Scientific Panel on Plant Health (PLH)

Minutes of the 72nd Plenary meeting

21 March & 22 March; 2018, Parma, (Italy)

21 March 2018 from 09:00 to 18:00

22 March 2018 from 08:30 to 13:00

(Agreed with written procedure, 17 April 2018)

Participants

- Panel Members
  Claude Bragard, David Caffier, Thierry Candresse, Elisavet Chatzivassiliou, Katharina Dehnen-Schmutz, Gianni Gilioli, Jean-Claude Gregoire, Josep Jaques Miret (2nd day only), Michael Jeger, Alan MacLeod, Maria Navajas, Björn Niere, Stephan Parnell, Roel Potting, Trond Rafoss, Vittorio Rossi, Gregor Urek, Ariena Van Bruggen, Wopke van der Werf, Jonathan West (participated by web-conference), Stephan Winter
- Hearing experts:
  Muriel Suffert (European and Mediterranean Plant Protection Organisation – EPPO)
  Andrea Sissons (Canada Food Inspection Agency – CFIA)
- European Commission representatives:
  Maria Mirazchiyska (DG SANTE)
- EFSA:
  ALPHA Unit: Ramona Ciubotaru, Ewelina Czwienczek, Alice Delbianco, Franco Ferilli, Ciro Gardi, Tomasz Kaluski, Virag Kertesz, Nikolaus Kriz, Svetla Kozelska, Maria Rosaria Mannino, Joshua Oyedele, Marco Pautasso, Giuseppe Stancanelli, Emanuela Tacci, Sybren Vos

  SCER Unit: Bernard Bottex

  AMU UNIT: José Cortinas Abrahantes

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants. Apologies were received from Josep Jaques Miret for the first day.

2. Adoption of the agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of Interest of Scientific Panel Members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest, EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest and the Specific Declarations of Interest filled in by the Panel

Members invited for the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process. For further details on the outcome of the Oral Declarations of Interest made at the beginning of the meeting, please refer to the Annex.

4. Report on written procedures since the 71st meeting

4.1. Report on the agreement with written procedure of the minutes of the 71st Plenary minutes

The minutes of the 71st PLH Plenary meeting were agreed by written procedure on 22 February 2018 and published on the EFSA webpage on 23 February 2018. https://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/events/event/180131

5. New Mandates

5.1. Additional TOR for the Black Pine bonsai plant mandate to include the request from China regarding import of Japanese white pine bonsai to the EU

EFSA is requested to prepare a scientific opinion on the risk analysis on a dossier submitted to the Commission by the General Administration of Quality Supervision, Inspection and Quarantine of the People's Republic of China in support of their request for a temporary derogation from Council Directive 2000/29/EC for import of Japanese white pine bonsai (*Pinus parviflora*) into the EU. Specifically, EFSA is requested, pursuant to Article 29 of Regulation (EC) No 178/2002, to provide a scientific opinion. Taking into account the available scientific information, including the technical information provided by China, EFSA is requested to consider how far the existing requirements for the bonsai pine species subject to derogation in Decisions 2002/887/EC and 2002/499/EC would cover all plant health risks from Japanese white pine bonsai *Pinus parviflora* imported from China. EFSA is requested to deliver an opinion within six months from the acceptance of the mandate. The requested opinion will be developed within the PLH Panel working group already dealing with similar request from Japan.

6. Scientific outputs submitted for discussion and/or possible adoption

6.1. Scientific Opinion on pest categorisation of *Apiosporina morbosa* (EFSA-Q-2017-00370)

The Panel on Plant Health adopted on 22 March 2018 the pest categorisation of *Apiosporina morbosa*, the fungus causing black knot, for

the European Union (EU). The identity of the pest is well established and reliable methods exist for its detection/identification. The pest is listed in Annex IIAI of Directive 2000/29/EC and is not known to occur in the EU. *Apiosporina morbosa* is present in Alaska, Canada, Mexico and the continental states of the USA. The major hosts of *A. morbosa* are *Prunus domestica* and *P. cerasus*; the host status of other *Prunus* species and hybrids is uncertain because of contradictory reports or lack of information. The pest could potentially enter the EU on host plants for planting and plant parts originating in infested third countries. Wood of *Prunus* spp. is also a pathway of entry, but of minor importance. The current pest distribution and climate matching suggest that the pest could establish and spread in the EU wherever the hosts are grown. In the infested areas, the pest causes girdling of twigs and occasionally of larger branches, whereas trees with multiple infections loose vigor, bloom poorly, and become unproductive, stunted and susceptible to winter injury and infection by other pathogens. The presence of black knots makes trees unsuitable for timber production. It is expected that the pest introduction and spread in the EU would impact host production. Uncertainty exists on whether the agricultural practices and chemical control methods applied in the EU could prevent the establishment and spread of *A. morbosa*. *Apiosporina morbosa* meets all the criteria assessed by EFSA for consideration as potential Union quarantine pest. As the pest is not known to occur in the EU, this criterion to consider it as Union regulated non-quarantine pest is not met.

6.2. Scientific Opinion on pest categorisation of *Tachypterellus quadrigibbus* (EFSA-Q-2017-00365)

The Panel on Plant Health performed a pest categorisation of the weevil *Anthonomus quadrigibbus* Say, (Coleoptera: Curculionidae), for the European Union (EU). *Anthonomus quadrigibbus* is a well-defined and distinguishable species, recognised as an occasional pest of apples, pears and sour cherries in North America where it also feeds on a range of wild rosaceous plants such as *Crataegus* and *Amelanchier*. Adults feed on leaves, flowers and fruit. Feeding damage to fruit reduces quality. Females oviposit into young fruit, causing surface blemishes and resulting in distortion as the fruit develops. Marketability is subsequently reduced. Larvae and pupae develop within host fruit. Most infested fruit fall prematurely, reducing yield. *A. quadrigibbus* was regarded as a more serious pest in the early twentieth century. *Anthonomus quadrigibbus* is not known to occur in the EU and is listed in Annex IIAI of Council Directive 2000/29/EC under the synonym Tachypterellus quadrigibbus. Host plants for planting and infested fruit could potentially provide a pathway into the EU. Considering the climatic similarities between North America and Europe, and that wild and commercial hosts occur widely

within the EU, *A. quadrigibbus* has the potential to establish within the EU. There would be one generation per year, as in North America. Impacts could be expected in apple, pear and perhaps sour cherry orchards. The level of impacts would be uncertain. There is also uncertainty regarding whether *A. quadrigibbus* would extend its host range to include other Rosaceae within the EU. Phytosanitary measures are available to reduce the likelihood of introduction of *A. quadrigibbus*. All criteria assessed by EFSA for consideration as a potential Union quarantine pest are met. *A. quadrigibbus* is not known to occur in the EU. Hence, the criterion of presence in the EU, assessed by EFSA as a precondition for consideration as a Union regulated non-quarantine pest, is not met.

The opinion was adopted by the Panel on 22 March 2018

6.3. Scientific Opinion on pest categorisation of *Mycosphaerella larici-leptolepis* (EFSA-Q-2018-00029)

Following a request from the European Commission, the EFSA Panel on Plant Health (PLH) performed a pest categorisation of *Mycodiella laricis-leptolepidis*, a well-defined and distinguishable fungal species of the family Mycosphaerellaceae. The former species name *Mycosphaerella laricis-leptolepis* is used in the Council Directive 2000/29/EC. The pathogen is regulated in Annex IAI as a harmful organism whose introduction into the EU is banned. *M. laricis-leptolepidis* is native to East Asia and causes a disease known as needle cast of Japanese larch (*Larix kaempferi = L. leptolepis*) and Kurile larch (*L. gmelinii*). European larch (*L. decidua*) was found to be susceptible to the disease as introduced tree in Japan. The fungus could enter the EU via plants for planting and cut branches of *Larix* spp. It could establish in the EU, as hosts are present and climatic conditions are favourable. The pathogen would be able to spread following establishment by human movement of infected plants for planting and by dissemination of ascospores. Should the pathogen be introduced in the EU, impacts can be expected due to needle loss in larch forests and plantations, thus leading to reduced tree growth and ecosystem service provision. The use of resistant / tolerant varieties can reduce the impacts. The key uncertainties are the knowledge gaps concerning (i) the potential range of spread through ascospores and (ii) the level of impacts in the native range of the pathogen. The criteria assessed by the Panel for consideration as a potential quarantine pest are met. For regulated non-quarantine pests. One of the criteria for regulation as a non-quarantine pest, i.e. pest presence in the EU, is not met.

The opinion was adopted by the Panel on the 22nd March 2018.

6.4. Scientific Opinion on pest categorisation of *Mycospharella populorum* (EFSA-Q-2018-00031)

Following a request from the European Commission, the EFSA Plant Health Panel performed a pest categorisation of *Sphaerulina musiva*, a well-defined and distinguishable fungal species of the family Mycosphaerellaceae. Following a recent phylogenetic analysis of the genus Septoria and other closely related genera, a new name (*Sphaerulina musiva*) was introduced for the species. The former species name *Mycosphaerella populorum* is used in the Council Directive 2000/29/EC. The pathogen is regulated in Annex IAI as a harmful organism whose introduction into the EU is banned. *S. musiva* is reported from North and South America, and not known to occur in the EU. *S. musiva* causes Septoria leaf spots and cankers of poplar (*Populus* spp.). Of the poplars native to Europe, *P. nigra* is reported as susceptible and *P. tremula* as susceptible when planted in North America. The hybrid *P. x canadensis* (arising from a cross of *P. nigra* and the North American *P. deltoides*), widely grown in the EU, is also susceptible. The pest could enter the EU on plants for planting, cut branches, isolated bark and wood with and without bark. *S. musiva* could establish in the EU, as hosts are common and favourable climatic conditions are widespread, and could spread following establishment by natural dispersal and movement of infected plants for planting, cut branches, isolated bark and wood with or without bark. The pest introduction would have impacts in woodlands, plantations and nurseries. The pathogen is considered the most serious disease affecting hybrid poplar production in North America. Selection, breeding and planting of resistant species and clones is the main method used to control the damage caused by the pathogen. There is some uncertainty on the geographical distribution of the pest in Asia and South America and on the level of susceptibility among *Populus* species native to Europe, as well as *Salix* spp. The criteria assessed by the Panel for consideration as a potential quarantine pest are met. The criterion of presence in the EU, assessed by EFSA as a precondition for consideration as a Union regulated non-quarantine pest, is not met.

The opinion was adopted by the Panel on the 22nd March 2018.

6.5. Scientific Opinion on pest categorisation of Blight and blight-like (EFSA-Q-2017-00309)

The EFSA Panel on Plant Health performed a pest categorization of "Blight and blight-like" for the European Union (EU) territory. Blight is a major disease of citrus. Similar "blight-like" diseases are also known (declinio, declinamiento…) and are addressed simultaneously with Blight in the present categorization. The causal agent(s) remain(s) unknown and the

potential role of a recently identified citrus endogenous pararetrovirus (Citrus Blight-associated pararetrovirus, CBaPRV) remains to be established. Transmissibility and ability to produce consistent (although poorly specific) symptoms have been demonstrated and a combination of indirect approaches is used, with limits, for diagnosis. There are large uncertainties on the biology of the causal agent(s) and on the epidemiology of the disease, including the transmission mechanism(s) responsible for the observed field spread. Blight has been reported from North, Central and South America, Africa and Oceania but is not known to occur in the EU. It is listed in Annex IIA of Directive 2000/29EC. It has the potential to enter, establish and spread in the EU territory. The main entry pathway (citrus plants for planting) is closed by existing legislation and entry is only possible on minor pathways (such as illegal import). Blight is a severe disease and a negative impact is expected should it be introduced in the EU but the magnitude of this negative impact is very difficult to estimate. "Blight and blight like" satisfies all criteria evaluated by EFSA to qualify as a Union quarantine pest. It does not meet the criterion of being present in the EU to qualify as a Union RNQP. Since the identity of the causal agent(s) of the Blight and blight-like disease(s) and the existence and efficiency of natural spread mechanism(s) remain unknown, large uncertainties affect all aspects of the present pest categorisation.

The opinion was adopted by the Panel on the 22nd March 2018.

6.6. Scientific Opinion on pest categorisation of *Nacobbus aberrans* (EFSA-Q-2017-00376)

The Panel on Plant Health performed a pest categorisation of *Nacobbus aberrans* (Nematoda: Pratylenchidae), the false root-knot nematode, for the European Union (EU). The nematode was originally described from the American continent. Due to differences in host range as well as molecular variability among populations, *N. aberrans* should be regarded as a species complex (*N. aberrans* sensu lato). All populations belonging to this species complex are pests of important host plants in the EU. *Nacobbus aberrans* had been detected indoors in the EU in the 1950s and 1960s but is no longer reported to be present in the EU. It is regulated by Council Directive 2000/29/EC, listed in Annex IAI as *Nacobbus aberrans* (Thorne) Thorne and Allen. Species within the *N. aberrans* complex are endoparasitic with migratory and sedentary stages. They are highly

polyphagous attacking many plant species. They are also found in soil where they can survive dry conditions and freezing temperatures. Plants for planting and soil are potential pathways for this nematode. Climatic conditions in the EU are similar to those found in the countries where the pest is present. Hosts of the nematode from which high yield losses have been reported include potato, sugar beet, tomato and beans.. The nematode only moves short distances (around 1m) but may be spread with plants and soil moving activities. Measures are available to inhibit EU entry via potatoes and soil as such but not all host plants are covered by current legislation. Entry of the nematode with plants and soil attached to plants for planting that are not regulated is therefore possible. *Nacobbus aberrans* does satisfy all the criteria that are within the remit of EFSA to assess to be regarded as a Union quarantine pest.

The opinion was adopted by the Panel on the 22nd March 2018.

6.7. Scientific Opinion on pest categorisation of *Hirschmanniella* spp. (EFSA-Q-2017-00377)

The draft opinion was presented to the Panel, Following a discussion on the interpretation of the terms of reference and the grouping of the various species of this genus, the Panel agreed to include in the opinion also *Hirschmanniella gracilis*. The opinion will be reviewed by the Working Group and after a commenting phase it will be sent for written adoption in April.

7. Feedback from the Scientific Committee/Scientific Panels, EFSA

7.1. PLH Scientific Panel including its Working Groups

7.1.1. Update of the working group on the pest risk assessment of *Spodoptera frugiperda* (EFSA-Q-2018-00068)

The WG chair updated on the status of the *Spodopera frugiperda* PRA. The interpretation of the ToR and the composition of the WG were presented. The chair illustrates the main findings on interceptions and presented the identified pathways. The conceptual models for Entry (trade and natural spread) were presented, as well as the proposed approach for the assessment of the establishment.

7.1.2. Update of the working group on the pest risk assessment of *Xylella fastidiosa* (EFSA-Q-2018-00069)

An update on the interpretation of the terms of reference and the work plan was presented.

7.1.3. Update of the working group on guidances for dossier submission and commodity risk assessment for high-risk plants, plant products or other objects (EFSA-Q-2018-00117, EFSA-Q-2018-00116)

The WG chair presented the mandate, the content of ToR and the composition of the WG.

7.1.4. Update on the public consultation of the draft guidance on quantitative pest risk assessment methodologies (EFSA-Q-2014-00351)

The panel was updated regarding the public consultation of the draft guidance on quantitative pest risk assessment methodologies. The public consultation of the draft guidance was launched on EFSA web-page on 12 February 2018 (http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/consultations/call/180212-0) and the deadline for comments is 25 March 2018. By 20 April 2018 two organisations provided general and specific comments so far. The WG will address the comments provided through the public consultation and perform the relevant changes in the document. The updated draft guidance will be presented during the next PLH Panel meeting for discussion.

7.1.5. Update of the working group on the request from Japan regarding export of black pine bonsai to the EU (EFSA-Q-2017-00715)

The WG chair presented shortly the background and the terms of reference and the progress done from the last PLH Panel plenary meeting. The WG analysed in detail the technical information provided by Japanese competent Authority and formulated a specific a request for additional information focusing on the procedure and criteria for compilation of pests list (systematic literature review), detailed information on efficacy of used pesticides and information on life cycle of selected pests. EFSA submitted a letter with the request for this additional information to the Japanese competent Authority. The WG will continue with its work on the opinion when the additional information will be available.

7.1.6. Update on work progress from the PLH Panel Working Groups on pest categorisations (M-2017-0055)

Agricultural Insects – 5 pest categorisations have been delayed and 3 put forward as compared to the original work plan. In April 2018 work will start on the non-EU Tephritidae group with the support of an EFSA funded

Tasking Grant Cooperation project awarded to the Thessaly University (Greece).

Forest Insects – The WG is currently working on *Dendrolimus sibiricus* a moth damaging coniferous forests in Russia. The work on this pest is supported also by an external expert from Russia. Work on the categorisation of non-EU Pissodes is starting soon.

Agricultural pathogens – The WG has started working on the next categorisation on *Glomerella gossypium*. The fungus is a protected zone pest which affects cotton cultivated in 3 EU MS.

Forest pathogens – The WG is currently working on *Guignardia laricina* and *Coniferiporia weirii / sulphurascens*.

Viruses – The WG started working on the group categorisations of pests of fruit crops with the support of the EFSA funded tasking grant cooperation project awarded to CNR Italy. The project will deliver the lists of non-EU viruses and viroids for Vitis, Malus, Pyrus, Cydonia, Fragaria, Ribes and Rubus. This will be followed by literature search and data collection on the non-EU species. Considering the large size of the group on several important crops, it was proposed to publish a first opinion on the list and description of how the viruses would be grouped, then specific opinions on the different crop virus groups.

Bacteria – The WG will start working on the categorisation of *Pantoea stewartii* stewartii. The draft opinion on *Curtobacterium flaccumfaciens* pv. flaccumfaciens will be finalised after clarification of the pest status in Romania and Germany.

Xylella fastidiosa pest categorisation – The WG is elaborating the current situation and evolution of the disease. Insect vectors are discussed, with a focus on the vector species richness in the EU. The draft opinion is planned to be finalised by the end of May.

Nematodes – The WG is currently updating the draft opinion on *Hirschmanniella* spp., *Xiphinema americanum* sensu lato is the next opinion to work on.

7.2. EFSA including its Working Groups/Task Forces

7.2.1. Update on Request to provide scientific and technical assistance on survey guidelines relevant for plant health for the EU territory (M-2017-0137)

The mandate and progress performed by the EFSA working group dedicated to this mandate were presented in details. The technical report on "Work-plan and methodology for EFSA to develop plant pest survey guidelines for EU Member States" has been finalised and published on the

EFSA Journal. In the context of the risk based survey design, the EFSA tool RiBESS+ for calculating sample size was presented. The mathematical and statistical concepts behind the proposed approach were also presented and discussed with the participants. In addition, an interactive simulation exercise of RiBESS+ was performed.

7.2.2. Update on the request from the European Commission to provide scientific and technical assistance on a horizon scanning exercise in view to crisis preparedness on plant health for the EU territory (M-2017-0012)

The main issues included in the 11th and 12th editions of the EFSA Plant Health Newsletter were presented as well as an update of the tasking grant on Horizon scanning and the perspectives of work. These include the first meeting of the EFSA working group on Horizon scanning and the plan for a wider distribution of the newsletter in the future.

7.3. Scientific Committee and its Working Groups

8. Feedback from the European Commission

No specific feedback was provided, in addition to the new mandates.

9. Other scientific topics for information and/or discussion

9.1. Presentation by Videoconference with Canadian Food Inspection Agency on Canada commodity risk assessment

Andrea Sissons, from the Canadian Food Inspection Agency (CFIA), shortly introduced the main activities of the agency, focusing then on the commodity risk assessment (CRA) that was started in Canada since the late 1980s. These types of RA can range in complexity, from simple lists of pest names, to embedded mini pest risk assessments of potential quarantine pests. Examples of recent CRAs were shown. CRAs are initiated by a request from the NPPO of the exporting country or a Canadian importer. Among the information requested in the dossier: commodity description, estimated commodity export value and volume, production area description, packing and shipping information, description of associated pests and diseases in the country of origin/production. The purpose of the CRA is "to evaluate the plant health risk of pests associated with the importation of xx commodity from yy country.
Among the challenges faced by CFIA: the limited information provided by the exporter (in some case CFIA is performing literature searches on behalf of the exporting country), the language of the available literature, the length of pest lists, the lack of information if commodity is a new crop in the exporting country.

9.2. EPPO presentations:

Muriel Suffert from EPPO presented the two EPPO Guidelines, shortly described below. Criteria for identifying new trades were presented, as well as the criteria for the re-evaluation of existing trades.

9.2.1. PM 5/9 (1) Preparation of pest lists in the framework of commodity PRAs

This Standard describes the process recommended for preparing pest lists in the framework of pathway-initiated pest risk analyses (PRAs) where a specific commodity and origin(s) have been identified. It also provides suggestions for criteria for the establishment of priorities between pests for the preparation of individual PRAs

9.2.2. PM 5/7 (1) Screening process to identify priorities for commodity PRA for plants for planting

The Decision-Support Scheme is intended to be used by NPPOs to identify priorities for commodity PRAs for imports of plants for planting (except seeds) from a given origin. This is applicable for new trade and for the re-evaluation of existing trade.

9.3. Presentation on procurement on *Xylella* vectors biology and control

Prof. Domenico Bosco, the coordinator of the EFSA procurement "Collection of data and information on biology and control of vectors of *Xylella fastidiosa*" (Call Reference: RC/EFSA/ALPHA/2015/01) presented the results of the first two year activity. The tasks included systematic literature reviews i) on phenology and ecology of *X. fastidiosa* vectors and potential vectors, ii) on effective control options against *X. fastidiosa* vectors and potential vectors, iii) identification of national databases and contact points on good agricultural practices (GAPs), iv) inventory of national integrated pest management (IPM) programmes, v) survey on national programs to monitor *X. fastidiosa* potential vectors, vi) field observations on phenological phases of *Philaenus spumarius* in olive orchards. This last activity included observations at three different scales (macrocosm, mesocosm, microcosm) and will be repeated for one additional year with the scope of providing a powerful tool for modelling population dynamics of *X. fastidiosa* vectors in the EU and building scenarios on risk of natural spread of the disease.

10. Any other business

10.1. Feedback received from the open plenary meeting

Feedback received on the open plenary was presented

10.2. EFSA conference 2018, Science, Food, Society, Parma 18 – 21 September 2018

Panel members were informed about the EFSA conference and the deadline for registration and the dedicated web page were shown

10.3. ANSES EPPO EFSA conference on Global Change in Plant Health, Paris, April 2018

Panel members were informed about the Global Change conference by showing the dedicated web page

10.4. International conference on Plant Pathology, Boston, USA August 2018

Panel members were informed about the International conference on Plant Pathology, some sessions of interests including that on *Xylella fastidiosa* and the deadline by showing the dedicated web page

10.5. International conference on Aerobiology, Parma September 2018

Panel members were informed about the International Aerobiology conference, the two EFSA sessions on airborne plant pathogens and on innovative approaches in aerobiology and the deadline by showing the dedicated web page

10.6. 6th *Xanthomonas* genomics conference to be held in Germany in July

Panel members were informed about the 6th *Xanthomonas* genomics conference and the deadline by showing the dedicated web page

10.7. Follow up on PLH panel opinion on the Evaluation of a paper on the first report in Europe of *Phyllosticta citricarpa*

The Panel was informed about presentation of the opinion to the PAFF committee and to EU MS Chief Plant Health Officers (COPHS) meetings, as well as on the EFSA ongoing outsourced projects on this pathogen.

Annex

Interests and actions resulting from the Oral Declarations of Interest done at the beginning of the meeting

With regard to this meeting **DR. ALAN MACLEOD** declared the following interest with regard to item 7.1.3 of the agenda: within his employment in DEFRA (UK) he participated to the European Commission Working Group dealing with the high risk plants and he was the **CO-AUTHOR OF THE UK WORKING DOCUMENT/PROPOSAL FOR SUCH ECWG.** In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes[1] and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest[2], and taking into account the specific matters discussed at the meeting in question, the interest above was not deemed to represent a Conflict of Interest for the expert concerned.

[1] http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf
[2] http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf