

## Scientific Panel on Food Additives and Flavourings (FAF)

### Minutes of the 4<sup>th</sup> Plenary meeting

**Held on 11-13 December 2018, Parma (Italy)**

**(Agreed on 10 January 2019)**

#### **Participants**

##### **■ Panel Members:**

Gabriele Aquilina, Laurence Castle, Karl-Heinz Engel, Maria José Frutos Fernandez, Peter Fürst, Ursula Gundert-Remy, Rainer Gürtler, Trine Husøy, Wim Mennes, Peter Moldeus, Agneta Oskarsson, Romina Shah<sup>1</sup>, Ine Waalkens-Berendsen, Detlef Wölfl and Maged Younes

##### **■ Hearing Experts:**

Claude Lambré for agenda item 6.3

##### **■ European Commission representatives:**

DG SANTE (Health and Food Safety), E2 Food processing technologies and novel foods: Guillermo Cardon and Miguel-Angel Granero Rosell<sup>2</sup>

##### **■ EFSA:**

FIP Unit: Claudia Roncancio Peña, Eleonora Alquati, Maria Carfi, Anna Christodoulidou, Dimitrios Chrysafidis, Alessandra Giarola, Federica Lodi, Carla Martino, Ana Maria Rincon, Camilla Smeraldi and Alexandra Tard and Giorgia Vianello.

DATA Unit: Francesca Riolo

#### **1. Welcome and apologies for absence**

The Chair welcomed the participants in the meeting. Apologies were received from Paul Fowler.

The Chair informed the Panel about the resignation of Sandra Rainieri as member of the FAF Panel further to her employment in the EFSA Food Ingredients and Packaging Unit as of 1 December 2018. Panel members were also informed that EFSA has initiated the procedure for replacing her with a new Panel member.

<sup>1</sup> Participated by web-conference on 11 and 12 December 2018 (pm sessions)

<sup>2</sup> Participated by web-conference on 11 December 2018 (am session)

The Panel was also informed that EFSA staff Anna Christodoulidou will move to BIOCONTAM Unit as of 1<sup>st</sup> January 2019.

## **2. Adoption of agenda**

The agenda was adopted without any changes.

## **3. Declarations of Interest of Scientific Panel Members**

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes<sup>3</sup> and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest<sup>4</sup>, EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled in by the Panel Members invited for the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

## **4. Agreement of the minutes of the 3<sup>rd</sup> Plenary meeting held on 6-8 November 2018, Parma (Italy)**

The minutes of the 3<sup>rd</sup> Plenary meeting held on 6-8 November 2018 were agreed by written procedure on 28 November 2018<sup>5</sup>.

## **5. Report on written procedures since 3<sup>rd</sup> Plenary meeting**

No scientific outputs were adopted by written procedure since the last plenary meeting.

## **6. Scientific outputs submitted for discussion and possible adoption**

### **Food Additives**

#### **6.1. Re-evaluation of phosphoric acid, phosphates, di-, tri- and polyphosphates (E 338-341; E 343; E 450-452) ([EFSA-Q-2011-00618](#); [EFSA-Q-2011-00619](#); [EFSA-Q-2011-00620](#); [EFSA-Q-2011-00621](#); [EFSA-Q-2011-00622](#); [EFSA-Q-2011-00623](#); [EFSA-Q-2011-00624](#); [EFSA-Q-2011-00625](#); [EFSA-Q-2011-00626](#); [EFSA-Q-2011-00628](#); [EFSA-Q-2011-00629](#); [EFSA-Q-2011-00630](#); [EFSA-Q-2011-00532](#); [EFSA-Q-2011-00533](#); [EFSA-Q-2011-00534](#); [EFSA-Q-2011-00535](#); [EFSA-Q-2011-00536](#); [EFSA-Q-2011-00537](#); [EFSA-Q-2011-00538](#); [EFSA-Q-2011-00539](#); [EFSA-Q-2011-00540](#); [EFSA-Q-2011-00541](#); [EFSA-Q-2011-00542](#); [EFSA-Q-2011-00543](#); [EFSA-Q-2018-00597](#))**

At the previous plenary meeting in November 2018, the Panel had discussed the preliminary conclusions reached by the Working Group on the re-evaluation of phosphates and had agreed on an approach to be further developed in the scientific opinion. An update on the status of the assessment and on the approach to reach final conclusions had been presented by the Chair of the FAF Panel to the 91st Plenary meeting of the EFSA Scientific Committee on 21-22 November 2018, leading to some questions and comments on the proposed approach from some members of the EFSA Scientific Committee.

