

**MINUTES OF THE 25<sup>th</sup> PLENARY MEETING  
OF THE SCIENTIFIC PANEL ON FOOD CONTACT MATERIALS,  
ENZYMES, FLAVOURINGS AND PROCESSING AIDS (CEF)**

**Held in Parma on 31 January - 2 February 2012**

**Adopted on 22 March 2012**

**AGENDA:**

---

**Table of Contents**

1. Welcome, apologies for absence .....	3
2. Adoption of the agenda.....	3
3. Declarations of interest .....	3
4. Matters arising from the 24 <sup>th</sup> Plenary Meeting (22-24 November 2011) .....	3
5. General information from the EFSA, the Commission and the Chair .....	3
6. Flavourings .....	4
6.1. Revision of list of representatives for footnote 10 testing .....	4
6.2. Flavouring group evaluations .....	4
7. Food contact materials.....	5
7.1. Substances for use in plastics.....	5
7.2. Active and intelligent substances.....	5
7.3. Draft opinion on mineral oil hydrocarbons (MOH).....	5
8. Scientific Opinion on the evaluation of the safety and efficacy of Cecure® for the removal of microbial surface contamination of raw poultry products.....	5
9. Presentations on environmental risk assessment (ERA) approaches.....	6
10. AOB.....	6
ANNEX I: interests & actions resulting from the screening of specific declaration of interests.....	7

**MINUTES OF THE 25<sup>th</sup> PLENARY MEETING  
OF THE SCIENTIFIC PANEL ON FOOD CONTACT MATERIALS,  
ENZYMES, FLAVOURINGS & PROCESSING AIDS (CEF)**

---

**PARTICIPANTS**

Panel Members:

Ulla Beckman Sundh, Mona-Lise Binderup (1<sup>st</sup> day and 2<sup>nd</sup> day morning), Leon Brimer (1<sup>st</sup> and 2<sup>nd</sup> days), Laurence Castle, Karl-Heinz Engel, Roland Franz, Nathalie Gontard, Trine Husøy, Klaus-Dieter Jany, Catherine Leclercq, Wim C. Mennes, Maria Rosaria Milana (1<sup>st</sup> and 2<sup>nd</sup> days), Iona Pratt, Kettil Svensson, Fidel Toldrá, Detlef Wölfle.

Apologies: Rainer Gürtler, Jean-Claude Lhuguenot

Invited Experts, hearing experts:

Vibe Beltoft (Item 6)

Karla Pfaff and Maria de Fátima Poças (Item 7.3)

Fernando Aguilar and Riccardo Crebelli (by teleconference), Joop De Knecht (Items 8 and 9)

European Commission (by teleconference):

Josiane Houins-Roulet (Items 5, 8, 9)

Rafael Luis Perez Berbejal (Item 5)

Sirkku Heinimaa (Item 6)

Annette Schäfer, Bastiaan Schupp (Item 7)

Barbara Moretti (Items 8 and 9)

EFSA:

PESTICIDES Unit: Domenica Auteri, Csaba Szentes (Item 9)

FIP Unit:

Scientific staff: Alexandre Feigenbaum, Dimitrios Spyropoulos, Anne Theobald, Eric Barthélémy, Cristina Croera, Kim Rygaard Nielsen, Anna F. Castoldi, Alina Lupu, Andrea Terron, Maria Carfi.

Administrative staff: Eva Maria Ferrari, Letizia Fontanesi.

**1. WELCOME, APOLOGIES FOR ABSENCE**

**2. ADOPTION OF THE AGENDA**

The agenda was adopted.

**3. DECLARATIONS OF INTEREST**

Declarations of interest were recorded and evaluated in compliance with EFSA's policy on declarations of interest:

<http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/efsawho/doi.htm>

See Annex I

**4. MATTERS ARISING FROM THE 24<sup>TH</sup> PLENARY MEETING (22-24 NOVEMBER 2011)**

The minutes of the 24<sup>th</sup> Plenary meeting were adopted after editorial changes.

They can be seen on:

<http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/events/event/111122.htm>

**5. GENERAL INFORMATION FROM THE EFSA, THE COMMISSION AND THE CHAIR**

**Revision of *Regulation 234/2011* on food enzymes so as to provide derogations in data requests, in particular toxicological data.**

SANCO has decided on 5 December 2011 to modify Regulation 234/2011 and to provide for derogations in article 8 thereof concerning "Specific data required for risk assessment of food enzymes", in particular as regards toxicological data.

