
Biological Hazards and Contaminants Unit (BIOCONTAM UNIT)

Scientific Panel on Biological Hazards
Minutes of the 99th Plenary meeting
Held on 9-10 September 2015, Parma (Italy)
(Agreed on 12 October 2015)

Participants

- **Panel Members:**

Ana Allende, Declan Bolton, Marianne Chemaly, Robert Davies, Pablo S. Fernandez-Escamez, Rosina Girones, Lieve Herman, Konstantinos Koutsoumanis (apologies), Roland Lindqvist, Birgit Nørrung¹, Antonia Ricci, Lucy Robertson, Giuseppe Ru², Moez Sanaa, Marion Simmons¹, Panagiotis Skandamis (apologies), Emma Snary, Niko Speybroeck, Benno Ter Kuile, John Threlfall (apologies), and Helene Wahlström.

- **European Commission and/or Member States representatives:**

- Aidan Cahill (for the items 5.6 and 7.2.1) Lucie Carrouée-Pook (for items 7.2.2, 7.2.3 and 7.2.4) (DG-SANTE)³

- **EFSA:**

- BIOCONTAM Unit: Ernesto Liebana, Winy Messens, Valentina Rizzi, Sandra Correia, Maria Teresa da Silva Felício, Beatriz Guerra, Michaela Hempen, Angel Ortiz Pelaez, Pietro Stella (Scientific staff), Emmanouil Chantzis (trainee)
- PRAS Unit: Frederique Istace (for item 5.9)

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

Apologies were received from K. Koutsoumanis, P. Skandamis and J. Threlfall.

2. Adoption of the agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

¹ Attended on 10 September only.

² Attended on 9 September only.

³ Attended by web-meeting.

3. Declarations of Interest of Panel Members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes⁴ and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest⁵, EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest and the Specific Declarations of Interest filled in by the Panel Members invited for the present meeting. For further details on the outcome of the screening of the ADol or the SDol, please refer to Annex. Oral Declaration of Interest was asked at the beginning of the meeting and no additional interest was declared.

4. Agreement of the minutes of the 98th Plenary meeting held on 7- 9 July 2015, Parma (Italy)

The minutes of the 98th Plenary meeting held on 7-9 July 2015 were agreed by written procedure on 31 August 2015⁶.

5. Scientific outputs submitted for discussion

5.1 Scientific Opinion on the update of the list of QPS recommended biological agents intentionally added to food or feed as notified to EFSA⁷

The last WG meeting took place on 2 July 2015 in Parma. Next WG meeting is on 25 September via web-conference. The WG Chair updated the Panel on the refinement of the extensive literature search coordinated by the Assessment and Methodological Support (AMU) Unit and the future activities. The Scientific Opinion is to be finalised by December 2016.

5.2 Panel Statement on the update of the list of QPS recommended biological agents intentionally added to food or feed as notified to EFSA 3: Suitability of taxonomic units notified to EFSA until September 2015⁸

The last WG meeting took place on 2 July 2015 in Parma. Next WG meeting is on 25 September via web-conference. The current document was thoroughly revised by the Panel. Further to taxonomic unit being evaluated, 3 new taxonomic units, recently notified to the EFSA units, have been included in the Statement for evaluation. The Panel Statement is to be finalised by December 2015.

5.3 Scientific Opinion on the public health risks associated with Enteraggregative *Escherichia coli*⁹

The fifth WG meeting took place on 14 July in Rome. R. Davies updated, on behalf of the WG Chair, the Panel on the progress of the draft Scientific Opinion. The next WG meeting is on 25 September 2015 via web-conference and the deadline to deliver the Scientific Opinion is end of December 2015.

