

Scientific Panel on Food Contact Materials, Enzymes, Flavourings and Processing Aids (CEF)

Minutes of the 56th Plenary meeting

Held on 23-25 June 2015, Parma (Italy)

(Agreed on 08 09 2015)

Participants

a) Panel Members

Claudia Bolognesi, Laurence Castle, Jean-Pierre Cravedi,¹ Karl-Heinz Engel, Paul Fowler, Konrad Grob, Rainer Gürtler, Trine Husøy,² Wim Mennes, Maria Rosaria Milana,³ André Penninks, Fátima Poças,² Vittorio Silano, Andrew Smith, Christina Tlustos,⁴ Fidel Toldrá,⁵ Detlef Wölflé, Holger Zorn

b) Hearing Experts:⁶

-

c) European Commission and/or Member States representatives:

- Miguel-Angel Granero Rosell, Rafael Perez Berbejal, Bastiaan Schupp (DG SANTE)

d) EFSA:

- Food Ingredients and Packaging (FIP) Unit: Margarita Aguilera-Gomez, Maria Anastassiadou, Magdalena Andryszkiewicz, Eric Barthélémy, Mary Carfi, Maria Correia, Cristina Croera, Marina Goumenou, Georges Kass, Joaquim Manuel Maia, Claudia Roncancio Peña, Annamaria Rossi, Kim Rygaard Nielsen, Rositsa Serafimova, Anne Theobald

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

No apologies were received.

¹ Participated on 24-25 June 2015

² Participated on 23 - 24 June 2015

³ Participated on 23 June 2015

⁴ Participated on 23 and 24 AM June 2015

⁵ Participated on 23 and 24 and 25 AM June 2015

⁶ As defined in Article 11 of the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest:
<http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without any changes.

3. Declarations of Interest of Scientific Committee/Scientific Panel/ Members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes⁷ and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest,⁸ EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest and the Specific Declarations of Interest filled in by the Scientific Panel Members invited for the present meeting. For further details on the outcome of the screening of the ADoI or the SDoI, please refer to Annex. Oral Declaration of Interest was asked at the beginning of the meeting and no additional interest was declared.

4. Agreement of the minutes of the 55th Plenary meeting held on 5-7 May 2015, Parma (Italy)

The minutes of the 55th Plenary meeting held on 5-7 May were agreed.⁹

5. Report on the written procedures since 55th Plenary meeting

No scientific outputs were adopted by written procedure since the last plenary meeting.

6. Scientific outputs submitted for discussion and possible adoption

6.1 Risk assessment of glass fibre sizing agents used in glass-fibre reinforced plastics for food contact ([EFSA-Q-2013-00838](#))

The Chair of the standing Working Group (SWG) on food contact materials introduced the draft opinion on the safety assessment of glass fibre sizing agents used in glass-fibre reinforced plastics for food contact to the members of the CEF Panel and presented the main points for discussion. The CEF Panel discussed the different parts of the risk assessment and adopted the opinion, subject to incorporation of changes as suggested during the meeting.

The [opinion](#) is available on the Authority's webpage.

6.2 Request for the assessment of the safety of the use of dimethyl ether as an extraction solvent under the intended conditions of use and the proposed maximum residual limits ([EFSA-Q-2014-00860](#))

The Chair of the SWG on food contact materials introduced the draft opinion on the assessment of the safety of the use of dimethyl ether as an extraction solvent under the intended conditions of use and the proposed maximum residual limits to the members of the CEF Panel and presented the main points for discussion. The CEF Panel discussed the different parts of the risk assessment and adopted the opinion, subject to incorporation of changes as suggested during the meeting.

The [opinion](#) is available on the Authority's webpage.

⁷ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf>

⁸ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>

⁹ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/de/events/event/150505b.htm>

6.3 Request for the re-evaluation of perfluoromethyl perfluorvinylether for use as monomer in plastics ([EFSA-Q-2014-00314](#))

The draft opinion on the re-evaluation of the safety of perfluoromethyl perfluorvinylether for use as monomer in plastics was presented to the members of the CEF Panel together with the main points for discussion. The CEF Panel discussed the different parts of the risk assessment and adopted the opinion, subject to incorporation of changes as suggested during the meeting.

The [opinion](#) is available on the Authority's webpage.

