ANIMAL AND PLANT HEALTH UNIT

Scientific Panel on Plant Health

Minutes of the 85th Plenary meeting

Held on 29-30 January 2020, Parma (Italy)

(Agreed on 19 February 2020)

Participants

- **Panel Members:**

  Claude Bragard, Francesco Di Serio, Katharina Dehnen-Schmutz, Annemarie Fejer Justesen, Paolo Gonthier, Josep Jaques Miret, Sven Christer Magnusson, Panagiotis Milonas, Juan A. Navas-Cortés, Roel Potting, Hans-Hermann Thulke, Wopke van der Werf, Antonio Vicent, Jonathan Yuen, Lucia Zappalà

- **Hearing Experts**:

  Thorhallur Halldorsson (Chair of EFSA Scientific Committee Working Group on Epidemiological studies)

  Muriel Suffert (EPPO)

- **European Commission and/or Member States representatives:**

  Mylona Panagiota (EC, DG SANTE, Unit Plant Health)

- **EFSA:**

  ALPHA Unit: Caterina Campese, Laura Carotti, Michela Chiumenti, Ewelina Czwienczek, Eduardo De La Peña, Alice Delbianco, Ciro Gardi, Mart Kinkar, Svetla Kozelska, Nikolaus Kriz, Andrea Maiorano, Maria Rosaria Mannino, Alzbeta Mikulova, Marco Pautasso, Maria Chiara Rosace, Oresteia Sfyra; Giuseppe Stancanelli, Franz Streissl, Emanuela Tacci and Sara Tramontini.

  RASA – Department: Juliane Kleiner

  AMU Unit: Marios Georgiadis, Olaf Mosbach Schulz

  FINANCE UNIT: Raimondo Raimondi**,** Christina Karkanti

  HUCAP UNIT: David Caira

  SCER Unit: Bernard Bottex, Andrea Gervelmeyer

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants. Apologies were received from the Panel Members Marie-Agnès Jacques, Alan MacLeod and Stephen Parnell.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of Interest

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management, EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Panel members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting were identified during the screening process. Certain interests were declared orally by the members before the beginning of the meeting. For further details on the outcome of the screening of the Oral Declaration(s) of Interest made at the beginning of the meeting, please refer to the Annex.

4. Agreement of the minutes of the 84th Plenary meeting

The minutes of the 84th Plenary minutes were agreed by written procedure.

5. New expert compensation scheme, extension of current Panel mandate and mutual assessment of EFSA staff and experts

Juliane Kleiner (Head of EFSA Risk Assessment and Scientific Assistance -RASA Department) attended the Plenary meeting to inform the Panel about the changes introduced by the Transparency Regulation (Regulation (EU) 2019/1381) and its implication to the Scientific Committee and Panels, in particular in relation to the extension of current Panel mandate, the increase in expert indemnity, the expert mutual assessment and the related timelines.

6. Scientific outputs submitted for discussion and possible adoption

6.1. Art. 29 Scientific opinion on Pest categorisation of *Nemorimyza maculosa*

The EFSA Panel on Plant Health performed a pest categorisation of *Nemorimyza maculosa* (Malloch) (Diptera: Agromyzidae) for the European Union (EU) territory. *N. maculosa* is an oligophagous insect pest; cultivated hosts include *Chrysanthemum*, lettuce and other Asteraceae, although there is little published evidence of recent impacts. *N. maculosa* occurs widely in the Americas and is present in the island of Madeira (Portugal), where it is under official control. *N. maculosa* is not known to occur in mainland Portugal based on surveys. *N. maculosa* can have multiple overlapping generations per year. Eggs are inserted into the leaves of host plants. Developing larvae feed within leaves causing blotch mines. Pupation takes place in the soil or under debris on the ground. Immature stages on leafy host plant material such as *Chrysanthemum* cut flowers provide potential pathways for entry into the EU. Human-assisted movement/trade of cut flowers, fresh leafy hosts for consumption and plants for planting with foliage are considered the main pathways for entry. The suitable climate and the wide availability of cultivated and wild host plants provide conditions to support establishment in the EU outdoors and in greenhouse. The extent of potential impact in the EU on hosts such as ornamental Asteraceae and lettuce is uncertain. *N. maculosa* is regulated in the EU by Commission Implementing Regulation 2019/2072 (Annex IIA) where it is listed with a synonym, *Amauromyza maculosa*. The import of soil or growing medium, from third countries other than Switzerland, is regulated in the EU and therefore prevents the entry of *N. maculosa* pupae within this pathway. All criteria assessed by EFSA for consideration either as a potential union quarantine pest or as a potential regulated non-quarantine pest were met.

The Opinion was adopted on 30 January 2020

6.2. Art. 29 Scientific opinion on Pest categorisation *Liriomyza sativae*

The EFSA Panel on Plant Health performed a pest categorisation of *Liriomyza sativae* (Diptera: Agromyzidae) for the EU territory. *L. sativae* (the cabbage or vegetable leaf miner) is a polyphagous insect pest native to the Americas which has spread to Africa,

Asia, and Oceania. *L. sativae* can have multiple overlapping generations per year. Eggs are inserted in the leaves of host plants. Three larval instars, which feed internally on field vegetables (leaves and stems), follow. Then the larva jumps into the soil where a fourth larval instar occurs immediately before pupation, which takes place in the soil. *L. sativae* is regulated in the EU by Commission Implementing Regulation (EU) 2019/2072 (Annex IIA). Within this Regulation, import of soil or growing medium as such or attached to plants for planting, from third countries other than Switzerland, is regulated, therefore, entry of *L. sativae* pupae via this pathway is prevented. However, immature stages on plants for planting (excluding seeds) and fresh leafy hosts for consumption, cut branches, flowers and fruit with foliage provide potential pathways for entry into the EU. *L. sativae* has been repeatedly intercepted in the EU, especially in basil (*Ocimum* spp.). Climatic conditions and the wide availability of host plants provide suitable conditions to support establishment in the EU, both outdoors and in greenhouses. Impact on field vegetables and ornamentals, as well as on other hosts in greenhouses, would be possible. Phytosanitary measures are available to reduce the likelihood of entry. *L. sativae* satisfies the criteria that are within the remit of EFSA to assess for it to be regarded as a potential Union quarantine pest. Although human-assisted movement of vegetables is considered the main spread way for *L. sativae*, this agromyzid does not meet the criterion of occurring in the EU for it to be regarded as a potential Union regulated non-quarantine pest (RNQP).

The Opinion was adopted on 30 January 2020

6.3. Art. 29 Scientific opinion on Pest categorisation *Liriomyza bryoniae*

The EFSA Panel on Plant Health performed a pest categorisation of *Liriomyza bryoniae* (Diptera: Agromyzidae) for the EU territory. *L. bryoniae* (the tomato leaf miner) is a polyphagous palearctic insect species which probably originates from southern Europe, where it occurs commonly outdoors, and has now spread to many parts of central and northern Europe, where it is only found in greenhouses. This species is also reported in north Africa and in several countries in Asia. *L. bryoniae* can have multiple overlapping generations per year. Eggs are inserted in the leaves of host plants. Three larval instars feed internally within leaves and stems of field vegetables. Pupation generally takes place in the soil and very occasionally on the upper or lower surfaces of the leaves. *L. bryoniae* is regulated in the EU by Commission Implementing Regulation (EU) 2019/2072 (Annex III) in specific protected zones only (the Republic of Ireland and Northern Ireland in the United Kingdom). However, *L. bryoniae* is not specifically mentioned in any of the annexes of Commission Implementing Regulation 2019/2072 concerning controls regarding certain protected zones. The wide current geographic range of *L. bryoniae,* both outdoors and in greenhouses, suggests that it is able to establish in most areas of the EU, including the protected zones, where its hosts are present and where impact would be possible both outdoors and in greenhouses. All criteria for consideration as a potential protected zone quarantine pest are met. Besides, being *L. bryoniae* widely distributed in the EU and being plants for planting the primary pathway, it could also qualify as RNQP.

The Opinion was adopted on 30 January 2020

6.4. Art. 29 Scientific opinion on Commodity Risk Assessment of High risk plants – *Robinia pseudacacia* from Israel (EFSA-Q-2019-00108)

The EFSA Panel on Plant Health was requested to conduct risk assessments for commodities listed in the relevant Implementing Acts as "High risk plants, plant products and other objects" [Commission Implementing Regulation (EU) 2018/2019 establishing a provisional list of high risk plants, plant products or other objects, within the meaning

of Article 42 of Regulation (EU) 2016/2031]. This Scientific Opinion covers the plant health risks posed by bare rooted plants for planting of *Robinia pseudoacacia* (1 year old with a stem diameter of less than 2.5 cm) imported from Israel, taking into account the available scientific information, including the technical information provided by Israel. The relevance of an EU-regulated pest for this opinion was based on evidence that: (i) the pest is present in Israel; (ii) *R. pseudoacacia* is a host of the pest, and (iii) the pest can be associated with the commodity. The relevance of this opinion for other non EU-regulated pests was based on evidence that: (i) the pest is present in Israel (ii) the pest is absent in the EU; (iii) *R. pseudoacacia* is a host of the pest; (iv) the pest can be associated with the commodity and (v) the pest may have an impact and can pose a potential risk for the EU territory. Two pests (one insect and one fungus, *Euwallacea fornicatus* and *Fusarium euwallaceae*) which fulfilled all criteria were selected for further evaluation. For the two selected pests, the risk mitigation measures proposed in the technical dossier from Israel were evaluated. Limiting factors in the effectiveness of the measures were documented. For the selected pests an expert judgement was given on the likelihood of pest freedom taking into consideration the risk mitigation measures acting on the pests, including uncertainties associated with the assessment. Based on the above elements, the Panel concluded being 95% sure that 9,950 or more plants for planting of *R. pseudacacia* per 10,000 will be free from these two pests.

This opinion was adopted on 30 January 2020.

Following the discussion and adoption of the first two scientific opinions on commodity risk assessment of high risk plants, the Panel decided that, based on this experience, a template for the scientific opinions for commodity risk assessment should be presented and discussed for possible endorsement by the Panel at the next 86th Plant Health panel plenary meeting on 25-26 March 2020.

6.5. Art. 29 Scientific opinion on Commodity Risk Assessment of High risk plants – *Malus domestica* from Serbia

The draft opinion on the commodity risk assessment for *Malus domestica* plants from planting from Serbia was presented and discussed. It was agreed to ask further clarifications from Serbia National plant protection organisation.

7. Feedback from Scientific Panel including their Working Groups, Scientific Committee, EFSA and European Commission

7.1. Feedback from presentation of the scientific opinion on *Saperda tridentata* pest categorisation at PAFF Committee section Plant Health

The EFSA coordinator of the WG on *Saperda tridentata* reported the feedback received from the presentation at the PAFF committee in 'Brussels of the opinion on the pest categorisation of *S. tridentata*.

7.2. Feedback from presentation of the scientific opinion on commodity risk assessment of *Albizia julibrissin* plants from Israel at PAFF Committee section Plant Health

The EFSA coordinator of the WG on High Risk Plants - Section I - reported the feedback received from the presentation at the PAFF committee in 'Brussels of the opinion on *Albizia julibrissin* from Israel.

7.3. Update from WG on High Risk Plants Section I

The EFSA coordinator of this WG presented the current and upcoming activities, in particular the status of the dossier on *Jasminum polyanthum* from Israel, and of the

dossiers recently submitted from Turkey(on *Berberis crataegina, Berberis cretica, Berberis integerrima, Berberis thunbergii, Berberis vulgaris, Robinia pseudoacacia, Lonicera caprifolium* and *Nerium oleander*).

The possible association of *Berberis* species with life stages of cereal rust fungi was discussed.

7.4. Update from WG on High Risk Plants Section II

The WG Chair presented the current and upcoming activities of this WG, in particular the status of the dossiers on *Acer* spp. from New Zealand and on *Ficus carica* from Israel.

7.5. Update from WG on High Risk Plants Section III

The EFSA coordinator of the WG presented the current and upcoming activities of the WG, in particular the status of the dossiers on *Malus domestica* from Serbia and on *Persea americana* from Israel.

Methodological issues relevant for the three WG on High Risk Plants (section I, section II and section III) were also discussed with the Panel.

7.6. WG on High Risk Plants – Momordica

A new PLH Panel WG was created to assess the *Momordica* fruit dossiers within the framework of the High Risk Plants mandate. The Panel Chair nominated Panagiotis Milonas as Chair of this new WG.

