

## Scientific Panel on Plant Health (PLH)

### Minutes of the 75<sup>th</sup> Plenary meeting

**04 July 2018, 14:00 – 18:00 – Auditorium A01**

**05 July 2018, 09:00 – 18:00 – Meeting room MO7**

**Parma, Italy**

**(Agreed with written procedure, 20 July 2018)**

#### **Participants**

##### **■ Panel Members**

Claude Bragard, Katharina Dehnen-Schmutz, Francesco Di Serio, Paolo Gonthier, Josep Jaques Miret, Annemarie Fejer Justesen, Alan MacLeod, Sven Christer Magnusson, Panagiotis Milonas, Juan A. Navas-Cortés, Stephen Parnell, Roel Potting, Philippe Lucien Reignault, Hans-Hermann Thulke, Wopke Van der Werf, Antonio Vicent, Jonathan Yuen, via web-conference: Marie-Agnès Jacques, Lucia Zappalà

##### **■ European Commission representatives: Maria Mirazchiyska, Yannis Karamitsios**

##### **■ EFSA:**

ALPHA Unit: Elma Bali, Michela Chiumenti, Ramona Ciubotaru, Ewelina Czwierczek, Alice Delbianco, Franco Ferilli, Ciro Gardi, Tomasz Kaluski, Virag Kertesz, Svetla Kozelska, Andrea Maiorano, Maria Rosaria Mannino, Joshua Oyedele, Marco Pautasso, Gritta Schrader, Giuseppe Stancanelli, Sara Tramontini, Sybren Vos

SCER Unit: Bernard Bottex

AMU: Olaf Mosbach-Schulz

#### **1. Welcome and apologies for absence**

The EFSA representative welcomed the participants.

#### **2. Adoption of the agenda**

The agenda was adopted by the Panel.

#### **3. Declarations of Interest Scientific Panel Members**

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest, EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest and the Specific Declarations of Interest filled in by the Panel Members invited for the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process.

#### **4. Round table presentation of PLH Panel members and EFSA PLH Team**

PLH panel members and EFSA PLH team presented themselves.

## 5. Report on written procedure since the 74<sup>th</sup> Plenary meeting

### 5.1. Report on the agreement with written procedure of the minutes of the 74<sup>th</sup> Plenary minutes

The minutes of the 74<sup>th</sup> Plenary meeting was approved by written procedure on July 2<sup>nd</sup> and published on the EFSA webpage on July 3<sup>rd</sup> 2018.

## 6. Presentation of PLH Panel mandate: general mandate and overview of completed, ongoing and future mandates

A thorough presentation was given to the PLH panel on general mandate and overview of completed, ongoing and future mandates

## 7. Rules for Panel Chair and Vice-chairs election

PLH panel members received clear and concise explanation on the rules and procedure of Panel Chair and Vice-chairs election.

## 8. Election of Panel Chair and Vice-Chairs

The elections were carried following the procedure.

The results are:

Panel Chair: Claude Bragard

1<sup>st</sup> Vice Chair: Jonathan Yuen

2<sup>nd</sup> Vice Chair: Francesco di Serio

## 9. How we work together in PLH: Nomination and roles of WG Chair and Vice-chairs, WG members, rapporteurs, hearing experts; role of EFSA staff

PLH team leader explained to the new PLH Panel the roles of and roles of WG Chair and Vice-chairs, WG members, rapporteurs, hearing experts; role of EFSA staff.

## 10. World café discussion groups on Plant health activities: Pest Survey, Horizon Scanning, EU candidate priority pests, *Xylella* global host plants database, High risk plants and commodity risk assessments

The main objectives and tasks of these activities were presented to the panel members in dedicated spaces and sessions for discussion in small groups.

## 11. Feedback from the European Commission

### 11.1. Introduction to the new EU Plant Health Law

DG Santé presented the new EU Plant health law, emphasising the important scientific contribution of the EFSA PLH Plant Health: [Plant Health Biosecurity legislation](#)

## 12. Pest Categorisation

### 12.1. Introduction to the mandate, the work plan and the template

The Panel was informed about the pest categorisation mandate, its background, the related working groups and their work plan, as well as the interim results until June 2018. The pest categorisation template was presented to the panel in detail.

