

Parma, 24 November 2015
EFSA/CONTAM/2612

Scientific Panel on Contaminants in the Food Chain
Minutes of the 75th plenary meeting
Held on 18-20 November, 2015, Parma (Italy)
(Agreed on 08/01 2016)

Participants

- **Panel Members:**

Margherita Bignami, Sandra Ceccatelli¹, Michael Dinovi², Lutz Edler, Bettina Grassl-Kraupp, Christer Hogstrand, Ron Hoogenboom, Helle Knutsen, Carlo Nebbia, Isabelle Oswald³, Annette Petersen, Martin Rose, Alain-Claude Roudot, Tanja Schwerdtle¹, Christiane Vleminckx, Günter Vollmer and Heather Wallace.

- **Hearing Expert⁴:**

Daniel Doerge (for item 9.1)²

- **European Commission and/or Member States representatives:**

Frans Verstraete, European Commission, DG Health and Food Safety (EC-DG SANTE)

- **EFSA:**

- **BIOCONTAM Unit:**

Katleen Baert, Marco Binaglia, Mari Eskola, Ernesto Liebana Criado, Michaela Hempen, Marta Hugas, Karen Mackay, Luisa Ramos Bordajandi, Ruth Roldán Torres, Hans Steinkellner, Pietro Stella, Natalie Thatcher and Mathijs Van Manen.

- **DATA Unit:**

José Ángel Gómez Ruiz (for item 7) Francesco Vernazza (for item 9.1)

- **AMU Unit:**

Laura Martino (for item 8), Laura Ciccolallo (for item 9.3), and Ana Garcia (for item 10)

- **Observers⁵:**

¹ Present on 18 and 19 November only.

² Attendance by audio-web conference.

³ Present on 19 and 20 November only.

⁴ As defined in Article 11 of the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest:

<http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>

⁵ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/stakeholders/observers.html>

Not Applicable

- **Others:**

Not Applicable

1. Welcome

The CONTAM Panel Chair welcomed the participants. The newly appointed Panel member Martin Rose introduced himself to the Panel.

2. Apologies for absence

Apologies were received from Jan Alexander, Lars Barregard, Bruce Cottrill and Vera Rogiers (CONTAM Panel), Marina Marini (EC-DG SANTE, unit 03), and Frank Swartenbroux (EC-DG SANTE, unit E7).

3. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

4. Declarations of Interest of Scientific Panel members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes⁶ and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest⁷, EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest and the Specific Declarations of Interest filled in by the Scientific Panel Members invited for the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

5. Agreement of the minutes of the 74th Plenary meeting held on 23 - 25 September 2015, Parma (Italy)

The minutes of the 74th Plenary meeting held on 23 - 25 September 2015 were agreed by written procedure on 11 November 2015⁸.

6. Report on the written procedures since 74th Plenary meeting

The CONTAM Team Leader distributed a new request received from EC on the risk assessment related to the presence of perfluoroalkylated substances in food. The decision to set up a new WG for this mandate and the invitation to submit expressions of interest to join the WG were communicated by written procedure. The EC request was further discussed at the 75th CONTAM plenary meeting (item 11.1).

The CONTAM Team Leader reported the outcome of the possible adoption of the draft Scientific Opinion on the risks for human and animal health related to the presence of phorbol esters in Jatropha kernel meal (EFSA-Q-2014-00445) by written procedure. Despite a majority of positive votes for the adoption of the draft opinion were received, major comments were also received indicating the need for additional changes in the opinion. Due

⁶ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf>

⁷ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>

⁸ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/panels/contam>

to the tight timelines, it was not possible to implement these changes in the opinion before the end of the written procedure. As a consequence, the chair of the CONTAM Panel, in consultation with the CONTAM Team Leader decided to withdraw the opinion and to present it for additional discussion and possible adoption at the 75th CONTAM plenary meeting (item 9.2).

7. Dietary exposure assessment: activity of the DATA Unit and its support to the CONTAM Panel

A presentation was given on the DATA Unit activities and responsibilities, and its tasks to support the development of the dietary exposure assessments in the scientific opinions of the CONTAM Panel.

8. Draft Guidance of the Scientific Committee on Uncertainty in Scientific Assessment

A presentation was given on the draft guidance of the EFSA's Scientific Committee on uncertainty in scientific assessment. The CONTAM Team Leader proposed that the draft opinion on Zearalenone in feed could be used as an example to test the draft guidance, as requested by the Scientific Committee. Panel Members were also invited to express their interest to attend the first round of trainings to become ambassadors on the uncertainty guidance.

9. Scientific outputs submitted for discussion and/or possible adoption

9.1. For discussion and possible adoption Draft scientific opinion on the risks for human health related to the presence of 2- and 3-monochloropropanediol (2- and 3-MCPD) fatty acid esters and glycidyl fatty esters in food (EFSA-Q-2014-00535)⁹

The Chair of the CONTAM WG on monochloropropanediol (MCPD) and glycidyl esters presented the draft opinion following a request from the European Commission (EC) (EFSA-Q-2014-00535) in which the EC had asked EFSA to assess the risks to human health related to the presence of 2- and 3-MCPD fatty acid esters and glycidyl fatty esters in food. The CONTAM Panel discussed the draft opinion, and proposed further revisions for some chapters. Therefore the draft opinion was not adopted in the plenary meeting and the CONTAM Panel agreed to have it presented for discussion and possible adoption in March 2016. EC representative informally agreed to extend the deadline of the mandate to allow for adoption within the first half of 2016.