<sup>3</sup> [http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate\\_publications/files/policy\\_independence.pdf](http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf)

<sup>4</sup> [http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate\\_publications/files/competing\\_interest\\_management\\_17.pdf](http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf)

<sup>5</sup> <https://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/event/181106-m.pdf>

At the current plenary meeting, the Panel was presented with a revised draft opinion on the re-evaluation of the safety of phosphoric acid, phosphates, di-, tri- and polyphosphates (E 338-341; E 343; E 450-452) together with the main points arising from the discussion held at the level of the EFSA Scientific Committee. One of the main points raised after the discussion at the level of the Scientific Committee, was the need to further elaborate an estimate of the background dietary intake of total phosphorus from the studies considered in the ongoing assessment. While acknowledging the difficulties in obtaining such information for the human studies, the Panel agreed to make an attempt at contacting the manufacturers of the animal laboratory diets to gather information on the typical phosphorus content of the chow used in the studies considered in the assessment. Relevant scientific literature will also be reviewed to gather additional evidence.

At the current meeting, the Panel was also presented with the additional data requested from interested parties with respect to the particle size of the food additives, to be further assessed in the draft opinion.

On the basis of the comments received during the current plenary meeting, the draft opinion will require further elaboration by the Working Group and will be tabled for possible adoption at a forthcoming Plenary.

In the light of the additional work to be completed, a request for an extension of the current deadline (31.12.2018) will be discussed with the European Commission.

## **6.2. Re-evaluation of hydrochloric acid and chlorides (E 507-509; E 511) ([EFSA-Q-2011-00657](#); [EFSA-Q-2011-00658](#); [EFSA-Q-2011-00659](#); [EFSA-Q-2011-00660](#))**

At the previous plenary meeting in November 2018, the Panel could not discuss this draft opinion due to the lack of time.

At the current plenary meeting, the Panel was presented with a revised draft opinion on the re-evaluation of the safety of hydrochloric acid and chlorides (E 507-509; E 511) together with the main points for discussion.

The Panel reviewed the technical part and toxicological part of the opinion and had a number of comments on the proposed approach discussed in the draft opinion. Several comments were made also to the exposure assessment part, which would require further consideration by the Working Group.

The draft opinion will be further elaborated by the WG following the recommendations from the Panel.

The revised draft opinion will be scheduled for discussion and possible adoption at a forthcoming plenary meeting.

In the light of the additional work to be completed, a request for an extension of the current deadline (31.12.2018) will be discussed with the European Commission.

**6.3. Re-evaluation of tartaric acid-tartrates (E 334-337, 354) ([EFSA-Q-2011-00612](#); [EFSA-Q-2011-00613](#); [EFSA-Q-2011-00614](#); [EFSA-Q-2011-00615](#); [EFSA-Q-2011-00616](#); [EFSA-Q-2011-00617](#); [EFSA-Q-2011-00637](#))**

The FAF Panel was presented with the preliminary conclusions reached by the Working Group on the re-evaluation of remaining food additives other than colours and sweeteners on the draft scientific opinion on tartaric acid (E 334), sodium (E 335), potassium (E 336), potassium sodium (E 337) and calcium tartrate (E 354) as food additives was presented to the members of the FAF Panel together with the main points for discussion. An orientation from the Panel was sought with respect to the approach to be followed by the Working Group in further elaborating its conclusions in the draft opinion.

The draft opinion will be further elaborated by the WG following the recommendations from the Panel and also taking into account the additional information that has been requested to interested parties and is currently awaited in order to proceed with the finalisation of the assessment.

In the light of the additional work to be completed, a request for an extension of the current deadline (31.12.2018) will be discussed with the European Commission.

**6.4. Opinion on the follow up of the re-evaluation of sorbic acid (E200) and potassium sorbate (E202) as food additives ([EFSA-Q-2018-00137](#))**

The FAF Panel was presented with the preliminary conclusions reached by the Working Group on the follow-up of the re-evaluation of sorbic acid (E 200) and potassium sorbate (E 202) as food additives. The ongoing assessment is limited in scope to the data provided by interested parties in response to the call launched by the European Commission after the completion of the re-evaluation of these food additives by the former ANS Panel in 2015<sup>6</sup>. In its opinion the ANS Panel had set a new temporary group ADI for sorbic acid and potassium sorbate expressed as 3 mg sorbic acid/kg bw/day for sorbic acid and its potassium salt, pending submission of data that could reduce the uncertainties identified in the assessment.

As a follow-up of that scientific opinion, new reproductive and developmental toxicity data had been generated by interested parties and are currently being assessed by the FAF Panel. An orientation from the Panel was sought with respect to the approach to be followed by the Working Group in further elaborating its conclusions.

The draft opinion will be further elaborated by the WG following the recommendations from the Panel and a revised draft opinion will be scheduled for discussion and possible adoption at a forthcoming plenary meeting.

**6.5. Re-evaluation of Quillaia extract (E 999) as a food additive combined with evaluation of an application for its extension of use as a food additive in 'flavourings' ([EFSA-Q-2011-00731](#); [EFSA-Q-2014-00095](#))**

This item was not discussed due to lack of time. Panel members were invited to distribute their comments in writing since the draft opinion will be scheduled

<sup>6</sup> <https://efsa.onlinelibrary.wiley.com/doi/10.2903/j.efsa.2015.4144>

for discussion and possible adoption at the next plenary meeting in January 2019.

## **Flavourings**

### **6.6. FGE.217 Revision 2 – FGE.19 subgroup 4.1 ([EFSA-Q-2013-00286](#); [EFSA-Q-2014-00425](#); [EFSA-Q-2014-00426](#); [EFSA-Q-2014-00427](#); [EFSA-Q-2014-00428](#); [EFSA-Q-2014-00429](#); [EFSA-Q-2014-00430](#); [EFSA-Q-2014-00431](#); [EFSA-Q-2014-00432](#); [EFSA-Q-2014-00433](#))**

The FAF Panel was presented for the first time with the draft opinion on the FGE.217 (Revision 2) together with the main points for discussion. The FAF Panel discussed the different parts of the assessment and unanimously adopted the opinion, subject to incorporation of changes as suggested during the meeting.

The full opinion will be available on the Authority's webpage.

### **6.7. FGE.208 Revision 3 – FGE.19 subgroup 2.2 ([EFSA-Q-2018-00618](#))**

The FAF Panel was presented for the first time with the draft opinion on the FGE.208 (Revision 3) together with the main points for discussion. The FAF Panel discussed the different parts of the assessment and unanimously adopted the opinion, subject to incorporation of changes as suggested during the meeting.

The full opinion will be available on the Authority's webpage.

## **7. New Mandates**

No new mandates were received since the last FAF Plenary meeting.

## **8. Feedback from the Scientific Committee/Scientific Panels, EFSA, the European Commission**

### **8.1. Scientific Committee and Scientific Panel(s) including their Working Groups**

#### **8.1.1. FAF WG Food Additives Applications**

No additional issues were brought to the attention of the FAF Panel further to what is already recorded in the [minutes of the WG](#).

#### **8.1.2. FAF WG on the re-evaluation of miscellaneous food additives**

No additional issues were brought to the attention of the FAF Panel further to what is already recorded in the [minutes of the WG](#).

#### **8.1.3. FAF WG on Phosphates**

No additional issues were brought to the attention of the FAF Panel further to what is already recorded in the [minutes of the WG](#).

**8.1.4.**FAF WG on the re-evaluation of food additives permitted in foods for infants below 16 weeks of age

The Chair provided feedback on the workshop held on 30 November 2018<sup>7</sup> at EFSA's premises on the data requirements for the re-evaluation of food additives used in foods for infants below 16 weeks of age. Over 40 registered stakeholders had the opportunity to gain a better understanding on the data requirements and provide feedback on their data provision plans in this specific area of re-evaluation. No additional issues were brought to the attention of the FAF Panel further to what is already recorded in the [minutes of the WG](#).

**8.1.5.**FAF WG on the re-evaluation of remaining food additives other than colours and sweeteners

No additional issues were brought to the attention of the FAF Panel further to what is already recorded in the [minutes of the WG](#).

**8.1.6.**FAF WG on Sweeteners

No additional issues were brought to the attention of the FAF Panel further to what is already recorded in the [minutes of the WG](#).

**8.1.7.**FAF WG on Flavourings

No additional issues were brought to the attention of the FAF Panel further to what is already recorded in the [minutes of the WG](#).

**8.1.8.**FAF WG on the follow-up of the re-evaluation of sorbic acid and potassium sorbate as food additives

No additional issues were brought to the attention of the FAF Panel further to what is already recorded in the [minutes of the WG](#).

**8.1.9.**FAF WG on the re-evaluation of Annatto extracts (E 160b)

No additional issues were brought to the attention of the FAF Panel further to what is already recorded in the [minutes of the WG](#).

**8.1.10.**FAF WG on Specifications of Food Additives

The WG will meet for the first time on 18 December 2018. Feedback will be provided at the next FAF Panel plenary meeting.

**8.2. EFSA including its Working Groups/Task Forces**

The Chair of the Panel reported back from the last Scientific Committee meeting held on 21-22 November 2018 and open to observers. Minutes from the meeting are available on the EFSA's website<sup>8</sup>.

**8.3. European Commission**

No feedback provided.

<sup>7</sup> <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/events/event/181130>

<sup>8</sup> <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/event/181121-m.pdf>

**9. Other scientific topics for information and/or discussion**

No other scientific topics were presented for information and/or discussion.

**10. Any Other Business**

None