**Update on BPA**

As a follow-up of the CEF Panel statement of 24 November 2011, the CEF Panel discussed and agreed on the need to undertake by May 2013 a full re-evaluation of the human risks associated with exposure to BPA through the diet, also taking into consideration the contribution of non dietary sources to the overall exposure to BPA. A self-mandate for this task will be prepared and submitted to EFSA.

**EFSA colloquium on "low dose effects" June 2012**

This colloquium will enable an open scientific debate on the current state of the art in low dose response in toxicology. It will take place in EFSA in Parma on 14<sup>th</sup> and 15<sup>th</sup> June 2012.

<http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/events/event/120614.htm>

## 6. FLAVOURINGS

### 6.1. Revision of list of representatives for footnote 10 testing

(EFSA-Q-2012-00374)

A draft was presented and discussed.

### 6.2. Flavouring group evaluations

According to Regulation 1565/2000 of 18 July 2000 and to recent requests from Commission.

#### FGE.10Rev3

Aliphatic primary and secondary saturated and unsaturated alcohols, aldehydes, acetals, carboxylic acids and esters containing an additional oxygenated functional group and lactones.

(EFSA-Q-2011-01010, EFSA-Q-2010-01554)

The present revision of FGE.10, FGE.10Rev3, includes the assessment of two additional candidate substances [FL-no: 09.951 and 10.170]. Besides, submitted requested information on specifications has also been introduced.

The draft opinion was discussed, modified and adopted. The full opinion is available through:

<http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/efsajournal/pub/2563.htm>

#### FGE.49Rev1

Xanthine alkaloids from the Priority List.

(EFSA-Q-2011-01015)

The opinion was not presented during the meeting because it was considered necessary to discuss it further in the flavouring working group.

#### FGE.87Rev1

Consideration of bicyclic secondary alcohols, ketones and related esters evaluated by JECFA (63<sup>rd</sup> meeting).

(EFSA-Q-2011-01048, EFSA-Q-2011-01047)

This revision of FGE.87 is made due to consideration of two additional substances [FL-no: 02.100 and 02.101]. Additionally, new information on EU production volumes of two substances and information on stereoisomeric composition for 13 substances are also included.

The draft opinion was discussed, modified and adopted. The full opinion is available through:

<http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/efsajournal/pub/2564.htm>

#### FGE.201Rev1

2-Alkylated aliphatic alpha, beta-unsaturated aldehydes and precursors with or without additional double-bonds.

(EFSA-Q-2011-01082, EFSA-Q-2011-01083, EFSA-Q-2012-00070, EFSA-Q-2012-00071, EFSA-Q-2011-01084, EFSA-Q-2011-01085, EFSA-Q-2011-01086, EFSA-Q-2011-01087, EFSA-Q-2012-00072, EFSA-Q-2011-01088, EFSA-Q-2007-00333)

The opinion was not adopted, due to discussion on criteria for acceptance of the *in vivo* micronucleus test. The opinion will be rediscussed at the genotoxicity and flavouring working groups before a new discussion at the Panel.

## **Smoke flavour Primary Product AM 01**

*(EFSA-Q-2011-01019)*

The draft opinion was discussed, modified and adopted. The full opinion is available through:

<http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/efsajournal/pub/2580.htm>

## **7. FOOD CONTACT MATERIALS**

### **7.1. Substances for use in plastics**

#### **Ref. No 38565**

3,9-Bis[2-(3-(3-tert-butyl-4-hydroxy-5-methylphenyl)propionyloxy)-1,1-dimethylethyl]-2,4,8,10-tetraoxaspiro[5,5]undecane

*(EFSA-Q-2009-00769)*

The draft opinion was discussed, modified and adopted. The full opinion is available through:

<http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/efsajournal/pub/2566.htm>

### **7.2. Active and intelligent substances**

#### **Oxygen absorbers based on:**

Iron, calcined kaolin, activated carbon, sulphur, sodium chloride

*(EFSA-Q-2011-00238, EFSA-Q-2011-00239, EFSA-Q-2011-00242)*

The draft scientific opinion was discussed and changes were noted. The opinion will be revised and it will be scheduled for the March Panel meeting.

#### **Oxygen absorber based on:**

Sodium borohydride and palladium acetate

*(EFSA-Q-2011-00067)*

The draft opinion was discussed and changes were noted. The opinion will be reconsidered by the FCM working group and it will be scheduled for the March Panel meeting.

