

**ALPHA UNIT****Scientific Panel on Animal Health and Welfare****Minutes of the 90<sup>th</sup> plenary meeting****Held on 23-24 June 2015, Parma****(Agreed on 30 June 2015)****Participants****• Panel Members:**

Charlotte Berg, Anette Bøtner, Howard Browman, Aline De Koeijer, Klaus Depner, Mariano Domingo, Christian Ducrot, Sandra Edwards, Christine Fourichon, Frank Koenen, Simon More, Mohan Raj, Liisa Sihvonen, Hans Spooler, Jan Arend Stegeman, Hans-Hermann Thulke, Ivar Vågsholm, Antonio Velarde, Preben Willeberg

**• European Commission representatives:**

Nicole Heine (DG SANTE, Unit G6), Pedro Rosado-Martin (DG SANTE, Unit G5) (by phone).

**• EFSA:**

ALPHA Unit: Franck Berthe, Alessandro Broglia, Denise Candiani, Marianne Carson, Sofie Dhollander, Chiara Fabris, Andrea Gervelmeyer, Andrey Gogin, Per Have, Renata Leuschner, Eliana Lima, Francesca Porta, Frank Verdonck, Matthew Watts

AMU Unit: Jose Cortinhas Abrahantes

BIOCONTAM Unit: Beatriz Guerra, Ernesto Liebana Criado, Valentina Rizzi

**1. Welcome and apologies for absence**

The Chair welcomed the participants.

**2. Adoption of agenda**

The agenda was adopted without changes.

### 3. Declarations of interest

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes<sup>1</sup> and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest<sup>2</sup>, EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest and the Specific Declarations of Interest filled in by the Panel Members invited for the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process. For further details on the outcome of the Oral Declarations of Interest made at the beginning of the meeting, please refer to the Annex.

### 4. Agreement of the minutes of the 89<sup>th</sup> Plenary meeting held on 05-06 05 2015.

The minutes were agreed on 24 05 2015 and published on the EFSA website 24 05 2015.

### 5. New Mandates

#### 5.1 Request for a scientific opinion on measures to reduce the need to use antimicrobial agents in animal husbandry in the European Union, and the resulting impacts on food safety (EFSA-Q-2015-00216)

The mandate for a joint opinion of EFSA and EMA that has been requested by the EC has been assigned to the EFSA BIOHAZ Panel (leading panel) and the AHAW Panel (supporting panel with view to the animal health and welfare aspects). The mandate was presented by three representatives from the BIOCONTAM Unit. The terms of reference and the overall approach for the opinion were discussed. EFSA is asked to review the measures that have been, or are being taken, to reduce the use of antimicrobials in animal husbandry in the EU, to assess the impact of such measures regarding the occurrence of antimicrobial resistance in bacteria from food-producing animals and food, to review the recent scientific developments in the area of possible alternatives to the use of antimicrobials in animal husbandry in the EU, to assess the potential impact of such alternative measures on the occurrence of antimicrobial resistance in bacteria from food-producing animals and food and to recommend options to reduce antimicrobial usage in animal husbandry in the EU, including consideration of the advantages and disadvantages of the different alternatives. Where a continued need is identified to use antimicrobials in the interests of animal health and welfare, EFSA should recommend how such use can continue with the minimum possible risk to human health. The deadline is set for December 2016.

The AHAW Panel expressed its view that a reduction of the need to use antibiotics requires prevention of illness and improvement of health of food-producing animals. In order to achieve that, a thorough understanding of the husbandry practices for the different food-producing animal species and the factors motivating the use of antimicrobials is needed. Hence, the required expertise should encompass all relevant aspects related to livestock production systems, infectious and production diseases of food-producing animals, including epidemiology, disease control under farm conditions, animal welfare and social sciences, for each species/farming system where antimicrobial usage is significant. Further, the Panel requested clarification about the terminology (e.g. the need to differentiate between 'antimicrobial usage' and 'antimicrobial need').

---

<sup>1</sup> <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencypolicy.pdf>

<sup>2</sup> <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>

## 6. Opinions presented for adoption

### 6.1. Scientific opinion on African swine fever (ASF) (EFSA-Q-2014-00897)

The draft opinion was presented for adoption. Conclusions and recommendations were discussed and reviewed. The opinion was adopted unanimously.

### 6.2. Report on oral vaccination of foxes against rabies (EFSA-Q-2014-00864)

The draft opinion was presented for adoption. Conclusions and recommendations were discussed and reviewed. The opinion was adopted unanimously.

### 6.3. Scientific opinion on enzootic bovine leukosis (EFSA-Q-2013-00546)

The draft opinion was presented for adoption. Conclusions and recommendations were discussed and reviewed. The opinion was adopted unanimously.

## 7. Opinions submitted for discussion

### 7.1 Request for an update of the 2011 scientific opinion on hatchery waste as animal by-products (EFSA-Q-2014-00902)

The draft opinion was tabled for discussion with the emphasis on identified potential hazards to animal health. AHAW Panel experts commented prior to the plenary meeting that the draft opinion was very clear and concise. Further comments related to processing parameters (time and temperature) of processing method 1 according to Regulation (EC) No 142/2011 and on the new uncertainty section of the draft opinion. The uncertainty section is following the outline and considerations of the Draft Guidance document on Uncertainty in Scientific Assessment which is currently for public consultation on the EFSA website (<http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/consultations/call/150618.htm>). The comments of the AHAW Panel experts provided in writing were shared with the BIOHAZ WG experts. The animal health-relevant sections of the opinion shall be endorsed by the AHAW Panel at its plenary meeting in September 2015, and the opinion is scheduled for adoption by the BIOHAZ Panel in October 2015.

## 8. Scientific outputs submitted for update on progress

### 8.1 Scientific opinion concerning the risk of survival, establishment and spread of the small hive beetle (*Aethina tumida*) in the EU (EFSA-Q-2014-00938)

An update of the SHB mandate was presented to the Panel. It was agreed that the spread of SHB from the south of Italy to other Member States should be addressed at the theoretical level due to the lack of data on trade in bees and bee products. Scenarios will be generated indicating the risk of SHB spread as a function of the number of shipments, SHB prevalence in the region of origin and sensitivity to detect the pest.

### 8.2 Scientific opinion on health of honey bee colonies (EFSA-Q-2015-00047)

The Panel was updated on the activities of the HEALTHY-B WG. The main comments received from hearing experts representing stakeholders, EU projects and EC colleagues were discussed. Furthermore, the criteria proposed by the WG to categorize identified

indicators and factors were presented. It was requested to clarify what exactly is covered by 'technical feasibility'.

## **9. Other scientific topics for information and/or discussion**

### **9.1 The use of animal-based measures to assess animal welfare in the EU - state of art and gap analysis (EFSA-Q-2015-00148)**

An update of the project and preparation of the extended WG-meeting with experts that will take place from the 8th (pm) to the 10th (am) of July, in Parma- Palazzo Ducale has been provided. Some preliminary results on the gaps' identification regarding the general ABMs' concept ("toolbox") and the specific ABMs ("tools") were presented. Both aspects were of interest of the Panel as a methodological approach is necessary in order to approach animal welfare risk assessment using ABMs. For presenting the project at the July meeting with hearing experts it was suggested to have a helicopter view, i.e. starting from the aim of the project, before going down to the results. In addition, the use of questions for stimulating the discussion and arriving to the definition of ABMs could also be worthwhile.

### **9.2 Feedback on AHAW Panel period 2012-2015**

The Panel members discussed their views on the panel period 2012-2015. The discussions focussed on the production of the opinions, the difficulty for experts to cope with the demands of being a panel member in addition to their employment, the challenges in achieving input from all panel members on all activities and across disciplines as well as the organisation of plenary meetings. The conclusions of discussion will provide the basis for the induction of the new panel in the second half of 2015.

## Annex

### **Interests and actions resulting from the Oral Declarations of Interest done at the beginning of the meeting**

With regard to this meeting, Dr. Klaus Depner declared the following interest: occasional consultancy on African swine fever (ASF) for the European Commission (DG-SANTE). Dr. Klaus Depner is a member of the Community Veterinary Emergency Team (CVET) doing epidemiological investigations for the Commission together with experts from the Community Veterinary Laboratory in Member States affected by ASF. In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes<sup>3</sup> and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest<sup>4</sup>, and taking into account the specific matters discussed at the meeting in question, the interest above was deemed to represent a Conflict of Interest.

This results in exclusion of the expert from any discussion, voting or other processing of item 6.1, Scientific opinion on African swine fever (ASF) (EFSA-Q-2014-00897), by the concerned scientific group.

---

<sup>3</sup> <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf>

<sup>4</sup> <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>