9.2. Draft Scientific Opinion on the risks for human and animal health related to the presence of phorbol esters in Jatropha kernel meal (EFSA-Q-2014-00445)¹⁰

The Scientific Officer in charge of the coordination of the CONTAM WG on the presence of phorbol esters in Jatropha kernel meal (EFSA-Q-2014-00445) presented the changes implemented in the draft opinion following its withdrawal from the adoption by written procedure. The CONTAM Panel adopted the opinion subject to incorporation of minor changes as suggested during the meeting. The chair of the CONTAM Panel expressed her appreciation to the members of the WG and the EFSA staff.

⁹ <http://registerofquestions.efsa.europa.eu/roqFrontend/questionLoader?question=EFSA-Q-2014-00535>

¹⁰ <http://registerofquestions.efsa.europa.eu/roqFrontend/questionLoader?question=EFSA-Q-2014-00445>

9.3. Draft Scientific Opinion on the risks for human and animal health related to the presence of dioxins and dioxin-like PCBs in food and feed (EFSA-Q-2015-00028)¹¹

The Chair of the WG together with the BIOCONTAM scientific officer in charge presented to the Panel members the proposed draft strategy to develop the risk assessment related to the presence of dioxins and dioxin-like polychlorinated biphenyls (PCBs) in food and feed, as well as the progress made up to now and the next steps. The draft strategy will be presented at the next CONTAM Panel meeting for possible agreement. Changes in the WG organisation were communicated to the Panel. Namely, Helle Knutsen and Henk Van Loveren resigned from their roles as WG Chair and Vice-chair and agreed to continue their involvement as WG members. The Panel Chair appointed Ron Hoogenboom as WG Chair and Heather Wallace as WG Vice-chair.

10 Update on Prometheus project

The general background information and the latest development of the project were presented to the Panel.

11. New mandates

11.1 Request for an EFSA opinion on the evaluation of perfluoroalkylated substances in food (EFSA-Q-2015-00526)¹²

The CONTAM Panel discussed the new mandate received and agreed with the approach proposed by the Secretariat to set up a new ad hoc WG and to propose an extended deadline to mid-2017. The Panel Chair appointed Tanja Schwerdtle as WG Chair and Günter Vollmer as WG Vice-chair.

11.2 Request for a scientific opinion on hazard analysis approaches for certain small retail establishments in view of the application of their food safety management system (EFSA-Q-2015-00593)¹³

The CONTAM Panel discussed its possible contribution in the mandate allocated to the Panel on Biological Hazards (BIOHAZ). The Panel agreed with the request to contribute to the development of the Scientific Opinion, since aspects related to chemical hazards need to be taken into account. The proposal of the Secretariat to appoint a Lars Barregard in the BIOHAZ WG and to present the sections relative to chemical hazards for endorsement by the CONTAM Panel was agreed.

11.3 Request for an EFSA scientific opinion on the risk for the development of Antimicrobial Resistance (AMR) due to feeding calves with milk (EFSA-Q-2015-00611)¹⁴

The CONTAM Panel discussed its possible contribution in the mandate allocated to the BIOHAZ Panel. The CONTAM Panel concluded that the specific terms of reference of the mandate do not fall within its remit and therefore a contribution is not warranted.

¹¹ <http://registerofquestions.efsa.europa.eu/roqFrontend/questionLoader?question=EFSA-Q-2015-00028>

¹² <http://registerofquestions.efsa.europa.eu/roqFrontend/questionLoader?question=EFSA-Q-2015-00526>

¹³ <http://registerofquestions.efsa.europa.eu/roqFrontend/questionLoader?question=EFSA-Q-2015-00593>

¹⁴ <http://registerofquestions.efsa.europa.eu/roqFrontend/questionLoader?question=EFSA-Q-2015-00611>

12. Feedback from the Scientific Committee/Scientific Panels, EFSA, the European Commission

12.1. European Commission

The EC representative gave feedback on the activities of the EC in relation to the issued scientific opinions of the CONTAM Panel. Several amendments for current legislation are under discussion with the Member States as an outcome of the CONTAM Panel scientific opinions. Furthermore, several recommendations to the Member States have been made by the European Commission based on CONTAM opinions. In addition, the Panel was informed about new mandates under preparation falling in the remit of the CONTAM Panel.

12.2. CONTAM Panel Working Groups

12.2.1. Working Group on Fusarium toxins

The Chair of the WG on Fusarium toxins presented a summary of the approach to the hazard identification and the hazard characterization of deoxynivalenol and its acetylated and modified forms. The Panel discussed possible options for characterization of the acute risk in response and provided some guidance to the WG.