### **7.3. Draft opinion on mineral oil hydrocarbons (MOH)**

*(EFSA-Q-2010-00896)*

The draft opinion and in particular the exposure to MOH from food packaging made of recycled paper were discussed and changes were noted. A new version of the opinion will be scheduled for the March Panel meeting, in view of adoption of the sections in the remit of CEF.

## **8. Scientific Opinion on the evaluation of the safety and efficacy of Cecure® for the removal of microbial surface contamination of raw poultry products**

*(EFSA-Q-2011-01018)*

The rapporteurs presented the opinion. Some amendments and clarifications were requested by the Panel, which will be addressed to the WG on Processing aids. A revised version of the opinion will be presented for adoption in the Plenary of March 2012.

**9. Presentations on environmental risk assessment (ERA) approaches**

To support the discussion and the evaluation of environmental risks linked to processing aids, two presentations on the ERA were given: one illustrating the approaches and criteria used for the evaluation of Cecure and the other describing the methodology for the evaluation of pesticides.

**10. AOB**

None.

## **ANNEX I: INTERESTS & ACTIONS RESULTING FROM THE SCREENING OF SPECIFIC DECLARATION OF INTERESTS**

Dr. Franz declared an interest in sodium borohydride used in conjunction with palladium acetate. His laboratory has carried out some experimental migration testing as contract work for the applicant and the test reports have been used as supporting documentation in the dossier. This interest is considered as conflict and the expert was asked to leave the room when the opinion was discussed.

Dr. Wölfle advises the German Federal Ministry of Food, Agriculture and Consumer Protection on specific substances (e.g. Bisphenol A, mineral hydrocarbons in food) in the context of his work for the German RA body BfR. Furthermore, he declared to have been a member of the former EFSA WG on BPA. These activities are not considered as conflicts of interest as the advice is given to a public risk assessment body.

Dr. Wölfle provided preparatory work documents in the field of food contact materials for the following substances: Ref. No 38565, and sodium borohydride used in conjunction with palladium acetate, in the context of the contract between EFSA and BfR. This was considered as a conflict of interest because he could not act at the same time as a representative of the contractor and as a member of the Panel with voting rights. He was allowed to stay in the room to answer to specific technical questions but he did not participate in the discussion of the opinion. Another Panel member presented the draft opinions.

Dr. Pratt declared an interest in BPA, as she has been involved in the previous evaluation of this substance for EFSA in 2006 and during her employment at the Food Standards Agency Ireland (FSAI). In the frame of a consultancy contract with Milieu Environmental Law and Policy she provided in the period January 2011 to June 2011 technical assistance to DG-ENV related to the precautionary principle in chemicals regulations. In this context it should be noted that Bisphenol A is included as a case study in the report on application of the Precautionary Principle by the European Commission. The report however did not involve assessment of Bisphenol A and does not make any recommendations in relation to this or other chemicals. It seeks to establish general criteria for application of the precautionary principle for use by the European Commission. Both activities are not regarded as conflicts as the scientific advice is given to public bodies (EFSA and FSAI) and the expert was not involved in the report dealing with Bisphenol A as an example for the precautionary principle in chemicals regulations nor would that be related to EFSA's work.

Dr. Leclercq declared an interest in BPA. She is a member of the Scientific Committee of the French Total Diet in infants (EAT infantile) of the French Agency for Food, Environmental and Occupational Health & Safety (ANSES). BPA is one of the substances to be monitored in this study. This activity is not considered as a conflict as this study is commissioned and evaluated by a public risk assessment body.

Dr. Milana declared an interest in BPA. She was and is regularly involved in the advices on BPA given to the Italian Ministry of Health on behalf of her employer. This activity is not considered as a conflict as the advice is given to a public risk assessment body.

Dr. Svensson declared an interest in BPA. He provides scientific advice to the Swedish authorities. This activity is not considered as a conflict as the advice is given to a public risk assessment body.

Dr. Mennes and Dr. Binderup reported that their institutions are involved in the risk assessment of BPA. This is not a conflict.

Dr. Toldrá declared to have been in the past an expert in the joint FAO/WHO Project to assess the benefits and risks of the use of chlorine-containing compounds and other disinfectants in food production and food processing. This activity occurred in the past and does not pose a conflict of interest.