

Scientific Network on Risk Assessment in Animal Health and Welfare

Minutes of the 2nd meeting of National Contact Points established under Art 20 of Council Regulation (EC) 1099/2009

Held on 18 October 2017, Parma

(Agreed on 3 November 2017)

Participants

- **Network Representatives of Member States (including EFTA Countries):**

Country	Representative
Austria	Martina Doerflinger
Belgium	Ester Peeters
Bulgaria	Madlen Vasileva
Croatia	Branka Bukovic Sobic
Cyprus	Yola Iacovou
Czech Republic	----
Denmark	Else Enemark
Estonia	David Arney
Finland	Satu Raussi
France	Laure Paget
Germany	Michael Marahrens
Greece	Katerina Marinou
Hungary	Zoltan Huber
Iceland	Thora Johanna Jonasdottir
Ireland	Niall O'Nuallain
Italy	Domenico Castelluccio
Latvia	Iveta Kocina
Liechtenstein	---
Lithuania	---
Luxembourg	---
Malta	---
Netherlands	Marien Gerritzen
Poland	---

Portugal	---
Romania	Hristescu Ioana
Slovakia	---
Slovenia	Tea Dronjic
Spain	Antonio Velarde
Sweden	Charlotte Berg
Switzerland	Peter Jakob
United Kingdom	Henry Buller
Norway	Cecilie Marie Mejdell

- **Hearing Experts**

De Paepe Karlien (BE), Alessandra Raucci (IT), Julien Etienne (ICF Consultant)

- **European Commission:**

Stanislav Ralchev (DG SANTE)

- **EFSA:**

ALPHA Unit (Denise Candiani (chair), Chiara Fabris, Frank Verdonck, Gabriele Zancanaro)

DTS Unit (Nicola Maj): participated in agenda point 3.5

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

Apologies were received from Czech Republic, Lichtenstein, Lithuania, Luxembourg, Malta, Poland, Portugal and Slovakia.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Topics for discussion

3.1. DG SANTE activities on protection of animals at killing

The European Commission (Stanislav Ralchev, DG SANTE G2) provided an overview of the work and actions to improve animal welfare at slaughter and killing. The Commission expectations regarding scientific support under Art 20 of Council Regulation EC No 1099/2009 were also outlined. He informed the meeting about current Commission studies on i) Welfare of farmed fish: common practices during transport and at slaughter and ii) Preparation of best practices on the protection of animals at the time of killing (see next point in agenda). He also gave an update on the EU Platform on Animal Welfare which will meet for second time on 10 November 2017 (Webpage: http://ec.europa.eu/food/animals/welfare/eu-platform-animal-welfare_en) and announced the publication of a call for establishment of the "First EU Reference Centre for animal welfare". It will first focus on official controls carried out to

enforce requirements for the welfare of pigs (Dir. 2008/120/EC). The call for selection and designation is published at: https://ec.europa.eu/food/animals/welfare_en. Only the National Competent Authorities of Member States may submit an application respecting the deadline of 20 November 2017.

3.2. Commission study on “Preparation of best practices on the protection of animals at the time of killing”

Julien Etienne - Managing Consultant at the contractor company ICF <http://www.icfi.com/> - gave a presentation via webconference on the aforementioned study which has been recently concluded and its report is expected to be published soon. The guide addresses the need for best practice information regarding the protection of animals at the time of killing, in a number of areas where problems have been identified by recent Commission audits. For this purpose, information on current practices was collected from different sources and gaps were identified. Based on that elements for best practices were drafted and stakeholders were largely consulted before finalizing the elements for best practices. The intended audience is business operators and in particular animal welfare officers in slaughterhouses. The final product will include three sets of documents relating to: i) slaughterhouse operations, ii) slaughter without stunning and ii) on-farm killing. A link will be circulated to NCPs when it will be published online on DG SANTE website.

3.3. Current work of EFSA regarding animal welfare at slaughter: LAPS opinion and AW Network

EFSA gave an overview of EFSA's work regarding welfare at slaughter. Gabriele Zancanaro presented the on-going work on the Low Atmospheric Pressure System (LAPS) for stunning of poultry. The scientific opinion will respond to the question whether the new proposed method provides a level of animal welfare at least equivalent to the one provided by the methods currently approved. In order to respond the question, EFSA, following its guidance document on the assessment of stunning studies published in 2013 – has assessed eligibility & quality assessment of the submitted dossier proposing the new method, requested for further data & information from the applicant, made additional quantitative analysis, an Extensive Literature Search and finally a hazard ranking based on expert knowledge. The scientific opinion will be proposed to the AHAW Panel for adoption in the end of October and eventually published by the end of November on EFSA's website.

Denise Candiani presented the ongoing work on i) the update of the guidance document on the assessment of stunning studies published in 2013 and on ii) the last meeting of the Animal Welfare Network where an exercise of animal welfare topic prioritisation was held leading to, among the others, several slaughter related topics resulting as high priority topics i.e. with a need to further deepen the knowledge through a risk assessment: 1) welfare and slaughter of fish, 2) spent hen transport, 3) slaughter of wild farm animals, 4) non-food animals killing, 5) on-farm slaughter for direct supply, 6) killing for disease control. The scope of the exercise was to identify a few AW topics where international collaboration amongst risk assessors is desirable. MSs can follow up

by initiating collaborations amongst themselves and by requesting support from EFSA.

3.4. Exchange of information among MSs

The following topics were presented for exchange of information and discussion among MSs. Switzerland queried about the electrical stunning of sows. In particular, the electrical stunning equipment (incl. programmes) seems fine for 100kg pigs but not for sows and other heavy pigs. It was discussed whether for sows 2 A/s is necessary, when it seems that 1.8 can work as well. For pigs and sows, it was also questioned the impact of 50 Hz (head / heart) on meat quality. The problem of scarce manufacturer's instructions was also discussed.

Belgium (Karlien De Paepe) started a discussion on the effectiveness of government inspections and the role of the animal welfare officer. This followed from two recent animal welfare scandals concerning slaughterhouses in March and September 2017 after undercover videos by an animal welfare organisation. It was therefore discussed how the other MS organize slaughterhouse inspections and if any MS have additional rules or guidelines on whether animals shouldn't see other slaughtered animals. Another discussion focused on the use of mobile slaughterhouses and the experiences of other MS.

Denmark introduced a discussion on the availability of instructions for the use of restraining and stunning equipment as follow up from audits on Reg. 1099/2009 art. 8. Most MS experienced challenges in convincing producers of such equipment to make it available via internet as required by Regulation EC 1099/2009.

Slovenia started a discussion on the self-declaration of infringements from the slaughterhouses and how the other MSs manage that.

3.5. Sharing of documents and information among NCP with Microsoft 365

Following the outcomes of last year NCP for EC Reg 1099/2009, EFSA set up a common shared space on the Microsoft 365 platform for sharing information between NCP such as such as guides to good practice, opinions, training material, and other existing resources. Nicola Maj from EFSA DTS Unit presented the platform and its features, e.g. real-time editing of documents and document storage. Microsoft 365 accounts were activated for almost all NCPs. It was requested that only one NCP email address per MS is given – NCPs can activate their individual email address if they are the officially appointed NCP in their MS otherwise it is best to activate a general email account such as *NCP1099/2009_MSname@XXX*. After the account activation, the link to be followed is (please copy and paste into the browser bar):

<https://efsa815.sharepoint.com/sites/TeamNCPNetworkReg1099-2009?e=1:e1d04e829386477fa9da39761feb0394>

The home page presents links to a section on "News" and recent uploaded files. The subpage "documents" includes the folder that have been created and agreed at the meeting, particularly: certificates of competence, general, links to relevant websites, manufacturer's instructions, meeting NCP EFSA, relevant MS

meetings, scientific opinions and guidance, standard operating procedures, training material.

NCPs were invited to start uploading documents into these folders and to consult documents uploaded from others. The future harmonisation of certain documents was also considered of interest and the shared space has the potential to play a key role by providing access to such documents and templates used in the different MS.

A discussion on the relevant information needed in the certificates of competence was welcomed with view to consider future efforts to uniform the information in the certificates issued by different countries.

4. Date for next meeting

It was agreed that the next meeting should take place in autumn 2018.