



European Food Safety Authority

**Adopted Minutes of the Management Board Meeting
20 June 2006
Palazzo Ducale, Parma**

Members of the Management Board present

- | | |
|---------------------------|-------------------------------|
| • Angeliki Assimakopoulou | • Robert Madelin |
| • Ernst Bobek | • Catherine Geslain- Lanéelle |
| • Carlos Escribano-Mora | • Patrick Wall |
| • Roland Vaxelaire | • Pirkko Raunemaa |
| • Deirdre Hutton | • Bart Sangster |
| • Matthias Horst | • Stuart Slorach |
| • Giorgio Calabrese | |

Staff of the European Food Safety Authority present

- | | |
|----------------------|----------------------------|
| • Antoine Cuvillier | • Alexandrine Maviel-Sonet |
| • Herman Koëter | • Anne-Laure Gassin |
| • Djien Liem | • François Monnart |
| • Christine Majewski | • Finn Sheye |
| | • Lionel Rigaux |

PUBLIC SESSION

Preliminary Formalities

1. Stuart Slorach opened the meeting by welcoming the Board members, the Authority's staff, those watching on the web stream and the live audience in Parma. The Chair asked if members wished to make any declarations of interest beyond those already made in the annual declarations of interest, which can be found on the EFSA website. There were none.

1.1 The Chair reported that the following 7 yesterday were nominated for the Board: Diána Bánáti, Marianne Elvander, Peter Gæmelke, Marion Guillou, Bart Sangster, Roland Vaxelaire and Konstatinos Yazitzoglou.

2. Adoption of Agenda (Document MB 20.06.2006 - 1)

The Chair asked if there were any additional points to the agenda. There was none. The draft agenda was adopted.

3. Adoption of draft minutes of the previous meeting and matter arising from the minutes (Document MB 20.06.2006 -2)

3.1. The Chair mentioned that a number of points from the last meeting would be discussed at this meeting: The list of Competent Organisations, The functioning of the Scientific Committee and Panels and the Audit Committee.

3.2. The minutes of the meeting of 29 March were adopted and would be published on the Authority's website.

4. For discussion and adoption: The List of Competent Organisations designated by the Member States which may assist the Authority with its mission

4.1 The Director for Legal Affairs and the Acting Director for Science introduced the document. It was mentioned that the document was a good step forward, that impartiality as the most important factor, but more information on the use of the list was needed.

4.2 Several members of the Board stressed that an in-depth analysis of the list of Competent Organisations was needed, especially in relation to the question of their sources of funding. It was felt that the matter of funding to these organisations was often complex and that in particular the inclusion of private organisations on the list caused some concern. However it was also noted that public organisations often received private funding. The Board asked for further consultation of the Advisory Forum as they were concerned that there was lack of clarity with respect to whether all organisations on the list were in a position to pursue public interest objectives and in addition they had questions about the independence of a number of the organisations.

4.3 The Board indicated that there needed to be some further detail on the objectives EFSA was following in establishing the Article 36 list¹ and the uses that it would be put

¹ E.g. whether the organisation carry out tasks within the EFSA's mission, pursues public interest objectives, can provide evidence that it has organisational arrangements and specific procedures to ensure that its tasks can be performed with independency and integrity, maintain EFSA's confidentiality level and have adequate high quality expertise.

to. It would be necessary to have more information for the Board before it could take its final decision.

4.4 The Acting Executive Director said that it was a dynamic list and at any time the Member States could ask EFSA to add or take organisations off the list. He said that EFSA had sent a questionnaire to all institutions and that the list was the result of the feedback EFSA has received. He added that there had also been discussions in the Advisory Forum on the individual Member States' recommendations and on those bodies considered by EFSA to be possibly unacceptable for the list. In addition EFSA would not cover all costs on each occasion a tasks would be outsourced. Each time it would be a specific contract between the organisation and EFSA and indeed there may be a variety of funding options.

4.5 The Acting Executive Director indicated that it was indeed planned to consult the Advisory Forum on the use of the list once it was finalised. He added that private funded institutions had been included and in some cases such organisations could be private but also working in the public interest. He also informed the Board that EFSA could provide the Board with further information by written procedure for the September meeting, but it would be important for EFSA to start on the outsourcing of work with the shortest delay. He suggested that it could be possible to start with a shorter list perhaps minus 21 private institutions that had been mentioned by the Board.