## 12.2. Scientific output submitted for discussion and/or possible adoption: Scientific Opinion on pest categorisation of *Thecaphora solani* ([EFSA-Q-2018-00015](#))

The Panel reviewed the draft pest categorisation of *Thecaphora solani* tabled for possible adoption, but expressed some concern regarding the emphasis given to two theoretical pathways of entry. The current template of the section dealing with phytosanitary measures was also thoroughly discussed. The Working Group on Agricultural Fungal Pathogens will revise the pest categorisation according to the comments made and submit again the pest categorisation for possible adoption by written procedure beginning of September 2018.

## 12.3. Scientific output submitted for discussion and/or possible adoption: Scientific Opinion on pest categorisation of *Arceuthobium* spp. ([EFSA-Q-2018-00035](#))

Following a request from the European Commission, the EFSA Panel on Plant Health performed a pest categorisation of *Arceuthobium* spp. (non-EU), a well-defined and distinguishable group of parasitic plant species of the family Viscaceae, also known as dwarf mistletoes. These are flowering plants parasitizing a wide range of conifers of the families Pinaceae and Cupressaceae. *Arceuthobium* species (non-EU) are regulated in Council Directive 2000/29/EC (Annex IAI) as harmful organisms whose introduction into the EU is banned. Many *Arceuthobium* species are recognized, with most dwarf mistletoes native in the New World, and north-western Mexico and the western USA as the center of diversity for the genus. Only two *Arceuthobium* species are native (and reported to be present) in the EU (*Arceuthobium azoricum* and *Arceuthobium oxycedrum*), which are thus not part of this pest categorisation. Host species of non-EU dwarf mistletoes include species of the genera *Abies*, *Cupressus*, *Juniperus*, *Larix*, *Picea*, *Pinus*, *Pseudotsuga* and *Tsuga*. Most *Arceuthobium* spp. can parasitize more than one species of conifer host. Dwarf mistletoes could enter the EU via host plants for planting and cut branches, but these pathways are closed. They could establish in the EU, as hosts are widespread and climatic conditions are favourable. They would be able to spread following establishment by human movement of host plants for planting and cut branches, as well as natural spread. Should non-EU dwarf mistletoes be introduced in the EU, impacts can be expected on coniferous woodlands, plantations, ornamental trees and nurseries. The main uncertainties concern (i) the precise distribution and host range of the individual *Arceuthobium* spp. and (ii) the level of susceptibility of conifers native to Europe. For *Arceuthobium* spp. (non-EU) as a group of organisms, the criteria assessed by the Panel for consideration as a potential quarantine pest are met, whilst, for regulated non-quarantine pests, the criterion on the pest presence in the EU is not met.

The opinion was adopted on 5 July 2018.

## 13. Introduction to Quantitative Pest Risk assessment

### 13.1. PLH Panel guidance on Quantitative Pest Risk assessment

The PLH Panel Guidance on Quantitative Pest Risk assessment was presented to the participants. First the purpose of pest risk assessment and the two-phase approach were explained. The second part of the presentation focused on the reasons for quantitative pest risk assessment approach, the principles, the mechanistic population-based approach and scenarios to distinguish different situations. The tiered approach when deciding on the level of detail in quantification was shown as well. The use of models and how to deal with uncertainty including the decomposition of uncertainty were demonstrated using examples. A final part of the presentation was dedicated to the communication issues, use of the opinion and challenges.

### 13.1. Quantitative Risk assessment on *Spodoptera frugiperda*: an example from a completed opinion

The Chair of the Working Group presented the case of *Spodoptera frugiperda*, as an application of the recently adopted quantitative pest risk assessment guidance. In the mandate received from EC it was requested EFSA to focus on the evaluation of Entry, Establishment and on the risk reduction options. Impact was not evaluated; hence the opinion was a partial risk assessment. The structure and the expertise of the WG members were presented, focusing on their complementarity that allowed the WG to have up-to-date awareness on the dynamic situation in Africa. The process of expert knowledge elicitation (EKE) was summarized, and reference made also to non-conventional sources of evidences (e.g. YouTube videos for getting information on post-harvest treatments of commodities in particular countries). The preparation and use of the “evidence dossiers”, as collection of data and evidences to support the EKE, was described. The conceptual models for entry via trade and natural spread were presented, illustrating associated uncertainties. For the evaluation of the establishment suitability, the results of a series of models were taken into account, outlining the uncertainties for the establishment of *S. frugiperda* in the EU territory.

### 13.2. Update from the working group on the quantitative pest risk assessment of *Xylella fastidiosa* ([EFSA-Q-2018-00069](#))

The Chair of the Working Group made a short introduction about the development of *Xylella fastidiosa* disease in Europe since 2015, when the previous EFSA pest risk assessment was published. Since 2015, new outbreaks have been recorded in France in the PACA region and Corse, subspecies *multiplex*, and in Spain, in the region of Alicante (subs. *multiplex*), and in the Balearic Islands (subsp. *multiplex*, *pauca*, *fastidiosa*). In Italy, the disease has continued spreading towards the north in the Apulia region (subsp. *pauca*). The new mandate of the European Commission for *Xylella fastidiosa* asks to update the previous pest risk assessment considering the recent outbreaks, the subspecies and the sequence types of *Xylella fastidiosa*, and to assess the probability of short and long distance spreading and establishment in Europe together with their consequences on the plant species concerned. In addition, the EC asks to identify and evaluate the risk reduction options currently available, and the asymptomatic period of the disease with the aim of providing an indication about the minimum number of years needed before lifting the demarcated area after the implementation of the eradication measures. The deadline for this mandate is the end of March 2019. The working group was established at the beginning of May, and it met twice. The next meeting will be on 17 July 2018.

## 14. Workshop on Quantitative Pest Risk assessment:

### ➤ Introduction to the Workshop and the discussion groups

A Workshop was organised to give the participants a general introduction to the Guidance for qualitative pest risk assessment. The Workshop consisted in a 90-minute practical exercise in four discussion groups focussing on four specific aspects of the quantitative methodology using different pests as indicated below:

- Discussion Group 1: Setting of scenario A0 – current situation (case study on *Xylella fastidiosa*)
- Discussion Group 2: Evidence management (case study on Citrus canker)
- Discussion Group 3: Estimation of a parameter (case study on *Spodoptera frugiperda*)

- Discussion Group 4: Setting of scenarios using different Risk reducing options (case study on *Eotetranychus lewisi*)

➤ Wrap-up and Plenary discussion

The practical exercise in the four discussion groups was followed by a plenary discussion where the results of the exercise and a group feedback were presented by the discussion group rapporteur and discussed with the whole Panel.

## 15. Other scientific topics for information and/or discussion

- 15.1. International Conference on Plant pathology ICPP 2018, August 2018 Boston USA
- 15.2. International Conference on Aerobiology ICA 2018, September 2018 Parma Italy
- 15.3. EFSA Conference, September 2018, Parma Italy

The above points of the agenda were not discussed due to time constrain. Information on the conferences will be sent out by email to the Panel.

## 16. Any other business

### 16.1. Nomination of WG chairs

The Panel Chair nominated the WG chairs as per table here below

| WG   | Chair                    | New Chair/<br>Confirmed Chair |
|--|--------------------------|-------------------------------|
| Agriculture Insects categorisation           | Alan MacLeod             | Confirmed                     |
| Forest Insects categorisation                | Panagiotis Milonas       | New                           |
| Agriculture Fungal Pathogens categorisation  | Antonio Vicent           | New                           |
| Forest Pathogens categorisations             | Katharina Dehnen Schmutz | New                           |
| Bacterial plant pathogens categorisation     | Marie Agnes Jacques      | New                           |
| Pine bonsai plants derogations (Japan/China) | Roel Potting             | Confirmed                     |
| High risk plants                             | Roel Potting             | Confirmed                     |
| <i>Xylella</i> Pest Risk Assessment          | Stephen Parnell          | Confirmed                     |

The chair of the WG on Plant Viruses categorisation is going to be nominated at a later stage.

### 16.2. Confirmation of Plenary meeting dates

The panel confirmed the meeting dates for 2018 and 2019.

Next plenary meeting will take place on September 26<sup>th</sup> & 27<sup>th</sup>, Parma Italy