Scientific Panel on Plant Health

Minutes of the 81st Plenary meeting

Held on 26-27 June 2019 Parma (Italy)
(Agreed on 16 July 2019)

Participants

- Panel Members

  Claude Bragard, Francesco Di Serio, Paolo Gonthier, Alan MacLeod Josep Jaques Miret, Sven Christer Magnusson, Panagiotis Milonas, Juan A. Navas-Cortés, Stephen Parnell, Roel Potting, Hans-Hermann Thulke, Wopke van der Werf (attended by skype only for item 6.6), Antonio Vicent, Jonathan Yuen, Marie-Agnès Jacques

- European Commission and/or Member States representatives:

  Maria Mirazchiyska, Wolfgang Reinert (via skype) & Maria Kammenou (via skype) (DG SANTE)

  Pieter Beck (JRC)

- EFSA:
  ALPHA Unit: Melanie Camillieri, Ewelina Czwienczek, Eduardo De La Peña, Alice Delbianco, Makrina Diakaki, Ciro Gardi, Michela Guzzo, Tomasz Kaluski, Virag Kertesz, Mart Kinkar, Svetla Kozelska, Andrea Maiorano, Maria Rosaria Mannino, Marco Pautasso, Stefano Preti, Maria Chiara Rosace, Giuseppe Stancanelli, Emanuela Tacci, Sara Tramontini and Sybren Vos

  SCER Unit: Bernard Bottex; Angelo Maggiore

- EFSA Art. 36 Tasking Grants:
  Michela Chiumenti and Luciana Galetto (CNR, Italy)

  Elma Bali (UTH, Greece)

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.
Apologies were received from Lucia Zappalà; Annemarie Fejer Justesen, Philippe Lucien Reignault, Katharina Dehnen-Schmutz & Wopke Wan de Werf.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of Interest of Scientific Committee/Scientific Panel/ Members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management, EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Panel members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process.

Certain interests were declared orally by the members before the beginning of the meeting. For further details on the outcome of the screening of the Oral Declaration(s) of Interest made at the beginning of the meeting, please refer to the Annex.

4. Agreement of the minutes of the 80th Plenary meeting held on 22 May 2019, Parma (Italy)

The minutes of the 80th Plenary meeting held on 22 May 2019, Parma (Italy) were agreed by written procedure.

5. Other scientific topics for information and/or discussion

5.1 Presentation of the draft JRC Technical report on Tree species distribution data and maps for Europe

Pieter Beck from the European Commission Joint Research Centre presented to the Panel the draft technical report on "Tree species distribution data and maps for Europe". This report describes the maps on tree species distribution routinely produced at Joint Research Centre, and the data sets used to produce them. Its aim is to help those searching for information on forest tree species distribution in Europe and to identify which of the maps might fit their needs, what their strengths and weaknesses are, and what data and methods were used to produce them. The report provides information on the different data sets reporting tree species occurrences in Europe, on which the maps are based, highlighting the uncertainties and limitations affecting their use. The report then presents different types of tree species distribution maps based on these observational data sets. For each map type, it provides information for a correct use, including which questions a particular map type is able to help answer and a suggested caption that can be used when reproducing a map. Finally, for two tree species, the report provides multiple distribution maps side-by-side, with annotations to help interpret the information, including uncertainty that they convey. These examples illustrate how different map types convey different types of information and how they are affected by data availability, which differs not only between source data sets but also between species within the same data set. The draft report will be circulated in July 2019 to PLH Panel for reading/commenting before finalisation and publication.

5.2 2020 International Year of Plant Health

The Panel was updated on the state of the art on planned activities for IYPH 2020 and contacts of EFSA with FAO IPPC and the EC.

6. Feedback from the Scientific Committee/Scientific Panels, EFSA, the European Commission

6.1 Update from WG on *Saperda tridentata* pest risk assessment

The Panel was informed about the progress of the WG in the pest categorization of *Saperda tridentata*. Very limited information is available for this pest. This is not a well-studied species. Available information comes from very old observational literature (i.e. not based on experiments). It is not clear what the host range of the pest is nor the plasticity of the *Saperda* genus to different hosts. No evidence was found so far that EU *Ulmus* species are attacked. In addition, from preliminary information, it seems that the amount of traded wood of *Ulmus* is very low. With the currently available evidence, the uncertainties of the PRA, if conducted, would be very high. As a result of the presentation and of the discussion, it was decided that: i) the WG should intensify the literature search in order to look for more information and details about the host range of this pest; ii) the ecological characteristics of *Saperda* genus in relation to host range and to host range expansion should be explored; iii) there is a need to look for North America experts and data sources that could inform on *S. tridentata*. The WG will present the update of the pest categorization at the next plenary in September and a decision will be taken on the next steps in relation to the development of a PRA.