4.6 The Board decided that the secretariat should deliver further information on the list of Competent Organisations (Art. 36), and that the members of the Advisory Forum should be asked for their opinion on the list and whether they live up to the objectives mentioned in point 4 (in a written procedure) and that EFSA should send an updated revised document for adoption to a later Board meeting.

4.7 The Board also stressed that once the list was adopted the process for assigning specific tasks to organisations on the list should include a check on whether independence can be guaranteed in relation the specific tasks to be outsourced.

5. For adoption: Management Board conclusions of the external evaluation and recommendations arising from the report (Document 20.06.2006 - 4)

5.1 The Acting Executive Director introduced the document and explained that an enormous amount of information has been collected through many different channels including the Advisory Forum, the Stakeholder Consultative Platform, staff and an open consultation on the EFSA website. In the main the Board agreed with the key priorities presented but felt that the document needed some further refinement particularly in relation to focusing more on the identification of the main issues and removing the many of the 'action points'.

5.2 It was felt that revisions should be considered to indicate the first priority would be networking with the national agencies, that there would be appropriate management

resources to coordinate the networks, there was a need to put special focus on activating the new Member States.

5.3 In relation to future communications activities (Priority 4) – there should be broader emphasis including activities aimed at the European Parliament and Council and there was a need to publicise EFSA more while looking at EFSA's language regime. More information would be needed on the way forward on nutrition

5.4 The secretariat was asked by the Board to improve the document in close co-operation with the new Executive Director. The members of the Board were asked to send input to the document to the Acting Executive Director by the 23 June and the document would be updated and a draft send out so the final document could be approved by 30 June.

6. Financial Statement Accounts (Document 20.06.2006 - 5)

The document was introduced by the EFSA accountant.

The Board agreed on a statement where the Board formulates a positive opinion on the 2005 accounts, on the basis of Article 83 of EFSA's Financial Regulation taking into account the declaration of assurance related to the 2005 Annual Activity Report signed by the Acting Executive Director.

Management Matters

7. For information: Plan of action related to the functioning of the Scientific Committee and the Panels (Document 20.06.2006 – 6)

7.1 The acting Director of Science introduced the document.

7.2 A number of Board members asked for more realistic deadlines against the actions highlighted in the document, and they didn't find point A of the document precise enough (except for the first part on time-management tools). It was mentioned by several that point A needed to be discussed further and revised.

7.3 The Board asked EFSA to revise the point A of the document, except for the first part on time management tools and asked for a revised document on this for a future Board meeting.

7.4 The Board could agree to the other parts of the document.

8. For information: Progress Report (Document MB 20.06.2006 - 7)

The Acting Executive Director introduced the documents and highlighted 3 topics: the meeting on Aspartame the 5 May, the meeting the 15 May on GMO's and the meeting the 20 May with the Advisory Forum.

Financial matters

9. For information: Transfers in the EFSA Budget (Document MB 20.06.2006 - 8)

The Director for Finance introduced the document and the Board noted the transfer.

10. For information: State of play with respect to financial perspectives - Preliminary Budget 2007 (Document MB 20.06.2006 - 9)

The Director for Finance introduced the document and explained that the discussions in the budgetary authority were looking more positive towards EFSA's requirements than they had in March, but that the final decision would not be taken until the end of the year.

11. For information: Budget execution 2006 – state of play (Document MB 20.06.2006 – 10)

The Director for Finance introduced the document and mentioned that there today is 230 staff of different types including Temporary Agents, Auxiliary, Interim contracts and consultants at EFSA and that for title 3 in the budget, the approval of the Art. 36 organisations would provide an important basis for the foreseen expenditure.

Any other business

12. For information: Where we are on the final Seat building (Document MB 20.06.2006 – 11)

The Director for Finance explained that the decision on who had won the competition for the design of the building for the final seat of EFSA would be published by the municipality of Parma in the weeks following the meeting. He further explained that if things went according to plan that the earliest EFSA could move to the new building would be March 2009.

14. Thanks to the Board members leaving

The Board thanked the members of the Board who would be leaving after this meeting for their great contribution to EFSA's success. In particular the Board thanked the Chair for the excellent job he had done as Chair during the first 4 years of EFSA's existence. END