

**MINUTES OF THE 36<sup>TH</sup> PLENARY MEETING  
OF THE EFSA SCIENTIFIC PANEL ON PLANT HEALTH  
HELD IN PARMA (ITALY) ON 21 MARCH 2012**

**SESSION OPENED TO OBSERVERS**

(ADOPTED ON 22 MAY 2012)

ITEM	AGENDA	PAGE
1.	Welcome, apologies for absence	2
2.	Adoption of the agenda	3
3.	Declarations of interests	3
4.	Adoption of the minutes of 35 <sup>th</sup> Plenary meeting	3
5.	Discussion and possible adoption of the draft opinion on risk assessment of European versus non-European populations of the potato cyst nematodes <i>Globodera rostochiensis</i> and <i>G.pallida</i>	3
6.	Discussion and possible adoption of the draft statement on the Commission request regarding <i>Agrilus planipennis</i>	3
7.	Discussion and possible adoption of the draft statement on the pest risk analysis on <i>Pomacea insularum</i> , the island apple snail prepared by the Spanish Ministry of Environment, and Rural and Marine Affairs	4
8.	New mandates from the Commission	4
9.	Presentation from the Commission on the Annexes of the Directive 2000/29/EC	4
10.	Update on the status of the on-going mandates: — Request to provide a scientific opinion on the risk to plant health of <i>Liriomyza trifolii</i> (Burgess), <i>Liriomyza huidobrensis</i> (Blanchard), <i>Erwinia chrysanthemi</i> pv. <i>dianthicola</i> (Hellmers) Dickey, <i>Pseudomonas caryophylli</i> (Burkholder) Starr and Burkholder, <i>Phialophora cinerescens</i> (Wollenweber) van Beyma, <i>Puccinia horiana</i> Hennings, <i>Scirrhia pini</i> Funk and Parker, and <i>Chrysanthemum stunt viroid</i> , for the EU territory — Request to provide a scientific opinion on the risk to plant	4

	<b>health of <i>Bemisia tabaci</i> for the EU territory</b> <b>— Request to provide a scientific opinion on the risk to plant health of the tospoviruses, for the EU territory</b>	
<b>11.</b>	<b>EFSA Colloquium on emerging risks in plant health – follow up conclusions</b>	<b>6</b>
<b>12.</b>	<b>Presentation of the Communications directorate</b>	
<b>13.</b>	<b>Miscellaneous:</b> - <b>Report from Scientific Committee</b> - <b>Update from PLH Secretariat</b> - <b>Next meeting confirmation</b>	<b>6</b>
<b>14.</b>	<b>Questions and answers</b>	

## PARTICIPANTS

### *Members of the PLH Panel*

Richard BAKER, Thierry CANDRESSE, Erzsébet DORMANNSNÉ SIMON, Gianni GILIOLI, Jean-Claude GRÉGOIRE, Michael John JEGER, Olia Evtimova KARADJOVA, Gábor LÖVEI, David MAKOWSKI, Charles MANCEAU, Maria NAVAJAS, Angelo PORTA PUGLIA, Trond RAFOSS, Vittorio ROSSI, Jan SCHANS, Gritta SCHRADER, Gregor UREK, Johan Coert VAN LENTEREN, Irene VLOUTOGLOU, Stephan WINTER, Marina ZLOTINA

### *EFSA*

PLH Unit: Roberta CARFAGNINI, Elzbieta Ceglarska, Gábor HOLLO, Virag KERTESZ, Svetla KOZELSKA, Doreen RUSSELL, Giuseppe STANCANELLI, Joanna SWARCEWICZ, Sara TRAMONTINI, Sybren VOS, Martin VOSTA

RASA Directorate: Claudia HEPPNER

### *European Commission*

Guillermo CARDON

### *Observers*

No applications to attend this meeting were received by the deadline.

### *Apologies*

European Commission: Michael WALSH

## 1. WELCOME, APOLOGIES FOR ABSENCE

The Panel Chair welcomed the Panel members. Apologies were received from Michael Walsh.

Claudia Heppner, acting director of EFSA Risk Assessment and Scientific Assistance Directorate, introduced the Panel to the EFSA pilot project to open selected plenary meetings to observers. This meeting of the PLH Panel was designated as the first meeting open to observers; however no applications to attend this meeting were received. She informed the experts that a future PLH plenary meeting would be opened to observers.

## **2. ADOPTION OF THE AGENDA**

The agenda was adopted.

## **3. DECLARATIONS OF INTERESTS**

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Declarations of Interest, EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest (ADoI) and Specific Declaration of Interest (SDoI) filled in by the experts invited to the meeting. For further details on the outcome of the declarations of interest please refer to Annex I.

## **4. ADOPTION OF THE MINUTES OF THE 35<sup>TH</sup> PLENARY MEETING**

The minutes were adopted.

## **5. DISCUSSION AND POSSIBLE ADOPTION OF THE DRAFT SCIENTIFIC OPINION ON RISK ASSESSMENT OF EUROPEAN VERSUS NON-EUROPEAN POPULATIONS OF THE POTATO CYST NEMATODES *GLOBODERA ROSTOCHIENSIS* AND *G. PALLIDA***

EFSA is requested to provide a scientific opinion the plant health risks posed by European and non-European populations of the potato cyst nematodes *Globodera pallida* and *G. rostochiensis* to solanaceous plants in the EU. The mandate is registered in the EFSA register of questions as EFSA-Q-2011-00782.

The draft opinion was presented to the Panel, focussing on the conclusions of the risk assessment and the evaluation of risk reduction options. The Panel discussed and adopted the opinion.<sup>1</sup>

## **6. DISCUSSION AND POSSIBLE ADOPTION OF THE DRAFT STATEMENT ON THE COMMISSION REQUEST REGARDING *AGRILUS PLANIPENNIS***

EFSA is requested to provide clarification on a statement in the scientific opinion on *Agrilus planipennis* (EFSA-Q-2010-01097). The clarification request is registered in the EFSA register of questions as EFSA-Q-2012-00255.

The Chair of the working group outlined the background to the original request for the scientific opinion, in particular that the original mandate was to evaluate the data presented and not to suggest an appropriate heat treatment for the organism. He then presented the clarification request to the Panel and the statement prepared by the working group in response to this request.

---

<sup>1</sup> Panel member Gabor Lovei was absent from the meeting during the adoption of the opinion.

The Panel discussed the statement and subject to minor editorial amendments the statement was unanimously adopted.

**7. DISCUSSION AND POSSIBLE ADOPTION OF THE DRAFT STATEMENT OF THE PEST RISK ANALYSIS ON *POMACEA INSULARUM*, THE APPLE ISLAND SNAIL, PREPARED BY SPANISH MINISTRY OF ENVIRONMENT, AND RURAL AND MARINE AFFAIRS**

EFSA is requested to provide clarification in relation to the scientific opinion on the evaluation of the pest risk analysis on *Pomacea insularum* (EFSA-Q-2011-01127). The clarification request is registered in the EFSA register of questions as EFSA-Q-2012-00375.

The statement prepared by the working group was presented to the Panel and following a discussion the statement was unanimously adopted by the Panel.

**8. NEW MANDATES FROM THE COMMISSION**

The Commission representative outlined the possible new requests. None have yet been finalised but the Commission may request clarifications on a scientific opinion already issued based on the comments received from a Member State.

**9. PRESENTATION FROM THE COMMISSION ON THE ANNEXES OF THE DIRECTIVE 2000/29/EC**

Guillermo Cardon presented Directive 2000/29/EC - the Plant Health regime – whose objective is to protect food security, agriculture and forests and in which the protection of plant health is a central objective. Based on international agreements such as the IPPC and WTO, the Directive allows for the introduction of secondary legislation. He explained that the evaluation of the existing plant health regime is completed and that the proposal for a new plant health regime is in preparation.

He described the nine annexes to the Directive, listing the prescribed organisms to be regulated and the extent of regulatory control. In light of the current mandate the Panel is addressing for Annex II (A) II organisms; the Commission representative explained the possibility of amending the Annexes and the process involved.

The Panel asked questions and sought clarification from the speaker.

**10. UPDATE ON THE STATUS OF THE ON-GOING MANDATES**

- **Request to provide a scientific opinion on the risk to plant health of *Liriomyza trifolii* (Burgess), *Liriomyza huidobrensis* (Blanchard), *Erwinia chrysanthemi* pv. *dianthicola* (Hellmers) Dickey, *Pseudomonas caryophylli* (Burkholder) Starr and Burkholder, *Phialophora cinerescens* (Wollenweber) van Beyma, *Puccinia horiana* Hennings, *Scirrhia pini* Funk and Parker, and Chrysanthemum stunt viroid, for the EU territory**

The EFSA Panel on Plant Health is requested to prepare a pest risk assessment for each of the above mentioned species. For each organism EFSA is asked to identify risk management options and

to evaluate their effectiveness in reducing the risk to plant health posed by the organism. EFSA is also requested to carry out an evaluation of the present EU requirements against those organisms, which are laid down in Council Directive 2000/29/EC. The mandate is registered in the EFSA register of questions as: EFSA-Q-2011-01158, *Liriomyza trifolii* (Burgess); EFSA-Q-2011-01184, *Liriomyza huidobrensis* (Blanchard); EFSA-Q-2011-01185, *Erwinia chrysanthemi* pv. *dianthicola* (Hellmers) Dickey; EFSA-Q-2011-01186, *Pseudomonas caryophylli* (Burkholder) Starr and Burkholder; EFSA-Q-2011-01187, *Phialophora cinerescens* (Wollenweber) van Beyma; EFSA-Q-2011-01188, *Puccinia horiana* Hennings; EFSA-Q-2011-011889, *Scirrhia pini* Funk and Parker and EFSA-Q-2011-01190, Chrysanthemum stunt viroid.

An update on the activities of the coordination group and of the four taxonomic subgroups was presented. With regard to methodology, it was confirmed that the pest risk assessment would be conducted under the scenario of current EU phytosanitary measures. For data collection, the Panel discussed the questionnaires to be sent by EFSA to the National Plant Protection Organisations of the Member States on the status of the organisms. The proposed timeframe for receipt of Member State responses together with potential difficulties in completion were discussed and it was agreed to proceed only after further editorials to the questionnaires are provided by the Insects subgroup. It was also proposed to organise a hearing session for the Panel on plant propagation material, cut flowers and pot plants production of carnation and chrysanthemum with external experts who can supply valuable information on data that cannot be accessed in scientific literature or other EU data sources. In collaboration with EFSA's EmRisk Unit (via the MedIsys media surveillance system) and the JRC media monitoring, media surveillance will be established to detect news about these organisms for this mandate and for other current mandates of the Panel.

**- Request to provide a scientific opinion on the risk to plant health of *Bemisia tabaci* for the EU territory**

The EFSA Panel on Plant Health is requested to provide a pest risk assessment of *Bemisia tabaci* Genn with particular regard to the viruses it transmits, to identify risk management options and to evaluate their effectiveness in reducing the risk. EFSA is also requested to provide an opinion on the effectiveness of the present EU special requirements linked to *Bemisia tabaci* as listed in Annex IV of Council Directive 2000/29/EC.

The Chair of the working group presented the approach to undertaking the pest risk assessment including pest categorisation. A pathway analysis for ornamentals and short summaries of certain risk reduction options have been conducted by the working group.

The Panel provided their comments and requested certain other information from the working group.

**- Request to provide a scientific opinion on the risk to plant health of the tospoviruses, for the EU territory**

The EFSA Panel on Plant Health is requested to provide a pest risk assessment of *Tomato spotted wilt virus* as well as of the other tospoviruses, for the EU territory. EFSA is also requested to identify risk management options and to evaluate their effectiveness in reducing the risk and to provide an opinion on the effectiveness of the present EU requirements against *Tomato spotted wilt*

*virus* and *Chrysanthemum stem necrosis virus*, as in the Council Directive 2000/29/EC. The mandate is registered in the EFSA register of question as: EFSA-Q-2011-01156 and EFSA-Q-2012-00076.

A progress report on this mandate was presented to the Panel. A trial has been set-up by the EFSA EmRisk Unit for a media survey of the organism through the MedIsys media surveillance system. For the pest categorisation stage the conclusions are almost finalised and in addition the vector viruses were presented including those viruses with the highest potential for damage but currently absent from the EU and those viruses present in the EU and for whom damage is beyond doubt.

The Panel engaged in a discussion on the progress of the mandate in relation to the first question addressing pest categorisation of the Tospoviruses for the EU territory.

## **11. EFSA COLLOQUIUM ON EMERGING RISKS IN PLANT HEALTH – FOLLOW UP CONCLUSIONS**

The EFSA PLH unit presented ongoing activities on emerging risks. It was suggested to have a more thorough discussion on this topic at a future PLH plenary, involving the EFSA EmRisk Unit in order to receive an update on how the identification of emerging risks are currently dealt within EFSA and to discuss how to follow up on the conclusions of the Colloquium.

## **12. PRESENTATION BY THE COMMUNICATIONS DIRECTORATE (POSTPONED)**

## **13. MISCELLANEOUS:**

### **- Report from Scientific Committee**

No report presented

### **- Update from PLH Secretariat**

The secretariat advised the Panel of the status of the Panel renewal exercise. With respect to the European Commission Consultation on Invasive Alien Species, the secretariat will send the Environmental Risk Assessment Guidance and Panel members can comment on an individual basis to the consultation. An event relevant to Plant Health and part of EFSA's 10<sup>th</sup> Anniversary was presented to the experts and will take place in Finland. The secretariat advised the Panel of the presentation of the risk reduction options guidance to the AHAW Panel

### **- Next meeting confirmation:**

22-23 May 2012, Bremen (Germany).

## **14. QUESTIONS AND ANSWERS:**

Within the framework of the EFSA pilot project on open scientific meeting<sup>2</sup> no observers were present at this meeting and consequently no questions and answers were tabled.

---

<sup>2</sup> EFSA's pilot project on open scientific meetings: guidelines & registration for observers can be accessed at: <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/stakeholders/observers.htm>

### Annex I

With regard to the mandate on *Agrilus planipennis* (EFSA-Q-2012-00255) Dr. Marina Zlotina declared an interest in relation to her current activities with USDA APHIS. In accordance with EFSA's policy on Declarations of Interest and Implementing documents thereof, and taking into account the specific matters discussed at the meeting above, the interest above was deemed to represent a conflict (level C). Pursuant to EFSA's Procedure on Identifying and Handling Declarations of Interest, the said expert as per point C.III1 is excluded from drafting the opinion and discussing and adopting the final Panel outputs.