6.2 Update from WG plant bacteria categorisation on non-EU phytoplasma of *Malus*, *Pyrus*, *Cydonia*, *Prunus*, *Rubus*, *Vitis*, *Ribes* and *Fragaria*

The Panel was informed about the progress of the WG in the pest categorisation of the non-EU phytoplasmas of the above mentioned fruit genera. The presentation focused on Ca. *P. fraxinii* and Ca. *P. trifolii*. The plan for the pest categorisation of the remaining phytoplasmas was explained. The opinion is scheduled for possible adoption at the November 2019 PLH plenary meeting.

6.3 Update on High Risk Plants commodity risk assessment mandate, including presentation of literature search for pests list

The supporting scientific officers updated the Panel on the procedures followed by the WG for the preparation of the pest lists for two species related to the dossiers received so far: (*Albizia julibrissin* and *Robinia pseudoacacia*). The steps and the databases used for retrieving information as well as the strings adopted were shown and explained. The Excel file and the pivot tables, the filters and the methodology proposed for selecting the relevant pest were shown and explained.

The Panel was updated about the state of play regarding the Working groups establishment for the High Risk Plants commodity risk assessment mandate. Three parallel WGs were established and the chairs were nominated as follows:

- WG on High Risk Plants-Section 1, chair: Roel Potting,
- WG on High Risk Plants-Section 2, chair: Paolo Gonthier,
- WG on High Risk Plants-Section 3, chair: Jonathan Yuen.

6.4 Feedback from presentation at PAFF Committee Plant Health on 17 May 2019 of the scientific opinion on Commodity risk assessment of black pine (*Pinus thunbergii* Parl.) bonsai from Japan

The Panel was updated about the presentation at PAFF Committee Plant Health meeting on 17 May 2019 of the scientific opinion on Commodity risk assessment of black pine (*Pinus thunbergii* Parl.) bonsai from Japan. In general, good feedback was received on the level of details taken into account and provided in the opinion and on the methodology used. Questions and comments were received related to the procedure and the results and its interpretation. The discussion in the PAFF Committee meeting focused mainly on the analyses of the opinion and on the need for further discussion before taking a decision on how to proceed further.

6.5 Short update from WG Forest insects categorisation

The WG Chair updated the panel on the latest developments. The group has recently finalised the categorisation of non-EU *Acleris* species. This draft opinion will be circulated soon to the Panel for comments and will then be presented for adoption in September. Work on the categorisation of non-EU Scolytinae spp. is ongoing. The draft list of species that was endorsed by the Panel in May was circulated to the Chief Plant Health Officers for consultation. Upon comments received, the WG will update the list if necessary. The final list as well as the categorisation will be tabled for adoption at the plenary in November.

6.6 Update from WG on *Pantoea stewartii* USA corn seed derogation (EFSA-Q-2018-00902)

The Panel was informed about the progress of the WG since the last PLH plenary meeting. The conceptual model, formal model, scenarios and preliminary results were presented. The plan for further work was summarized.

7. Scientific outputs submitted for discussion and/or possible adoption

7.1 Art. 29 Scientific opinion on the Pest categorisation of *Spodoptera litura* (including a short update on activities of WG agriculture insects categorisation)

The EFSA Panel on Plant Health performed a pest categorisation of *Spodoptera litura* (Lepidoptera: Noctuidae) for the European Union (EU). *S. litura* is widely distributed across South and East Asia and Oceania. It is established in tropical and sub-tropical regions where there are no, or few, frost days each year. It can extend its range into cooler temperate regions during summer months. *S. litura* is highly polyphagous feeding on hosts within at least 40 botanical families, including economically important crops within Brassicaceae, Cucurbitaceae, Fabaceae, Malvaceae, Poaceae and Solanaceae. Larvae are primarily leaf feeders and can cause complete defoliation. At high population densities almost all plant parts are eaten. *S. litura* is a serious pest in the Asia-Pacific region where it causes losses to many economically important cultivated field crops and crops such as eggplants, sweet peppers and tomatoes in protected cultivation. As a species that appears limited by winter temperatures, only a small area of the EU provides climatic conditions where establishment outdoors may be possible although cultivated and wild hosts are distributed across the EU. *S. litura* has been intercepted in the EU many times on ornamentals and leafy vegetables. Outbreaks have occurred in EU glasshouses and have been eradicated. Phytosanitary measures are available to inhibit entry. *S. litura* satisfies the criteria that are within the remit of EFSA to assess for it to be regarded as a potential Union quarantine pest. *S. litura* does not meet the criteria of occurring in the EU, and plants for planting being the principal means of spread for it to be regarded as a potential Union regulated non-quarantine pest.

The opinion was adopted on 27 June 2019.

The Chair of Agricultural Insects WG updated the Panel on activities of WG and the opinions in preparation in 2019.

7.2 Art 29 Scientific opinion on the Pest categorisation of *Fragaria* viruses and viroids (Q-2018-00783) (including a short update on activities of WG plant viruses categorisation).

Following a request from the EU Commission, the Panel on Plant Health addressed the pest categorisation of the viruses and viroids of *Fragaria* L. determined as being either non-EU or of undetermined standing in a previous EFSA opinion. These infectious agents belong to different genera and are heterogeneous in their biology. With the exclusion of strawberry latent virus and strawberry latent C virus for which very limited information exists, the pest categorisation was completed for 12 viruses having acknowledged identities and available detection methods. All these viruses are efficiently transmitted by vegetative propagation techniques, with plants for planting representing the major pathway for long-distance dispersal and thus considered as the major pathway for entry. Depending

on the virus, additional pathway(s) can also be Fragaria seeds, pollen and/or vector(s). Most of the viruses categorised here are known to infect only one or few plant genera, but some of them have a wide host range, thus extending the possible entry pathways. Strawberry chlorotic fleck-associated virus, strawberry leaf curl virus, strawberry necrotic shock virus, strawberry pallidosis associated virus, strawberry vein banding virus (SVBV) and tomato ringspot virus meet all the criteria evaluated by EFSA to qualify as potential Union quarantine pests (QPs). For SVBV, the Panel considered that following its entry and establishment into the EU territory, an impact of uncertain magnitude is expected mainly because a synergistic effect may occur in strawberry in case of mixed infections with viruses already present in the EU. Strawberry crinivirus 3, strawberry crinivirus 4 and strawberry polerovirus 1 meet all criteria for being considered as potential Union QPs, except for the impact in the EU territory, on which the Panel was unable to conclude. *Fragaria chiloensis* cryptic virus, *Fragaria chiloensis* latent virus and strawberry pseudo mild yellow edge virus do not meet the criterion of having potential negative impact in the EU. For several viruses, especially those recently discovered, the categorisation is associated with high uncertainties mainly because of the absence of data on their biology, distribution and impact. The viruses addressed in this opinion do not meet the criteria assessed by EFSA to qualify as a potential Union regulated non-quarantine pests.

The opinion was adopted on 27 June 2019.

The Chair of Viruses WG updated the Panel on activities of WG. The WG is currently working on two opinions: non-EU viruses and viroids of *Rubus* and non-EU viruses and viroids of *Ribes*. The opinions are planned for discussion and possible adoption in September and November 2019 PLH Panel plenary meetings.

7.3 Art. 29 Scientific opinion on the "List of non-EU viruses and viroids infecting potato (*Solanum tuberosum*) and other tuber-forming *Solanum* species", for endorsement by the Panel after data consultation with EU MS Chief Plant Health Officers (including a short update on activities of WG potato viruses categorisation)

The Panel was updated on the comments received following the consultation of the Member States' Plant Health Chief Officers on the list of non-EU viruses and viroids infecting potato and other tuber-forming *Solanum* species.

The working group was unable to circulate the draft pest categorisation of the non-EU viruses and viroids of potato to the Panel on time for possible adoption at this Plenary meeting, due to the need for further work on the impact section and the conclusion tables of the pest categorisation. The draft pest categorisation, together with the draft opinion on the list of non-

EU viruses of potato, is planned for discussion for possible adoptions at the next Plenary meeting of the Panel in September 2019.

During the September 2019 Plenary meeting, the Panel will be presented also the first pest categorisations of the non-EU isolates of potato viruses A, M, S, V, X and Y, and potato leafroll virus. The objective is to receive feedback from the Panel on the approach taken for the pest categorisations. The pest categorisations for the non-EU isolates of the seven potato viruses are due for adoption at the November 2019 Plenary meeting.