5.4 Scientific Opinion on an update of the 2011 Scientific Opinion on hatchery waste as animal by-products¹⁰

The fourth meeting of the WG was held on 8 September 2015 in Parma. The opinion was presented for thorough reading to the BIOHAZ Panel. Suggestions from the BIOHAZ Panel will be shared with the WG experts. The Animal Health and Animal Welfare Panel (AHAW) will

⁴ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf>

⁵ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>

⁶ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/150708a-m.pdf>

⁷ <http://registerofquestions.efsa.europa.eu/roqFrontend/questionLoader?question=EFSA-Q-2014-00189>

⁸ <http://registerofquestions.efsa.europa.eu/roqFrontend/questionLoader?question=EFSA-Q-2014-00696>

⁹ <http://registerofquestions.efsa.europa.eu/roqFrontend/questionLoader?question=EFSA-Q-2014-00536>

¹⁰ <http://registerofquestions.efsa.europa.eu/roqFrontend/questionLoader?question=EFSA-Q-2014-00902>

discuss the parts of the draft opinion dealing with animal health aspects (mainly on the identification of the hazards) during their next plenary (22-23 September) for possible endorsement. The next meeting is on the 9 October via web-conference. The deadline for this Scientific Opinion is 31 October 2015.

5.5 Scientific Opinion on the evaluation of an alternative method, continuous multi-step catalytic hydro treatment to be applied to rendered fat for the production of renewable fuels (NExBTL)¹¹

The second WG meeting took place on 3 September 2015 in Parma. The WG reviewed additional data provided by the applicant upon request and discussed with a hearing expert the experimental data presented as validated measurement of the efficacy of the alternative method. The WG Chair led the thorough reading of the Scientific Opinion. The new deadline to deliver the Scientific Opinion is 24 November 2015. The next meeting will take place on 5 October 2015.

5.6 Scientific Opinion on the growth of spoilage bacteria during storage and transport of meat¹²

The third WG meeting was held on 27 August 2015 via web-conference. The draft opinion was presented for thorough reading to the BIOHAZ Panel. The deadline to deliver the Scientific Opinion is end of October 2015.

5.7 Scientific Opinion on the evaluation of heat treatments, that could be applied to live bivalve molluscs in order to eliminate pathogenic micro-organisms¹³

The third WG meeting was held on 28 August 2015 via web-conference. The draft Opinion was for the first time presented to the BIOHAZ Panel focussing on the approach taken and the preliminary results obtained. The next WG meeting will take place on 25 September in Parma. The deadline to deliver the Scientific Opinion is end of December 2015.

5.8 Joint EFSA and EMA Scientific Opinion on measures to reduce the need to use antimicrobial agents in animal husbandry in the European Union and the resulting impacts on food safety¹⁴

The *ad hoc* WG helping with the preparatory work in the development of the Scientific Opinion has been established. The first WG meeting was held on 16 July 2015 via web-conference, jointly with the corresponding EMA WG. The next meeting will take place on 15 September 2015 in Parma. The deadline to deliver the EFSA-EMA Joint Scientific Opinion is 20 December 2016.

5.9 Request for a Scientific Opinion concerning the risks for public health related to the presence of *Bacillus cereus* and other *Bacillus* spp., including *Bacillus thuringiensis* in foodstuffs¹⁵

An *ad hoc* WG has been established to help with the preparatory work in the development of the Scientific Opinion. The first WG meeting took place on 23 July 2015 in Parma. The WG Chair updated the Panel on the approach proposed by the WG to address the ToRs and presented the preliminary Table of Contents. The next meeting will take place on 29-30 September 2015 in Brussels.

¹¹ <http://registerofquestions.efsa.europa.eu/roqFrontend/questionLoader?question=EFSA-Q-2015-00118>

¹² <http://registerofquestions.efsa.europa.eu/roqFrontend/questionLoader?question=EFSA-Q-2015-00163>

¹³ <http://registerofquestions.efsa.europa.eu/roqFrontend/questionLoader?question=EFSA-Q-2015-00161>

¹⁴ <http://registerofquestions.efsa.europa.eu/roqFrontend/questionLoader?question=EFSA-Q-2015-00216>

¹⁵ <http://registerofquestions.efsa.europa.eu/roqFrontend/questionLoader?question=EFSA-Q-2015-00254>

5.10 Scientific Opinion on the safety of a method for processing animal fats intended for technical purposes with the aim to establish the end point in the manufacturing chain^{16,17}

After receiving a mandate last May from the European Commission for the evaluation of an animal-by products (ABP) application and the evaluation of the establishment of an 'end point' in the respective manufacturing process, EFSA Apdesk contacted the Polish competent authority (CA) for providing the complete application. In July 17, EFSA received an application from the CA which raised the need of further clarifications as its purpose was different from the one foreseen. The follow up will be decided together with the European Commission after further clarifications with the CA.

