q-2003-144)**

The rapporteur introduced the draft opinion, which was extensively discussed. New issues were raised and it was therefore decided to refer the draft back to the Working Group for further elaboration.

### **7.2. Flavouring Group Evaluations (FGE)**

#### **7.2.1. FGE.01-revised**

Branched-chain aliphatic saturated aldehydes, carboxylic acids and related esters of primary alcohols and branched-chain carboxylic acids.

The draft opinion was not evaluated due to lack of time. The draft opinion will be on the agenda for the next Plenary 3 – 5 July 2007

#### 7.2.2. **FGE.02-revised**

Branched- and straight-chain aliphatic saturated primary alcohols, and related esters of primary alcohols and straight-chain carboxylic acids and one straight-chain aldehyde.

The draft opinion was not evaluated due to lack of time. The draft opinion will be on the agenda for the next Plenary 3 – 5 July 2007

#### 7.2.3. **FGE.14-revised (EFSA-Q-2003-157-revised)**

Phenethyl alcohol, aldehyde, acetal, a carboxylic acid and related esters.

J. Gry introduced the draft opinion, which was discussed and revisions were made. The opinion was adopted subject to these revisions.

The full opinion will be published on:

[http://www.efsa.eu.int/science/afc/afc\\_opinions/catindex\\_en.html](http://www.efsa.eu.int/science/afc/afc_opinions/catindex_en.html) as an update of the previously adopted opinions on the respective FGEs.

#### 7.2.4. **FGE.16-revised (EFSA-Q-2003-159-revised)**

Aromatic ketones.

J. Gry introduced the draft opinion, which was discussed and revisions were made. The opinion was adopted subject to these revisions.

The full opinion will be published on:

[http://www.efsa.eu.int/science/afc/afc\\_opinions/catindex\\_en.html](http://www.efsa.eu.int/science/afc/afc_opinions/catindex_en.html).

#### 7.2.5. **FGE.19 (Q)SAR**

(Q)SAR predictions on 271 alpha, beta-unsaturated substances or precursors predicted to be metabolised to alpha, beta-unsaturated aldehydes and ketones

An ad hoc working group under the Flavouring Working Group had discussed the applicability of (Quantitative) Structure Activity Relationships as a tool for predicting the potential for genotoxicity of this group of substances. Working papers were presented by J. Gry and the models were extensively discussed.

No final conclusion was reached, but it was decided that the WG should refine the method and present the results to the Plenary.

### 7.3. **Review of JECFA evaluations of flavourings since 2000 (EFSA-Q-2004-049)**

According to the provisions in Commission Regulation (EC) No 1565/2000 EFSA has been requested by the European Commission to consider JECFA's evaluations of flavourings substances assessed since 2000, and to decide whether further evaluation would be necessary. It has been decided to divide these evaluations into groups (FGE.50 and

onwards), which can be compared to the Flavouring Group Evaluations (FGE), already adopted by the Plenary.

7.3.1. **FGE.51: 13 alicyclic ketones and secondary alcohols and related esters evaluated by JECFA (59th meeting).**

J. Gry introduced the draft opinion, which was discussed and revisions were made. The opinion was adopted subject to these revisions.

The full opinion will be published on:

[http://www.efsa.eu.int/science/afc/afc\\_opinions/catindex\\_en.html](http://www.efsa.eu.int/science/afc/afc_opinions/catindex_en.html).

7.3.2. **FGE.52: 45 hydroxy- and alkoxy-substituted benzyl derivates evaluated by JECFA (57th meeting).**

Not discussed because of lack of time. The draft will be on the agenda at next Plenary 3-5 July 2007.

7.3.3. **FGE.53: 41 phenethyl alcohol, aldehyde, acid and related acetals and esters evaluated by JECFA (59th meeting).**

J. Gry introduced the draft opinion, which was discussed and revisions were made. The opinion was adopted subject to these revisions.

The full opinion will be published on:

[http://www.efsa.eu.int/science/afc/afc\\_opinions/catindex\\_en.html](http://www.efsa.eu.int/science/afc/afc_opinions/catindex_en.html).

7.3.4. **FGE.54: Consideration of 36 benzyl derivates evaluated by JECFA (57th meeting).**

J. Gry introduced the draft opinion, which was discussed and revisions were made. The opinion was adopted subject to these revisions.

The full opinion will be published on:

[http://www.efsa.eu.int/science/afc/afc\\_opinions/catindex\\_en.html](http://www.efsa.eu.int/science/afc/afc_opinions/catindex_en.html).

7.3.5. **FGE.55: 15 phenyl-substituted aliphatic alcohols and related aldehydes and esters evaluated by JECFA (63rd meeting).**

J. Gry introduced the draft opinion, which was discussed and revisions were made. The opinion was adopted subject to these revisions.

The full opinion will be published on:

[http://www.efsa.eu.int/science/afc/afc\\_opinions/catindex\\_en.html](http://www.efsa.eu.int/science/afc/afc_opinions/catindex_en.html).

7.3.6. **FGE.56: 22 monocyclic and bicyclic secondary alcohols, ketones, and related esters evaluated by JECFA (63rd meeting).**

J. Gry introduced the draft opinion, which was extensively discussed and several revisions were made. A revised draft opinion will be on the agenda for next Plenary for final adoption.

## **8. ANY OTHER BUSINESS**

### **8.1. The genotoxic potential in vivo and in vitro of estragole and tarragon**

During the discussions on a proposed Regulation on Flavourings in Council and Parliament reference has been made to a, as yet unpublished, research study comparing the genotoxicity of the active principle estragole as a pure substance or as a normal component of the herb tarragon. The study has been used to question the need to set maximum limits for certain substances that may be naturally present in flavourings and in foods with flavouring properties (herbs and spices).

The Commission asked the Panel for its initial comments on this information.

The Panel commented that it was plausible that the expression of the inherent toxicity of a naturally occurring substance could be modified by the matrix (the herb and spice) in which it was present. Depending on the mechanism of action, this could result in the toxicity being unchanged, reduced or even increased. In the Panel's view research on individual substance/matrix interactions cannot be used to draw general conclusions about herbs and spices under all conditions of use, ingestion and metabolism.

### **8.2. Behaviour study on food colours and benzoate**

The Panel was aware from media reports that a new study on food additives and child behavior, commissioned by the UK Food Standards Agency, has been completed and noted that the results would be relevant for the EFSA review of colours that is currently underway. The Panel will consider the results when the study is published.