7.7. Update from WG on Agricultural Insects pest categorisation

The work plan 2020 of the Agricultural Insects WG was presented to the PLH Panel.

7.8. Update from WG on Plant Viruses pest categorisation

In 2020 this WG will address the last two categorisations of plant viruses within the large mandate received in 2017, on Tomato leaf curl New Delhi virus and Beet necrotic yellow vein virus.

7.9. Update from WG on Plant Bacteria pest categorisation

The Panel was informed about the progress of the WG on plant bacteria pest categorisation. The remaining work, to be performed during 2020, concerns the listing and categorisation of non-EU potato phytoplasmas. The work is currently in the planning phase and will be supported by an EFSA Art. 36 Tasking Grant.

7.10. Feedback from the European Commission

The EC DG SANTE representative provided feedback to the Panel on processing for decision making of the PLH Panel pest categorisations.

7.11. Presentation on the new EU Plant Health Law (Regulation (EU) 2016/2031) and its annexes

The EC DG SANTE representative presented an overview of the legal implementation of Regulation EU) 2016/2031 and its annexes.

7.12. 2020: International Year of Plant Health: EFSA activities

A presentation was given on the activities planned by EFSA during the International Year of Plant Health (IYPH), including:

i) An EFSA Workshop with EU Chief Plant Health Officers to be held in Parma on 9-11 March 2020;

ii) 6 webinars from June to November 2020 dedicated to presenting and explaining the different EFSA plant health activities;

iii) Contribution to the International Plant Health Conference "Protecting Plant Health in a changing world", organised by IPPC and Finland in Helsinki on 5-8 October 2020;

iv) Dedicated communication activity on the social media, in particular through the EFSA thematic twitter account @Plants_EFSA.

The Panel members were invited to contribute to the communication activities above-mentioned, in particular by short videos on the EFSA thematic twitter account @Plants_EFSA.

The EPPO representative introduced the mascot "Beastie the Bug" that EPPO created for the IYPH.

7.13. Discussion and training on PLH Panel quantitative pest risk assessment and SC Uncertainty guidance

The Panel was informed about the plan for plenary discussions and training on the EFSA uncertainty guidance and PLH quantitative pest risk assessment methodology.

A presentation was given on the uncertainty training offered by the SCER unit to EFSA Panels, and how this is going to be tailored to the needs of the PLH Panel during 2020 PLH Panel plenary meetings.

The key principles of the PLH Panel guidance on quantitative pest risk assessment were summarised and a web-based survey to collect the Panel training needs on quantitative pest risk assessment was performed.

A summary of the main results of the survey on the Panel training needs on quantitative pest risk assessment was presented, identifying some priority topics. Next steps were discussed for the planning of the discussion sessions and the training during the year. The possible dates of the uncertainty training are 23/11/2020 (afternoon h 14-18) and 24/11/2020 (full day h 9-18). It was agreed to constitute a group of Panel members to contribute to planning and steering the discussion and training (Panel Chair and Vice Chairs and the Panel Members Alan MacLeod, Philippe Reignault and Wopke van der Werf). Further information will be provided at the next plenary meeting in March 2020.

7.18 Presentation from SC WG on guidance for appraisal of epidemiological studies

The mandate and scope of the Scientific committee Guidance on appraising and integrating evidence from epidemiological studies were presented to the Panel. The differences in the concepts, terminology and practices of epidemiology in human health and animal health versus plant health epidemiology were discussed with the Panel. The Panel was asked to identify areas of "plant health" epidemiology in which it could be useful apply this guidance.

8. AOB wrap up & next Panel meetings

The calendar of 2020 was shared with the Panel along with the draft proposal for the calendar of the 2021 PLH plenary dates, which is still pending due to confirmation from the Scientific Committee Plenary dates for 2021.

Annex

Interests and actions resulting from the Oral Declaration of Interest done at the beginning of the meeting

With regard to this meeting, Dr. Antonio Vicent informed that he is coordinating an EFSA Art. 36 Grant "Reduce risk assessment uncertainty: suitability of Mediterranean citrus production areas for *Phyllosticta citricarpa*".
In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence[1] and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management[2], and taking into account the specific matters discussed at the meeting in question, the interest above was not deemed to represent a Conflict of Interest (CoI).

[1] http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

[2] http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf