

Parma, 30 January 2017  
EFSA/CONTAM/2946

**Scientific Panel on Contaminants in the Food Chain**  
**Minutes of the 82<sup>nd</sup> plenary meeting**  
**Held on 24-26 January 2017, Parma (Italy)**  
**(Agreed on 20-02-2017)**

## Participants

- **Panel Members:**

Jan Alexander, Lars Barregard<sup>1</sup>, Margherita Bignami, Beat Brüschweiler, Sandra Ceccatelli<sup>2</sup>, Bruce Cottrill<sup>3</sup>, Mike Dinovi<sup>3</sup>, Lutz Edler, Bettina Grassl-Kraupp, Christer Hogstrand, Ron Hoogenboom<sup>4</sup>, Helle Knutsen, Carlo Nebbia<sup>2</sup>, Isabelle Oswald, Martin Rose, Tanja Schwerdtle, Christiane Vleminckx and Günter Vollmer<sup>5</sup>.

- **Hearing Experts<sup>6</sup>:**

Not applicable

- **European Commission and/or Member States representatives:**

Frans Verstraete (European Commission, DG Health and Food Safety, unit E2)<sup>4</sup>

- **EFSA:**

- **BIOCONTAM Unit:**

Katleen Baert, Marco Binaglia, Paolo Colombo, Mari Eskola, Marta Hugas, Sara Levorato, Karen Mackay, Ruth Roldán Torres, Luisa Ramos Bordajandi and Hans Steinkellner.

- **DATA Unit:**

Zsuzsanna Horvat (for item 7.1) and Andrea Altieri (for item 7.2)

- **Observers:**

Not applicable

- **Others:**

Not Applicable

<sup>1</sup> Attendance by audio-web conference on 26 January only.

<sup>2</sup> Attendance on 25-26 January only.

<sup>3</sup> Attendance by audio-web conference.

<sup>4</sup> Attendance on 24-25 January only.

<sup>5</sup> Attendance by audio-web conference on 25 January only

<sup>6</sup> As defined in Article 11 of the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest:  
<http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>

## 1. Welcome

The Chair of the CONTAM Panel welcomed the participants. P. Colombo, a new Scientific Officer in the CONTAM Team was welcomed by the CONTAM Panel.

## 2. Apologies for absence

Annette Petersen, Alain-Claude Roudot and Heather Wallace (CONTAM Panel), Frank Swartenbroux (European Commission, DG Health and Food Safety, unit E2), Paolo Caricato (European Commission, DG Health and Safety, unit G4) and Marina Marini (European Commission, DG Health and Food Safety, unit D1).

## 3. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

## 4. Declarations of Interest of Scientific Panel members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes<sup>7</sup> and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest<sup>8</sup>, EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest and the Specific Declarations of Interest filled in by the Scientific Panel Members invited for the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

## 5. Agreement of the minutes of the 81<sup>st</sup> Plenary meeting held on 22-24 November 2016, Parma (Italy)

The minutes of the 81<sup>st</sup> Plenary meeting held on 22 – 24 November 2016 were agreed on 15 December 2016.

## 6. Report on the written procedures since 81<sup>st</sup> Plenary meeting

The following requests from the European Commission were discussed by written procedure:

- Request for an assessment of six applications of detoxification processes for compliance with the acceptability criteria provided for in Commission Regulation (EU) 2015/786 of 19 May 2015 (EFSA-Q-2016-00794, EFSA-Q-2016-00795, EFSA-Q-2016-00796, EFSA-Q-2016-00797, EFSA-Q-2016-00798, EFSA-Q-2016-00799)<sup>9</sup>  
The Panel agreed to set up a new standing WG. Following consultation with the CONTAM secretariat, the Panel Chair nominated Christer Hogstrand and Martin Rose as WG Chair and vice Chair, respectively.
- Request for an assessment of the human health risks related to the presence of pyrrolizidine alkaloids in honey, tea, herbal infusions and food supplements (EFSA-Q-2016-00800)<sup>10</sup>.

<sup>7</sup> <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf>

<sup>8</sup> <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>

<sup>9</sup> <http://registerofquestions.efsa.europa.eu/roqFrontend/questionLoader?mandate=M-2016-0235>

<sup>10</sup> <http://registerofquestions.efsa.europa.eu/roqFrontend/questionLoader?question=EFSA-Q-2016-00800>

The Panel agreed that the mandate will be addressed by a scientific statement of the Panel, to be drafted by the CONTAM Team and reviewed by Helle Knutsen and Ron Hoogenboom before the discussion at the CONTAM Panel.