6. New Mandates

6.1 Request for a scientific opinion on the evaluation of the safety and efficacy of Listex P 100 for reduction of pathogens on different ready to eat (RTE) food¹⁸

A new request for a Scientific Opinion on the evaluation of the safety and efficacy of Listex P 100 for reduction of pathogens on different ready to eat (RTE) food was received in EFSA from the European Commission and it was allocated to the BIOCONTAM Unit. An *ad hoc* WG will be established to help with the preparatory work in the development of the Scientific Opinion. B. Nørrung was appointed as Chair for this WG. The terms of reference were presented and the missing information required was summarized. The deadline to deliver the Scientific Opinion is 6 months following the receipt of a valid application.

7. Feedback from the Scientific Committee/the Scientific Panel, EFSA, the European Commission

7.1 Scientific Committee and/or Scientific Panel(s) including their Working Groups

7.1.1 Scientific Committee Working Group on Uncertainty in Risk Assessment¹⁹

EFSA launched a public consultation for feedback on the guidance document on Uncertainty in Risk Assessment²⁰. The BIOHAZ Panel has to identify two opinions to be tested in the trial phase. Training on uncertainty and variability is available for the Panel members.

7.1.2 Scientific Committee Working Group on production and consumption of insects as food and feed²¹

The WG Chair updated the Panel on the progress of the draft Scientific Opinion. The last WG meeting was held on 31 August 2015 in Parma. The draft opinion will be tabled for possible adoption at the Scientific Committee plenary meeting on 15-16 September 2015. The deadline to deliver the Scientific Opinion is 30 September 2015.

¹⁶<http://registerofquestions.efsa.europa.eu/roqFrontend/questionLoader?question=EFSA-Q-2015-00351>

¹⁷<http://registerofquestions.efsa.europa.eu/roqFrontend/questionLoader?question=EFSA-Q-2015-00352>

¹⁸<http://registerofquestions.efsa.europa.eu/roqFrontend/questionLoader?question=EFSA-Q-2015-00428>

¹⁹<http://registerofquestions.efsa.europa.eu/roqFrontend/questionLoader?question=EFSA-Q-2013-00738>

²⁰<http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/consultations/call/150618.htm>

²¹<http://registerofquestions.efsa.europa.eu/roqFrontend/questionLoader?question=EFSA-Q-2014-00578>

7.2 EFSA including its Working Groups / Task Forces

7.2.1 Scientific Report on a clarification on the Scientific Opinion on the public health risks related to the maintenance of the cold chain during storage and transport of meat (Part I and II)²²

The first WG meeting was held on 29 April 2015. The draft scientific report was presented for thorough reading to the BIOHAZ Panel. The deadline to deliver the Scientific Report is end of October 2015.

7.2.2 Scientific Report to evaluate the application of Denmark to be recognised as having a negligible risk of classical scrapie²³

The second WG meeting was held on 13 July 2015 via web-conference. Some clarifications were requested to the European Commission by the WG before the meeting and were discussed during the meeting with panel members. The draft scientific report was presented to the BIOHAZ Panel including the methodological approach and preliminary results. The next WG meeting will take place on 10 September 2015 in Parma. The report will be presented for endorsement to the Panel on the 21-22 October meeting. The deadline to deliver the Scientific Reports is 31 October 2015.

7.2.3 Scientific Report to evaluate the application of Finland to be recognised as having a negligible risk of classical scrapie²⁴

See agenda item 7.2.2.

7.2.4 Scientific Report to evaluate the application of Sweden to be recognised as having a negligible risk of classical scrapie²⁵

See agenda item 7.2.2.