6.4 FGE.210 Rev2: [FL-no: 07.061] allyl alpha-ionone ([EFSA-Q-2015-00060](#))

The draft opinion on the safety assessment of the Flavouring Group Evaluation 210, Revision 2, was presented to the members of the CEF Panel together with the main points for discussion. The CEF Panel discussed the different parts of the risk assessment and adopted the opinion, subject to incorporation of changes as suggested during the meeting.

The [opinion](#) is available on the Authority's webpage.

6.5 FGE.208 Rev1: [FL-no: 05.117] p-Mentha-1,8-dien-7-al ([EFSA-Q-2014-00378](#)), [FL-no: 02.060] p-Mentha-1,8-dien-7-ol ([EFSA-Q-2014-00379](#)), [FL-no: 02.091] Myrtenol ([EFSA-Q-2014-00380](#)), [FL-no: 05.106] Myrtenal ([EFSA-Q-2014-00381](#)), [FL-no: 05.121] 2,6,6-Trimethyl-1-cyclohexen-1-carboxaldehyde ([EFSA-Q-2014-00382](#)), [FL-no: 09.272] Myrtenyl formate ([EFSA-Q-2014-00383](#)), [FL-no: 09.278] p-Mentha-1,8-dien-7-yl acetate ([EFSA-Q-2014-00384](#)), [FL-no: 09.302] Myrtenyl acetate ([EFSA-Q-2014-00385](#)), [FL-no: 09.899] Myrtenyl-2-methylbutyrate ([EFSA-Q-2014-00386](#)), [FL-no: 09.900] Myrtenyl-3-methylbutyrate ([EFSA-Q-2014-00387](#))

The draft opinion on the safety assessment of the Flavouring Group Evaluation 208, Revision 1, was presented to the members of the CEF Panel together with the main points for discussion. The CEF Panel discussed the different parts of the risk assessment and adopted the opinion, subject to incorporation of changes as suggested during the meeting.

The [opinion](#) is available on the Authority's webpage.

6.6 FGE.302: [FL-no: 16.119] N-(2-methylcyclohexyl)-2, 3, 4, 5, 6-pentafluorobenzamide ([EFSA-Q-2014-00060](#))

The Chair of the SWG on flavourings introduced the draft opinion on the safety assessment of the Flavouring Group Evaluation 302 to the members of the CEF Panel and presented the main points for discussion. The CEF Panel discussed the different parts of the risk assessment and asked the Flavouring WG some additional clarification. A revised draft opinion will be presented at a future plenary for discussion and possible adoption.

6.7 Request for the evaluation of Extrupet (Pty) recycling process for poly(ethylene terephthalate) for direct food application (Starlinger iV+) ([EFSA-Q-2015-00003](#))

The draft opinion on the safety assessment of the recycling process Extrupet (Pty) was presented to the members of the CEF Panel together with the main points for discussion. The CEF Panel discussed the different parts of the risk assessment and adopted the opinion, subject to incorporation of changes as suggested during the meeting.

The [opinion](#) is available on the Authority's webpage.

6.8 Request for the evaluation of Coveris recycling process to produce recycled plastic for food contact uses (Starlinger viscotec deCON) ([EFSA-Q-2015-00190](#))

The draft opinion on the safety assessment of the recycling process Coveris was presented to the members of the CEF Panel together with the main points for discussion. The CEF Panel discussed the different parts of the risk assessment and adopted the opinion, subject to incorporation of changes as suggested during the meeting.

The [opinion](#) is available on the Authority's webpage.

6.9 Request for the evaluation of montmorillonite clay modified by dimethyldialkyl(C14-C18)ammonium chloride ([EFSA-Q-2013-00437](#))

The draft opinion on the assessment of the safety of montmorillonite clay modified by dimethyldialkyl(C14-C18)ammonium chloride was presented to the members of the CEF Panel with the main points for discussion and possible adoption. The CEF Panel discussed the different parts of the risk assessment and suggested to request clarifications from the applicant.

A revised draft opinion will be presented at a future plenary for discussion and possible adoption.

6.10 Request for the evaluation of isoctadecanamide ([EFSA-Q-2014-00651](#))

The draft opinion on the assessment of the safety of isoctadecanamide was presented to the members of the CEF Panel with points on which the SWG sought advice from the CEF Panel for continuing with the safety assessment. The CEF Panel mostly discussed the parts of the risk assessment he was consulted on, advised the SWG and suggested to request clarifications from the applicant.

A revised draft opinion will be presented at a future plenary for discussion and possible adoption.

7. New Mandates

The Head of the FIP unit informed the members of the CEF Panel that twenty new mandates for the safety assessment of enzymes, two new mandates for the safety assessment of flavourings and one new mandate for the safety assessment of a smoke flavouring had been received since the last Plenary meeting.

7.1 New applications since the previous meeting

Food Sector	EFSA-Q-Number	Subject
ENZ	2015-00272 until 276	<p>Request for EFSA to perform a scientific risk assessment on the food enzyme: Glucoamylase from <i>Rhizopus oryzae</i> (strain AE-G)</p> <p>Request for EFSA to perform a scientific risk assessment on the food enzyme: Beta-glucosidase from <i>Penicillium multicolour</i> (strain AE-GLY)</p> <p>Request for EFSA to perform a scientific risk assessment on the food enzyme: Peroxidase from a genetically modified strain of <i>Aspergillus niger</i> (strain MOX)</p> <p>Request for EFSA to perform a scientific risk assessment on the food enzyme: Beta-amylase from a genetically modified strain of <i>Bacillus licheniformis</i> (strain NZYM-JA)</p> <p>Request for EFSA to perform a scientific risk assessment on the food enzyme: Triacylglycerol lipase from <i>Aspergillus niger</i> (strain AE-L)</p>
ENZ	2015-00288 until 292	<p>Request for EFSA to perform a scientific risk assessment on the food enzyme: Ribonuclease P from <i>Penicillium citrinum</i> (strain AE-RP)</p> <p>Request for EFSA to perform a scientific risk assessment on the food enzyme: Glutaminase from <i>Bacillus amyloliquefaciens</i> (strain AE-GT)</p> <p>Request for EFSA to perform a scientific risk assessment on the food enzyme: Oryzin from <i>Aspergillus melleus</i> (strain AE-P)</p> <p>Request for EFSA to perform a scientific risk assessment on the food enzyme: Triacylglycerol lipase from <i>Candida rugosa</i> (strain AE-LAY)</p> <p>Request for EFSA to perform a scientific risk assessment on the food enzyme: Glucoamylase from <i>Aspergillus niger</i></p>
ENZ	2015-00323	Request for EFSA to perform a scientific risk assessment on the food enzyme: Beta-fructofuranosidase from <i>Saccharomyces cerevisiae</i>

ENZ	2015-00337 until 340	<p>Request for EFSA to perform a scientific risk assessment on the food enzymes Inulinase from a genetically modified strain of <i>Aspergillus Oryzae</i> (strain MUCL 44346)</p> <p>Request for EFSA to perform a scientific risk assessment on the food enzyme Trypsin from porcine pancreatic glands</p> <p>Request for EFSA to perform a scientific risk assessment on the food enzyme Triacylglycerol lipase from <i>Candida cylindracea</i></p> <p>Request for EFSA to perform a scientific risk assessment on the food enzyme Cellulase, Glucanase and Hemicellulase covering Xylanase and Mannanase from <i>Aspergillus niger</i></p>
ENZ	2015-00370 until 374	<p>Request for EFSA to perform a scientific risk assessment on the food enzyme: Cellulase from <i>Talaromyces cellulolyticus/Talaromyces pinophilus</i> (strain Acremonium cellulolyticus)</p> <p>Request for EFSA to perform a scientific risk assessment on the food enzyme: Aspergillopepsin I from a GM strain of <i>Trichoderma reesei</i> (strain DP-Nzq40)</p> <p>Request for EFSA to perform a scientific risk assessment on the food enzyme: Trypsin and Chymotrypsin from porcine pancreatic glands</p> <p>Request for EFSA to perform a scientific risk assessment on the food enzyme: Peptidase from a strain of <i>Aspergillus oryzae</i> (strain NZYM-EX)</p> <p>Request for EFSA to perform a scientific risk assessment on the food enzyme: Triacylglycerol lipase from a GM strain of <i>Hansenula polymorpha</i> (strain DP-Jzk33)</p>
FLAV	2015-00297 until 312	Request for re-evaluation of flavouring substances from FGE.204 (FGE.19 subgroup 1.2.1)
FLAV	2015-00324 until 336	Request for re-evaluation of flavouring substances from FGE.205 (FGE.19 subgroup 1.2.2)
SMK	2015-00313	Smoke Flavouring Primary Product RS1003

7.2 Valid applications since the previous meeting

Applications considered valid for the start of the assessment:

Food Sector	EFSA-Q-Number	Subject	Valid on
ENZ	2014-00668	Request for EFSA to perform a scientific risk assessment on a food enzyme: Acylglycerol Lipase from <i>Penicillium camemberti</i> (AE-LG)	8/05/2015
ENZ	2014-00920	Request for EFSA to perform a scientific risk assessment on the food enzyme: Aqualysin 1 from a genetically modified strain of <i>Bacillus subtilis</i> (LMGS 25520)	8/05/2015

ENZ	2015-00178	Request to perform a scientific risk assessment on the extension of use for the food enzyme Polygalacturonase from a genetically modified strain of <i>Aspergillus niger</i> (strain EPG)	08/05/2015
ENZ	2014-00852	Request for EFSA to perform a scientific risk assessment on the food enzyme: Acid prolyl endopeptidase from a genetically modified strain of <i>Aspergillus niger</i> (GEP)	27/05/2015
ENZ	2014-00853	Request for EFSA to perform a scientific risk assessment on the food enzyme: Beta-galactosidase from a genetically modified strain of <i>Aspergillus niger</i> (TOL)	27/05/2015
ENZ	2015-00234	Request for EFSA to perform a scientific risk assessment on the food enzyme: Lipase from a genetically modified strain of <i>Aspergillus niger</i> (NZYM-DB)	01/06/2015
ENZ	2014-0919	Request for EFSA to perform a scientific risk assessment on the food enzyme: Lysophospholipase produced by a genetically modified strain of <i>Aspergillus niger</i> (NZYM-LP)	11/06/2015
ENZ	2014-00912	Request for EFSA to perform a scientific risk assessment on the food enzyme: Alpha-amylase from a genetically modified strain of <i>Bacillus subtilis</i> (NBA)	18/06/2015
FCM	2015-00190	Request for safety evaluation of Coveris recycling process to produce recycled plastic for food contact uses (Starlinger viscotec deCON)	07/05/2015
FCM	2014-00300	Request for the evaluation of a new additive: titanium dioxide treated with fluoride modified alumina	22/05/2015
FCM	2014-00859	Request to evaluate additive substance N,N-Bis(2-hydroxyethyl)alkyl(C8-C18) amine	28/05/2015
FCM	2015-00242	Request for the evaluation of Dimethyl-1,2,3,4-tetrahydronaphthalene-2,6-dicarboxylate	5/06/2015
FLAV	2015-00315 until 319	FGE.51Rev2 Alicyclic sec alcohols	28/05/2015
FLAV	2015-00320 until 322	FGE.313 2,5-dimethylfuran-3(2H)-one	28/05/2015
FLAV	2015-00244	Request for an evaluation of a new flavouring substance: 4-amino-5-(3-(isopropylamino)-2,2-dimethyl-3-oxopropoxy)-2-methylquinoline-3-carboxylic acid - S9632	08/06/2015
FLAV	2015-00246	Request for an evaluation of a new flavouring substance: (E)-3-(3,4-Dimethoxyphenyl)-N-[2-(3-methoxyphenyl)-ethyl]-acrylamide	16/06/2015

These applications were assigned to the respective working groups.

8. Feedback from the Scientific Committee/Scientific Panels, EFSA, the European Commission

8.1 Scientific Committee and Scientific Panel including their Working Groups

8.1.1. Scientific Committee and its Working Groups

The Scientific Committee Plenary was held 8-10 June 2015. A presentation was made by the Chair. A further presentation on the draft Guidance document on Uncertainty in Scientific Assessment was made. The Panel was invited to comment on the draft Guidance document that is currently in the public consultation phase.

8.1.2. CEF SWG Food Enzymes

At the last meeting a tiered approach for exposure assessment was presented to the CEF Panel. The SWG on Food Enzymes has started testing this approach with specific examples for Tier 1 (for screening purpose) and presented the outcome for further discussion. The Panel commented the text and suggested clarifications on this approach.

8.2 EFSA including its Working Groups /Task Forces

The Head of the REPRO Department presented to the CEF Panel an overview of the recent organisational changes within EFSA. The Head of the FIP Unit reported on the meeting with the National Food Institute, Technical University of Denmark, on bisphenol A. She also reminded the Panel of the scientific training opportunities offered by EFSA and that a full list of the different courses will be circulated to the Panel.

9. Any Other Business

No other business was raised.