8 Feedback from the European Commission

The EC representative informed the Panel about the progresses in the processing of the implementing acts of the new Plant health and the multi annual plant health surveillance programme.
Commission is responsible for the report and give practical guidance to member states on how to perform the reports.

9 Feedback from Scientific Committee and its Working Groups

The PLH Panel chair provided the feedback from the presentation of the PLH Panel and ALPHA Unit activities at the plenary meeting of the SC open to observers. The PLH Panel chair suggested that Stephen Parnell would represent PLH Panel in the SC WG on epidemiology at least for the drafting of the general part, to ensure the correctness for what regards plant health epidemiology and its terminology.

10 Feedback from EFSA including its Working Groups

10.1 Presentation of EFSA quantitative assessment for ranking Union candidate priority pests (https://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/efsajournal/pub/5731)

The Panel received a presentation about the project recently finalised by the EFSA Working Group on EU Priority Pests. The 2-year-mandate required the development of *ad hoc* methodology and protocols in collaboration with the Joint Research Centre. The aim of the project was to support EU Commission and Member States in the definition of a preliminary list of quarantine pests to be regulated as "priority pests" in line with the Regulation (EU) 2016/2031 (applicable from 14 December 2019). EFSA applied the methodology to assess the 28 candidate species provided with the mandate and later ranked with the impact Indicator for Priority Pests (I2P2) developed by JRC. The presentation provided details on the methodology, its coherence with the quantitative risk assessment guidelines adopted in 2018 by the Panel and the final outcomes. Since the 3rd of June 2019, the "Scientific Report on the methodology applied by EFSA to provide a quantitative assessment of pest-related criteria required to rank candidate priority pests as defined by Regulation (EU) 2016/2031" is online at https://efsa.onlinelibrary.wiley.com/doi/10.2903/j.efsa.2019.5731. From that document, the 28 specific reports published on Zenodo are accessible

through the specific links provided in Appendix C. At each Zenodo page, there are the Pest Datasheet (.xlsx. file, with the data provided to JRC), the Pest Report (.pdf file, with the supporting information to the datasheet and the EKE report) and, in most of the cases, the link to interactive maps (reachable both from the Pest Report and from the Zenodo page, as 'Supplementary material').

10.2 Presentation of the EFSA CLEFSA (climate change and Emerging risks for Food Safety) project, including plant health issues identified and request for PLH Panel contribution

The EFSA Scientific Committee - Emerging Risks Unit (SCER) is conducting a project on "Climate change as a driver of emerging risks for food and feed safety, plant, animal health and nutritional quality (CLEFSA)". A brief note describing the project was shared with the Panel. In the first part of the project, a crowdsourcing procedure has allowed to identify emerging issues for food, feed safety, plant and animal health, and for nutritional quality, potentially associated with climate change. SCER is now looking for experts who could be involved in the scoring and characterisation of these emerging issues. Examples of the identified issues were shown and the criteria for scoring and those for characterisation were also briefly presented. The timeline for conducting the scoring and characterisation exercise is **July-September 2019**.

The Panel discussed the importance of addressing climate change scenarios in plant health risk assessment, particularly with regard to changes in land use and cultivated crops.

It was commented that there are already two pest ranking exercises conducted in plant health to support EU decision making, under specific mandates by EC DG SANTE: the new plant pests identified during the horizon scanning via media and literature monitoring are ranked with the scope to provide a tool to risk managers to decide the conduct of a pest categorisation by EFSA or the intensification of phytosanitary measures; the EU quarantine plant pests already listed are ranked based on a multivariate economical analysis with the scope to select Union Priority Quarantine Pests for which a more intense surveillance will be conducted and contingency plans will be developed. On this regard, it was explained that the scope of the CLEFSA ranking exercise is to identify food safety, animal health and plant health issues of concern linked to climate change. With regard to the examples of plant health issues identified by the CLEFSA crowdsourcing project, it was commented that they showed the interest of the public for climate change and plant health, but, at least for the cases shown, they seem more linked to global change and increased trade than to climate change, although it is often difficult to separate the effect of these two drivers. Some of the issues identified regarded large group of plant pests (e.g. aphids) making impossible a linkage to climate change. It was agreed the importance of continuing the discussion in the Panel on

approaches and scenarios to address climate change in the panel's pest risk assessments. The CLEFSA project will circulate an email, via the ALPHA Unit secretariat, to ask PLH panel members to volunteer to participate during the summer to the ranking exercise of climate change issues identified via crowdsourcing.

11 Any Other Business

The updated calendar of the PLH panel plenary meetings was presented.