7.2.5. Request for scientific and technical assistance concerning the revision of the BSE monitoring regime in Croatia²⁶

The term of reference, namely the revision of the BSE monitoring programme in Croatia, was discussed in detail. An *ad hoc* WG chaired by EFSA staff has been established. G. Ru and M. Simmons are members of this WG. Due to a conflict of interest, E. Snary could not join the WG. The Panel was informed of the procurement contract with the developers of the C-TSEMM model, an in-house tool fit for purpose. The first meeting of the WG will take place on 16 September. The deadline for endorsement is 31 January 2016.

7.2.6. Scientific Network on BSE-TSE and MRA

The remit and objectives of the Scientific Networks on BSE-TSE and MRA were introduced to the Panel.

The next BSE-TSE Network meeting will take place on 7-8 October 2015 in Parma. A preliminary agenda of the meeting was presented.

The next meeting of the MRA Network will take place on 27-28 October 2015 in Parma.

7.3. European Commission

None.

²²<http://registerofquestions.efsa.europa.eu/roqFrontend/questionLoader?question=EFSA-Q-2015-00162>

²³<http://registerofquestions.efsa.europa.eu/roqFrontend/questionLoader?question=EFSA-Q-2015-00240>

²⁴<http://registerofquestions.efsa.europa.eu/roqFrontend/questionLoader?question=EFSA-Q-2015-00261>

²⁵<http://registerofquestions.efsa.europa.eu/roqFrontend/questionLoader?question=EFSA-Q-2015-00262>

²⁶<http://registerofquestions.efsa.europa.eu/roqFrontend/questionLoader?question=EFSA-Q-2015-00350>

8. Other scientific topics for information and/or discussion

8.1 Self-task mandates of the BIOHAZ Panel

A discussion took place for each of the five proposals for self-task mandates (a. Whole genome sequencing b. Microbiological Criteria c. *Campylobacter*; d. TSE infectivity e. *Listeria*). Panel members were asked to express interest in contributing to the drafting of the presented proposals. Another proposal (hepatitis E) was made and will be discussed further at the next BIOHAZ plenary meeting.

It was decided to proceed with the self-task mandate on *Listeria*. Interested panel members to be involved in this activity can express their interest.

8.2 EFSA's 2nd Scientific Conference in the context of EXPO 2015

Experts were informed that it's only four weeks to go to EFSA's second Scientific Conference "Shaping the Future of Food Safety, Together"²⁷ to be held in Milan, Italy, on the occasion of EXPO 2015. Shortly after the plenary meeting, it has been communicated that the entire conference will be webcast, with the possibility to send in questions. Briefing notes²⁸ have been shared on the conference website.

9. Any other business

9.1. Meeting dates 2015/2016

The proposed meeting dates 2015/2016 were presented and agreed upon.

9.2. Upcoming mandates

A new mandate on Hazard Analysis and Critical Control Points (HACCP) will be received from the European Commission.

²⁷ <http://www.efsaexpo2015.eu/>

²⁸ http://www.efsaexpo2015.eu/wp-content/uploads/2015/01/Briefing_notes_combined_final.pdf

Annex I

Interests and actions resulting from the screening of Annual Declarations of Interest (ADoI) or Specific Declarations of Interest (SDoI)

CONFLICT OF INTEREST: In her SDoI filled for the present meeting **Ms. EMMA SNARY** declared the following interest: *The C-TSEMM model was developed within the APHA Biomathematics & Risk Research workgroup (ES is the workgroup leader) within the Department of Epidemiological Sciences. EFSA have recently requested that the APHA provide expert assistance in updating the CTSEMM model for the scientific and technical assistance concerning the revision of the BSE monitoring regime in Croatia (Negotiated procedure reference: NP/EFSA/BIOCONTAM/2015/04). A proposal is currently being prepared. ES will not be part of this project team, but would like the panel to be aware of this potential conflict of interest.*

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes²⁹ and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest³⁰, and taking into account the specific matters discussed at the meeting in question, the interest above was deemed to represent a Conflict of Interest.

This results in exclusion of the expert from any discussion, voting or other processing of item 7.2.5 by the concerned scientific group.

²⁹<http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf>

³⁰<http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>