12.2.2. Standing Working Group on Non-allowed pharmacologically active substances in food and feed and their reference points for action

The Chair of the SWG on non-allowed pharmacologically active substances in food and feed and their reference points for action informed the members of the CONTAM Panel that the Scientific Opinion on the adequacy in view of the protection of human health of the reference point for action for malachite green in food is progressing well.

12.2.3. Working Group on dioxins in food and feed

See item 9.3.

12.2.4. Working Group on MCPD and glycidyl esters

See item 9.1.

12.2.5. Working Group on Phorbol esters in Jatropha kernel meal

See item 9.2.

12.2.6. Working Group on Erucic acid in food and feed

The Chair of the WG on erucic acid in food and feed informed the members of the CONTAM Panel that the Scientific Opinion on the risks for animal and human health related to the presence of erucic acid in feed and food is progressing well.

12.2.7. Update from WG on Hydrocyanic acid in apricot kernels

The Chair of the WG presented the approach to risk assessment developed by the WG. The proposed approach was agreed by the CONTAM Panel.

12.2.8. Update from WG on Group Health-Based Guidance Values (HBGV) for mycotoxins

The Vice-chair of the WG presented the approach to risk assessment developed by the WG. The proposed approach was agreed by the CONTAM Panel.

12.2.9. Update from WG on Plastic microparticles

The Chair of the WG on plastic microparticles and nanoparticles in food informed the members of the CONTAM Panel that the Statement is progressing well and that the mandate deadline has been extended to May 2016.

12.3. EFSA

12.3.1 Scientific Committee and Scientific Panel(s) including their Working Groups

The Chair of the CONTAM Panel highlighted the main items discussed in the 76th plenary meetings of the Scientific Committee (SC) held on 11-12 November 2015. In particular, the adoption of two opinions on environmental risk assessment, and the discussion on the draft guidance on the use of benchmark dose in risk assessment were reported. More information is available on the EFSA website¹⁵.

The respective CONTAM Panel members who are members of the SC WGs of interest to the CONTAM Panel informed about current status of these WGs, namely the standing WG on Genotoxicity, WG on Weight of evidence, WG on Biological relevance, WG on BMD approach, and WG on uncertainty in risk assessment.

12.3.2. Advisory Forum

The 57th meeting of the Advisory Forum (AF) was held on 13 October in Milan. Amongst the items for discussion in the agenda, there was a presentation on the scientific cooperation roadmap including the proposal for a common risk assessment agenda shared amongst EFSA and the EU Member States. More information on the AF and its meeting is available on the EFSA website¹⁶.

12.3.3. Management Board

The 66th Management Board (MB) meeting was held on 1 October 2015 in Parma. Amongst the discussed items, the MB endorsed the draft EFSA 2020 strategy document for public consultation. More information on the MB and its meeting is available on the EFSA website¹⁷.

12.3.4. Other

The CONTAM Panel Chair appointed Isabelle Oswald as Chair and Carlo Nebbia as Vice-chair of the WGs on Zearalenone in feed and Fumonisins in feed.

The Team Leader of the CONTAM Team informed the Panel that the recent comments from the Nickel Producers Environmental Research Association (NiPERA) and the Nickel Institute on the EFSA Scientific opinions on nickel in food and drinking water, and nickel in feed have been addressed by the appointed experts and that the response will be sent to the Panel for endorsement. The agreed response will be communicated to NiPERA and the Nickel Institute by EFSA on behalf of the CONTAM Panel.

13. Other scientific topics for information and/or discussion

13.1. Present status of current outsourcing activities of the CONTAM Team (BIOCONTAM Unit)

For the Article 36 grant on the combined bioaccumulation/toxicity study on a broad mixture of mineral oil saturated hydrocarbons relevant to the human dietary exposure (signed with Institut national de la recherche agronomique (INRA, France) and Norwegian Institute of Public Health (NIPH, Norway) in September 2013). The project

¹⁵ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/it/panels/scientific-committee>

¹⁶ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/events/event/151013a>

¹⁷ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/events/event/151001>

deadline has been extended to end of January 2016. The final meeting has been postponed to early 2016.

For the Article 36 grant on occurrence of tropane alkaloids in food, the contract was signed with the appointed beneficiary (Stichting Dienst Landbouwkundig Onderzoek (RIKILT, The Netherlands)), Institut de Recerca i Tecnologia Agroalimentàries (IRTA, Spain), Food and Environment Research Agency (FERA, UK) and Vysoka Skola Chemicko-Technologicka V Praze (VSCHT, Czech Republic). The first interim meeting took place in May 2015 (4 months from the start of the project), where the first interim report was discussed. The second interim report will be submitted and discussed at the second interim meeting in January 2016.

For the Article 36 grant on occurrence data on citrinin in food, the contract was signed with the appointed beneficiary (RIKILT, The Netherlands), Netherlands Food and Consumer Product Safety Authority (NVWA, The Netherlands), Università Cattolica del Sacro Cuore (UCSC, Italy), IRTA (Spain) and National Institute of Public Health – National Institute of Hygiene (NIPH-NIH, Poland) in August 2015. The project kick-off meeting was held on 22 September 2015. The interim report will be submitted in April 2016.

14. Any other business

Not Applicable.