- Request for a scientific opinion on the risks for animal and human health related to the presence of chlorinated paraffins in feed and food (EFSA-Q-2016-00801)<sup>11</sup>.  
The Panel agreed to set up a new *ad hoc* WG. Following consultation with the CONTAM secretariat, the Panel Chair nominated Martin Rose and Beat Brüschiweiler as WG Chair and vice Chair, respectively.
- Request for a scientific opinion on the health risks related to the presence of hydrocyanic acid in foods other than raw apricot kernels (EFSA-Q-2016-00802)<sup>12</sup>.  
The proposal is to set up a new *ad hoc* WG. Following consultation with the CONTAM secretariat, the Panel Chair nominated Tanja Schwerdtle as WG chair.
- Request for a scientific opinion on the risks for animal and human health related to the presence of quinolizidine alkaloids in feed and food, in particular in lupins and lupin-derived products (EFSA-Q-2016-00810)<sup>13</sup>.  
The Panel agreed to set up a new *ad hoc* WG. Following consultation with the CONTAM secretariat, the Panel Chair nominated Margherita Bignami and Annette Petersen as WG Chair and vice Chair, respectively.
- Request for a scientific opinion on the risks for animal and human health related to the presence of glycoalkaloids in feed and food, in particular in potatoes and potato-derived products (EFSA-Q-2016-00811)<sup>14</sup>.  
The Panel agreed to set up a new *ad hoc* WG. Following consultation with the CONTAM secretariat, the Panel Chair nominated Günter Vollmer and Bettina Grassl-Kraupp as WG Chair and vice Chair, respectively.
- Request for an update of the scientific opinion on the risk for public health related to the presence of opium alkaloids in poppy seeds (EFSA-Q-2016-00812)<sup>15</sup>.  
The Panel agreed to set up a new *ad hoc* WG. Following consultation with the CONTAM secretariat, the Panel Chair nominated Christiane Vleminckx as WG Chair.

## 7. Scientific outputs submitted for discussion and/or possible adoption

### 7.1. Draft opinion on the evaluation of the toxicity of Tetrodotoxins (TTX) and TTX-analogues in bivalve molluscs and marine gastropods (EFSA-Q-2016-00399)<sup>16</sup>

In the absence of the Chair of the WG on Tetrodotoxin (TTX) and TTX-analogues, another WG member presented the draft opinion on the evaluation of the toxicity of TTX and TTX-analogues in bivalve molluscs and marine gastropods. Several options have been explored for derivation of an Acute Reference Dose and taking into account the overall evidence, it is most appropriate to use data from a recent acute study with laboratory animals. Overall, the work is progressing very well and therefore the opinion is already in quite an advanced stage. The CONTAM Panel discussed the draft opinion and the following sections were

<sup>11</sup> <http://registerofquestions.efsa.europa.eu/roqFrontend/questionLoader?question=EFSA-Q-2016-00801>

<sup>12</sup> <http://registerofquestions.efsa.europa.eu/roqFrontend/questionLoader?question=EFSA-Q-2016-00802>

<sup>13</sup> <http://registerofquestions.efsa.europa.eu/roqFrontend/questionLoader?question=EFSA-Q-2016-00810>

<sup>14</sup> <http://registerofquestions.efsa.europa.eu/roqFrontend/questionLoader?question=EFSA-Q-2016-00811>

<sup>15</sup> <http://registerofquestions.efsa.europa.eu/roqFrontend/questionLoader?question=EFSA-Q-2016-00812>

<sup>16</sup> <http://registerofquestions.efsa.europa.eu/roqFrontend/questionLoader?question=EFSA-Q-2016-00399>

endorsed: 1.2.1. Sources and origin of TTX; 1.2.2. Previous assessments; 1.2.3. Chemistry; 1.2.4. Methods of detection; 1.2.5. Legislation; 2.1. Occurrence data; 2.1.2. Food consumption data; 2.1.3. Data on toxicokinetics and toxicity; 2.2. Methodologies; 3.1.1. Toxicokinetics; 3.1.2. Toxicity; 3.1.3. Mode of action; 3.2.1. Previously reported occurrence data; 3.3. Impact of food processing.

## **7.2. Draft Scientific Opinion on the risks to human and animal health related to the presence of deoxynivalenol and its acetylated and modified forms in food and feed (EFSA-Q-2013-00721)<sup>17</sup>**

The Chair of the WG on *Fusarium* toxins presented the draft opinion on the risks to human and animal health related to the presence of deoxynivalenol and its acetylated and modified forms in food and feed for possible adoption. The Panel discussed the opinion and, subject to minor revisions, adopted it. The Chair of the CONTAM Panel expressed her appreciation to the members of the WG and the EFSA staff. In this opinion the Panel considered deoxynivalenol (DON), 3-acetyl-DON (3-Ac-DON), 15-acetyl-DON (15-Ac-DON) and DON-3-glucoside as they are currently the most relevant forms of DON in Europe occurring in food and feed, mainly in cereal grains and cereal-based food. For the acute effects (vomiting) in humans, the CONTAM Panel established a group acute reference dose (ARfD) of 8 µg/kg b.w. per eating occasion for the sum of DON, 3-Ac-DON, 15-Ac-DON and DON-3-glucoside and for chronic effects a group tolerable daily intake (TDI) of 1 µg/kg b.w. per day for the sum of DON, 3-Ac-DON, 15-Ac-DON and DON-3-glucoside. It was concluded by the Panel that the current acute exposure to the sum of DON, 3-Ac-DON, 15-Ac-DON and DON-3-glucoside in food raises no health concern. However, there is a health concern associated with chronic dietary exposure to the sum of DON, 3-Ac-DON, 15-Ac-DON and DON-3-glucoside, particularly for infants, toddlers and other children at the high, but at least in some European countries, also at the mean exposure. In adolescents and the adult age groups, the group TDI was exceeded only at the high chronic exposures. The CONTAM Panel conducted risk assessment also for a number of farm and companion animals and concluded that based on estimated mean exposures to the sum of DON, 3-Ac-DON, 15-Ac-DON and DON-3-glucoside in ruminants, poultry, rabbits, dogs and cats, most farmed fish species and horses, adverse effects are not expected. At the high exposures, there is a potential risk for chronic adverse effects in pigs and farmed fish and for acute adverse effects in cats and farmed mink.

## **7.3. Draft Scientific Opinion on the risks for animal health related to the presence of zearalenone and its modified forms in feed (EFSA-Q-2015-00247)<sup>18</sup>**

The Chair of the WG on Zearalenone in feed presented, for discussion, the draft opinion on the risks for animal health related to the presence of zearalenone and its modified forms in feed. The Panel discussed the opinion and, subject to some minor revisions, endorsed the following sections 3.1.1. Toxicokinetics and 3.1.3. Adverse effects in livestock, fish, horses and companion animals.

## **8. JECFA-EFSA divergence on dose response analysis of 3-MCPD and glycidyl esters**

The CONTAM Panel discussed in detail the scientific divergence identified in the assessment of 3-monochloropropane diol and glycidyl fatty acid esters with the Joint

<sup>17</sup> <http://registerofquestions.efsa.europa.eu/roqFrontend/questionLoader?question=EFSA-Q-2013-00721>

<sup>18</sup> <http://registerofquestions.efsa.europa.eu/roqFrontend/questionLoader?question=EFSA-Q-2015-00027>

FAO/WHO Expert Committee on Food Additives and Contaminants (JECFA). The CONTAM Panel agreed that it is appropriate to reopen its Scientific Opinion on the risks for human health related to the presence of 3- and 2-MCPD, and their fatty acid esters, and glycidyl fatty acid esters (EFSA-Q-2014-00535) to address the identified scientific divergence. The Panel agreed to issue a self-task mandate, whose terms of reference will be detailed following the consultation with the EFSA Scientific Committee. Pending the approval of the self-task mandate, the CONTAM Panel agreed to set-up an *ad hoc* Working Group and Christer Hogstrand was nominated WG Chair.

## **9. Update on the EFSA ANS Panel assessments on nitrites and nitrates**

The CONTAM Team Leader informed the Panel on the on-going assessment of the EFSA's Panel on Additives and Nutritional Sources (ANS) on nitrites and nitrates as food additives. In view of the possible impact of the ANS assessment on nitrates as food contaminants, a procedure to review the ANS opinions was presented. Due to the cross-area nature of the two opinions, they will be shared for consultation with the CONTAM Panel and the Scientific Committee. The CONTAM Panel agreed with this approach..

## **10. Feedback from the Scientific Committee/Scientific Panels, EFSA, the European Commission**

### **10.1. European Commission**

The item was deferred to the 83<sup>rd</sup> Plenary meeting of the CONTAM Panel.

### **10.2. CONTAM Panel Working Groups**

#### **10.2.1. Update from WG on Fusarium toxins**

The Chair of the WG informed the members of the CONTAM Panel that the work on the draft opinion on moniliformin (MON) in food and feed (EFSA-Q-2010-01004 has started and that the work on draft opinion on diacetoxyscirpenol (DAS) in food and feed (EFSA-Q-2010-01010) will be kicked-off at the next meeting of the WG held in February 2017. See also item 7.2.

#### **10.2.2. Update from WG on dioxins in food and feed**

EFSA informed the members of the CONTAM Panel that the draft opinion is progressing well.

#### **10.2.3. Update from WG on Group HBGV for mycotoxins**

The chair of the WG reported that the work on the opinion on nivalenol and its modified forms was progressing well and was therefore already in an advanced stage. The approach taken for the assessment will be presented to the Panel at the next Plenary in March. The Chair also noted that the WG has already started to review the literature for the last opinion within the frame of this mandate, namely the one on HGBVs for fumonisins and their modified forms.

#### **11.2.4 Update from WG on Zearalenone in feed**

See item 7.3

#### **10.2.5. Update from WG on Perfluoroalkylated substances (PFASs) in food**

The chair of the WG on PFASs in food informed the members of the CONTAM Panel that the draft opinion is progressing well. The proposed approach for the exposure assessment was presented and agreed by the CONTAM Panel.

### **10.2.6. Update from WG on Furan in food**

EFSA informed the members of the CONTAM Panel that the draft opinion is progressing well. EFSA is organizing an info session with stakeholders. This engagement with stakeholders offers stakeholders to share information with the WG.

### **10.2.7. Update from WG on TTX and TTX-analogues**

See item 7.1.

## **10.3. EFSA**

### **10.3.1. Advisory Forum**

The CONTAM Team Leader informed the CONTAM Panel that the 62<sup>nd</sup> meeting of EFSA's Advisory Forum meeting was held on December 2016. Additional information is available on the EFSA website<sup>19</sup>.

### **10.3.2. Management Board**

The CONTAM Team Leader informed the CONTAM Panel that the 71<sup>st</sup> meeting of the EFSA's Management Board was held on 14 December 2016. Proposals for the renew of the EFSA independence policy and on the Management Board Decision on the establishment and operations of the Scientific Committee, Scientific Panels and their WGs were presented to the Management Board. Additional information is available on the EFSA website<sup>20</sup>

### **10.3.3. Other**

The CONTAM Team Leader informed the Panel that a possible error was identified in the occurrence dataset submitted by a member of the European Edible Oils and Protein meal Industry Federation (FEDIOL) used in the opinion on Erucic acid in food and feed (EFSA-Q-2015-00027), and the DATA Unit is currently checking the possible impact of this error in the exposure and risk assessment conclusions of the opinion.

The CONTAM Team Leader informed the Panel on the new format of the open plenary meetings of the EFSA Scientific Panels and Committee. Several members of the Panel expressed concern for the web-streaming of the meetings, and the Panel Chair agreed to report the concerns at the next meeting of the EFSA's Scientific Committee.

## **10.4 Scientific Committee and its Working Groups of interest to the CONTAM Panel**

No meetings of the Scientific Committee took place from the last meeting of the CONTAM Panel.

The respective CONTAM Panel members who are members of the SC WGs of interest to the CONTAM Panel reported on the current status of these WGs, namely the WG on Weight of evidence, WG on Mixtures, WG on Biological relevance,

<sup>19</sup> <https://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/events/event/160928>

<sup>20</sup> <https://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/events/event/161005>

## 11. Other scientific topics for information and/or discussion

### 11.1. Present status of current outsourcing activities of the CONTAM Team (BIOCONTAM Unit)

For the Article 36 grant on the occurrence of tropane alkaloids in food, the contract was signed with the appointed beneficiaries (Stichting Dienst Landbouwkundig Onderzoek (RIKILT, The Netherlands)), Institut de Recerca i Tecnologia Agroalimentàries (IRTA, Spain), Fera Science Ltd. (UK) and Vysoka Skola Chemicko-Technologicka V Praze (VSCHT, Czech Republic). The final report was approved and published on the EFSA website in December 2016.

For the Article 36 grant on occurrence data on citrinin in food, the contract was signed with the appointed beneficiaries (RIKILT, The Netherlands), Netherlands Food and Consumer Product Safety Authority (NVWA, The Netherlands), Università Cattolica del Sacro Cuore (UCSC, Italy), IRTA (Spain) and National Institute of Public Health – National Institute of Hygiene (NIPH-NIH, Poland) in August 2015. The final report, received on 19 December 2016, is in the final stages of the approval process.

For the Article 36 grant on *in vivo* toxicity and genotoxicity of beauvericin and enniatins, the 2<sup>nd</sup> interim meeting (discussion of the 2<sup>nd</sup> interim report with the appointed beneficiaries (Consortium of Istituto Superiore di Sanità (ISS), Italian National Agency for New Technologies, Energy and Sustainable Economic Development (ENEA) and French Agency for Food, Environmental and Occupational Health and Safety (ANSES) will be held on 7 April 2017. The consortium proposes several deviations from the initial project plan which are currently under review by EFSA.

A negotiated procedure for the implementation and verification of published dioxin PBPK modelling codes into ACSLXtreme software was signed with RIVM (The Netherlands) and the first interim report is expected in April.

## 12. Any other business

Not applicable